



Samy Amanatullah

“Slowly, incest is being legalized throughout Europe”

Detecting Human Rights
Vulnerabilities in Fake News Using
Critical Discourse Analysis

SAMY AMANATULLAH

‘SLOWLY, INCEST IS BEING LEGALISED
THROUGHOUT EUROPE’:
DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN
FAKE NEWS USING CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS

FOREWORD

The *European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation* (EMA) is a one-year intensive programme launched in 1997 as a joint initiative of universities in all EU Member States with support from the European Commission. Based on an action- and policy-oriented approach to learning, it combines legal, political, historical, anthropological, and philosophical perspectives on the study of human rights and democracy with targeted skill-building activities. The aim from the outset was to prepare young professionals to respond to the requirements and challenges of work in international organisations, field operations, governmental and non-governmental bodies, and academia. As a measure of its success, EMA has served as a model of inspiration for the establishment of six other EU-sponsored regional master's programmes in the area of human rights and democratisation in different parts of the world. These programmes cooperate closely in the framework of the *Global Campus of Human Rights*, which is based in Venice, Italy.

90 students are admitted to the EMA programme each year. During the first semester in Venice, students have the opportunity to meet and learn from leading academics, experts and representatives of international and non-governmental organisations. During the second semester, they relocate to one of the 41 participating universities to follow additional courses in an area of specialisation of their own choice and to conduct research under the supervision of the resident EMA Director or other academic staff. After successfully passing exams and completing a master's thesis, students are awarded the *European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation*, which is jointly conferred by a group of EMA universities.

Each year the EMA Council of Directors selects five theses, which stand out not only for their formal academic qualities but also for the originality of topic, innovative character of methodology and approach, potential

usefulness in raising awareness about neglected issues, and capacity for contributing to the promotion of the values underlying human rights and democracy.

The EMA Awarded Theses of the academic year 2017/2018 are:

- Amanatullah, Samy, *“Slowly, incest is being legalized throughout Europe”*. *Detecting human rights vulnerabilities in fake news using critical discourse analysis*, Supervisor: Antonis Gardikiotis, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki
- Kasunić, Sandra, *Pragmatic Peace. The UNTAES Peacekeeping Mission as Example for Peaceful Reintegration of Occupied Multiethnic Territories*, Supervisor: Đorđe Gardašević, University of Zagreb
- Phoenix, Michael James, *Images and Human Rights: towards Sovereignty or Subversion*, Supervisor: Guy Haarscher, Université Libre de Bruxelles
- Vassalo Abreu Vieitas de Amorim, Sara Andreia, *Is Offshoring the Solution? The EU and the Extraterritorial Processing of Asylum Claims*, Supervisor: Lisa Heschl, University of Graz
- Venner, Kayin Joëll, *The Making of Human Rights Politics: Contentious Governance and the Uneven Implementation of Human Rights. The Case of Irregular Migrants’ Unequal Access to Healthcare in Spain after Royal Decree Law 16/2012*, Supervisor: Gorka Urrutia Asua, University of Deusto, Bilbao

The selected theses demonstrate the richness and diversity of the EMA programme and the outstanding quality of the work performed by its students. On behalf of the Governing Bodies of EMA and of all participating universities, we congratulate the authors.

Prof. Manfred NOWAK
Global Campus Secretary General

Prof. Ria WOLLESWINKEL
EMA Chairperson

Prof. George ULRICH
EMA Programme Director

This publication includes the thesis *“Slowly, incest is being legalized throughout Europe”*. *Detecting human rights vulnerabilities in fake news using critical discourse analysis*, written by Samy Amanatullah and supervised by Antonis Gardikiotis, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki.

BIOGRAPHY

Samy Amanatullah holds a BA in linguistics. Prior to obtaining his MA with EIUC, he worked in international education and as a freelance writer/editor. His research interests include persuasion campaigns, sociocultural linguistics, and human rights advocacy.

ABSTRACT

Liberal democracy has struggled to respond to so-called fake news. The term is used to describe content and discredit the media, and it is increasingly seen as the tool of illiberal actors. This research examines how fake news targets human rights through a critical discourse analysis of demonstrably false headlines in four environments: the United States, Italy, Greece and Ukraine.

This research defines fake news as disinformation or disingenuous content that is disseminated to persuade as an agenda. It then examines relevant social theories, enabling features and motivated actors to suggest that disinformation functions through repetition and peripheral processing that exploit existing scepticism and social tensions in the neo-liberal system.

This study collects headlines and headline-adjacent content from fact-checking sites in four countries, codes them according to sociological implications and analyses them through social discourse theory. It finds that disinformation targets social movements and multi-culturalism by discrediting actors and presenting the human rights regime as disingenuous and oppressive. Disinformation frames illiberal behaviour as positive transformative action and co-opts the rhetoric of the human rights regime to further arguments rooted in new racism.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization chair office of Aristotle University of Thessaloniki for hosting my research. I would like to extend my special gratitude to Antonis Gardikiotis for his attention and patience in supervising this research.

I would also like to thank the editors and publishers of PolitiFact, Butac.it, EllinikaHoaxes and StopFake. Their work made this research possible.

TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS

AFC	Automated fact-checking
CDA	Critical discourse analysis
CoE	Council of Europe
CP	Cooperative principle
ELM	Elaboration likelihood model
HRW	Human Rights Watch
HSM	Heuristic systematic processing
IFCN	International Fact-Checking Network
MR	Members' resources
MRC	Media Research Center
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO	Non-governmental organisation
NLW	Non-linear warfare
SMF	Social media fraud
STRATCOM	Strategic communications
UN	United Nations

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	II
Biography	IV
Abstract	IV
Table of abbreviations	VI
List of tables	IX
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. DEFINITIONS AND CAUSES	4
2.1 Towards a working definition of fake news	5
2.2 Reception of disinformation	7
2.2.1 Social psychology	7
2.2.2 Debates over echo chambers, filter bubbles and the backfire effect	10
2.3 Enablers of disinformation	12
2.3.1 Virality, amplification and monetisation	12
2.3.2 Non-linear warfare	15
2.3.3 News media and disinformation	17
3. CONSEQUENCES AND REMEDIES	20
3.1 Consequences of disinformation	21
3.1.1 Real-world consequences	21
3.1.2 Agenda setting and devaluation of truth	23
3.1.3 Human rights as a target of disinformation	25
3.1.4 Disruption and disinformation	28
3.2 Remedies	30
3.2.1 Media literacy	31
3.2.2 Government regulation	33
3.2.3 Platforms and algorithms	34
3.2.4 Fact-checking	34
4. METHODOLOGY	36
4.1 The role of headlines in disinformation	36
4.2 Framework	38
4.2.1 Cooperative principle	38
4.2.2 Critical discourse analysis	40
4.3 Research questions and methodology	41
4.4 Environment background and fact-checking sites	44

4.4.1 United States	44
4.4.2 Italy	45
4.4.3 Greece	47
4.4.4 Ukraine	48
4.4.5 Notes on the sources and headlines	49
5. RESULTS	51
5.1 General findings	51
5.2 US	54
5.2.1 Celebrity	55
5.2.2 Guns	56
5.2.3 Social issues	57
5.2.4 Liberal markers	58
5.2.5 Trump	60
5.2.6 Media	60
5.2.7 Curiosities	61
5.3 Italy	62
5.3.1 Politics	62
5.3.2 Social issues	65
5.3.3 Culture and media	68
5.4 Greece	69
5.4.1 International affairs	70
5.4.2 Governance	72
5.4.3 Culture and social issues	73
5.5 Ukraine	75
5.5.1 Weak Ukraine	76
5.5.2 International institutions	77
5.5.3 Human rights violations and Ukrainian military hostility	78
5.5.4 Pro-Russia	79
5.5.5 EUvsDisinfo	79
6. DISCUSSION	81
6.1 A Gricean perspective	81
6.2 Description	83
6.3 Interpretation	84
6.4 Explanation	89
7. CONCLUSION	103
BIBLIOGRAPHY	107
Appendix A: Disinformation headline charts	124
Appendix B: United States	125
Appendix C: Italy	135
Appendix D: Greece	152
Appendix E: Ukraine StopFake	164
Appendix F: Ukraine EUvsDisinfo	169

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Definitions of fake news	5
Table 2: Headline totals by country	51
Table 3: Examples of discourse manipulation	85
Table 4: Headlines showing self-reflexive media narratives	86
Table 5: Headlines showing insider perspective narratives	86
Table 6: Headlines related to imminent punishment narratives	87
Table 7: Headlines showing positive transformative action	89
Table 8: Headlines showing negative transformative action	90
Table 9: Headlines concerning the international order	91
Table 10: Headlines concerning domestic governments	92
Table 11: Headlines discrediting social movements	93
Table 12: Headlines concerning refugees and migrants	94
Table 13: Headlines purporting leftist negligence of their citizenry	95
Table 14: Headlines purporting leftist fascism	96
Table 15: Headlines purporting popularity of right-wing movements	97
Table 16: Headlines purporting cultural erosion	98
Table 17: Headlines on refugees and immigration in support of left-wing causes	99
Table 18: Headlines with inflammatory leftist content	100

1.

INTRODUCTION

Many of the narratives about fake news begin in 2016, but a more productive starting point might be 27 April 2007, when the Estonian government sought to relocate a Soviet-era monument from the Tallinn city centre.

The Bronze Soldier of Tallinn was a point of pride for the Russian population, but for the ethnic Estonians who make up 70% of the population, it was a monument to their oppression under Soviet rule. After a week of protests and riots, including false stories of the desecration of the graves of Russian soldiers, the Estonian government moved the statue in the middle of the night.¹ Hours later, the country's institutions were bombarded with distributed denial-of-service attacks that overwhelmed its institutions with cascades of cyber activity. Within a few hours, the country's ability to function had effectively been inhibited. Estonia pointed the finger at Russia, though neither they nor the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) could establish a conclusive link.²

The years since have been defined by changing applications and attitudes to new media technologies. A year after the Estonia attack, Barack Obama was elected president in the United States (US) on the back of a grassroots, largely online campaign. The Arab Spring three years later heralded social media as the new tool of democratisation.

¹ Damien McGuinness, 'How a Cyber Attack Transformed Estonia' (*BBC News*, 27 April 2017) <www.bbc.com/news/39655415> accessed 30 June 2018.

² Stephen Herzog, 'Revisiting the Estonian Cyber Attacks: Digital Threats and Multinational Responses' (2011) 4(2) *Journal of Strategic Security* 49 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.5038/1944-0472.4.2.3>> accessed 30 July 2018.

In 2018, this landscape looks very different. Major corporations harvest data to target users with manipulative advertisements. Governments use automated accounts to disrupt civil society campaigns. Elections are increasingly characterised by xenophobic rhetoric and deluges of inflammatory statements. In the wake of one such campaign, victorious far-right Italian politician Matteo Salvini said, ‘Thank God for the internet, thank God for social media, thank God for Facebook’.³

The strategic dissemination of disinformation has had sweeping effects for democracy through the invocation of fake news. As Human Rights Watch (HRW) warned, ‘the growing ubiquity of fake news poses serious challenges for the human rights movement since it blurs the lines between fact and fiction, truth and lies’.⁴ Thus far, fake news has functioned to incite crowds to murder, deny ethnic cleansing and re-frame pluralist media as an enemy of the people. Fake news, a term that is simultaneously loaded and empty, has become a contentious area for liberal democracy as partisan narratives rooted in manipulated content travel through corridors of doubt that exist in society, particularly, though not exclusively, online.

The Brexit referendum and the US election acted as a tipping point for fake news and public engagement, but the tools of information disorder have been being weaponised for years. Many of those tools, once believed to be inherently democratising, have become means of censorship and subjugation at the behest of dominant institutions. The parties that seem to benefit from fake news are those who invoke xenophobic rhetoric and display illiberal aims. They present views, which they promise to convert to policy, that are antithetical to the human rights regime.

This study seeks to illuminate and clarify the narratives around fake news and identify how this disinformation targets human rights issues. It does this through a critical discourse analysis (CDA) of demonstrably false headlines collected from fact-checking sites in the US, Italy, Greece and Ukraine during the first half of 2018. Disinformation headlines are coded by semantic features and analysed through communicative theories, mainly Grice’s cooperative principle (CP) and Fairclough’s social theory, to identify human rights vulnerabilities.

³ Cristina Maza, ‘Far-Right Leader Thanks Facebook For Strong Election Results in Italy’ (*Newsweek*, 5 March 2018) <www.newsweek.com/far-right-leader-thanks-facebook-strong-election-results-italy-831023> accessed 30 June 2018.

⁴ Iain Levine, ‘Why “Fake News” As Word of the Year Is Bad For Human Rights’ (Human Rights Watch, 11 November 2016) <www.hrw.org/news/2017/11/06/why-fake-news-word-year-bad-human-rights> accessed 30 June 2018.

Four research questions guide this analysis:

1. What human rights-relevant topics does disinformation engage?
2. If the above question yields results, what stances are taken by disinformation with regards to human rights?
3. What narratives might be formed by these stances?
4. What linguistic or rhetorical features are used in the formation of these stances?

This study is structured to highlight some of the most pertinent and affective aspects of this ecosystem. Chapter 2 establishes a working definition for fake news and details the factors that inform and enable disinformation transmission such as social psychology, online amplification, non-linear warfare and established media. Chapter 3 provides a brief history of fake news, examines its consequences and rhetorical implications, and summarises current remedies for combatting it. Chapter 4 details this report's methodology by explaining the decision to focus on headlines, highlighting relevant issues by country and providing information about the fact-checking sites used to build the corpus. Chapter 5 presents the findings in a general analysis and by country. Chapter 6 discusses the findings in line with CDA and social theories, concluding that fake news takes an active role in discrediting human rights causes and actors by devaluing rights-based rhetoric and appropriating it for illiberal means. Chapter 7 presents potential areas for research and consideration.

As this study focuses on how fake news frames and targets human rights, its scope is limited. It does not examine fake news as a human rights violation nor does it provide technical analysis of relevant technology. This research also does not seek to provide a solution to fake news, nor does it fully explore the implications of potential solutions for the human rights regime.

This study has implications for the study of disinformation and the framing of human rights issues in the future. In taking an interdisciplinary, hybrid approach to media language analysis, this study presents narratives that seek to shift public attitudes on issues that relate to liberal governance and human rights concerns. It also isolates linguistic and rhetorical features that exist in media content to reaffirm and strengthen bias.

2.

DEFINITIONS AND CAUSES

This section defines fake news and provides a working definition to be used throughout the study. It reviews relevant social psychology, finding that fake news is internalised through subtle cues and repeated exposure while widespread theories limiting public discourse are exaggerated. This chapter then examines how online economic opportunities and incentives are used by governments and non-state actors to further their aims. It also examines foreign disinformation, particularly the methods and goals of the Kremlin's campaigns, arguing that such campaigns mean to stoke tensions and instil confusion. It then discusses vulnerabilities in mainstream media that facilitate fake news.

2.1 TOWARDS A WORKING DEFINITION OF FAKE NEWS

The term fake news encompasses a frustratingly wide area, including everything from literal applications like satire to philosophical ideas of post-truth. Several taxonomies have emerged to describe the scope of what is meant by fake news. Some of the most prominent are summarised below:

Table 1: Definitions of fake news

Source	Taxonomy
Council of Europe (CoE)/First Draft ⁵	satire or parody, misleading content, imposter content, fabricated content, false connections (incongruent visuals or text), false context, manipulated content
London School of Economics (LSE) ⁶	falsehoods for political gain, falsehoods for financial gain, parody, unethical journalism, consensus-challenging news, orthodox authority-challenging news
Analysis of 34 scholarly definitions of fake news ⁷	news satire, parody, fabrication, manipulation, advertising, propaganda
Knight Foundation/Oxford Internet Institute ⁸	incendiary and outrageous headlines, hate speech, hyper-partisan content, political propaganda(uses the term junk news rather than fake news)
Facebook ⁹	information/influence operations, false news, false amplifiers, disinformation

⁵ Claire Wardle and Hossein Derakhshan, 'Information Disorder: Toward an Interdisciplinary Framework for Research and Policy and Making' (Council of Europe DGI(2017)09, 27 September 2017) 17 <<https://rm.coe.int/information-disorder-toward-an-interdisciplinary-framework-for-research-and-policy-and-making/168076277c>> accessed 4 March 2018.

⁶ Damian Tambini, 'Fake News: Public Policy Responses' (London School of Economics Media Policy Project, March 2017) 3 <<http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/73015/>> accessed 27 March 2018.

⁷ Edson C Tandoc Jr, Zheng Wei Lim and Richard Ling, 'Defining "Fake News"' (2018) 6(2) Digital Journalism 137, 141 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2017.1360143>> accessed 10 May 2018.

⁸ Samantha Bradshaw and Philip N Howard, 'Why Does Junk News Spread So Quickly Across Social Media? Algorithms, Advertising and Exposure in Public Life' (Knight Foundation, 29 January 2018) 3 <https://kf-site-production.s3.amazonaws.com/media_elements/files/000/000/142/original/Topos_KF_White-Paper_Howard_V1_ado.pdf> accessed 21 June 2018.

⁹ Jen Weedon, William Nuland and Alex Stamos, 'Information Operations and Facebook' (Facebook Newsroom, 27 April 2017) 5 <<https://fbnewsroomus.files.wordpress.com/2017/04/facebook-and-information-operations-v1.pdf>> accessed 5 March 2018.

Public considerations of fake news are equally broad. A focus group study showed that people categorise fake news as satire, poor journalism, propaganda, advertising, hoaxes and opportunistic fabrications. Fake news also functions as a ‘politicized buzzword’, and the difference between fake and real news is porous, separated ‘by degree’ rather than clear demarcation.¹⁰

Given the term’s vagueness, researchers and institutions have rejected ‘fake news’ as a description of content. In their 2018 report, the European Commission committed to the cessation of the term’s use based on First Draft’s recommendation. This position was also adopted by the UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Opinion and Expression, the Organization for Security and Co-operation (OSCE), the Organization of American States and the African Commission on Human and Peoples’ Rights in a joint declaration.¹¹

Fake news is better understood as a conflation of three concepts: disinformation, misinformation and malinformation.¹² Disinformation is content that is false and intends to harm. Examples include fabricated news stories, manipulated content such as doctored photos, or information taken out of context. Misinformation is false content that is spread because sharers think it is true. Malinformation is content that is reality-based and malicious in intent. This includes hate speech, slander, libel and privacy violations like doxing.¹³

Tandoc and others¹⁴ identify facticity and intention to deceive as indicators of fake news, and another aspect is its online status and behaviour.¹⁵ Not all fake news begins as false information, and not every piece of disinformation functions as fake news.

¹⁰ Rasmus Kleis Nielsen and Lucas Graves, “‘News You Don’t Believe’: Audience Perspectives on Fake News” (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, October 2017) 3 <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/2017-10/Nielsen%26Graves_factsheet_1710v3_FINAL_download.pdf> accessed 25 March 2018.

¹¹ UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Opinion and Expression and others, ‘Joint Declaration on Freedom of Expression and “Fake News,” Disinformation and Propaganda’ (3 March 2017) FOM.GAL/3/17 <www.osce.org/fom/302796?download=true> accessed 25 March 2018.

¹² Wardle and Derakhshan (n 5) 20.

¹³ *ibid.*

¹⁴ Tandoc, Lim and Ling (n 7) 147.

¹⁵ Liliana Bounegru and others, ‘A Field Guide to “Fake News” and Other Information Disorder’ (Public Data Lab 2017) 8 <<https://fakenews.publicdatalab.org/>> accessed 20 April 2018.

‘Material that starts its life as niche satire can be repackaged as hyper-partisan clickbait to generate advertising money and then continue life as an illustration of dangerous political misinformation.’¹⁶ Another feature is that articles are disseminated such that ‘they appear to be spread by other users, as opposed to being paid-for advertising’ with the intention to influence or manipulate.¹⁷

The focus of this study is intentionally inaccurate or manipulated content that pushes an agenda through disingenuous solicitation while assuming newsworthy status. Therefore, this study uses the term disinformation to refer to content that meets those parameters. ‘Fake news’ hereafter refers to the debate or its strategic deployment to accomplish rhetorical aims.

2.2 RECEPTION OF DISINFORMATION

2.2.1 *Social psychology*

Social psychology offers crucial insights into how audiences engage with disinformation. There are implications for how people process and share disinformation, as well as how they respond to corrections.

Information processing can best be understood through the heuristic-systematic model of information processing (HSM) and the elaboration likelihood model (ELM) of persuasion. HSM articulates cognitive processes as heuristic – users minimise effort by relying on stored knowledge – and systematic – by which users engage in analytic thinking.¹⁸ In ELM, persuasion occurs either by the central route of active consideration or the peripheral route, which relies on heuristics.¹⁹

¹⁶ Liliana Bounegru and others, ‘A Field Guide to “Fake News” and Other Information Disorder’ (Public Data Lab 2017) 8 <<https://fakenews.publicdatalab.org/>> accessed 20 April 2018.

¹⁷ Lion Gu, Vladimir Kropotov and Fyodor Yarochin, ‘The Fake News Machine: How Propagandists Abuse the Internet and Manipulate the Public’ (Trend Micro 2017) 5 <https://documents.trendmicro.com/assets/white_papers/wp-fake-news-machine-how-propagandists-abuse-the-internet.pdf> accessed 6 March 2018.

