

UNLOCKING THE DOOR TO JUSTICE: DOMESTIC WORKERS IN DIPLOMAT'S HOUSEHOLDS

Jimy Perumadan

E.MA Human Rights and Democratisation

Supervisor: Professor Emeritus Göran Melander Lund University, Sweden 2012/2013



Declaration against plagiarism¹

To be signed and placed at the beginning of the thesis

Name of the student:				
Second semester host university:				
Name of the supervisor:				
Title of the E.MA thesis:				
Academic year:				
I certify that the attached is all my own work.				
I understand that I may be penalised if I use the words of others without acknowledgement.				
(Signature)				

Art. 5.1.i of the E.MA Rules of Assessment: The thesis shall consist of an academic piece of work, written individually and independently by the student. It shall be different from work previously undertaken by the student outside the framework of the E.MA Programme, e.g. in another Master's programme. It shall be written in English. The student may write the thesis in French upon prior approval of the E.MA director of the second semester University. [...]



Statement on the use of the E.MA thesis for library purposes¹

Name of the student:
Second semester host university:
Name of the supervisor:
Title of the E.MA thesis:
Academic year:
I hereby allow ²
 Publication of the <u>entire</u> thesis on the web Publication <u>only</u> of the abstract and table of content of the thesis on the web
Use of the thesis in the library for the purposes of:
Consultation only
 Photocopying Loan
 Digital format (pdf) delivery (only for other Masterini)
(Signature)

As decided by the E.MA Executive Committee on 22-23 April 2005. ² Tick only the options you allow.

To Stefan.

Acknowledgement

I'm thanking my Supervisor, Göran Melander, for his thoughts and guidance throughout this thesis writing. Our meetings have always been inspiring to me.

Special thanks to my interview partners Wolfgang Spadinger and Erik Karlsson for sharing their knowledge and time.

To Soroptimist International Österreichische Union for the generous scholarship and supporting my dreams.

I want to thank Jon for proof reading my thesis. All remaining errors are mine.

I'm thanking Stefan, for putting things in perspective, for encouraging me, and for paying the big telephone bill.

And finally but immensely my parents, Mary and Johny. For your love and support. Thank you!

Abstract

Domestic workers who are employed in diplomats' households face a huge challenge when their rights are violated. Due to the immunity of their employers, domestic workers have limited access to courts. This research study addresses the gap of legal protection of domestic workers employed by diplomats in European countries and examines the role of receiving States in their capacity of hosting foreign diplomats. The study is based on a broad literature review and is complemented by two expert interviews with representatives of Ministries of Foreign Affairs in Austria and Sweden. Furthermore, a legal analysis of jurisprudence of national courts as well as the European Court of Human Rights is conducted. The findings reveal that receiving States have a positive obligation under international human rights law to offer effective protection to domestic workers employed by diplomats. The interviews in Austria and Sweden have shown an increasing awareness for the situation of domestic workers and political will to prevent rights violations. The study contributes with its collection of primary data on the procedural framework of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in Austria and Sweden. It shall serve as a guideline for discussions and future research studies but also give practical recommendations to Protocol Departments.

Table of Contents

1	Ac	Acronyms1				
2	Int	Introduction2				
3 Rights violations of domestic workers in the context of immunities						
	3.1	Definitions	4			
	3.2	Violations of international legal instruments	5			
	3.3	Conflict of immunities and human rights	7			
	3.4	Vulnerability of domestic workers				
4	Re	esearch aim, scope and methodology	10			
5	Do	omestic workers in diplomat's households on the international agenda	ı 12			
	5.1	International level	12			
	5.2	Regional level	14			
6	Int	ternational immunities in the context of domestic workers	17			
	6.1	Diplomatic Immunity	17			
	6.	.1.1 Scope of diplomatic immunity	18			
	6.	.1.2 Termination of immunities	20			
	6.2	Consular immunity	23			
	6.3	Immunity of officials of international organisations	23			
	6.4	State immunity	24			
7	Ex	amples of case law	26			
	7.1	National courts in receiving States	27			
	7.2	European Court of Human Rights	35			
	7.3	International Treaty Bodies	39			
7	Po	sitive human rights obligations of receiving States to protect domesti	c			
W	orke	ers	41			
	7.1	The nature of human rights obligations	42			
	7.2	The positive obligations of States to protect individuals from violations co	mmitted			
	by t	hird parties	44			
	7.3	Receiving States positive obligation to protect domestic workers	49			

	7.3.1	The preventive obligation to protect	50
	7.3.2	The remedial obligation to protect	58
8	Recom	nmendations	63
	8.1 Pre	eventive measures to protect domestic workers	63
	8.1.1	Regulation of diplomatic visa	63
	8.1.2	Regulation of employment conditions	65
	8.1.3	Immigration status	66
	8.2 Re	medial measures to protect domestic workers	67
	8.2.1	Informal measures at the diplomatic level	67
	8.2.2	Formal measures according to the VCDR	68
	8.2.3	Immigration Status	68
	8.2.4	Alternative remedies	69
9	Conclu	ısion	71
10	Biblio	ography	73
11	Anne	х	81