



**DOES MULTICULTURALISM POSE A PROBLEM FOR
THE IMPLEMENTATION OF INDIVIDUAL RIGHTS?**

**THE CASE OF FORCED MARRIAGE IN THE CONTEXT
OF THE UNITED KINGDOM**

Laia Pau Romani

E.MA European Master Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation
2011-2012

Supervised by
Professor Matthew Alexander Halkes Carey

University Of Copenhagen

Abstract

Does multiculturalism pose a problem for the implementation of individual rights?
How?

In the western context, conceptions of human rights are grounded in the liberal traditions of what could be considered, a moderately homogenous Western culture. However, within the recent past, as a result of globalisation and the increase of the migration flows, this culture has changed into a more heterogeneous one. Together with the notable diversity of beliefs and subcultures, some new challenges to these liberal traditions have appeared. An example of where such challenges evoke expressly contrasting opinions is the issue of forced marriages, where the social and cultural rights of different minority groups seem to be in tension with concepts concerning the human rights of an individual. Therefore, this question challenges a number of positions, including principles of multiculturalism.

With this thesis I will investigate, whether and how multiculturalism poses a problem for the realisation of individual rights. Accordingly, I will analyse my question through the case of forced marriages in a context of migration in Europe, concentrating my research in the concrete social, legal and political frame of the United Kingdom.

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Matthew Alexander Halkes Carey of Copenhagen University for his guidance. I would like to thank Professor Oskar Salemnik, E.MA National Director, for his comments. I am also grateful to the Danish Institute for Human Rights, the DCSIM library and its dedicated personnel, for helping and allow me to access to their privileged sources. I want to express my special gratitude to Dr. Angela Melchiore, E.MA Programme Director and to Ms Monika Gabriela Dabrowska, EMA Fellow, for their time and patience in answering so many questions. Finally, thanks to all the *masterini* with whom I have shared this fruitful and unforgettable year.

List of Abbreviations

ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights (Banjul Charter)
CDHRI	Cairo Declaration on Human Rights in Islam
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CFREU	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
CLU	Community Liaisons Unit
CRC	Convention on the Right of the Child
CRDP	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
EU	European Union
FCO	Foreign Commonwealth Office
FMU	Forced Marriage Unit
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
IKWRO	Iranian and Kurdish Women's Rights Organisation
KN	Karma Nirvana
LGBT	Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender
MAT	Muslim Arbitration Tribunal
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NRPF	Non Recourse to Public Fund Rule
SBS	Southall Black Sisters
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UIDHR	Universal Islamic Declaration of Human Rights
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund

Table of Contents

Introduction	p.7
1. By way of example	p.7
2. Aims.....	p.9
3. Conceptual approaches	p.10
3.1 Forced Marriage.....	p.11
3.1.1 Conceptual approach	p.11
3.1.2 Problems of definition: The issue of consent	p.13
3.2 Multiculturalism	p.17
3.2.1 Multiculturalism in Europe: Historical contextualisation in a nutshell	p.19
3.2.2 Conceptual approach	p.21
4. Methodology	p.25
5. Delimitation of the subject.....	p.28
5.1 Country	p.28
5.2 Women	p.29
5.3 Muslim	p.29
6. Structure.....	p.30
 Chapter 1 - Forced Marriage: The factors behind the practice and the international legal framework	p.32
1.1 Introduction.....	p.32
1.2 An estimated overview	p.32
1.3 Forced marriage: Factors behind the practice.....	p.37
1.3.1 Causes	p.38
1.3.2 Methods of pressure used to push the spouses	p.40
1.3.3 Consequences	p.42
1.4 Forced marriage: Beyond the international legal framework	p.44
1.5 Conclusion	p.49

Chapter 2 - Forced Marriage in the United Kingdom: practice, prevention and the problem of enforcement	p.50
2.1 Introduction.....	p.50
2.2 Forced Marriage in the United Kingdom: A bit of context	p.51
2.3 Forced Marriage in the United Kingdom: Prevention, Protection and Punishment	p.52
2.3.1 International law	p.52
2.3.2 Civil Law	p.53
2.3.3 Criminal Law	p.56
2.3.4 Migration Law	p.58
2.3.5 Policies.....	p.59
2.4 Forced Marriage in the United Kingdom: the problem of enforcement and its factors...	p.63
2.4.1 The use of forced marriage as an excuse to tighten migration controls	p.64
2.4.2 The lack of political will.....	p.65
2.4.3 Ambiguous approaches.....	p.68
2.4.4 Gender blindness of law and policies	p.69
2.4.5 Lack of protection for victims, witnesses and ‘survivors’	p.70
2.5 Conclusion	p.71
 Chapter 3 - Forced Marriage: Multiculturalism, the problem of enforcement and its factors	p.73
3.1 Introduction: Forced Marriage and multiculturalism.....	p.73
3.2 The multicultural influence: multicultural principles and the prevention against forced marriages	p.75
3.3 Conclusion	p.87
 Chapter 4 - Conclusions	p.90
 Bibliography	p.96
Legislation and Official texts	p.108
Annex	p.111