¹⁸ Gerd Bohner, Gordon B Moskowitz and Shelly Chaiken, ‘The Interplay of Heuristic and Systematic Processing of Social Information’ (1995) 6(1) *European Review of Social Psychology* 33 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/14792779443000003>> accessed 4 July 2018.

¹⁹ Richard E Petty and John T Cacioppo, ‘The Elaboration Likelihood Model of Persuasion’ (1986) 19 *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology* 123 <[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0065-2601\(08\)60214-2](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0065-2601(08)60214-2)> accessed 4 July 2018.

HSM is present in online information consumption in that audiences use heuristics of ‘expectancies within context’ and ‘social confirmation’;²⁰ however, these ‘may falsely equate credibility with popularity’.²¹ Those more willing to think analytically are less likely to believe disinformation regardless of opinions of media bias.²² Users are more likely to share news that triggers physiological arousal.²³ Audiences decide to share content based on perceived information quality, risk-taking propensity and enjoyment.²⁴ The effects of disinformation can differ based on the type of arousal: anger inspires partisan reactions while anxiety inspires an apolitical desire for accurate information.²⁵

Disinformation is resilient. A single exposure to a disinformation headline can convince readers of accuracy even when they are not aware of exposure. While this is not true for outlandish claims, a small degree of plausibility can enable internalisation.²⁶ Repetition increases perceptions of truth²⁷ which strengthen over time and assume credibility.²⁸ Disinformation likely succeeds through peripheral processing and the use of heuristics.²⁹ When people believe disinformation, it is due to ‘failures of critical thinking’, not because they use

²⁰ Miriam J Metzger, Andrew J Flanagin and Ryan B Medders, ‘Social and Heuristic Approaches to Credibility Evaluation Online’ (19 August 2010) 60 *Journal of Communication* 413, 435 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.2010.01488.x>> accessed 5 March 2018.

²¹ Miriam J Metzger and Andrew J Flanagin, ‘Credibility and Trust in Online Environments: The Use of Cognitive Heuristics’ (December 2013) 59(B) *Journal of Pragmatics* 210, 217 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2013.07.012>> accessed 5 March 2018.

²² Gordon Pennycook, Tyrone Cannon and David G Rand, ‘Prior Exposure Increases Perceived Accuracy of Fake News’ (3 May 2018) *Journal of Experimental Psychology General* <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2958246>> accessed 22 May 2018.

²³ Jonah Berger, ‘Arousal Increases Social Transmission of Information’ (20 June 2011) 22(7) *Psychological Science* 891 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797611413294>> accessed 29 March 2018.

²⁴ Mehrdad Koohikamali and Anna Sidorova, ‘Information Re-Sharing on Social Network Sites in the Age of Fake News’ (2017) 20 *Informing Science: The International Journal of an Emerging Transdiscipline* 215 <<https://doi.org/10.28945/3871>> accessed 24 October 2017.

²⁵ Brian E Weeks, ‘Emotions, Partisanship, and Misperceptions: How Anger and Anxiety Moderate the Effect of Partisan Bias on Susceptibility to Political Misinformation’ (19 June 2015) 65(4) *Journal of Communication* 699 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/jcom.12164>> accessed 25 March 2018.

²⁶ Pennycook, Cannon and Rand (n 22).

²⁷ Lisa K Fazio and others, ‘Knowledge Does Not Protect Against Illusory Truth’ (October 2015) 144(5) *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General* 993 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/xge0000098>> accessed 23 February 2018.

²⁸ Danielle C Polage, ‘Making Up History: False Memories of Fake News Stories’ (May 2012) 8(2) *Europe’s Journal of Psychology* 245 <<https://doi.org/10.5964/ejop.v8i2.456>> accessed 24 October 2017.

²⁹ Benjamin D Horne and Sibel Adali, ‘This Just In: Fake News Packs a Lot in Title, Uses Simpler, Repetitive Content in Text Body, More Similar to Satire than Real News’ (2017) *CoRR* <<https://arxiv.org/abs/1703.09398>> accessed 1 April 2018.

motivated reasoning,³⁰ and most users who share disinformation do so because they believe it.³¹

Motivated reasoning, by which people interpret results to conform to existing beliefs,³² affects corrections and is a cause of political misperceptions.³³ Studies on the effects of fact-checking in correcting misconceptions about Marine Le Pen, Donald Trump,³⁴ the Israel-Palestine conflict and the UK economy³⁵ found that even when people accept corrections they do not necessarily change opinions or voting habits. Tagging headlines as false increases perceptions of accuracy for all un-flagged headlines, including fake ones.³⁶

Misperceptions decrease when related stories correct a source of disinformation,³⁷ and causal explanations are more effective than denials, even those that use evidence.³⁸ On Twitter, corrections are more successful when they come from a personal source,³⁹ and social endorsements can be so effective that they eliminate existing bias.⁴⁰

³⁰ Gordon Pennycook and David G Rand, 'Who Falls for Fake News? The Roles of Bullshit Receptivity, Overclaiming, Familiarity, and Analytic Thinking' (23 May 2018) SSRN 31 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3023545>> accessed 20 May 2018.

³¹ Adam J Berinsky, 'Telling the Truth about Believing the Lies? Evidence for the Limited Prevalence of Expressive Survey Responding' (January 2018) 80(1) *The Journal of Politics* <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/694258>> accessed 29 March 2018.

³² Ulrike Hahn and Adam JL Harris, 'What Does It Mean to be Biased: Motivated Reasoning and Rationality' (2014) 61 *Psychology of Learning and Motivation* 41 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-800283-4.00002-2>> accessed 4 July 2018.

³³ DJ Flynn, Brendan Nyhan and Jason Reifler, 'The Nature and Origins of Misperceptions: Understanding False and Unsupported Beliefs About Politics' (26 January 2017) 38(S1) *Political Psychology* <<https://doi.org/10.1111/pops.12394>> accessed 23 February 2018.

³⁴ Alexios Mantzarlis, 'French and American voters seem to respond in a similar way to fact-checking' (Poynter.org, 5 May 2017) <<https://www.poynter.org/fact-checking/2017/french-and-american-voters-seem-to-respond-in-a-similar-way-to-fact-checking/>> accessed 15 May 2018.

³⁵ Daniel Funke, 'These two studies found that correcting misperceptions works. But it's not magic' (Poynter.org, 11 October 2017) <<https://www.poynter.org/fact-checking/2017/these-two-studies-found-that-correcting-misperceptions-works-but-it-%C2%92s-not-magic/>> accessed 15 May 2018.

³⁶ Gordon Pennycook and David G Rand, 'The Implied Truth Effect: Attaching Warnings to a Subset of Fake News Stories Increases Perceived Accuracy of Stories Without Warnings' (8 December 2017) SSRN <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3035384>> accessed 26 February 2018.

³⁷ Leticia Bode and Emily K Vraga, 'In Related News, That was Wrong: The Correction of Misinformation Through Related Stories Functionality in Social Media' (1 August 2015) 65(4) *Journal of Communication* 619 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/jcom.12166>> accessed 25 March 2018.

³⁸ Brendan Nyhan and Jason Reifler, 'When Corrections Fail: The Persistence of Political Misperceptions' (30 March 2010) 32(2) *Political Behavior* 303 <<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11109-010-9112-2>> accessed 5 March 2018.

³⁹ Drew B Margolin, Aniko Hannak and Ingmar Weber, 'Political Fact-Checking on Twitter: When Do Corrections Have an Effect?' (5 September 2017) 35(2) *Political Communication* 196 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/10584609.2017.1334018>> accessed 1 April 2018.

⁴⁰ Solomon Messing and Sean J Westwood, 'Selective Exposure in the Age of Social Media: Endorsements Trump Partisan Source Affiliation When Selecting News Online' (31 December 2012) 41(8) *Communication Research* 1042 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0093650212466406>> accessed 25 March 2018.

2.2.2 Debates over echo chambers, filter bubbles and the backfire effect

Algorithmic curating in the form of echo chambers and filter bubbles has gained attention for its perceived effect on public discourse. Echo chambers are online environments where users are only exposed to information with which they agree⁴¹ while filter bubbles refer to algorithms that personalise content based on user behaviour.⁴²

These concepts were widely blamed for 2016's election surprises, with *Wired* famously announcing, 'Your filter bubble is destroying democracy'.⁴³ Studies show the existence of echo chambers on Facebook⁴⁴ and Twitter,⁴⁵ and they have been shown to disseminate disinformation.⁴⁶ However, their effect is likely overstated.

Recent research suggests that echo chambers are 'strongest in offline social networks'.⁴⁷ Studies show that people's choices determine exposure to information more than algorithms⁴⁸ and that polarisation increased most among those 'least likely to use the Internet and social media'.⁴⁹

⁴¹ Seth Flaxman, Sarah Goel and Justin M Rao, 'Filter Bubbles, Echo Chambers, and Online News Consumption' (1 January 2016) 80(S1) *Public Opinion Quarterly* 298 <<https://doi.org/10.1093/poq/nfw006>> accessed 29 March 2018.

⁴² Eli Pariser, *The Filter Bubble: What the Internet is Hiding From You* (Penguin Press 2011).

⁴³ Mostafa M El-Bermawy, 'Your Filter Bubble is Destroying Democracy' (*Wired*, 18 November 2016) <www.wired.com/2016/11/filter-bubble-destroying-democracy/> accessed 10 March 2018.

⁴⁴ Walter Quattrociocchi and others, 'Echo Chambers on Facebook' (13 June 2016) SSRN 1 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2795110>> accessed 23 March 2018; Alessandro Bessi, 'Personality Traits and Echo Chambers on Facebook' (December 2016) 65 *Computers in Human Behavior* 319 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2016.08.016>> accessed 23 March 2018.

⁴⁵ Kiran Garimella and others, 'Political Discourse on Social Media: Echo Chambers, Gatekeepers, and the Price of Bipartisanship' WWW '18 Proceedings of the 2018 World Wide Web Conference 913 <<https://doi.org/10.1145/3178876.3186139>> accessed 22 May 2018.

⁴⁶ Bradshaw and Howard (n 8).

⁴⁷ Andrew Guess and others, 'Avoiding the Echo Chamber About Echo Chambers: Why Selective Exposure to Like Minded Political News is Less Prevalent Than You Think' (Knight Foundation, 2018) 15 <https://kf-site-production.s3.amazonaws.com/media_elements/files/000/000/133/original/Topos_KF_White-Paper_Nyhan_V1.pdf> accessed 1 April 2018.

⁴⁸ Eytan Bakshy, Solomon Messing and Lada A Adamic, 'Exposure to Ideologically Diverse News and Opinion on Facebook' (5 June 2015) 348(6239) *Science* 1130 <<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/348/6239/1130>> accessed 1 April 2018.

⁴⁹ Levi Boxell, Matthew Gentzkow and Jesse M Shapiro, 'Greater Internet Use is Not Associated With Faster Growth in Political Polarization Among US Demographic Groups' (3 October 2017) 114(40) *PNAS* 10612 <<https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1706588114>> accessed 29 March 2018.

Internet users are more likely to be exposed to diverse political attitudes,⁵⁰ and social media reduced political polarisation in some environments.⁵¹ Filter bubbles have proven difficult to measure, but their effect is also believed to be exaggerated.⁵²

Echo chambers are highest among two groups: offline social circles and the most politically vocal online. As a result, the latter group is ‘disproportionately visible’ to the public and researchers.⁵³ Garimella and others recognise this in their study’s limitations: ‘as we focused on politically-savvy users on Twitter, the reader should not infer that ... echo chamber effects are as pronounced for the general public’.⁵⁴

The reporting on these studies does not consider these limitations. Headlines like ‘The Grim Conclusions of the Largest-Ever Study of Fake News’⁵⁵ and ‘Study proves that Twitter echo chambers are very real’⁵⁶ present an exaggerated viewpoint. By ignoring the limitations of these articles, false narratives are perpetuated in much the same way as disinformation: they isolate specific, alarmist features to present a broad, pessimistic representation of reality.

The backfire effect has been discussed in a similar way. Nyhan and Reifler suggested that factual contradictions could strengthen misperceptions,⁵⁷ and headlines like ‘Why Fact-Checking Fake News Backfires’⁵⁸ and ‘How to Convince Someone When Facts Fail’⁵⁹ presented these findings as fact. However, the backfire effect has failed

⁵⁰ Flaxman, Goel and Rao (n 40).

⁵¹ Pablo Barberá, ‘How Social Media Reduces Mass Political Polarization. Evidence from Germany, Spain, and the U.S.’ (APSA Conference, San Francisco, 2015) <http://pablobarbera.com/static/barbera_polarization_APSA.pdf> accessed 29 March 2018.

⁵² Guess and others (n 46).

⁵³ *ibid.*

⁵⁴ Garimella and others (n 44) 921.

⁵⁵ Robinson Meyer, ‘The Grim Conclusions of the Largest-Ever Study of Fake News’ *The Atlantic* (Washington DC, 8 March 2018) <www.theatlantic.com/technology/archive/2018/03/largest-study-ever-fake-news-mit-twitter/555104/> accessed 10 March 2018.

⁵⁶ Chrissy Sexton, ‘Study Proves That Twitter Echo Chambers Are Very Real’ (Earth.com, 25 April 2018) <www.earth.com/news/twitter-echo-chambers-real/> accessed 10 May 2018.

⁵⁷ Nyhan and Reifler (n 37).

⁵⁸ Brandon Withrow and Mandy Withrow, ‘Why Fact-Checking Fake News Backfires’ (Thecuriousape.com, 24 November 2016) <www.thecuriousape.com/fact-checking-backfires/> accessed 10 May 2018.

⁵⁹ Michael Shermer, ‘How to Convince Someone When Facts Fail’ (*The Scientific American*, 1 January 2017) <www.scientificamerican.com/article/how-to-convince-someone-when-facts-fail/> accessed 12 May 2018.

to replicate in research environments,⁶⁰ and a later study cast doubt on the concept and its prevalence.⁶¹

Much of the public stepped into the fake news-era thinking that everyone was communicating in bubbles of self-reinforcing logic. Those that disagreed with them were incapable of being persuaded because they did not believe in facts. In this way, post-truth was thrust upon the public through the overstatement and perpetuation of theories in ways that embody the worst of populist movements: they amplify the loudest, most extreme voices to treat them as the majority while othering populations they deem to be of lesser intellectual or ethical faculty.

2.3 ENABLERS OF DISINFORMATION

2.3.1 *Virality, amplification and monetisation*

Mainstreaming a philosophy or popularising a product was once a costly and time-consuming process. Technology has created new methods and opportunities to reach publics, and purveyors of disinformation have seized onto these.

Virality can be thought of in terms of information cascades,⁶² and these are easily manipulatable via strategic framings, hashtag flooding and connected networks of users operating multiple accounts to spread a message.⁶³ An example from 2015 illustrates how this works. On the website 8chan, a user uploaded a doctored anti-refugee video, which the site's users referred to as propaganda.

⁶⁰ Kathryn Haglin, 'The Limitations of the Backfire Effect' (3 July 2017) 4(3) *Research and Politics* 1 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/2053168017716547>> accessed 23 May 2018.

⁶¹ Thomas Wood and Ethan Porter, 'The Elusive Backfire Effect: Mass Attitudes, Steadfast Factual Adherence' (January 2016) SSRN <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2819073>> accessed 23 May 2018.

⁶² Sharad Goel and others, 'The Structural Virality of Online Diffusion' (22 July 2015) 62(1) *Management Science* 180 <<https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.2015.2158>> accessed 29 March 2018.

⁶³ Alice Marwick and Rebecca Lewis, 'Media Manipulation and Disinformation Online' (*Data & Society*, 15 May 2015) 33 <https://datasociety.net/pubs/oh/DataAndSociety_MediaManipulationAndDisinformationOnline.pdf> accessed 6 March 2018; Eni Mustafaraj and P Takis Metaxas, 'The Fake News Spreading Plague: Was it Preventable?' (*ACM Web Science Troy*, June 2017) <<https://repository.wellesley.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1149&context=scholarship>> accessed 1 April 2018.

They coordinated a hashtag and strategies to share other media showing ‘migrants being animals or violent heathen’ in order to prove that they ‘aren’t a bunch of bot accounts’. Users sent it to as many people as possible: right wing personalities, social justice bloggers and YouTube personalities. One user advised, ‘frame it in a way that they will talk about it’.⁶⁴

Research into political memes and communities like these found a ‘surprisingly complex’ ecosystem that largely involved two sites: 4chan’s ‘Politically Incorrect’ board and The_Donald subreddit.⁶⁵ However, as Goel and others show, virality for online content is low. It depends on media attention for amplification.⁶⁶

Social media fraud (SMF) enables and exacerbates this process through astroturfing, where bots emulate human-led grassroots campaigning,⁶⁷ and sockpuppetry, in which users operate false accounts.⁶⁸ Astroturfing is heavily present in Russian-language Twitter accounts referencing NATO operations in Eastern Europe,⁶⁹ as well as nationalist, right-wing accounts in Poland and Ukraine.⁷⁰

Astroturfing has become a widespread tool for governments, especially during political campaigns. It was used by South Korea’s secret service in the 2012 election⁷¹ and in Brazil’s 2014 election and ensuing impeachment process.⁷² A small number of bots generated a large

⁶⁴ Dan Evon, ‘With Gates Wide Open’ (Snopes.com, 17 November 2015) <www.snopes.com/news/2015/11/17/disturbing-muslim-refugee-video/> accessed 16 March 2018.

⁶⁵ Savvas Zannettou and others, ‘On the Origins of Memes by Means of Fringe Web Communities’ (31 May 2018) CoRR 16 <<https://arxiv.org/abs/1805.12512>> accessed 19 June 2018.

⁶⁶ Goel and others (n 61) 191.

⁶⁷ Philip N Howard, *New Media Campaigns and the Managed Citizen* (Cambridge UP 2006) 98.

⁶⁸ Srijan Kumar and Neil Shah, ‘False Information on Web and Social Media: A Survey’ (23 April 2018) CoRR 1 <<https://arxiv.org/abs/1804.08559>> accessed 4 July 2018.

⁶⁹ Rolf Fredheim, ‘Robotrolling’ (NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence, January 2017) <www.stratcomcoe.org/robotrolling-20171> accessed 5 March 2018.

⁷⁰ Sergey Sanovich, ‘Computational Propaganda in Russia: The Origins of Digital Misinformation’ (Project on Computational Propaganda Working Paper No 2017/3, March 2017) 15 <<http://comprop.oii.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/sites/89/2017/06/Comprop-Russia.pdf>> accessed 1 April 2018.

⁷¹ JungHwan Yang and others, ‘How to Manipulate Social Media: Analyzing Political Astroturfing Using Ground Truth Data from South Korea’ (AAAI Conference on Web and Social Media, Montreal, May 2017) <<https://aaai.org/ocs/index.php/ICWSM/ICWSM17/paper/download/15638/14870>> accessed 1 April 2018.

⁷² Samuel C Woolley and Philip N Howard, ‘Computational Propaganda Worldwide: Executive Summary’ (Project on Computational Propaganda Working Paper No 2017 11, November 2017) 564 <<http://comprop.oii.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/sites/89/2017/06/Casestudies-ExecutiveSummary.pdf>> accessed 5 March 2018.

amount of pro-leave content on Twitter during the Brexit campaign,⁷³ and bots were used by the Trump campaign ‘to rant, confuse people on facts, or simply muddy discussions’.⁷⁴

As a tool of disinformation, sockpuppetry refers to users operating false accounts to promote an agenda while acting as normal users. Russia’s Internet Research Agency⁷⁵ and China’s TenCent bloggers⁷⁶ are famous examples that ‘weave propaganda seamlessly into what appeared to be the nonpolitical musings of an everyday person’.⁷⁷ They can be mobilised en masse to direct harassment at an individual or drown out dissident online voices. Like astroturfing, sockpuppets have become a de facto tool of government (this is explored in section 2.3.2). As Zoltán Kovács, an advisor to Hungary’s leadership, said in response to questions about Hungary’s use of paid trolls, ‘All parties are using social media according to the rules of the social media’.⁷⁸

Astroturfing and sockpuppetry are the result of an economic market that thrives on its ability to create facades of popularity that can be leveraged into influence. Buying likes and followers for content promotion has become common practice, but SMF can also disrupt discourse. As of 2017, the Russian SMF industry can manipulate online petitions for \$1,065 for 10,000 signatures or remove content for \$50. A bundle of 100 dislikes for a YouTube video costs around \$1.70. Instigating a street protest in the US costs about \$200,000.

⁷³ Yuriy Gorodnichenko, Tho Pham and Oleksandr Talavera, ‘Social media, sentiment and public opinions: Evidence from #Brexit and #USElection’ (NBER Working Paper No w24631, May 2018) 5 <https://eml.berkeley.edu/~ygorodni/Brexit_Election.pdf> accessed 1 April 2018.

⁷⁴ John Markoff, ‘Automated Pro-Trump Bots Overwhelmed Pro-Clinton Messages, Researchers Say’ *The New York Times* (New York City, 17 November 2016) <www.nytimes.com/2016/11/18/technology/automated-pro-trump-bots-overwhelmed-pro-clinton-messages-researchers-say.html?_r=0> accessed 20 April 2018.

⁷⁵ Natasha Lomas, ‘Study: Russia-linked fake Twitter accounts sought to spread terrorist-related social division in the UK’ (*TechCrunch*, 18 December 2017) <<https://techcrunch.com/2017/12/18/study-russia-linked-fake-twitter-accounts-sought-to-spread-terrorist-related-social-division-in-the-uk/>> accessed 1 April 2018.

⁷⁶ Gary King, Jennifer Pan and Margaret E Roberts, ‘How the Chinese Government Fabricates Social Media Posts for Strategic Distraction, Not Engaged Argument’ (27 July 2017) 111(3) *American Political Science Review* 484 <<https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003055417000144>> accessed 5 March 2018.

⁷⁷ Adrian Chen, ‘The Agency’ *The New York Times Magazine* (New York City, 2 June 2015) <www.nytimes.com/2015/06/07/magazine/the-agency.html> accessed 10 April 2018.

⁷⁸ J Lester Feder and Rebeka Kulcsar, ‘Meet The Mystery Man Who Is The Power Behind The Throne In Hungary’ (*BuzzFeed News*, 4 April 2018) <www.buzzfeed.com/lesterfeder/hungarys-steve-bannon> accessed 16 April 2018.

In Mexico, where drug cartels use bots for intimidation, discrediting a journalist costs \$55,000.⁷⁹ Social media was once thought of as inherently democratic, but SMF makes this untrue. As Treré writes, ‘Activists have few digital weapons at their disposal, above all because they cannot count on huge economic resources’.⁸⁰

Online advertising models also enable disinformation through programmatic and targeted advertising. Programmatic advertising allows companies to place ads based on clicks or views.⁸¹ The fake news industry of North Macedonia was so profitable because it could drive traffic to sites using programmatic advertising.⁸² Targeted advertising uses cookies to harvest data and develop psychological profiles. In the US election, this information was instrumental in utilising so-called dark posts that are only visible to specific users.⁸³ In both instances, online platforms like Google and Facebook profit directly by selling digital ad space, and they are also instrumental in directing disinformation towards users.

2.3.2 *Non-linear warfare*

Non-linear warfare (NLW) extends disinformation to international relations. As with the rest of the fake news debate, it is a product of blurred borders and competing narratives. Kremlin disinformation campaigns have become the de facto face of NLW despite Kremlin denials of meddling, which it dismisses as Russophobia.

A consensus has emerged for NLW as ‘the application of collective subversive measures on a state(s) ... targeting its government, population, and vital social functions’ to erode its social, political and military institutions.⁸⁴ This includes SMF and encompasses ‘everything from the creation of front organisations ... to the use of “agents of influence” to so called “patriotic hacktivism”’.⁸⁵

⁷⁹ Gu, Kropotov and Yarochkin (n 17) 30, 59-60.

⁸⁰ Emiliano Treré, ‘The Dark Side of Digital Politics: Understanding the Algorithmic Manufacturing of Consent and the Hindering of Online Dissidence’ (24 January 2016) 47(1) IDS Bulletin 127, 135 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.19088/1968-2016.111>> accessed 29 March 2018.

⁸¹ Tambini (n 6) 10.

⁸² Samantha Subramanian, ‘Inside the Macedonian Fake-News Complex’ (*Wired*, 15 February 2017) <www.wired.com/2017/02/veles-macedonia-fake-news/> accessed 12 December 2017.

⁸³ Bradshaw and Howard (n 8) 13.

⁸⁴ Tad A Schnauer II, ‘Redefining Hybrid Warfare: Russia’s Nonlinear War against the West’ (2017) 10(1) *Journal of Strategic Security* 17, 23-24 <<http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1538&context=jss>> accessed 9 February 2018.

⁸⁵ Thomas Elkjer Nissen, ‘Social Media’s Role in “Hybrid Strategies”’ (NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence, 20 September 2016) 1 <www.stratcomcoe.org/social-medias-role-hybrid-strategies-author-thomas-elkjer-nissen> accessed 20 February 2018.

This behaviour is not exclusive to Russia. China uses similar techniques for its campaign in the South China Sea, and terrorist group ISIS recruited with these methods.⁸⁶ The US used sockpuppet accounts in Operation Earnest Voice⁸⁷ as have intelligence agencies in Britain.⁸⁸ The Kremlin's narrative is 'that Russia is the victim of hybrid warfare waged against it by the West'⁸⁹ which is 'using everything from CNN to human rights NGOs [non-governmental organisations] to wage covert war'.⁹⁰ These claims are also part of the strategy.

During the 2016 US election, over half of the ads paid for by Russia referenced race.⁹¹ Of the pro-leave bots active during the Brexit campaign, 156,252 have been connected to Russia, sharing 'almost 45,000 messages ... in the 48 hours around the vote'.⁹² Currently, Kremlin disinformation plays to the weaknesses of different regions: 'in Ukraine it can create complete havoc; in the Baltic states it can destabilize; in Eastern Europe, co-opt power; in Western Europe, divide and rule; in the US, distract; in the Middle East and South America, fan flames'.⁹³

These efforts typically appear across several mediums through multiple sources delivering the same or similar messages without concern for objective reality or consistency.⁹⁴ They incorporate poor journalism

⁸⁶ Peter Pomerantsev, 'Brave New War' *The Atlantic* (Washington DC, 29 December 2015) <www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2015/12/war-2015-china-russia-isis/422085/> accessed 25 February 2018.

⁸⁷ Nick Fielding and Ian Cobain, 'Revealed: US Spy Operation That Manipulates Social Media' *The Guardian* (London, 17 March 2011) <www.theguardian.com/technology/2011/mar/17/us-spy-operation-social-networks> accessed 20 April 2018.

⁸⁸ Glenn Greenwald, 'How Covert Agents Infiltrate the Internet to Manipulate, Deceive, and Destroy Reputations' (*The Intercept*, 24 February 2014) <<https://theintercept.com/2014/02/24/jtrig-manipulation/>> accessed 20 April 2018.

⁸⁹ Flemming Splidsboel Hansen, 'Russian Hybrid Warfare' (DIIS, 2017) 10 <http://pure.diiis.dk/ws/files/950041/DIIS_RP_2017_6_web.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

⁹⁰ Peter Pomerantsev and Michael Weiss, 'The Menace of Unreality: How the Kremlin Weaponizes Information, Culture and Money' (*The Interpreter*, Institute of Modern Russia, 2014) 12-13 <www.interpretermag.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/The_Menace_of_Unreality_Final.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

⁹¹ Nick Penzenstadler, Brad Heert and Jessica Guynn, 'We Read Every One of the 3,517 Facebook Ads Bought By Russians. Here's What We Found' *USA Today* (McLean, 11 May 2018) <www.usatoday.com/story/news/2018/05/11/what-we-found-facebook-ads-russians-accused-election-meddling/602319002/> accessed 12 May 2018.

⁹² Natasha Lomas, 'Study: Russian Twitter Bots Sent 45k Brexit Tweets Close to Vote' (*TechCrunch*, 15 November 2017) <<https://techcrunch.com/2017/11/15/study-russian-twitter-bots-sent-45k-brexit-tweets-close-to-vote/>> accessed 12 May 2018.

⁹³ Pomerantsev and Weiss (n 89) 24.

⁹⁴ Christopher Paul and Miriam Matthews, 'The Russian "Firehose of Falsehood" Propaganda Model' (Rand Corporation, PE-198-OSD, 2016) 2 <www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE100/PE198/RAND_PE198.pdf> accessed 5 March 2018.

practices into media that appears official,⁹⁵ and this allows Kremlin-friendly outlets to be the first to cover events and present narratives that endure through repetition across multiple platforms.⁹⁶ It utilises ‘the Western media problem of favouring balance over objectivity’ which results in established media ‘taking into account the entirely false, but ubiquitous, Russian alternate narrative’.⁹⁷

The aim is to devalue the truth and induce confusion and fear⁹⁸ so as to ‘kill the possibility of debate and a reality-based politics’.⁹⁹ Internationally, Kremlin NLW feeds off societal divisions by supporting right-wing groups and exploiting the refugee crisis with the goal of dividing NATO and the EU.¹⁰⁰

Fact-checking cannot keep up with the deluge of weaponised information cascades. These campaigns seek to overwhelm and drown out counter-narratives as ‘countering every single piece of Russian disinformation is not only labour-intensive out of all proportion to the result, but also futile’.¹⁰¹

2.3.3 News media and disinformation

The media ecosystems of North America and Europe differ in pluralism and reliance on partisan relations.¹⁰² However, disinformation campaigns in both regions exploit long-held scepticism about the media while economic vulnerabilities in the industry make audiences susceptible to misleading content.

Advertising’s shift online has led to the closure of local news media and the consolidation of ownership of the remaining publications, creating ‘deserts’ of local news that drive users online,¹⁰³ often to sites that use

⁹⁵ Nissen (n 84) 2.

⁹⁶ Paul and Matthews (n 93) 3.

⁹⁷ Keir Giles, ‘Russia’s “New” Tools for Confronting the West Continuity and Innovation in Moscow’s Exercise of Power’ (Chatham House, March 2016) 36 <www.chathamhouse.org/sites/default/files/publications/2016-03-russia-new-tools-giles.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

⁹⁸ Schnauffer (n 83) 27.

⁹⁹ Pomerantsev and Weiss (n 89) 16.

¹⁰⁰ Schnauffer (n 83) 27.

¹⁰¹ Giles (n 96) 38.

¹⁰² Dan Mihalache, ‘The Crisis of European Western Civilisation and the Risk of a New “Moral Wandering”’ (March 2014) VI(1) *Cogito Multidisciplinary Research Journal* 60 <<http://cogito.ucdc.ro/cogito-en-martie.pdf>> accessed 4 December 2017.

¹⁰³ Wardle and Derakhshan (n 5) 51.

outrage to grab attention and spur traffic. Online advertising models also price balanced reporting out of the media ecosystem. In the US, for example, balanced coverage was profitable because advertisers ‘wanted to sell goods to Democrats and Republicans alike’.¹⁰⁴ As online engagement becomes increasingly driven by tribalised identities, the economic incentive for balance disappears. More so, offline news is increasingly being bought up by large corporations, which has troubling implications for media pluralism.

Traditional media also struggles to maintain standards in an online market that lacks economic incentives to fact-check. The economic model of the internet, which values being first and posting constantly, goes against the needs for accuracy and verification that define good journalism.¹⁰⁵ In an industry that relies on ad revenue, where ad revenue is measured in clicks, waiting to publish is a death knell. As seen in the previous section, disinformation thrives on this.

However, one of the largest enablers of disinformation is trust. Low trust in the media predates fake news concerns. In their 2017 report, Reuters found that worldwide ‘deep-rooted political polarisation and perceived mainstream media bias’ are as much to blame as social media or the fake news crisis.¹⁰⁶ In the markets surveyed in 2018, 44% of the population expressed trust in the media.¹⁰⁷

In the US, trust in the media is significantly higher among Democrats than Republicans,¹⁰⁸ and liberals are more likely ‘to participate in cross-ideological dissemination of political and nonpolitical information’ on Twitter.¹⁰⁹

¹⁰⁴ Eric Levitz, ‘“Baby Breitbarts” Might Be the Future of Local Newspapers’ (*Intelligencer*, 1 May 2018) <<http://nymag.com/intelligencer/2018/05/baby-breitbart-might-be-the-future-of-local-newspapers.html?gclid=bottom&gclid=bottom>> accessed 1 May 2018.

¹⁰⁵ Craig Silverman, ‘Lies, Damn Lies and Viral Content’ (Tow Center for Digital Journalism, 2015) <<https://doi.org/10.7916/D8Q81RHH>> accessed 4 March 2018.

¹⁰⁶ Nic Newman and others, ‘Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2017’ (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2017) 10 <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/Digital%20News%20Report%202017%20web_0.pdf> accessed 5 March 2018.

¹⁰⁷ Nic Newman and others, ‘Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2018’ (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2018) 9 <<http://media.digitalnewsreport.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/digital-news-report-2018.pdf?x89475>> accessed 8 July 2018.

¹⁰⁸ Michael Barthel and Amy Mitchell, ‘Americans’ Attitudes About the News Media Deeply Divided Along Partisan Lines’ (Pew Research Center, 10 May 2017) <www.journalism.org/2017/05/10/americans-attitudes-about-the-news-media-deeply-divided-along-partisan-lines/> accessed 20 April 2018.

¹⁰⁹ Pablo Barberá and others, ‘Tweeting From Left to Right: Is Online Political Communication More Than an Echo Chamber?’ (21 August 2015) 26(10) *Psychological Science* 1, 10 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797615594620>> accessed 29 March 2018.

In Western Europe, populist opinions are linked with lower trust in and value for the media, especially among southern Europeans and British adults. Populists are more likely to get their news on social media and less likely to check the source of that news.¹¹⁰

Disinformation also spreads so effectively due to porous borders between news and opinion, information and analysis, objectivity and bias. The idea of post-truth suggests that nothing can be trusted and that everything is biased; thus, if bias is unavoidable, there is no sense in mitigating it or aspiring to objectivity. Much has been written in concern about the effect of these ideas on democracy, but the most telling aspect of this discourse is that it exists in the first place and is being operationalised.

However, these findings are subject to resistance. Commenting on the Oxford study that showed that disinformation during the 2016 presidential election was more popular among right-wing voters, *Fox News* declared, 'Oxford study saying Trump supporters share more fake news is fake news'.¹¹¹

¹¹⁰ Amy Mitchell and others, 'In Western Europe, Public Attitudes Toward News Media More Divided by Populist Views Than Left-Right Ideology' (Pew Research Center, 14 May 2018) <http://assets.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/13/2018/05/27124059/PJ_2018.05.14_Western-Europe_FINAL.pdf> accessed 20 May 2018.

¹¹¹ Elizabeth Harrington, 'Oxford Study Saying Trump Supporters Share More Fake News is Fake News' (*Fox News*, 9 February 2018) <www.foxnews.com/politics/2018/02/09/oxford-study-saying-trump-supporters-share-more-fake-news-is-fake-news.html> accessed 9 February 2018.

3.

CONSEQUENCES AND REMEDIES

The first part of this section explores the physical, rhetorical and sociological effects of disinformation. It begins with a brief history of notable disinformation and summarises how disinformation contributes to widespread human rights violations in contemporary society. Next, it argues that fake news as a concept functions to reshape societal values and discourse through an exploration of relevant theories. This section then details how disinformation engages the rhetoric of human rights and argues that identity politics and the co-opting of rights-based language exasperate and muddy online economies of attention. This is followed by a brief discussion of the technological ethos of disruption and an exploration of how the reckless fetishisation of creative destruction without regard for the consequences helped pave the way for the fake news crisis.

The second half of this section summarises current remedies including education and the responses of government, technology companies and journalists. It suggests that there is no overarching solution for disinformation. Laws targeting fake news will be illiberal and ineffective. More potent solutions include regulating SMF and making the resources to fact-check new technologies widely available.

3.1 CONSEQUENCES OF DISINFORMATION

3.1.1 *Real-world consequences*

Disinformation has a storied history. Notable precursors include Byzantine alternate histories, ribald sonnets influencing 16th century papal elections,¹¹² 17th century gossip that led to the closure of English coffeehouses ‘to restrain the spreading of false news’,¹¹³ and European newsbooks featuring monsters and medical anomalies.¹¹⁴ Partisan, inaccurate ‘songs and poems no longer than today’s tweets’ may have contributed to political reformation in France and the execution of Marie Antoinette.¹¹⁵ By the 1830s, US newspapers were publishing hoaxes about life on the moon¹¹⁶ and using yellow journalism to justify the Spanish-American War.¹¹⁷

In recent history strategic disinformation has affected democracy and human rights. The publishing of a forged directive from Moscow to British communists cost the Labour party the election of 1924.¹¹⁸ In the First World War, fabricated stories of Germany committing atrocities made the public hesitant to trust reports of the Holocaust during the Second World War.¹¹⁹ After the assassination of John F Kennedy, Russian propaganda contributed to conspiracy theories, one of which endured as the plot of the film *JFK*.¹²⁰

¹¹² Robert Darnton, ‘The True History of Fake News’ *The New York Review of Books* (New York City, 13 February 2017) <www.nybooks.com/daily/2017/02/13/the-true-history-of-fake-news/> accessed 10 March 2018.

¹¹³ Kenan Malik, ‘Fake News Has a Long History. Beware the State Being Keeper of “the Truth”’ *The Guardian* (London, 11 February 2018) <www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/feb/11/fake-news-long-history-beware-state-involvement> accessed 10 March 2018.

¹¹⁴ Tom Standage, ‘The True History of Fake News’ *The Economist 1843* (London, 26 April 2017) <www.1843magazine.com/technology/rewind/the-true-history-of-fake-news> accessed 10 March 2018.

¹¹⁵ Darnton (n 111).

¹¹⁶ David Uberti, ‘The Real History of Fake News’ (*Columbia Journalism Review*, 15 December 2016) <www.cjr.org/special_report/fake_news_history.php> accessed 10 March 2018.

¹¹⁷ Alexandra Samuel, ‘To Fix Fake News, Look To Yellow Journalism’ (*JSTOR Daily*, 29 November 2016) <<https://daily.jstor.org/to-fix-fake-news-look-to-yellow-journalism/>> accessed 15 March 2018.

¹¹⁸ Malik (n 112).

¹¹⁹ Steve Huckle and Martin White, ‘Fake News: A Technological Approach to Proving the Origins of Content, Using Blockchains’ (1 December 2017) 5(4) *Big Data* <<https://doi.org/10.1089/big.2017.0071>> accessed 29 March 2018.

¹²⁰ Peter Pomerantsev and Michael Weiss, ‘The Menace of Unreality: How the Kremlin Weaponizes Information, Culture and Money’ (The Interpreter, Institute of Modern Russia, 2014) 9 <www.interpretermag.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/The_Menace_of_Unreality_Final.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

The 2003 invasion of Iraq was justified by fabricated intelligence reported as true in the press, and those events were a boon to literal fake news as programmes like *The Daily Show* assumed relevance, credibility and popularity.

Social media has facilitated violence and human rights violations, especially in countries where social media platforms dominate online activity. In Myanmar, where Facebook is synonymous with the internet and is used to spread anti-Muslim rhetoric, atrocities against the Rohingya have been dismissed as ‘fake news’.¹²¹ Mob violence in Sri Lanka against Muslims was instigated by rumours spread by Facebook¹²² so often that the country temporarily banned the platform. WhatsApp has been instrumental in vigilante lynchings in India,¹²³ and online disinformation stoked election-time violence in Kenya.¹²⁴

Social media has also been used to inhibit pluralist functions. In Cambodia, where Facebook tested an algorithm that limited the audience for independent media sources,¹²⁵ the platform was so instrumental in stifling opposition that human rights defenders filed petitions against it.¹²⁶ In Mexico, the government has used sockpuppet accounts to undermine civil society campaigns and silence opposition.¹²⁷

Platforms’ bids to be as global as possible may also make them complicit in rights violations, as their presence in a country requires

¹²¹ Muneza Naqvi, ‘Burma’s Aung San Suu Kyi Says “Fake News” Fuelling Rohingya Crisis’ *Independent* (London, 6 September 2017) <www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/burma-rohingya-latest-aung-san-suu-kyi-fake-news-fuelling-crisis-minority-muslims-violence-exodus-a7931886.html> accessed 10 May 2018.

¹²² Zaheena Rasheed, ‘In Sri Lanka, Hate Speech and Impunity Fuel Anti-Muslim Violence’ *Al Jazeera* (Doha, 13 March 2018) <www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/03/sri-lanka-hate-speech-impunity-fuel-anti-muslim-violence-180310020253272.html> accessed 10 May 2018.

¹²³ David Lumb, ‘Fake News on WhatsApp Is Inciting Lynchings in India’ (*Engadget*, 2 July 2018) <www.engadget.com/2018/07/02/india-fake-news-whatsapp-groups/> accessed 2 July 2018.

¹²⁴ Nick Miriello, David Gilbert and Julia Steers, ‘Kenans Face a Fake News Epidemic’ (*Vice*, 22 March 2018) <https://news.vice.com/en_us/article/43bdpm/kenans-face-a-fake-news-epidemic-they-want-to-know-just-how-much-cambridge-analytica-and-facebook-are-to-blame> accessed 2 July 2018.

¹²⁵ Ben Paviour, ‘What a Facebook Experiment Did to News in Cambodia’ (*BBC News*, 31 October 2017) <www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-41801071> accessed 10 May 2018.

¹²⁶ Megha Rajagopalan and Hayes Brown, ‘Facebook Is Being Taken to Court Over Human Rights Abuses in Cambodia’ (*BuzzFeed News*, 8 February 2018) <www.buzzfeednews.com/article/meghara/an-exiled-politician-is-taking-facebook-to-court-over-human> accessed 10 May 2018.

¹²⁷ Emiliano Treré, ‘The Dark Side of Digital Politics: Understanding the Algorithmic Manufacturing of Consent and the Hindering of Online Dissidence’ (24 January 2016) 47(1) *IDS Bulletin* 135 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.19088/1968-2016.111>> accessed 29 March 2018.

cooperation with governments. In nations that limit civil liberties, this means that platforms remove content critical of the government at their behest.¹²⁸ This has also resulted in the removal of evidence of human rights abuses.¹²⁹

3.1.2 *Agenda setting and devaluation of truth*

Fake news has become a way of discrediting the press and such denunciations have been made by strongmen leaders, former Nobel Peace Prize winners and the US president. This has normalised behaviour once thought to be antithetical to liberal democracies.¹³⁰ As with Kremlin disinformation, the concept of fake news devalues language and disrupts discourse, and its use creates confusion and mainstreams once unacceptable ideas.

In this way fake news evokes theories of hypernormalisation and shock politics. Yurchak used hypernormalisation to describe the language of latter-day Soviet Russia, positing that ‘fixed and cumbersome forms of language that were often neither interpreted nor easily interpretable’ made it that ‘as long as one reproduced the precise forms of language, the correctness of the meanings conveyed was guaranteed’.¹³¹ Many, most famously documentarian Adam Curtis, have applied hypernormalisation to western democracies in the post-Cold War era.¹³² Klein’s theories of shock economics and politics argue that sudden disruptions in society are exploited to enact sweeping change. She ascribes the election of Trump as one such shock, with privatisation and de-regulation constituting sweeping change.¹³³

¹²⁸ Hans Block and Moritz Riesebeck, *The Cleaners* [motion picture] (Gebrueder Beetz Filmproduktion, 2018).

¹²⁹ Olivia Solon, ‘Civil Rights Groups: Facebook Should Protect, Not Censor, Human Rights Issues’ *The Guardian* (London, 31 October 2016) <www.theguardian.com/technology/2016/oct/31/facebook-human-rights-censorship-civil-rights-mark-zuckerberg-actu> accessed 5 April 2018.

¹³⁰ John Kruzel, ‘Donald Trump’s “Fake News” Epithet Emboldens Despots Around the World’ *PolitiFact*, 17 January 2018 <www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/jan/22/jeff-flake/donald-trumps-fake-news-epithet-emboldens-despots-/> accessed 5 April 2018.

¹³¹ Alexei Yurchak, *Everything Was Forever, Until It Was No More: The Last Soviet Generation* (Princeton UP 2006) 50-51.

¹³² Adam Curtis, *Hypernormalisation* [motion picture] (BBC, 2016).

¹³³ Naomi Klein, *No Is Not Enough: Resisting the New Shock Politics and Winning the World We Need* (Alfred A Knopf 2017).

Both theories offer means to understand how publics can be exhausted into submission and then cajoled into accepting conditions antithetical to their values and against their interests. Disinformation, with its aim and ability to instil confusion and devalue standards of discourse, is often a symptom of the environments described by Yurchak and Klein. It can mainstream ideas that were once unacceptable, a process conceptualised as the Overton Window.¹³⁴

False and partisan content has been able to set news agendas for international relations, the economy and religion.¹³⁵ Hartzell argues that the alt-right as an entity served to connect white supremacy to public discourse.¹³⁶ The underpinnings of new racism utilise colour-blindness to make judgements based on culture.¹³⁷ Analysis of news media has found that these sentiments are heavily present in news discourse, presenting immigrants as breaking cultural norms while in-groups are represented either as victims or responding to cultural encroachment by out-groups.¹³⁸ In this sense, Overton's Window has been opened for extremist attitudes rooted in xenophobia and othering.

This extremism is muddled by the sometimes-ironic stance used to present it. This is Poe's Law, which argues that it is impossible to be sure of anyone's true intentions on the internet.¹³⁹ When someone posts something that is racist or sexist, they can claim that it is an extreme form of satire and those offended misunderstand them and oppose free speech. Consequently, notions that would generally be considered socially unacceptable are allowed to be debated without ever declaring a position concerning their sincerity.

¹³⁴ Alice Marwick and Rebecca Lewis, 'Media Manipulation and Disinformation Online' (Data & Society, 15 May 2015) 11 <https://datasociety.net/pubs/oh/DataAndSociety_MediaManipulationAndDisinformationOnline.pdf> accessed 6 March 2018.

¹³⁵ Chris J Vargo, Lei Guo and Michelle A Amazeen, 'The Agenda-Setting Power of Fake News: A Big Data Analysis of the Online Media Landscape from 2014 to 2016' (15 June 2017) 20(5) *New Media & Society* 2028 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/1461444817712086>> accessed 4 April 2018.

¹³⁶ Stephanie L Hartzell, 'Alt-White: Conceptualizing the "Alt-Right" as a Rhetorical Bridge between White Nationalism and Mainstream Public Discourse' (2018) 8(1/2) *Journal of Contemporary Rhetoric* 6 <http://contemporaryrhetoric.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/Hartzell8_1_2_2.pdf> accessed 23 June 2018.

¹³⁷ Paul Finkelman, 'The Rise of the New Racism' (1996) 15(1) *Yale Law & Policy Review* <<https://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/ylpr/vol15/iss1/6/>> accessed 4 July 2018.

¹³⁸ Teun A van Dijk, 'New(s) Racism: A Discourse Analytical Approach' in Simon Cottle (ed), *Ethnic Minorities and the Media* (Open UP 2000) 33-49.

¹³⁹ Emma Grey Ellis, 'Can't Take a Joke? That's Just Poe's Law, 2017's Most Important Internet Phenomenon' (*Wired*, 5 June 2017) <www.wired.com/2017/06/poes-law-troll-cultures-central-rule/> accessed 6 March 2018.

Theories of attention suggest that mainstreaming efforts should be combatted. In the US, strategic silence, by which media does not report on hate group activity, has been used to limit their amplification, and leaders of hate groups have acknowledged that media coverage is instrumental to broadcast their message.¹⁴⁰ Neuman's spiral of silence suggests that the mainstreaming of illiberal rhetoric is meant to present these values as more popular than they statistically are.¹⁴¹ Given the implications that new media has for both theories, there is a need to examine and reconsider current practices concerning containment and radicalisation.

3.1.3 Human rights as a target of disinformation

Disinformation facilitates human rights violations, but it also affects the human rights regime on an existential level. The regime is particularly vulnerable to disinformation for rhetorical reasons, chief among them the exclusionary aggression of identity politics and the co-opting of rights-based rhetoric for extremist causes. Human rights causes are an active part of the attention economy and what Bakir and McStay call the emotion economy,¹⁴² with various causes using the reach of social media to raise awareness and funding.

In his history of the international human rights movement, Neier describes the regime as 'a worldwide secular movement',¹⁴³ and Nathan, in his analysis of Neier, goes further: 'a new world ideology, even a kind of secular religion'.¹⁴⁴ While it is not a binding global authority, the regime has enjoyed an ascendancy in that it is incorporated into public discourse and policy-making. This alone is enough to make it a target of disinformation, which often seeks to disrupt or embarrass existing power structures.

¹⁴⁰ Joan Donovan and Danah Boyd, 'The Case for Quarantining Extremist Ideas' *The Guardian* (London, 1 June 2018) <www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/jun/01/extremist-ideas-media-coverage-kkk> accessed 1 June 2018.

¹⁴¹ Lion Gu, Vladimir Kropotov and Fyodor Yarochin, 'The Fake News Machine: How Propagandists Abuse the Internet and Manipulate the Public' (Trend Micro 2017) 62 <https://documents.trendmicro.com/assets/white_papers/wp-fake-news-machine-how-propagandists-abuse-the-internet.pdf> accessed 6 March 2018.

¹⁴² Vian Bakir and Andrew McStay, 'Fake News and the Economy of Emotions' (20 July 2017) 6(2) *Digital Journalism* 154-175 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2017.1345645>> accessed 1 April 2018.

¹⁴³ Aryeh Neier, *The International Human Rights Movement* (Princeton UP 2012) 257.

¹⁴⁴ Andrew J Nathan, 'How Human Rights Became Our Ideology' *The New Republic* (New York City, 16 November 2012) <<https://newrepublic.com/article/110197/how-human-rights-became-our-ideology>> accessed 28 June 2018.

Modern tensions and shifts in identity play a large part in the application of disinformation to human rights. Leftist identity politics have abandoned the colour-blind, collective rhetoric of traditional liberalism in favour of exclusionary in-groups that seek to raise awareness of systematic inequalities.¹⁴⁵ These groups use competitive memory strategies that have long-defined awareness raising.¹⁴⁶ Different in-groups compete for public support in online economies of attention and emotion. This typically positions different causes as competing for the same resources.

The rhetoric of these groups invokes human rights directly by assuming Dworkin's concept of rights as trumps¹⁴⁷ which manifests as call-out culture, the public and often online shaming of culturally insensitive behaviour.¹⁴⁸ Disinformation elicits the outrage that often accompanies this rhetoric and leverages it in online economies to inflate stereotypes about these groups.¹⁴⁹ This also provides an environment for further criticisms of rights rhetoric, mainly that it is intrusive, demanding and overcompensating.

Identity politics have allowed critiques to further narratives of social justice as an industry¹⁵⁰ and frame political incorrectness as a freedom of speech issue.¹⁵¹ These scepticisms are visible when focus groups in Liberia display 'negative connotations' about human rights and associate such rights with the idea that 'children were free to disobey [parents] and that parents would no longer be able to impose discipline'.¹⁵²

¹⁴⁵ Amy Chau, 'How America's Identity Politics Went From Inclusion to Division' *The Guardian* (London, 1 March 2018) <www.theguardian.com/society/2018/mar/01/how-americas-identity-politics-went-from-inclusion-to-division> accessed 3 March 2018.

¹⁴⁶ Michael Rothberg, 'Introduction: Theorizing Multidirectional Memory in a Transnational Age' in Michael Rothberg, *Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonization* (Stanford UP 2009) 1-29.

¹⁴⁷ Ronald Dworkin, 'Rights as Trumps' in Jeremy Waldron (ed), *Theories of Rights* (OUP 1984) 153-162.

¹⁴⁸ Conor Friedersdorf, 'The Excesses of Call-Out Culture' *The Atlantic* (Washington DC, 19 February 2018) <www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2018/02/what-good-can-come-of-callout-culture/553661/> accessed 25 May 2018.

¹⁴⁹ Marwick and Lewis (n 133) 42.

¹⁵⁰ Addison Del Mastro, 'Social Justice Warriors Define Bigotry Down So They Can Stay In Business' (theFederalist.com, 21 September 2006) <<http://thefederalist.com/2016/09/21/social-justice-warriors-define-bigotry-can-stay-business/>> accessed 25 May 2018.

¹⁵¹ Cathy Young, 'Anti-PC for Anti-PC's Sake' *Observer Media* (New York City, 6 September 2016) <<https://observer.com/2016/09/anti-pc-for-anti-pcs-sake/>> accessed 25 May 2018.

¹⁵² UN Mission in Liberia, 'An Assessment of Human Rights Issues Emanating from Traditional Practices in Liberia' (UN Mission in Liberia [UNMIL] 2016) 15 <www.refworld.org/docid/568d1ca94.html> accessed 25 June 2018.

It can be seen when fans of celebrity academic Jordan Peterson say, ‘We hear too much about rights and how much we need more of that. I feel Peterson’s talking about responsibilities, not being a victim’,¹⁵³ and they have also long been simmering in Europe where liberals have been perceived as reluctant to call out radical Islam for fear of sounding racist.¹⁵⁴

At the same time, right-wing identity politics depart from traditional conservatism by rejecting the individualism long propagated by the right¹⁵⁵ in favour of collective identities based on fraternal deprivation. This is notably embodied by the alt-right in the US and the identitarian and populist movements in Europe. These groups are defined by their embrace of new racism and their use of rights-based rhetoric as well as competitive memory to posit neglect by the state.

European identitarianism invokes the mantra ‘Human rights include the right to a homeland’.¹⁵⁶ Steve Bannon’s call to right-wing Europeans to ‘let them call you racist’¹⁵⁷ assumes the approach of groups embracing the slurs used against them. White supremacist Jason Kessler calls for a ‘white civil rights movement’ and accuses the left of appropriating ‘white European culture to subvert the core identity of our nations’.¹⁵⁸ One German neo-Nazi party calls itself *Der Dritte Weg*, the third way, to suggest ethnonationalism as a solution to the stalemate of binary politics. In the US, freedom of speech arguments have been used ‘to justify unlimited campaign spending, discrimination against gay couples and attacks on the regulation of tobacco, pharmaceuticals and guns’.¹⁵⁹

These interpretations present human rights as self-defeating. Not all groups can enjoy them, and the rights of one group infringe on those

¹⁵³ Ben Bryant, ‘Why Do Young Men Worship Professor Jordan Peterson?’ (*BBC News*, 1 August 2018) <www.bbc.co.uk/bbcthree/article/f1d7fed0-4ddf-4a8a-94b9-ea05f913cdd2> accessed 14 June 2018.

¹⁵⁴ Ian Buruma, ‘Final Cut’ *The New Yorker* (New York City, 3 January 2005) <www.newyorker.com/magazine/2005/01/03/final-cut-2> accessed 3 July 2018.

¹⁵⁵ Chau (n 144).

¹⁵⁶ ‘Racists in Skinny Jeans: Meet the IB, Europe’s Version of America’s Alt-Right’ *The Economist* (London, 12 November 2016) <www.economist.com/europe/2016/11/12/meet-the-ib-europes-version-of-americas-alt-right> accessed 15 May 2018.

¹⁵⁷ Jakob Hanke, ‘Steve Bannon to French Far-Right: “Let Them Call You Racists”’ (*Politico.com*, 11 March 2018) <www.politico.eu/article/steve-bannon-to-french-far-right-let-them-call-you-racists/> accessed 15 March 2018.

¹⁵⁸ Jason Kessler, ‘The Alt Right Should Be a White Civil Rights Movement’ (*JasonKessler.us*, 28 December 2017) <<http://jasonkessler.us/2017/12/28/whitecivilrights/>> accessed 1 July 2018.

¹⁵⁹ Adam Liptak, ‘How Conservatives Weaponized the First Amendment’ *The New York Times* (New York City, 30 June 2018) <www.nytimes.com/2018/06/30/us/politics/first-amendment-conservatives-supreme-court.html> accessed 30 June 2018.

of others. Kremlin disinformation has tapped into this in that it ‘plays on [western] values and relies on pushing our buttons of shame, easily pushed precisely because we have the right to call out hypocrisy on civil rights and free speech’.¹⁶⁰ The Kremlin invokes the human rights regime to undermine and present it as empty and disingenuous:

Where the Soviets once co-opted and repurposed concepts such as ‘democracy,’ ‘human rights’ and ‘sovereignty’ to mask their opposites, the Putinists use them playfully to suggest that not even the West really believes in them. Gitmo, Iraq, Ferguson, BP, Jobbik, Schröder—all liberalism is cant, and anyone can be bought.¹⁶¹

Human rights issues have great sway in the attention economy. Rights-adjacent content appeals to emotions, lends itself to resharing and ascribes to a moral certainty that hypothetically trumps legality or tradition. However, the exclusionary and aggressive rhetoric of the left and the logical fallacies employed by the right leverage fraternal deprivation as a means of obtaining legitimacy in a neo-liberal system that encourages competitive memory. Disinformation ensures that rather than one side having an outright victory, the human rights regime seems less authoritative and liberal democracy is less certain, thus illiberalism and autocracy are less objectionable.

3.1.4 Disruption and disinformation

Fake news is also rooted in the technology industry’s philosophy of disruption. Disruption is ‘the rallying cry of the business of tech’.¹⁶² It is the name of one of the biggest technology conferences in the world. It has been applied to a university programme,¹⁶³ multiple books

¹⁶⁰ Paula Chertok, ‘Russophobia: How Russia Exploits Western Values For Its Propaganda’ (StopFake.org, 22 May 2018) <www.stopfake.org/en/russophobia-how-russia-exploits-western-values-for-its-propaganda/> accessed 24 May 2018.

¹⁶¹ Peter Pomerantsev and Michael Weiss, ‘The Menace of Unreality: How the Kremlin Weaponizes Information, Culture and Money’ (The Interpreter, Institute of Modern Russia, 2014) 5 <www.interpretermag.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/The_Menace_of_Unreality_Final.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

¹⁶² Ian Bogost, ‘Startups Need to “Stop Disrupting and Start Innovating”’ (*Wired*, 12 December 2016) <www.wired.co.uk/article/startups-disrupt-disruption> accessed 15 June 2018.

¹⁶³ Michael Barthel, ‘Why “Disruption” is an Ugly and Dishonest Buzzword’ (*Bullett*, 4 June 2013) <<http://bulletmedia.com/article/why-disruption-is-an-ugly-and-dishonest-buzzword/>> accessed 15 June 2018.

and a lecture series, and even to the sock industry.¹⁶⁴ It is ‘unironically ubiquitous’ in marketing new products to whatever industry it focuses on – taxis, the justice system, convenience stores.¹⁶⁵

Disruptive innovation, as popularised by Clayton Christensen in *The Innovator’s Dilemma*, is ‘a process by which a product or service takes root initially in simple applications at the bottom of a market and then relentlessly moves up market, eventually displacing established competitors.’¹⁶⁶ Much as with the language of rights, it is the rhetoric of resistance and revolution: ‘Disruptors frame themselves as revolutionaries, and in parallel their targets become oppressors’.¹⁶⁷ It is ‘transformative change in the Internet economy, with “incumbents” providing rhetorical contrast’.¹⁶⁸ A 2012 issue of Harvard’s *Nieman Reports*, co-edited by Christensen in ‘a mission to save the news industry’, featured him on the cover with the dominant headline ‘Be the Disruptor’ in big orange text.¹⁶⁹

Fake news is disruption. It disrupts journalism, advertising, political campaigning, the human rights regime and democracy itself. It does this largely by using liberal means to realise illiberal aims. In 2013, Wealthfront CEO Andy Rachleff wrote, ‘Google’s search algorithm wasn’t disruptive. It was AdWords, its advertising service [which] offered a self-service ad product for as little as \$1’.¹⁷⁰ Three years later, AdWords generated millions of dollars in revenue for Google via disinformation.¹⁷¹

Disruption as a philosophy and rhetoric is problematic. First, it suffers from overapplication: ‘when everything is disruptive, nothing is’.¹⁷²

¹⁶⁴ Sarah McBride, ‘Silicon Valley’s Next Target for Disruption Is Socks’ *Bloomberg Businessweek* (New York City, 3 October 2017) <www.bloomberg.com/news/features/2017-10-03/silicon-valley-s-next-target-for-disruption-is-socks> accessed 15 June 2018.

¹⁶⁵ Jason Tashea, ‘The Limiting Language of Disruption’ (*Huffington Post*, 29 October 2015) <www.huffingtonpost.com/jason-tashea/the-limiting-language-of-disruption_b_8400064.html> accessed 8 July 2018.

¹⁶⁶ Clayton Christensen, ‘Disruptive Innovation’ (Claytonchristensen.com, 2018) <www.claytonchristensen.com/key-concepts/> accessed 8 July 2018.

¹⁶⁷ Bogost (n 161).

¹⁶⁸ Kent Anderson, ‘The Price of Silicon Valley’s “Disruption” – Is It Possible to Now Have Responsible Information Economics?’ (*Scholarly Kitchen*, 4 January 2017) <<https://scholarlykitchen.sspnet.org/2017/01/04/the-price-of-silicon-valleys-disruption-is-it-possible-to-now-have-responsible-information-economics/>> accessed 18 June 2018.

¹⁶⁹ ‘Be the Disruptor’ (Fall 2012) *Nieman Reports* 66(3) <https://niemanreports.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/be_the_disruptor.pdf> accessed 27 March 2018.

¹⁷⁰ Andy Rachleff, ‘What “Disrupt” Really Means’ (*TechCrunch*, 16 February 2013) <<https://techcrunch.com/2013/02/16/the-truth-about-disruption/>> accessed 18 June 2018.

¹⁷¹ Campaign for Accountability, ‘How Google Makes Millions Off of Fake News’ (Campaign for Accountability, 30 October 2017) <<https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/how-google-makes-millions-off-of-fake-news/>> accessed 8 July 2018.

¹⁷² Kevin Roose, ‘Let’s All Stop Saying “Disrupt” Right This Instant’ (*Intelligencer*, 16 June 2014) <<http://nymag.com/intelligencer/2014/06/lets-all-stop-saying-disrupt.html>> accessed 20 April 2018.

Second, it has outlasted its truth: ‘Modern digital spaces are often characterized by entrenched and unchecked dominance, not continuous waves of creative destruction’.¹⁷³ Finally, rather than making the world a better place, notable disruptions re-entrench imbalances in influence, power and representation.

Disrupting the justice system with predictive policing has translated existing biases into computer code and statistical analysis.¹⁷⁴ Notable disruptors like Uber and AirBnB have vitalised a gig economy with negative consequences for workers’ rights.¹⁷⁵ Disruption parallels right-wing populism in that it is most effective in repeal and regression. Both are rooted in the idea that complacent incumbents need to be obliterated, but they do not invoke progress so much as creative destruction. In the place of solutions is the marketplace of ideas, and this has the high potential to yield power to illiberal actors promising easy solutions for complicated issues.

3.2 REMEDIES

Thus far efforts to combat disinformation are being enacted by governments, platforms, technology start-ups and civil society. Each party brings with it issues that need to be resolved before technological advancements largely mute these efforts.

One country is confident in their solution to disinformation. China’s Sesame System assigns users a score based on their internet activity, taking into consideration online social networks and behaviour. One’s score determines the ability to travel, obtain loans or jobs, or access the internet. Even though it has not been fully implemented, it has stopped people from taking 11.14 million flights and 4.25 million train trips.¹⁷⁶

¹⁷³ John M Newman, ‘Silicon Valley Rhetoric: Three Myths Debunked’ (CPI Antitrust Chronicle, April 2018) 5 <www.competitionpolicyinternational.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/CPI-Newman.pdf> accessed 8 July 2018.

¹⁷⁴ Kristian Lum and William Isaac, ‘To Predict and Serve?’ (7 October 2016) 13(5) Significance <<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1740-9713.2016.00960.x>> accessed 8 July 2018.

¹⁷⁵ Michelle Chen, ‘This Is How Bad the Sharing Economy Is for Workers’ *The Nation* (New York City, 14 September 2015) <www.thenation.com/article/this-is-how-bad-the-sharing-economy-is-for-workers/> accessed 8 July 2018; Miriam A Cherry and Antonio Aloisi, ‘“Dependent Contractors” in the Gig Economy: A Comparative Approach’ (2017) 66(3) *American University Law Review* 635 <<http://digitalcommons.wcl.american.edu/aclr/vol66/iss3/1>> accessed 9 July 2018.

¹⁷⁶ Francis Tara Chan, ‘China’s Social Credit System Has Blocked People From Taking 11 Million Flights and 4 Million Train Trips’ (*Business Insider*, 21 May 2018) <www.businessinsider.com/china-social-credit-system-blocked-people-taking-flights-train-trips-2018-5> accessed 22 May 2018.

Western powers vocally rejected this stance as against western values.¹⁷⁷ However, such actions in the west are not unfathomable. Supermarkets in the UK adjust insurance premiums based on shopping habits,¹⁷⁸ and platform demonetisation processes often involve quantifying user behaviour.

There is no one overarching solution to disinformation, and every effort that has been suggested comes with its own ethical concerns. This section describes some of the most notable solutions proposed thus far, but each should be considered as part of a solution. More so, some of the measures already being undertaken have dire consequences for rights and personal freedoms.

3.2.1 *Media literacy*

Education is often presented as the first step in combatting disinformation. Media literacy courses are increasingly being implemented in education systems worldwide, and the European Commission recommends institutionalising the subject into core curricula, providing teacher training and working with experts to ensure best practices.¹⁷⁹ The Commission's focus on best practices is important because, as Boyd suggests in 'Did Digital Literacy Backfire?',¹⁸⁰ previous approaches to digital literacy have re-entrenched scepticism and furthered partisan media bias narratives.

Education beyond the school yard is also an issue. Disinformation is increasingly spread through messaging groups.¹⁸¹ Trends in news consumption suggest that social media use is decreasing while the use of messaging apps is growing.¹⁸² Messengers like WhatsApp and Telegram

¹⁷⁷ Tambini (n 6) 14; European Commission, 'A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Disinformation: Report of the Independent High Level Group on Fake News and Online Disinformation' (March 2018) 18 <<https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/news/final-report-high-level-expert-group-fake-news-and-online-disinformation>> accessed 20 March 2018.

¹⁷⁸ Lawrence White, 'UK Supermarkets Analyze Customers' Shopping Habits to Price Insurance Products' (*Insurance Journal*, 13 December 2017) <www.insurancejournal.com/news/international/2017/12/13/473890.htm> accessed 14 April 2018.

¹⁷⁹ European Commission (n 176) 25.

¹⁸⁰ Danah Boyd, 'Did Media Literacy Backfire?' (Medium.com, 5 January 2017) <<https://points.datasociety.net/did-media-literacy-backfire-7418c084d88d>> accessed 30 June 2018.

¹⁸¹ Claire Wardle and Hossein Derakhshan, 'Information Disorder: Toward an Interdisciplinary Framework for Research and Policy and Making' (Council of Europe DGI(2017)09, 27 September 2017) 75 <<https://rm.coe.int/information-disorder-toward-an-interdisciplinary-framework-for-research/168076277c>> accessed 4 March 2018.

¹⁸² Nic Newman and others, 'Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2018' (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2018) 9 <<http://media.digitalnewsreport.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/digital-news-report-2018.pdf?x89475>> accessed 8 July 2018.

are private and communal, and their ability to spread disinformation is beyond the reach of fact-checkers. Educating the public about the means and motivations of disinformation campaigns is one way of addressing this. To this Hansen suggests amassing cognitive resilience, or a cognitive firewall,¹⁸³ to engrain a healthy scepticism for disinformation.

This issue strikes at the future of disinformation. Digital face recognition technology has become a ubiquitous tool of the entertainment industry,¹⁸⁴ and these tools have quickly moved online, allowing for so-called deep fakes and photorealistic manipulations of audio and video that present more potential for weaponised disinformation.¹⁸⁵ Voice impersonation technology, demonstrated by the ‘Synthesizing Obama’ project, can use neural networking to match audio to lip movements in unrelated video content and produce ‘photorealistic results’.¹⁸⁶

While these features might be detected by experts, they will be more than enough for the peripheral processing of the average viewer, especially as low-quality aesthetics become markers of authenticity. Fact-checking manipulated content will increasingly rely on incongruencies such as weather patterns, lighting and evidence of dubbing.¹⁸⁷ Amnesty International’s Digital Verification Corps also offers a response¹⁸⁸ but the onus is on the technology industry to make these tools available for the public and to raise awareness of them.

¹⁸³ Flemming Splidsboel Hansen, ‘Russian Hybrid Warfare’ (DIIS, 2017) 34 <http://pure.diiis.dk/ws/files/950041/DIIS_RP_2017_6_web.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

¹⁸⁴ Logan Hill, ‘Plastic Surgery With a Mouse Click’ (*Vulture*, 4 April 2016) <www.vulture.com/2016/03/special-effects-c-v-r.html> accessed 1 June 2018.

¹⁸⁵ Chris Meserole and Alina Polyakova, ‘Disinformation Wars’ *Foreign Policy* (Washington DC, 25 May 2018) <<https://foreignpolicy.com/2018/05/25/disinformation-wars/>> accessed 1 June 2018.

¹⁸⁶ Supasorn Suwajanakorn, Steven M Seitz and Ira Kemelmacher-Shlizerman, ‘Synthesizing Obama: Learning Lip Sync from Audio’ (Grail.cs.washington.edu, 10 July 2017) <<http://grail.cs.washington.edu/projects/AudioToObama/>> accessed 10 May 2018.

¹⁸⁷ Olivia Solon, ‘The Future of Fake News: Don’t Believe Everything You Read, See or Hear’ *The Guardian* (London, 26 July 2017) <www.theguardian.com/technology/2017/jul/26/fake-news-obama-video-trump-face2face-doctored-content> accessed 1 June 2018.

¹⁸⁸ Sam Dubberly, ‘In the Firing Line: How Amnesty’s Digital Verification Corps Changed Official Narratives Through Open Source Investigation’ (*Citizen Evidence Lab*, 18 May 2017) <<https://citizenevidence.org/2017/05/18/in-the-firing-line-how-amnestys-digital-verification-corps-changed-official-narratives-through-open-source-investigation/>> accessed 1 June 2018.

3.2.2 Government regulation

Countries that have passed laws against fake news – Kenya, Malaysia, India and Belarus, although India withdrew its law – have been criticised for censoring the press.¹⁸⁹ Other laws have been met with criticism or resistance. Germany's NetzDG was the first law to be associated with fake news even though it targets hate speech. HRW criticised it for its potential to encourage platform censorship and because platforms might overcompensate when removing content to avoid fines.¹⁹⁰

The Honest Ads Act proposed by the US congress would extend media transparency law to platforms, but its progress has stalled.¹⁹¹ While platforms claim to have adopted it anyway, these efforts have not been totally successful.¹⁹² Brazil and France introduced laws that target disinformation during election seasons, but France's law was criticised as ineffective and censoring.¹⁹³ Proposals to regulate SMF,¹⁹⁴ like those in South Korea and Ireland, may be a more meaningful way of combatting disinformation.

Other attempts include public outreach through informational websites or web portals and committees or task forces.¹⁹⁵ Papua New Guinea announced that it was looking into making its own social networking platform.¹⁹⁶ Other countries have proposed similar efforts, with Egypt launching its national equivalent in March 2018 which some have criticised as a means of surveilling the populace.¹⁹⁷

¹⁸⁹ Daniel Funke, 'A Guide to Anti-Misinformation Actions Around the World' (Poynter.org, 14 March 2018) <www.poynter.org/news/guide-anti-misinformation-actions-around-world> accessed 30 March 2018.

¹⁹⁰ Human Rights Watch, 'Germany: Flawed Social Media Law' (Human Rights Watch, 14 February 2018) <www.hrw.org/news/2018/02/14/germany-flawed-social-media-law> accessed 14 February 2018.

¹⁹¹ Heather Timmons and Hanna Kozłowska, 'Facebook's Quiet Battle to Kill the First Transparency Law for Online Political Ads' (*Quartz*, 22 March 2018) <<https://qz.com/1235363/mark-zuckerberg-and-facebooks-battle-to-kill-the-honest-ads-act/>> accessed 22 April 2018.

¹⁹² Sheera Frenkel, 'Facebook Tried to Rein In Fake Ads. It Fell Short in a California Race' *The New York Times* (New York City, 3 June 2018) <www.nytimes.com/2018/06/03/technology/california-congressional-race-facebook-election-interference.html> accessed 5 June 2018.

¹⁹³ Laura Smith-Spark and Saskya Vandoorne, 'As France Debates Fake News Bill, Critics See Threat to Free Speech' (CNN.com, 7 June 2018) <<https://edition.cnn.com/2018/06/07/europe/france-fake-news-law-intl/index.html>> accessed 10 June 2018.

¹⁹⁴ Funke (n 188).

¹⁹⁵ *ibid.*

¹⁹⁶ David Martin, 'Papua New Guinea to Ban Facebook For One Month, Broaches State-Run Social Network' (DW.com, 29 May 2018) <www.dw.com/en/papua-new-guinea-to-ban-facebook-for-one-month-broaches-state-run-social-network/a-43982064> accessed 15 June 2018.

¹⁹⁷ Mildred Europa Taylor, 'Egyptian Government Launches New Social Media Platform to Rival Facebook' (Face2faceAfrica.com, 26 March 2018) <<https://face2faceafrica.com/article/egyptian-government-launches-new-social-media-platform-rival-facebook>> accessed 15 June 2018.

3.2.3 Platforms and algorithms

Facebook's initial denial of election influence as 'a pretty crazy idea'¹⁹⁸ has given way to action by all major platforms. Platforms' measures are characterised by coordination with each other¹⁹⁹ and with fact-checkers,²⁰⁰ providing additional articles to disrupt filter bubbles,²⁰¹ and demonetising abusive or bot-like behaviour, which includes spreading disinformation.²⁰²

Algorithmic solutions to disinformation now comprise a substantial area of research and entrepreneurial effort. The Fake News Challenge (FNC) crowd-sourced detection algorithms that focus on stance detection in headlines,²⁰³ and several detection algorithms have been able to isolate features of disinformation that can be used to better target fact-checking efforts. However, algorithms are also a means beyond fact-checking. Neva Labs co-founder Mark Little says, 'the future is going to be a Spotify or Netflix for news ... We are really focusing on the individuals' experience of news. This is not just about saving journalism'.²⁰⁴

3.2.4 Fact-checking

Fact-checking has become a staple of pluralist media with over a hundred formal fact-checking and debunking organisations and websites worldwide. The majority were established in this decade, especially the last five years. Outside of the US, where 63% of fact-checking initiatives are operated by established news outlets, most are not affiliated with major media outlets.²⁰⁵

¹⁹⁸ Dave Lee, "Crazy" to Say Facebook Helped Trump Win – Zuckerberg' (*BBC News*, 11 November 2016) <www.bbc.com/news/technology-37946713> accessed 8 March 2018.

¹⁹⁹ Garrett Sloane, 'Google Details Plan to Fight Fake News, From Search to YouTube' (*AdAge*, 20 March 2018) <<https://adage.com/article/digital/google-combats-fake-news-search-youtube/312810/>> accessed 24 March 2018.

²⁰⁰ Jonathan Vanian, 'Facebook Expanding Fact-Checking Project to Combat Fake News' (*Fortune* (New York City, 21 June 2018) <<http://fortune.com/2018/06/21/facebook-fake-news-fact-checking/>> accessed 24 March 2018.

²⁰¹ Heidi Auvinen, 'Tackling Fake News and Misinformation in Platforms' (*PlatformValueNow*, 4 April 2018) <<http://platformvaluenow.org/signals/tackling-fake-news-and-misinformation-in-platforms/>> accessed 4 April 2018.

²⁰² Josh Constine, 'Facebook Bans Monetization of Violence, Porn, Drugs, Hate' (*TechCrunch*, 13 September 2017) <<https://techcrunch.com/2017/09/13/facebook-monetization-2/>> accessed 4 April 2018.

²⁰³ 'Fake News Challenge' (*Fakenewschallenge.org*, 2018) <www.fakenewschallenge.org/> accessed 4 March 2018.

²⁰⁴ Anne-Marie Tomchak, 'Algorithms Are Screwing Us Over With Fake News But Could Also Fix the Problem' (*Mashable*, 5 October 2017) <<https://mashable.com/2017/10/05/artificial-intelligence-algorithm-neva-labs/>> accessed 30 June 2018.

²⁰⁵ Lucas Graves and Federica Cherubini, 'The Rise of Fact-Checking Sites in Europe' (Reuters Institute, 2016) 6 <<https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/our-research/rise-fact-checking-sites-europe/>> accessed 6 March 2018.

The Poynter Institute's International Fact-Checking Network (IFCN) vets organisations and maintains a code of conduct including commitments to fairness and transparency.²⁰⁶ Currently 55 organisations operating in 35 territories are signatories or pending renewal. This network does not include all fact-checking sites in the world, nor even the majority, but it is the largest attempt at establishing a global standard.

A victory of sorts came in the 2018 Ireland abortion referendum, as fact-checkers worked with the public to counter dark ads,²⁰⁷ and technology presents some benefits for accuracy in news. Automated fact-checking (AFC) offers increased accuracy and efficiency in detecting and verifying online content, but it is largely limited to assisting the human element.²⁰⁸ Like AFC, crowdsourcing offers limited benefits.²⁰⁹ The process remains intensive, human-based and overwhelmed by the deluge of disinformation.

The influence of fact-checking also has limitations. Not only do audiences for disinformation and debunkings rarely overlap, the pushback against fact-checking, largely spearheaded by rightist parties, extends the liberal media bias narrative and limits the effect of corrective efforts. The right is statistically more sceptical of fact-checking,²¹⁰ and right-wing efforts such as the Media Research Center (MRC) which boasts that it is 'flipping the script of these faux-fact-checkers'²¹¹ and the Swedish Facebook group *Mediekollen*²¹² work to discredit the findings of these organisations.

²⁰⁶ 'International Fact-Checking Network' (Poynter, 2018) <www.poynter.org/international-fact-checking-network-fact-checkers-code-principles> accessed 20 April 2018.

²⁰⁷ Rachel Lavin and Roland Adorjani, 'How Ireland Beat Dark Ads' *Foreign Policy* (Washington DC, 1 June 2018) <<https://foreignpolicy.com/2018/06/01/abortion-referendum-how-ireland-resisted-bad-behaviour-online/>> accessed 8 June 2018.

²⁰⁸ Lucas Graves, 'Understanding the Promise and Limits of Automated Fact-Checking' (Reuters Institute, February 2018) <<https://agency.reuters.com/content/dam/openweb/documents/pdf/news-agency/report/reuters-institute-graves-factsheet-180228.pdf>> accessed 8 June 2018.

²⁰⁹ Mevan Babakar, 'Crowdsourced Factchecking' (Medium.com, 29 May 2018) <<https://medium.com/@meandvan/crowdsourced-factchecking-4c5168ea5ac3>> accessed 29 May 2018.

²¹⁰ Alexios Mantzarlis, 'Conservative Websites are far more likely to attack fact-checkers than their liberal counterparts' (Poynter.org, 8 June 2017) <<https://www.poynter.org/news/conservative-websites-are-far-more-likely-attack-fact-checkers-their-liberal-counterparts>> accessed 10 June 2018.

²¹¹ Media Research Center, 'Don't Believe the Liberal "Fact-Checkers!"' (*Newsbusters*, 2005-2018) <www.newsbusters.org/fact-checkers> accessed 10 June 2018.

²¹² Jasper Jackson, 'In the Post-Truth Era Sweden's Far Right Fake Fact Checker Was Inevitable' *The Guardian* (London, 19 January 2017) <www.theguardian.com/media/2017/jan/19/in-the-post-truth-era-swedens-far-right-fake-fact-checker-was-inevitable> accessed 10 June 2018.

4.

METHODOLOGY

This section explains the use of headlines to analyse disinformation and human rights. It then describes the framework used for this analysis. Theories of sociolinguistics and CDA are used in this research to better identify human rights vulnerabilities in disinformation narratives.

4.1 THE ROLE OF HEADLINES IN DISINFORMATION

Headlines are extremely effective at perpetuating disinformation. On social media, headlines are often the only part of a story that is read. News organisations ‘sensationalize headlines on Facebook in ways that wouldn’t be accepted on their own websites’²¹³ and optimise them for maximum social media engagement.²¹⁴ Headlines used in disinformation are increasingly designed to grab attention while engagement-driven algorithms increase the chances that they will appear in news feeds. Disinformation is ‘designed to be liked and shared based on headlines and photos’,²¹⁵ and bots like those used by Russia often only include headlines, retweets or memes when they reshare.²¹⁶

²¹³ Claire Wardle and Hossein Derakhshan, ‘Information Disorder: Toward an Interdisciplinary Framework for Research and Policy and Making’ (Council of Europe DGI(2017)09, 27 September 2017) 83 <<https://rm.coe.int/information-disorder-toward-an-interdisciplinary-framework-for-research/168076277c>> accessed 4 March 2018.

²¹⁴ Craig Silverman, ‘Lies, Damn Lies and Viral Content’ (Tow Center for Digital Journalism, 2015) 105 <<https://doi.org/10.7916/D8Q81RHH>> accessed 4 March 2018.

²¹⁵ Gu, Kropotov and Yarochin (n 17) 50.

²¹⁶ Sergey Sanovich, ‘Computational Propaganda in Russia: The Origins of Digital Misinformation’ (Project on Computational Propaganda Working Paper No 2017/3, March 2017) 14 <<http://comprop.oii.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/sites/89/2017/06/Comprop-Russia.pdf>> accessed 1 April 2018.

Disinformation headlines are written to present unverified claims as true or credible, even when the accompanying article explains that they are not. This instils urgency and encourages re-sharing. Such methods include the use of hedging language like ‘reportedly’, and declarative sentences that assert the authority of dubious claims. Implications made in a headline, even in the form of a question, have lasting links in readers’ minds and will persist even if accompanying text offers rebuttals or clarifications.²¹⁷

Linguistic analysis of disinformation articles reveals how such content appeals to readers. Hyperpartisan articles are shorter than mainstream articles²¹⁸ while disinformation uses more personal pronouns, hedging language and exaggerating features such as subjectives, superlatives and modal adverbs. Hoaxes use fewer comparisons while propaganda uses more.²¹⁹ Junk news or clickbait headlines use fewer words and more proper nouns and are more similar to satire than to news. This also supports the notion that disinformation functions through heuristics rather than argumentation.²²⁰

Given the aim of this study to identify and analyse disinformation and then detect human rights violations, headlines are the most indicative and reliable feature for analysis. They are designed to grab attention and convince audiences to believe then share them. Just as non-disinformation headlines are meant to give audiences as much relevant information as possible, disinformation headlines present a compact narrative without the expectation of further engagement. Considering how disinformation is internalised, it is also likely that the narratives and stances presented in headlines are the ones most likely to endure and later be understood as true.

²¹⁷ Silverman (n 213) 107.

²¹⁸ Martin Potthast and others, ‘A Stylometric Inquiry into Hyperpartisan and Fake News’ (18 February 2017) CoRR <<http://arxiv.org/abs/1702.05638>> accessed 8 July 2018.

²¹⁹ Hannah Rashkin and others, ‘Truth of Varying Shades: Analyzing Language in Fake News and Political Fact-Checking’ (Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing, Copenhagen, September 2017) 2931, 2933 <<https://aclanthology.info/papers/D17-1317/d17-1317>> accessed 1 April 2018.

²²⁰ Benjamin D Horne and Sibel Adali, ‘This Just In: Fake News Packs a Lot in Title, Uses Simpler, Repetitive Content in Text Body, More Similar to Satire than Real News’ (2017) CoRR <<https://arxiv.org/abs/1703.09398>> accessed 1 April 2018.

4.2 FRAMEWORK

Fake news is used to refer to a wide range of content and behaviour, and this study's use of disinformation refines that as intentionally disingenuous content disseminated online that seeks to persuade. As such, this can include everything from celebrity death hoaxes to manipulative political content. In analysing a subject that uses hybrid strategies, this study appropriates a hybrid framework that combines aspects of linguistics and discourse studies. These theories and their values in application are presented in this section.

4.2.1 *Cooperative principle*

CP, conceptualised by Paul Grice, argues that within verbal communication 'each participant recognizes in them, to some extent, a common purpose or set of purposes, or at least a mutually accepted direction'.²²¹ With this, Grice outlined Kantian maxims that dictate effective discourse. These are:

Quantity

1. Make your contribution as informative as is required (for the current purposes of the exchange).
2. Do not make your contribution more informative than is required.

Quality: Try to make your contribution one that is true.

1. Do not say what you believe to be false.
2. Do not say that for which you lack adequate evidence.

Relation: Be relevant

Manner

1. Avoid obscurity of expression.
2. Avoid ambiguity.
3. Be brief (avoid unnecessary prolixity).
4. Be orderly.

²²¹ Paul Grice, *Studies in the Way of Words* (1st edn, Harvard UP 1991) 26.

To some degree, these are subjective and dependent on the standards of users, and they are not equal in effect of violation: ‘a man who has expressed himself with undue prolixity would, in general, be open to milder comment than would a man who has said something he believes to be false’.²²² Flouting these conventions is also a means of communication. Humour functions by contravening these maxims. Satire, for example, is the intentional disregard of the quality maxim.

While this principle was designed for conversation, it has been applied to text including headlines, as in works by Dor, Al Kayed and Kitishat, and Ecker and others.²²³ As argued by Kheirabadi and Aghagolzadeh,²²⁴ news media functions as a conversation between publishers and audiences. Publishers are expected to conform to these maxims, and audiences respond with attention and financial support. The interactive nature of online media has strengthened this aspect of the relationship. More than ever, audiences can respond to publishers through comments and promotion via social media.

Of course, flouting and violating these maxims is a reality of news media. Clickbait, for example, is the intentional flouting of manner and quality. Violations, which are intentional and covert, are antithetical to the stated function of independent, balanced media.

Applied to the fake news issue, Grice’s maxims presuppose the widespread, systematic violation of discourse norms. ‘Examining on-line behaviour, not content, in order to detect deception is most important’,²²⁵ and CP bridges content and behaviour. Disinformation is the mobilisation of violations, and violations are behaviour. Thus, this study analyses headlines as discourse that is actively deceptive.

²²² Paul Grice, *Studies in the Way of Words* (1st edn, Harvard UP 1991)

²²³ Daniel Dor, ‘On Newspaper Headlines as Relevance Optimizers’ (May 2003) 35(5) *Journal of Pragmatics* 695 <[https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-2166\(02\)00134-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-2166(02)00134-0)> accessed 8 July 2018; Ullrich Ecker and others, ‘The Effects of Subtle Misinformation in News Headlines’ (2014) 20(4) *Journal of Experimental Psychology* 323 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/xap0000028>> accessed 1 July 2018; Murad Al Kayed and Amal Kitishat, ‘The Violation of Grice’s Maxims in Jordanian Newspapers’ *Cartoons: A Pragmatic Study* (January 2015) 4(4) *International Journal of Linguistics and Literature* 41 <www.researchgate.net/publication/306065313_The_Violation_of_the_Grice's_Maxims_in_Jordanian_newspapers_cartoons_a_Pragmatic_Study> accessed 8 July 2018.

²²⁴ Reza Kheirabadi and Ferdows Aghagolzadeh, ‘Grice’s Cooperative Maxims as Linguistic Criteria for News Selectivity’ (March 2012) 2(3) *Theory and Practice in Language Studies* 547 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.4304/tpls.2.3.547-553>> accessed 8 July 2018.

²²⁵ Thomas Elkjer Nissen, ‘Social Media’s Role in “Hybrid Strategies”’ (NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence, 20 September 2016) 6-7 <www.stratcomcoe.org/social-medias-role-hybrid-strategies-author-thomas-eltkjer-nissen> accessed 20 February 2018.

4.2.2 Critical discourse analysis

With this understanding, CDA is applied to disinformation headlines. Discourse analysis is an interdisciplinary approach frequently described ‘as the analysis of language “beyond the sentence”’.²²⁶ Initially, it was conceived of ‘as the discovery of patterns of formal equivalences across the sentences in a text’ by Zellig Harris and adopted by Chomsky ‘to focus it more exclusively on the constituent relations within the sentence itself’.²²⁷ The work of linguist Roger Fowler, in particular *Language and Control*, provided a foundation on which much of CDA has been established.

CDA is the application of analysis to power structures and their rhetorical means. To this, van Dijk defines CDA as the study of social power and discourse, specifically how ‘abuse, dominance, and inequality are enacted, reproduced, and resisted by text and talk’.²²⁸ Ramanathan and Tan note several features about CDA when applied to media: it is problem-oriented, inter-disciplinary, rooted in social research, interested in unethical issues and recommends spontaneous assessment and constant reevaluation.²²⁹

CDA has been applied to news media for various purposes. van Dijk’s *News As Discourse* and *New(s) Racism*²³⁰ are influential applications of CDA to news media, and Fairclough’s *Language and Power* has been influential in applying CDA to media discourse. CDA is increasingly being applied to social media, notably in recent work by Farkas, Schou and Neumayer²³¹ on social media hate speech.

This study primarily uses Fairclough’s social theory with a limited application of van Dijk’s ideology theory.

²²⁶ Deborah Tannen, ‘Discourse Analysis—What Speakers Do in Conversation’ (*Linguistic Society of America*, 2012) <www.linguisticsociety.org/resource/discourse-analysis-what-speakers-do-conversation> accessed 10 June 2018.

²²⁷ HG Widdowson, *Text, Context, Pretext: Critical Issues in Discourse Analysis* (Blackwell Publishing 2004) 17.

²²⁸ Teun A van Dijk, ‘Critical Discourse Analysis’ in D Schiffrin, D Tannen and HE Hamilton (eds), *The Handbook of Discourse Analysis* (Blackwell 2001) 352, 367.

²²⁹ Renugah Ramanathan and Bee Hoon Tan, ‘Application of Critical Discourse Analysis in Media Discourse Studies’ 21(2) 3L: The Southeast Asian Journal of English Language Studies 57, 58 <<http://ejournals.ukm.my/3l/article/view/9183>> accessed 9 July 2018.

²³⁰ Teun A van Dijk, *News as Discourse* (Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc 1988); van Dijk (n 137).

²³¹ Johan Farkas, Jannick Schou and Christina Neumayer, ‘Platformed Antagonism: Racist Discourses on Fake Muslim Facebook Pages’ 15(5) *Critical Discourse Studies* 463 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/17405904.2018.1450276>> accessed 9 July 2018.

van Dijk's ideology theory conceptualises four principles framed around the 'us versus them' dichotomy: emphasis of positive things about us, emphasis of negative things about them, de-emphasis of negative things about us and de-emphasis of positive things about them.²³² This is also referred to as an ideological square. Social theory proposes a three-dimensional model that includes description (analysis of text), interpretation (discourse in text production and interpretation) and explanation (situational, institutional and societal effects).²³³

Given the rhetorical challenges of disinformation – its goals of inciting outrage, its nebulous origins in power structures, its lack of concern for truth or logic – social theory allows for a multi-dimensional analysis of descriptive and discursive features. It incorporates means of production and context-based interpretation in analysis, which is crucial to understanding audience engagement of disinformation. Finally, aspects of explanation consider power relationships and transformative action, which, as shown in the discussion, are an important feature of the discourse within and about disinformation.

4.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND METHODOLOGY

This study collects and analyses headlines to detect human rights valences in disinformation within four environments – the US, Italy, Greece and Ukraine – chosen for their distinct engagements with and vulnerabilities to disinformation. To do this, headlines were observed and collected from fact-checking and debunking sites in each environment from 1 January to 30 June 2018. In addition to headlines, this study also examines memes, video titles, tweets and social media posts when the text operates or serves the function of a headline.

Headlines in each environment were collected from the fact-checking or debunking source. When a claim appeared on the website for the period specified, the headline as it appeared on the disinformation source was copied and coded according to semantic topics. This research excluded claims that were deemed to be at least half-true, as determined by the fact-checking website.

²³² Teun A van Dijk, *Ideology: A Multidisciplinary Approach* (Sage 1998) 267.

²³³ Norman Fairclough, *Discourse and Social Change* (Polity Press 1992) 56.

This study examined but did not include claims filed exclusively under ‘health’ as these claims largely constituted an insular ecosystem of hoaxes and urban legends beyond the concerns of this study.

Throughout the environments, there were instances where a claim did not feature a dominant headline, so a summary of the claim was written. While these do not feature in the analysis, they may be found in the appendix. In other cases, there were multiple headlines for a single claim. This study includes one chosen either for commonality or clarity. In cases where a headline could fit into two categories, its placement was determined based on pragmatic function and likely point of persuasion.

For example, ‘Obama administration kept illegal Mexican kids in detention camps as “experiment”’ fit in two code schemes: ‘social issues-immigration’ and ‘liberal-Obama’. Taken on their own, several features of the claim seem focused on denigrating Obama, but the use of ‘illegal’ also suggests that this is a comment on immigration policy. The context of the claim – it surfaced after Trump’s controversial family separation – made it more likely to be an attempt to legitimise policy first and denigrate Obama second. Hence, it was coded as ‘social issue-immigration’.

Each coded group was analysed by commonalities of actor, object, stance, sentiment and implication. Headlines were then interpreted through CP and social theory and presented in terms of description, interpretation and explanation. van Dijk’s ideology theory is also referenced in the interpretation discussion.

The main questions of this study are:

1. What human rights-relevant topics does disinformation engage?
2. If the above question yields result, what stances are taken by disinformation with regards to human rights?
3. What narratives might be formed by these stances?
4. What linguistic or rhetorical features are used in the formation of these stances?

This study comes with limitations. The collected headlines have all been disproven and shown to be false, so they do not encompass the totality of disinformation, as most disinformation likely goes un-debunked. Fact-checkers tend to select stories that are clearly debunkable, so more nuanced disinformation may be absent. The sources of the fact-checked

headlines also vary in technique and categorisation, so what is labelled as disinformation by one source might be described as manipulation by another; however, every headline featured in this study is demonstrably false and conforms to this study's definition of disinformation. Finally, discourse analysis has the potential to draw broad conclusions or posit widespread trends based on a limited corpus. This study does not suggest that its findings reflect the totality of what viral disinformation attempts to promote. Rather, it highlights areas of vulnerability for human rights that might be expanded or narrowed with future research.

Finally, this study analyses content in multiple languages. PolitiFact, StopFake and EUvsDisinfo operate or offer content in English. Content from Butac and EllinikaHoaxes was translated into English using online, automated translation services. As fact-checkers also engage with disinformation from other nations, this study analyses headlines in Turkish, Polish, French and Spanish in addition to the sources' native languages of English, Ukrainian, Russian, Italian and Greek. Content offered in English was subject to deeper linguistic analysis than headlines that were translated online. This has a minimal effect on the results. While this did limit analysis of lexical and grammatical features, headlines display limited syntactic variation and utilise overt cues. In cases where a translated headline is unclear, clarification is made in parentheses.

Despite these limitations, this research has applications for future studies of disinformation and the human rights regime. Quantitative big data research tries to identify areas where disinformation is likely to occur, and these findings can help better focus these areas. Bakir and McStay²³⁴ note the need for more in-depth, linguistic analysis of fake news headlines which this study provides to an extent. In their work for the Rand Corporation, Paul and Matthews argue that 'propagandists gain advantage by offering the first impression' so 'rather than trying to block, refute, or undermine the propaganda, focus instead on countering its objective'.²³⁵ This is an effort to better identify objectives or potential areas of attack.

²³⁴ Vian Bakir and Andrew McStay, 'Fake News and the Economy of Emotions' (20 July 2017) 6(2) *Digital Journalism* 157 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2017.1345645>> accessed 1 April 2018.

²³⁵ Christopher Paul and Miriam Matthews, 'The Russian "Firehose of Falsehood" Propaganda Model' (Rand Corporation, PE-198-OSD, 2016) 10 <www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE100/PE198/RAND_PE198.pdf> accessed 5 March 2018.

4.4 ENVIRONMENT BACKGROUND AND FACT-CHECKING SITES

For each environment, a fact-checking site was chosen. Information about each environment, its issues with disinformation, the site used and relevant information about it are provided below:

4.4.1 *United States*

The US has occupied much of the discussion about fake news. The 2016 election ushered fake news into cultural vernacular, and fake news as it pertains to the US dominates research, debate and public awareness. Several factors about the country's media landscape, including polarisation and economic incentives, make disinformation highly lucrative, spreadable and culturally relevant.

Attitudes towards the media are highly polarised, distrusting and hyperpartisan. Trust in the media has dropped consistently since 1977 and has remained below 50% since 2006, though it did enjoy an uptick between 2016 (its lowest point since 1973) and 2017.²³⁶ As of 2018, trust in media varies greatly, with the left displaying significantly higher levels than the right,²³⁷ and long-standing hostility towards the media persists. In a public opinion poll and behavioural study, 31% agreed with a Trump tweet that journalists are an 'enemy of the people'.²³⁸ Despite this, the US public is largely opposed to government regulation of fake news.²³⁹

This study used PolitiFact to compile fake news headlines. The site began in 2007 as an offshoot of the *Tampa Bay Times* (then the *St Petersburg Times*) and has since transferred ownership to the Poynter Institute. It is funded through content partnerships, advertising and grants. It asserts full independence in coverage, selection of topics and ratings of claims. PolitiFact checks various forms of media and political discourse.

²³⁶ Nic Newman and others, 'Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2017' (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2017) 102. <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/Digital%20News%20Report%202017%20web_0.pdf> accessed 5 March 2018.

²³⁷ Nic Newman and others, 'Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2018' (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2018) 62 <<http://media.digitalnewsreport.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/digital-news-report-2018.pdf?x89475>> accessed 8 July 2018.

²³⁸ Andrew Guess, Brendan Nyhan and Jason Reifler, "'You're Fake News!': Findings from the Poynter Media Trust Survey' (Poynter Journalism Ethics Summit, 2017) 5 <<https://poyntercdn.blob.core.windows.net/files/PoynterMediaTrustSurvey2017.pdf>> accessed 30 March 2018.

²³⁹ Newman and others (n 235) 20.

Its selection criteria include verifiability and the potential of a statement to mislead and/or engage the public. It seeks to maintain a bipartisan stance.²⁴⁰

PolitiFact tracks politicians' adherences to promises as well as their stances on issues, but its primary use in this study is its Truth-O-Meter which measures statements as 'true', 'mostly true', 'half true', 'mostly false', 'false' and 'pants on fire!'. It maintains a subject page for fake news. As of this writing, 73% of those claims are rated 'pants on fire!' while 'false' ratings comprise an additional 19%.

This study collected headlines from the fake news subject page as well as the general list of 2018 claims. Claims used in this study were rated 'pants on fire!' ('The statement is not accurate and makes a ridiculous claim') and 'false' ('The statement is not accurate'), with a small minority marked as 'mostly false' ('The statement contains an element of truth but ignores critical facts that would give a different impression').²⁴¹

4.4.2 Italy

Italy's recent election brought much attention to disinformation in the country. By the end of 2017, doctored images showing establishment politicians attending the funeral of mafioso went viral,²⁴² prompting several organisations to coordinate fact-checking efforts.

Italian online media is among the most polarised in Europe. Its most popular media outlets, *La Repubblica* and *TgCom24*, are dominated by users with strong political leanings.²⁴³ Compared to other European countries, Italians have low trust in the media – 39% expressed trust in 2017 – which is attributed to partisan journalism and heavy influence by business and political parties.²⁴⁴ Despite a minor uptick in 2018, trust remains low. It has also been noted that less politicised news brands are more trusted.²⁴⁵ Italy's geography places it on the frontlines of the

²⁴⁰ Angie Drobnic Holan, 'The Principles of the Truth-O-Meter: PolitiFact's Methodology for Independent Fact-Checking' (*PolitiFact*, 12 February 2018) <www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/article/2018/feb/12/principles-truth-o-meter-politifact-methodology-i/> accessed 30 March 2018.

²⁴¹ *ibid.*

²⁴² Paul Harrison, 'Italy's Vote: Fake Claims Attempt to Influence Election' (*BBC News*, 3 March 2018) <www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-43214136> accessed 5 March 2018.

²⁴³ Newman and others (n 235) 78.

²⁴⁴ *ibid.*

²⁴⁵ Newman and others (n 236) 88.

refugee and migrant crises, and this has impacted political discourse and challenged faith in the human rights regime.

This study collected disinformation from the website Butac. It is an independently run blog that claims a dedication to fighting hoaxes, misinformation, fear-mongering and online fraud guided by a stated passion for correct information. They profess an avoidance of political and ideological biases. Butac is not affiliated with any NGO or media outlet nor is it part of the IFCN. While some Italian fact-checkers are party to the IFCN, they mostly focus on claims made by politicians. Butac's focus on online misinformation, in addition to its reputation in the fact-checking community and transparency in operation, made it suitable for this study.

Despite not being connected to mainstream media, it has been used as a resource in academic research.²⁴⁶ It has also struggled with purveyors of disinformation. In 2018, it was briefly taken offline due to a defamation suit brought against them by a holistic medicine practitioner.²⁴⁷ It has since resumed status.

The site discusses any topics in the public interest, including politics, memes and public curiosities while encouraging readers to suggest claims to fact-check. At the end of each post they encourage small donations via Patreon. The most common site categories are 'bufala' ('where everything is fake') and 'disinformation' ('where starting from some truth someone decided to manipulate the facts to change the perception of the reader'). They write most about disinformation because 'those are the most dangerous'.²⁴⁸

Other categories include 'pseudo-journalism', 'uTonti', 'health', and 'pseudo-politics'. For this study, stories were mostly taken from the 'bufala' and 'disinformation' categories. It also employs a facticity scale, roughly translated as 'crap index' with four levels: low, medium, high and max, the latter indicating high falsity.

²⁴⁶ Richard Fletcher and others, 'Measuring the Reach of "Fake News" and Online Disinformation in Europe' (Reuters Institute, 2018) <<https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/2018-02/Measuring%20the%20reach%20of%20fake%20news%20and%20online%20distribution%20in%20Europe%20CORRECT%20FLAG.pdf>> accessed 15 June 2018.

²⁴⁷ Daniel Funke, 'When a Popular Italian Debunking Site Was Sued, a Judge Shut it Down' (Poynter.org, 16 April 2018) <www.poynter.org/news/when-popular-italian-debunking-site-was-sued-judge-shut-it-down> accessed 23 April 2018.

²⁴⁸ Email from Michelangelo Coltelli (Butac.it administrator and founder) to author (14 May 2008).

4.4.3 Greece

Greece's political climate and media environment are particularly conducive to disinformation. It is one of the only countries where trust in social media is higher than traditional news outlets, and it has consistently displayed the lowest levels of trust in media in all of Europe. Only 26% of the nation express confidence in the media landscape.²⁴⁹

Greece has long displayed low trust in established institutions,²⁵⁰ and the financial crisis as well as the government's response to it have reinforced scepticism in many institutions. The rise of populism coincides with heavy Euroscepticism. Like Italy, its geography has placed it at the forefront of Europe's refugee and migrant crises. In conjunction with the economic crisis, Greece increasingly seems overextended and underfunded by the EU, and attitudes of resentment and victimisation by the EU have influenced public discourse. Historical resentments contribute to this, while fraught relations with neighbours, North Macedonia and Turkey in particular, further facilitate an ecosystem where inflammatory content thrives.

Fact-checking organisations do not have as much of a media presence as they do in other parts of Europe. The website *EllinikaHoaxes* was chosen as a data collection source for its focus on online disinformation and engagement with claims that span political news to viral hoaxes. It is run by an editorial team of bloggers that state: 'Our common belief is that the internet is a valuable source of information and entertainment. However, it hides traps, many of which are dangerous'.²⁵¹

They select claims and categorise them according to the type of disinformation and then provide clarifications as to why claims are false and who is furthering them. Their most active categories include 'fake news', 'hoaxes', 'like farming', 'myths and history', 'misinformation', 'conspiracy' and 'health'. Some claims appear in multiple categories, and the site also features verifications, user guides and discussions about disinformation.

²⁴⁹ Newman and others (n 236) 82.

²⁵⁰ Yannis Theocharis and Jan W van Deth, 'A Modern Tragedy? Institutional Causes and Democratic Consequences of the Greek Crisis' (2015) 51(1) *Representation* 63 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/00344893.2015.1011464>> accessed 1 April 2018.

²⁵¹ Thodoris Daniilidis, 'About Us' (*EllinikaHoaxes.gr*, 2018) <<http://ellinikaHoaxes.gr>> accessed 13 April 2018.

The site was chosen for its inclusion of a wide range of topics relevant to the Greek population, its assertions of objectivity and value for accuracy, and its status in the Greek media landscape. Data was mostly collected from the ‘fake news’, ‘misinformation’ and ‘hoax’ categories as they are the most relevant and the most frequently updated. Other categories feature analysis of urban legends in addition to debunkings. When posts debunked a headline or claim, as opposed to analysing a common misperception, they were included.

The final month of this study’s observation period, which coincided with the announcement of a deal between Greece and North Macedonia, saw an escalation in disinformation. In the last half of June, multiple claims about police brutality against protestors emerged. The ‘conspiracy’ category, which was sparsely updated and mostly featured debunkings of pandemics and holistic medicine, started to address claims about mercenary armies hired by the Greek government to put down the people. The appearance of these claims was followed by the announcement of the expulsion of Russian diplomats over attempts to bribe politicians and meddle in national affairs.²⁵²

4.4.4 *Ukraine*

Few countries have been as affected by disinformation as Ukraine. At least since the annexation of Crimea by Russia, Ukraine has been bombarded by physical and informational warfare on a scale largely unseen post-Soviet collapse. The extent and effect of disinformation on Ukraine makes it a relevant study environment. Unlike data for the other environments, the headlines for Ukraine are weaponised with clearly identifiable sources and motivation.

Data has been collected from two sources. The first is StopFake. Started as a volunteer project by the Kyiv Mohyla Journalism School and the KMA Digital Future of Journalism to analyse Kremlin propaganda, it has expanded. It operates in 11 languages and on TV, radio and the internet. It also publishes a newspaper in Donbas. It refutes Kremlin-backed or -friendly disinformation and maintains archives of these claims. While it

²⁵² Angeliki Koutantou and Michele Kambas, ‘Greece, Russia to Expel Diplomats in Macedonia Tussle Ahead of NATO Summit’ (*Reuters*, 11 July 2018) <www.reuters.com/article/us-greece-russia-diplomats/greece-russia-to-expel-diplomats-in-macedonia-tussle-ahead-of-nato-summit-idUSKBN1K10PU> accessed 10 July 2018.

is not supported by Ukrainian institutions, it has received funding from the International Renaissance Foundation, the Foreign Ministry of the Czech Republic, the Embassy of United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland in Ukraine and the Sigrid Rausing Trust.²⁵³ Unlike the other sources in this study, it does not employ facticity scales or ratings, instead only selecting false stories and offering rebuttals. It features some claims labelled as ‘manipulation’ or ‘distortion’ but the majority are marked as ‘fake’.

Data from StopFake is augmented by the European External Action Service East Stratcom Task Force’s EUvsDisinfo website. This site collects and catalogues Kremlin disinformation efforts, listing markets and publishing outlets. Information is included if it is ‘a) false, which is determined by the facts and b) originating and in line with identified pro-Kremlin disinformation messaging’.²⁵⁴ For each claim, the website provides a summary of the disinformation, explains falsities and provides links to explanatory information. The website has revised its wording as to ‘not necessarily imply that the outlet concerned is linked to the Kremlin or pro-Kremlin, or that it has intentionally sought to disinform’. In this sense, theoretically it might include misinformation.

4.4.5 Notes on the sources and headlines

These sources were chosen for their professionalism, stated value and aspirations to objectivity or balance, and approach to content. However, they vary in different ways. While all the sites invite reader suggestions, Butac and EllinikaHoaxes have a wide scope, discussing anything that might catch the public’s eye from political disinformation to urban legends and health hoaxes. In this sense, their English-language equivalent might be Snopes.com. PolitiFact has an expectedly political focus, but it also features memes, social media posts and viral hoaxes. StopFake exclusively focuses on Kremlin-backed or -friendly disinformation in Ukraine, and EUvsDisinfo focuses on Kremlin-disinformation worldwide.

²⁵³ ‘About Us’ (StopFake.org, 2018) <www.stopfake.org/en/about-us/> accessed 30 March 2018.

²⁵⁴ ‘About’ (EUvsDisinfo, 2018) <<https://euvsdisinfo.eu/about/>> accessed 30 March 2018.

Two of these sources, Butac and PolitiFact, feature facticity scales in their fact-checks. EllinikaHoaxes labels claims based on facticity. All three include factual claims and news analysis. StopFake and EUvsDisinfo identify disinformation and explain how they are incorrect. A commonality among all the sites is that they feature resource guides and analyses of disinformation issues. Despite the variations between each source, this study believes that they all target the unique challenges of disinformation in their environments – political polarisation and media fracturing in the US, cultural insecurities in Italy and Greece, NLW in Ukraine – and provide a holistic, hybridised corpus for analysis that is indicative of wider disinformation stances.

This study attempts to provide the headlines as they appeared in their original publications, complete with original punctuation and formatting when possible. As a result, some headlines contain spelling or grammatical errors. Translated headlines have, in some cases, been edited for clarity, as automated translation is not without mistake. All headlines are listed in their original language in the appendix.

5.

RESULTS

5.1 GENERAL FINDINGS

This section provides a summary of research results. It details the findings of the study and responds to the research questions. It then analyses results by environment.

The research sample consists of 619 headlines and headline-adjacent texts collected from five sources across four environments (see appendix for complete list of headlines). The number of headlines by environment is listed below:

Table 2: Headline totals by country

Country	Total Headlines
US	164
Italy	142
Greece	131
Ukraine	182

In examining debunked disinformation headlines in the US, Italy, Greece and Ukraine from the first half of 2018, a series of narratives and linguistic features emerge. In response to the research questions for all four environments:

1. What human rights-relevant topics does disinformation engage?

Disinformation appeals to subject matter closely tied to identity politics and personal freedoms. Recurring topics include rights of

movement and the politicisation of migrant versus refugee status, social or humanitarian responses to violence, gender politics, race issues, culture and religion. Rights-based articulations of persecution are also present, usually accompanied by allegations of fascism.

Concepts of governance are closely tied to these issues. Corruption, sovereignty, the influence of international institutions, institutional efficacy and health structures are frequent topics as well.

2. If the above question yields result, what stances are taken by disinformation with regards to human rights?

Disinformation often posits that governments are negligent in their assurances of human rights. Headlines rely on existing binaries formed by social tensions to reinforce an ‘us versus them’ dichotomy and then to build on that dichotomy by suggesting that the in-group is being exploited by the out-group. Human rights are frequently regarded with scepticism, and rights-based causes are widely disparaged.

3. What narratives might be formed by these stances?

Across all four environments we find these narratives:

- Hostility towards the international order, particularly the insinuation that some entity – international law, the EU – seeks to control it, undermine it and humiliate it. Domestically, governments are seen as inept, out of touch and corrupt.
- Social and humanitarian movements are staged, disingenuous appeals to human rights that aim to oppress the populace. The White Helmets, the March for Our Lives organisers, fact-checkers – anyone who claims to be working for positive change is actually furthering an agenda of oppression.
- Refugees are migrants. Claims of asylum are smokescreens to exploit national benefits, erode native culture and supplant it with artificial liberalism.
- Countries are irreconcilably divided, mainly along partisan lines. To this:
 - Leftists care more about protecting non-citizens than their own people, and they overaccommodate as to not seem prejudiced while opening their own populations up to terrorism and unemployment.
 - Leftists hide fascist tendencies.
 - Right-wing causes are more popular than the media reflects.

- Liberalism, multiculturalism and internationalism erode traditional culture and induce values that are antithetical to the population in that they are either too conservative, as with narratives of Islam, or hedonistic, as with gender politics.

4. What linguistic or rhetorical features are used in the formation of these stances?

Syntactic features utilise the paradigms of news media to present false information and partisan interpretations as authoritative and urgent. Another common feature is what this study refers to as stance violations, where a famous figure is credited with a quote or attitude that is incorrect and often contradicts their known beliefs. The density of headlines also allows for the embedding of opinion or sentiment.

Memes and social media posts tend to be longer, more emotional and less formal, presenting outrage and first-person narratives as markers of authenticity. In many headlines, the inclusion of audio/visual proof is treated as verification even when it is unrelated or incongruent to the text. This suggests that even the pretence of visual proof can reinforce illusions of truthfulness over time.

These findings conform to existing descriptions of disinformation by Silverman²⁵⁵ and Horne and Adali.²⁵⁶ They also utilise the approaches described in the discussion of NLW in chapter 2 such as logical fallacies and blatant falsehoods.

Each environment has its own narratives, topics and subjects of disinformation. Local politicians, celebrities and cultural symbols appear based on environment. However, some individuals appear throughout the environments. Three figures featured in three or more environments: Oprah Winfrey, George Soros and Vladimir Putin.

Oprah's popularity is due to a manipulated interview in which she was presented as expressing violent racist attitudes. It was debunked by PolitiFact, Butac and EllinikaHoaxes. Soros is presented as a leftist bogeyman. In the US he is working with Obama and the Democrats to

²⁵⁵ Craig Silverman, 'Lies, Damn Lies and Viral Content' (Tow Center for Digital Journalism, 2015) <<https://doi.org/10.7916/D8Q81RHH>> accessed 4 March 2018.

²⁵⁶ Benjamin D Horne and Sibel Adali, 'This Just In: Fake News Packs a Lot in Title, Uses Simpler, Repetitive Content in Text Body, More Similar to Satire than Real News' (2017) CoRR <<https://arxiv.org/abs/1703.09398>> accessed 1 April 2018.

overthrow the government. In Ukraine, not content after the Maidan coup, he allegedly wants another. In Italy, he funds right-wing parties and an app to alert migrants to the presence of immigration agents. Putin is the only figure to appear in all the environments, and the only one to be presented positively. In all four environments, he is presented as proactive, assertive and sympathetic to the struggles of these countries.

The following sections present summaries of disinformation headlines, themes and relevant contextual analysis. The headlines retain their punctuation, spelling and grammar, even when they include mistakes. Some translated headlines have been edited for clarity, and the headlines in their original language can be found in the appendix.

Finally, it should be re-stated that all the headlines in the results section are not true. While the reasons for this may vary from fabrication to exaggeration or omission of relevant information, all of them are unambiguously untrue, and their presentation of information violates Gricean standards. Their falsity is a matter of pragmatics, not a matter of degree or semantics open to equivocation or debate. They are disingenuous attempts at manipulation, and they should not be understood in any way as offering a relevant perspective worthy of consideration.

5.2 US

US headlines were coded as celebrity, guns, social causes, liberal markers, Trump and media. A handful of claims associated with crime or governance were also found. The narratives that emerge from data collected from PolitiFact are largely anti-leftist. Common narratives imply the following: social/humanitarian movements are staged; leftists are political hacks exploiting causes; leftists care more about protecting othered agents than protecting citizens, and such overaccommodating puts citizens in danger; leftists are criminals facing imminent justice.

However, there is agitprop for both sides. The right, Trump especially, is portrayed as foolish, inept and blatantly uncaring about people. Prohibitive laws and cuts to services are alleged or exaggerated. They also posit blatant systematic inequalities, often using race or gender politics.

This sample does not include the US president's tweets. The president's utterances, verbal and digital, are inherently newsworthy, so

the media has a responsibility to fact-check them. Their inclusion would create an uneven distribution of data and overshadow other narratives. This study does include tweets from politicians or media figures if they are picked up by news media outlets or spread across social media and then debunked.

5.2.1 Celebrity

Claims tagged as celebrity are largely political. Some headlines were death hoaxes, but the majority are either pro-Trump or anti-Trump with degrees of structural complexity, as in examples where celebrities chastise others for anti-right views ('Says Sandra Bullock said to Hillary Clinton, "If you don't like our president you can leave and never come back again"). Many pro-Trump headlines utilise celebrities with appeal across political divides. They often feature women or African-American celebrities that are known for progressive views such as Denzel Washington, Sidney Poitier, Dolly Parton and Jennifer Aniston.

Celebrity anti-Trump sentiment often takes on tones of despair: 'Singer Miley Cyrus: "Trump fans are destroying my career, I can't stand them and I decided to move to ..."', 'Actor Brad Pitt: "Trump is not my president, we have no future with this ..."'. These could be interpreted as cheerleading for liberal perspectives, or as a sort of emotional victory for conservatives in that a liberal, openly pansexual pop star is destroyed by the mightiness of online Trump supporters, and a known liberal actor voices a stereotypical disdain associated with sore losers and overzealous liberals.

A final type, where action occurs – 'Jennifer Aniston: "Me and all the Trump supporter celebrities decide to make a company named "celebrities for Trump"', 'Hollywood celebs: We will go on "total strike" if Trump does not resign' – would successfully operate at the peripheral level to reinforce ideas that liberalism is extreme, that Trump support is more widespread than established media reports, and that liberals think they can bully US institutions with their influence.

5.2.2 *Guns*

Disinformation headlines about guns frame the anti-gun stance as hypocritical and part of a conspiracy to disarm citizens. They imply that gun violence is caused by liberals, racial and ethnic groups, and bullying committed by gun control activists.

Headlines disparaging the students who organised the March For Our Lives protest solicit conspiracy theory mentality. David Hogg is denounced as an actor furthering a government conspiracy, while Emma Gonzalez is repeatedly portrayed as a violent radical. ‘Emma Gonzalez bullied school shooter, isn’t sorry; then retweets message blaming “white boys’ entitlement” as cause of all school shootings’ uses identity politics to posit discrimination of the right and attribute violence to the activists. ‘Congressman just annihilated Parkland “victim” in calling her out -- now he’s facing arrest!’ extends this framing by insinuating that truth-to-power ethics for right-wing causes is subject to persecution.

Another salient point is the blaming of gun violence on liberals (‘Breaking: Santa Fe killer expresses his love for Obama’, ‘So many of these shooters turn out to be communist Democrats’). Gun-related headlines also reference the Pope: ‘Pope Francis: Gun owners “can’t call themselves Christian”’. Both claims could be seen as liberal wish fulfilment, but the actual sources point to a conservative, pro-gun bent that promotes scepticism of international institutions, suggesting that not even the Pope understands the US.

‘It begins: Florida police now confiscating guns from people with no due process’ and ‘Democrats go full tyranny: now demand nationwide gun confiscation from law-abiding Americans ... at gunpoint, of course’ play to common conservative rejections of gun control and frame action as urgent and sweeping. ‘Due process’ and ‘law-abiding’ trigger anger over deprivation while the second headline’s closing tag ‘at gunpoint, of course’ signals hypocrisy.

Finally, ‘The United States is 3rd in murders throughout the world. If you remove Chicago, Detroit, Washington, St. Louis and New Orleans, the United States is then 189th out of 193 countries in the entire world’ suggests that small populations of urban areas are responsible for the country’s disproportionately high murder rate. That these areas are diverse and heavily populated by African-American communities provides a subtext that gun violence is a product of race.

5.2.3 *Social issues*

‘Social issues’ were coded to headlines referencing immigration, Islam, race and gender politics. Immigration was closely tied to crime, criticism of the Democratic party and allowances that would undermine law if enacted. The connection to crime is present in ‘566,000 crimes made in Texas by criminal aliens in the last 6 years’ while right-wing personality Ann Coulter tweeted ‘100% of heroin/fentanyl epidemic is because we don’t have a WALL.’

Criticism of Democrats puts forward conflicting stances in which they are negligent – ‘Democrats who just voted to deport Dreamers. Share to shame Democrats who are enabling Trump’s racism’, ‘Democrats are nowhere to be found on DACA’ – and overly permissive – ‘California To Register Illegal Aliens To Vote – Automatically’ and ‘Chuck Schumer slams President Trump: “it’s racist to only allow citizens to vote”’. The headlines imply that liberal actors in the government systematically undermine the law to give special treatment to immigrants who are, of course, illegal. These also validate Trump’s claims about voter fraud, particularly in Democrat-won areas.

Another headline – ‘[Democrats] booed families of children murdered by MS13’ – combines both stances to suggest that Democrats are pro-illegal immigrant gang members and against their victims. In actuality, the video that accompanied that headline depicted Republicans booing at the term ‘illegal immigrants’.

Following the implementation of family separations at the border, two other narratives emerged. The first frames the system as inhuman. ‘This is what happens when a government believes people are “illegal.” Kids in cages’ presents an accurate narrative with inaccurate images. The other narrative is that this policy is with precedent: ‘Bill Clinton passed a law in 1996 that separated children from adults illegally entering America’. Similar claims say that ‘[Hillary] Clinton “gifted” children to human traffickers’ and that the ‘Obama administration kept illegal Mexican kids in detention camps as “experiment”’. The second narrative seeks to absolve the current administration of wrong-doing by (falsely) suggesting that this policy has been acceptable and opposition to it is politically motivated.

Other social issues related to Islam, race, and gender. Headlines suggest that radical Islam has infiltrated the country and that the law sides with the out-group (‘82-year-old who killed a Muslim in

self-defense gets the death penalty’, ‘Burka clad woman runs over baby, gets away with crime for one stunning reason ...’). An extension of this is that the Trump administration is effectively ending this: ‘Just in: 45 states just banned Sharia law’, ‘BREAKING Trump Removes Muslim Federal Judge For Trying To Implement Sharia Law In America’. More so, ‘Breaking: Czech Republic arms citizens. You can now shoot terrorists on sight’ suggests that other governments are free to defend themselves while the US is held captive by rights considerations. There is also the implication that terrorists have a distinct physical appearance.

Headlines about race purport that black rights issues are destroying business (‘First NFL team declares bankruptcy over kneeling thugs’) or exploiting their treatment for financial gain (‘Black men arrested In Philadelphia Starbucks settle for \$2 million’). In other cases, blackness is framed as militant and racist (‘Congressional Black Caucus introduces bill: tax people for being white’, ‘Malia Obama suspended after racist anti-white attack goes viral’). A headline that says a young rapper in Texas faces the death penalty while the Santa Fe High School shooter might get parole posits blatant bias.

Gender-related headlines propose that women are incompetent (‘A Female-Led Construction Company Built The Florida Bridge That Collapsed’) or disingenuous (‘Application for March for Our Lives permit was made months before Parkland shooting’) and dangerous (‘The Violent Radicals Behind March for Our Lives: Women’s March Leaders’). ‘Starbucks CEO: “If You Support Traditional Marriage We Don’t Want Your Business”’ is likely another viral hoax associated with 4chan that targets the company for supposed liberalisms while imbedding the term “traditional marriage” as an othering technique.²⁵⁷

5.2.4 *Liberal markers*

PolitiFact debunked several viral stories that made false claims about liberal actors such as Democrats, Robert Mueller, George Soros, the California legislature, the Clintons and the Obamas. The majority of these claims allege corruption, open disdain or ignorance of democratic process on behalf of the subject, and attempts to take over the US.

²⁵⁷ Dan Evon, ‘Is Starbucks Offering Coupons for Black Customers Only?’ (Snopes.com, 18 April 2018) <www.snopes.com/fact-check/starbucks-coupon-for-black-customers-only/> accessed 18 April 2018.

These headlines were sub-divided into three categories: miscellaneous liberal markers, Clinton headlines and Obama headlines.

Headlines show liberal figures in open contempt of the law facing legal ramifications. ‘Mueller will be forced to resign over Pelosi affair’ and ‘Maxine Waters Is Getting Criminally Charged!’ undermine criticisms of acting administrations, presuppose previous and long-standing violations of law, and state that current governments are effective in identifying and punishing them. One example, ‘Mexico’s Next President Calls for An Invasion Of The US’, plays on immigration connotations but transfers the fearmongering of nativist discourse to an entire state.

‘Russian source behind fake Trump dossier killed in Russian plane crash, Rosatom CFO also dead’ reaffirms conspiracy theories about the Russia investigation as a smear campaign. Other headlines show an insensitivity for conservative issues such as ‘Heitkamp High-Fives Schumer After Voting Against 20-Week Abortion Ban’. ‘California State Assembly bill would ban (selling the) Bible!’ is an attempt at narratives of cultural erosion. This ‘mostly false’ headline refers to a law that would outlaw the gay conversion industry, yet this case was used to posit persecution of freedom of religion.

Headlines about the Clintons continue long-held conspiracy theories that reflect moral depravity and corruption among the left. Headlines tie them to a real sex cult echoing Pizzagate, the death of Anthony Bourdain and general corruption. Accusations and presumptions of guilt are often embedded in the headline, as in ‘Bill Clinton’s hitman confesses on his deathbed’. They also suggest that Hillary Clinton has disdain for her supporters (‘Clinton: “the average Democrat voter is just plain stupid, they’re easy to manipulate”’) and is a pawn of a Zionist, inhumane global plot (‘Clinton Email: We must destroy Syria for Israel’).

Obama-relevant headlines are similarly themed. They allege recently exposed corruption and attempts to undermine the Trump government as in ‘Obama just broke federal law in attempt to take over presidency from Trump’, and ‘Jeff Sessions Caught Colluding with Obama’. Claims about the Obama family hating white people and that Obama was spying on the Trump campaign also persist.

5.2.5 *Trump*

Headlines relating to Donald Trump comprise anti-Trump disinformation portraying him as inept or corrupt, clickbait about the Trump family and pro-Trump stories that show victories over liberal agendas.

Anti-Trump content comes in memes such as ‘White House staff compiled a number of gorilla documentaries into a makeshift gorilla channel (for Trump)’. Reports about slashing public services – ‘Trump: police officers and firefighters make too much money...hits them with tax penalty’, ‘BREAKING: Trump Just Ended Welfare For One HUGE Group For 5 Years! – Let The Riots ERUPT!’ – seem optimised to stoke outrage and reaffirm existing attitudes. ‘Official: Rudy Giuliani officially resigns, Trump’s legal team on it’s last leg’ and ‘Breaking: FBI just raided the White House, 6 people thrown out’ posit similar claims of widespread illegality and impending punishment as those with liberal markers.

Tabloid-esque details about the Trump family such as inter-fighting and the hiring of an exorcist exist, but a more noticeable trend is the success of Donald Trump in standing up to left-wing markers as in ‘[Trump is] canceling funding for Obama’s free house and library’, ‘Trump declares globalist Soros as “national security threat” using Obama’s 2014 executive order’, ‘Trump wins the award Obama never could’. These are terse, celebratory statements that invent institutional injustices and attribute success to Trump.

5.2.6 *Media*

Headlines about media and technology further fears about technofascism and attract partisan attention by claiming that media is taking steps against a certain political ideology. Technology-adjacent headlines elicit conspiracy theories, such as ‘Bill Gates’ Former Doctor Says Billionaire “Refused To Vaccinate His Children”’, ‘All Citizens Who Want to Receive Gvt Benefits Must Agree to Be Microchipped in the Near Future’.

Media claims suggest that partisan outlets are being exposed and punished. For right-leaning audiences ‘CNN shocks America, fires “journalist” who made fun of Sarah Sanders’ face’, ‘Breaking: Michelle Wolf fired – Comedy Central apologizes to Sarah Sanders’ suggest that

the media is becoming more conservative. ‘CNN to permanently close its doors as ratings plunge 30 percent’, and ‘YouTube witness makes shocking admission on live TV. CNN pulls plug immediately’ validate accusations of liberal media bias.

A meme purporting to show Whoopi Goldberg wearing a t-shirt with a cartoon Donald Trump shooting himself accompanied by the text ‘Out of curiosity @ABC & @Disney this (index finger pointing down emoji) is okay with you? ...’ continues the right-wing narrative that the left uses double standards about what is acceptable. ‘Red Hen owner just issued sick threat to Sarah Sanders’ also suggests this. The claim conflates the act of asking Sanders to leave, which the restaurant owner did, with others’ harassment of Sanders to present an incorrect threat.

‘Laura Ingraham just fired!!!’ and ‘Fox News accidentally puts up a poll graphic that shows how they are the least trusted network’ seem to confirm leftist grievances against right-wing media. ‘FOX Network Picks Up “Roseanne,” Saying It Has No Problem With Occasional Racism’ goes further to stoke liberal outrage by presenting an institutional awareness of racism. The implication of these media bias confirmation narratives is that the other is aware of their ethically corrupt standing. The other side is propaganda.

5.2.7 *Curiosities*

Two headlines that were debunked took on semantic truth with time. ‘Democrats announce they will abolish ICE if they win 2020 election’ was declared false by PolitiFact. Dismantling the ICE has been proposed by some progressive candidates but is in no way party policy, and the information listed in the article itself, especially its attribution of this policy to Kamala Harris, is untrue.²⁵⁸ However, after the implementation of family separations and criminal prosecution for border crossings, several politicians have adopted this viewpoint.²⁵⁹

²⁵⁸ Miriam Valverde, ‘Website Claims Democrats Plan to Abolish ICE If They Win 2020 Election’ (*PolitiFact*, 15 March 2018) <www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/15/blog-posting/website-claims-democrats-plan-abolish-ice-if-they-/> accessed 5 July 2018.

²⁵⁹ Daniella Diaz, ‘These Democrats Want to Abolish ICE’ (*CNN*, 3 July 2018) <<https://edition.cnn.com/2018/07/02/politics/abolish-ice-democrats-list/index.html>> accessed 5 July 2018.

As a headline, ‘Breaking: Supreme Court sides with Trump - this changes everything!’ could be seen as true following the Supreme Court upholding parts of Trump’s travel ban. They did side with Trump, and proponents of that decision might believe that it does mean widespread, even pervasive, change. However, this headline, which appeared and was debunked months before that ruling relates to a fictional court decision banning the teaching of Sharia law in US schools.

5.3 ITALY

Disinformation campaigns in Italy were closely watched in the lead-up to the election, and the headlines of the first half of this year mainly focus on politics and social issues, especially immigration. Culture and media headlines also show an intersection of human rights concerns and disinformation.

These headlines were coded as politics, culture, media and technology, social issues and international affairs or relations. Aside from the election, the struggle to form a government, the murders in Macerata and the controversy over the Aquarius ship docking provided fodder for disinformation purveyors.

The most common narratives across categories imply the following: the right-wing is more popular than people think while also being excluded from voting processes and online discourse; leftist governments are full of cronyism and corruption, and they overtax the public and fail to serve adequately; resentments between the north and south are the result of stated disdain and visible disrespect; leftists care more about fulfilling EU-mandated humanitarian causes, and by overaccommodating they put citizens in danger; the same entities that value human rights are actually racist; refugees are not actually in need. Narratives and claims are highly partisan with attempts to portray the other side as disingenuous, corrupt and heartless on both sides.

5.3.1 Politics

Disinformation headlines relating to politics concerned corruption, wealth and taxation, political divisions and institutional failures. These are reinforced by high political polarisation and resentment over the economy.

The headlines disproved by Butac show an effort to discredit election findings and suggest an institutional undermining of democracy through the persecution of right-wing parties. In the days before the vote, a fake chart attributed to the BBC showed the Five Star party far ahead in the polls. Another headline suggested that a Forza Nuova candidate was unfairly prevented from campaigning. ‘SICILY: 500 thousand pre-filled cards with the symbol of the PD were found. New ones will be printed’ implies leftist scheming to commit election fraud. A meme that showed right-wing parties omitted from absentee ballots perpetuates discrimination narratives and omits relevant election law.

Disinformation headlines include heavy partisanship, portraying opposing parties as foolish and presumptuous. Multiple quotes erroneously attributed to Salvini purport hypocrisy. The Five Star party is said to be full of supporters of pseudoscience, while it and Lega Nord are funded by Soros. ‘Regeni? Relations with Egypt are more important’ and ‘Salvini removes the escort to Saviano’ frame the politician as feckless and unconcerned with justice.

‘BOLDRINI: “DI MAIO AND SALVINI ARE THE EVIL! YOU WANT A LAW AGAINST LEGA AND M5S”’ attributes hyperbolic judgement to the left to allege bias against populists on the right. A claim that Salvini did not stand up when the president addressed the chamber is a corresponding example of left-wing stoking outrage. Both present video evidence that does not support the claim.

Corruption was a frequent theme. Politicians Furbata and Boldrini are frequently accused of cronyism. Memes showing an individual supposedly related to a politician with text describing a useless post in the government with a high salary have become so common that they have been repurposed as satire.²⁶⁰ Cottarelli was linked to a corrupt corporation, while ‘The Scoop Of The Gregorio That Nails PD and the Republic’ is another framing of systematic liberal corruption now being exposed. This was reinforced by accusations that the Partito Democratico had legislated severance packages for themselves, which is a recycled viral hoax from 2013.

Headlines about taxation, wealth and institutional failure heavily coincided with allegations of cronyism and corruption.

²⁶⁰ Shadow Ranger, ‘BEFFA: This Is Ambrogio Salvini, Eldest Son of Matteo Salvini – Bufale.net’ (Bufale.net, 18 March 2018) <www.bufale.net/home/beffa-ambrogio-salvini-figlio-maggiore-matteo-salvini-bufale-net/> accessed 30 April 2018.

Disinformation repeatedly suggests that the government overtaxes and spends irresponsibly. Claims state that the government is taking benefits from widows, increasing utility bills on electricity, refusing to make cuts to their own salaries while raising the national debt and denying people a universal income that is already part of the constitution.

These headlines coincide with wealth hoaxes, wherein people discover greatly appreciated investments in old furniture or leave their fortunes to odd recipients like pets or Berlusconi, the latter of which is 'ready to invest more than 150 million euros in a company that can change your life' in another hoax. 'Giuseppe Conte? He is the "poorest" premier in history' cheerleads the populist head of government. Other economic headlines exploit concerns over poverty ('UNBELIEVABLE!!! A couple of Italians lose their homes: they are forced to live in cars ...') or alternatively overextend claims to suggest the opposite ('I've been looking for 25 workers for 3 months, I've only found four').

Institutional failures are used to further narratives about bureaucratic inefficiency or injustice. Headlines disparage the courts ('He Had Stolen Kicked Scooter. The Judge Denies The Reintegration To Work') or, with the claim that a person had to compensate burglars for injuries on their property, push narratives of law that does not serve the lawful. Other headlines allege brutal crime against public authority or suggest failures of bureaucracy to facilitate cancer treatment or feed poor children at school.

In addition to these, there are allegations against the international order. 'EUROPE RISKS ANOTHER FUKUSHIMA' and 'In French supermarkets, motor oil in mayonnaise. But it is not withdrawn from the trade: Officially for "Absence of acute toxicity"' present an EU that is careless and dangerous. The headline 'Sexual violence in Syria' and its first sentence, 'Meanwhile, according to the BBC, some Syrian women would have been abused by UN workers and other NGOs, who exchanged food and other aid with "sexual favors"' misattributes reporting about NGO workers frequenting prostitutes, twisting those reports into institutional exploitation at the highest levels of humanitarian organisations.

5.3.2 *Social issues*

Disinformation about social issues predominately focuses on immigration, with a limited number of claims dealing with Islam, race and gender politics.

Headlines about immigrants present different narratives, among them that refugees are not in trouble, the state takes better care of non-citizens than it does citizens, non-citizens are criminals, the government is not doing enough to help refugees and stance violations where one side is framed to be hostile or foolish. Presenting non-citizens as exploitative and ungrateful is another recurring trend.

The notion that refugees are opportunistic immigrants is pushed by conspiracy narratives. Memes use photos to suggest that a Coast Guard rescue was staged, and the White Helmets hoax was widely circulated in Italian cyberspace. Stories about other European countries devalue asylum claims: ‘France: Migrants having fun’ and ‘The deception of the “refugees”: in Germany 43% are fake minors’.

One of the defining rhetorical stances of xenophobic debate is the idea that the government cares more about othered groups (immigrants, migrants, refugees, minorities) than it does its own nationals. Some disinformation – the fake receipt for the Lampedusa refugee camp or the story of a migrant spreading tuberculosis – strongly infer victimisation of the public, others are more direct such as ‘While the refugees are in 3-star hotels, look at the conditions of the earthquake victims’ and ‘FREE DENTIST FOR IMMIGRANTS: NOTHING FOR THE POOR ITALIANS’.

Others operate in between: ‘Did you know that all the Chinese shops in Italy for the first 5 years do not pay taxes, just after 5 years change the name and you’re covered for another 5 years ...’ and ‘the government offers the illegal immigrants 500 euros per month!’. These claims also extend to Muslims. They allege that the PD government has forced an elderly citizen into poverty while a Nigerian named Mohamed who ‘has never done [anything] from the morning to the evening’ has been given a room in a five-star hotel, an Iphone, and 30 Euros per day, and ‘PD: “ITALIAN CHILDREN LEARN ARABIC TO INTEGRATE”’ combines this with the narrative of cultural erosion. Such claims not only present othered groups as burdens on the state, they also present them as beneficiaries of advantages not enjoyed by the public.

‘Kyenge immediately threatens the new government: “The illegal immigrants must keep the same rights!”’ frames immigrants as entitled and ungrateful, while the quoted use of illegal immigrants suggests that they are consciously exploiting Italy. Muslims are also shown as demanding and ungrateful as in ‘Austria, the dying daughter in the hospital is in the room with a Muslim, the father cannot come to visit her’.

These coincide with efforts to portray out-groups as animal-like such as ‘The alert is triggered: refugees rush into cars to get compensation’. ‘And here is the beautiful station of central Milan’ is a real image of people sleeping in a train station, but it was taken in 2015, implying that someone wants Italians to think that the previous government has done nothing to address immigration concerns and that the current government needs more power to do so.

False claims about the Aquarius paint those on the ship as opportunistic and disingenuous (‘Aquarius, the migrants throw away the red cross gifts and go to the restaurant with 100 euro bills’), who are purposely being forced on Italy (‘The captain of the Aquarius vessel ... refuses to dock in Malta for “adverse weather conditions” ... 26 degrees and sunny – Valletta’). This allows for convenient denials of duty. If other countries are perceived as not taking migrants and refugees, then this grievance can be used to absolve Italians of their human rights obligations.

The deceit placed on those on the Aquarius is extended to their supporters. Another meme showing Rome’s football captain Francesco Totti with the text, ‘Today I fight for the reception of the refugees, what I forgot to tell you is that I was in business with Odevaine and that these businesses gave me a million euros a year for renting my apartments to immigrants’ continues the framing of pro-refugee and pro-migrant figures as corrupt and hypocritical. International attitudes towards immigration are superimposed on Italy. On the same day that Butac debunked a meme showing images of children in a concentration camp with an image purported to be from the US child immigrant camps (it was actually an image of Palestinian children held in an Israel camp), it also debunked footage of a Putin interview that was subtitled in Italian to make it seem that he was talking about the Aquarius.

Crime-based headlines are also heavily exploitative. For example, ‘Heart and Liver of Pamela Eaten in a Ritual of the Nigerian Mafia’ uses the murder in Macerata as a vehicle for stereotypes about immigrants

and refugees while ‘Macerata: who really shot the migrants?’ attempts to cast doubt on right-wing violence. ‘Girl found in a Roma camp in Greece: turn the photo to warn the parents’ retrenches biases against the Roma population.

‘Macron: “Italy was a fascist country, it deserves all immigrants”’ compacts Euroscepticism with narratives of Italy as a put-upon state at the centre of a plot to erode its culture. ‘When Italy was able to say No to Islam!! In the thirties, the ambassador of Saudi Arabia, requested an audience with the Head of the Government OF BENITO MUSSOLINI ...’ presents Italian timidity in the face of cultural erosion. These headlines imply that fascism was willing to protect Italian identity while the EU, symbolised by Macron, still punishes Italy for its past and seeks to dilute its national identity. This is also seen in “‘Too many white citizens’”: excluding a Hungarian city from the European capital of culture’ which implies that Europe is engaged in a superficial diversity drive that denies ethnic majorities their place in a presumed cultural hierarchy.

Mixed messages of empathy are also present. ‘A Syrian child frightened by bombing. Dear politicians, these are the children to help ... not the nice muscular packs that run around Italy and break our balls in the parking lots ... SHAME ON YOU!’ denigrates out-groups already in the country, suggests that the current asylum process does not help those who need it, and implies widespread failure of protection and immigration regimes. ‘History of Segen, who died of hunger in Italy after arriving from Libya...’ profess empathy and shame the current administration, but they are inaccurate. While they lack the racism of other disinformation, they might be effective in convincing one part of the population that the government does too little, while another part thinks they do too much.

Gender politics suggest that children are being inappropriately educated. ‘Dad, at school they explained to me that I can change sex’ argues that gender liberalism is warping children’s minds. ‘How do I accept you, make you normal and legalize your pedophilia!’ goes even further by presenting LGBTQI awareness as an agenda to normalise pedophilia. This claim uses an image from a children’s book advocating gay conversion therapy written in the 1990s. This appropriation of a children’s medium is distasteful in itself, but taken in consideration of the meme, it is an indication of an anti-gay agenda being imposed on children.

5.3.3 *Culture and media*

Headlines about technology, media and culture include global hoaxes, scams, celebrity urban legends and claims about Italian travel issues. Beyond these, discourse about media and culture exhibit partisan attitudes.

Fact-checking itself has been misrepresented. ‘Activissimo works for the Italian Government? The case ends up in Parliament’ presents fact-checkers as criminals when the actual information refers to a social scientist advising parliament on fake news. Butac itself was criticised by anti-vaxxer scientist Stefano Montanari in a Facebook post. Left-leaning journalist Saviano is also a topic for criticism. In addition to the claim ‘Salvini removes the escort to Saviano’ which was coded under governance due to its potential to reflect on the politician, there is also a disparaging meme about the journalist that accuses him of elitism, plagiarism, and ‘massacring the reputation of the Neapolitans’.

A meme showing a young person with a sign saying, ‘Better to give it to a Nigerian than to a Po valley’ uses immigration to stoke regional resentments. Another meme, ‘... THE EVASION MAP’, shared on Facebook with the caption ‘THE TRUTH ... ON THE FISCAL EVASION FOR REGIONS ...’ fuel tensions between the north and south. The first meme presents southern resentment against the north while the unreliable tax evasion statistics posit northern exploitation of the south.

The erosion of Italian culture is presented in ‘The last folly of the Fedeli: the Italian theme will be abolished’ and its replacement is hinted at in ‘At school, African spirits and tribal rituals were evoked’. ‘It is not Auschwitz ... They are Ukrainians, under the communist regime 7,000,000 of dead. THE DAY OF MEMORY IS ALSO FOR THEM?’ and a claim that begins ‘These are the partisans, April 25th’ and goes on to say that leftists raped and executed fascist supporters use doctored visuals to advance accusations of fascism on the left.

‘Saviano: You miss a little detail: the Nigerian could not have known that to cut a person to pieces is a crime in Italy, the leghist instead knew very well that shooting [a person] is a crime’ establishes several unfortunate stances. This is a fake tweet that was made to look as if it occurred in a very real exchange on Twitter between journalist Roberto Saviano and blogger Tommaso Longobardi. But the response ascribed to a leading liberal voice in the country evokes the racism of lowered expectations, strong partisanship and the common criticism of human rights to overaccommodate othered groups without challenging the wrongs of those groups.

5.4 GREECE

Disinformation in Greece is informed by deep-seated tensions and vulnerabilities. The economic crisis, influxes of refugees and migrants, and fraught international relations contribute to a media environment that is prone to inflammatory content. Institutional corruption has long been a concern for the public, and low trust in institutions is well-documented.

The media has yet to develop a fact-checking network that compares in complexity to the other environments, and people have relatively high trust in social media news²⁶¹ and objectively low trust in established media. Exposure to fabricated content is also higher than in other countries news.²⁶² During the observation period, Star Media presented an interview with the wife of a military pilot. When fact-checkers revealed that she was a single actress, they responded by promising to 'legally move against anyone responsible for false reporting'.

Disputes with neighbours and resentment of the EU are also potent sources for discord. Relations with Turkey are particularly discouraging after acts of aggression. Relations with North Macedonia may improve with the recent agreement, but the first half of 2018 was marked by protests and intense displays of emotion on that issue. Greece also has historical grievances against Germany, and these impact discourse about the EU.

Headlines were coded and separated into four categories: international affairs, governance, social issues and culture. Within these, common narratives emerged including the erosion of culture, overaccommodation by leftists towards out-groups at the expense of the citizenry, validation for Greece concerning regional tensions, government corruption, incompetence and oppression, as well as the narrative that other countries control Greece's fate.

²⁶¹ Nic Newman and others, 'Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2017' (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2017) 72 <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/Digital%20News%20Report%202017%20web_0.pdf> accessed 5 March 2018.

²⁶² Nic Newman and others, 'Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2018' (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2018) 80 <<http://media.digitalnewsreport.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/digital-news-report-2018.pdf?x89475>> accessed 8 July 2018.

5.4.1 *International affairs*

International affairs disinformation features military-themed statements that exploit regional tensions. Hoaxes related to the Middle East are part of this narrative. The White Helmets conspiracy attracted online attention, and EllinkaHoaxes also debunked emotionally manipulative content such as ‘Syria ... Little girl keeps the eyes of her doll closed not to see the horror’.

Other international stances frame populist leaders as determined: Trump demoralises liberal figures like Soros and Matt Damon, and Putin takes a stand against minorities in Russia. Turkish disinformation also appears in the Greek environment. The claim ‘Greece and Cyprus Buying Russian Weapons’ resonated in the press, as did Greek rumours of US military build-up in Cyprus. Meanwhile, the headline “‘Red’ from Berlin to the F-16 upgrade: ‘The last thing Greece needs is an armament program’” is an attempt at pushing anti-EU sentiment, exploiting historical grievances and stoking fears about the submission of the Greek state.

Disinformation about competitive military resources presents the escalation of Greek forces (‘Sudden movement of a Patriot rocket array in Attica’) and Turkish ones (‘Images of the military scene in Evros! The Turkish army develops tanks and infantry’). These are accompanied by inflammatory expressions of supremacy. ‘Greek press: We cannot deal with the Turks’ appeared in Turkish media and ‘This video proves that: In 48 hours the Hellenic Air Force will knead the Turkish war machine’ in Greek media.

Turkish aggression is heavily framed based on current events (‘Exclusive testimony: They “took” them out of the outpost! [concerning Turkey arresting two Greek soldiers]’, ‘Turkish government spokesman: Greek soldiers are also accused of spying’). The death of a military pilot offered opportunities for anti-establishment speculation (‘Document - documentary about the fall of Mirage and the death of the shooter: Skyros radio was out of order!’) and literal fake news in ‘THE HEROIC WOMEN OF OUR MILITARY STRUGGLE’ mentioned in the introduction to this section.

The validation of pro-Greek stances, as in ‘... Formal cessation of arms sales to Turkey by the US’, are buttressed by negative reporting

of the Turkish military. Headlines about Afrin are also used to show moral depravity of the Turkish forces ('Turkish soldiers are running and kicking Kurdish mistresses in Afrin! (video)') or military weakness ('IN A DAY OF HARD FIGHTING 31 TURKISH SOLDIERS DEAD (VIDEO)').

Another set of headlines frame aggression on the part of North Macedonia and validation from the international community. 'Putin takes back the recognition of Skopje' and 'Shock: CHO: VETO to NATO-EU. from Bulgaria for the name "Macedonia"! Everything changes ...' suggest the international community sides with Greece. North Macedonian incitement is posed through memes such 'Macedonians changed the name of a motorway from "Alexander of Macedonia" to "former Alexander of Macedonia"'.

Following the announcement of a deal between Greece and what is now North Macedonia, headlines sought to agitate the issue. There are claims that protests were violent and police used oppressive measures ('"Battles" in Pisoderi with dozens of wounded - Woman in coma', 'IN PRESPE THEY USE RUBBER BULLETS. WATCH THE VIDEO [use of plastic bullets]') and of conflicts between Greeks and North Macedonians ('Macedonian media: Fights between Greeks and Skopje in a handball match').

More so, North Macedonia was presented as overeager ('Skopje has already released the new passport and writes "North Macedonia"'), and disinformation presented the agreement as the start of a German plot to divide Greece ('Shock from Germany after signing Tsipra: Prepare "union" of Macedonia - See the map of state DW').

Viral memes also exacerbate tensions 'From the textbooks of the junta. Wow patriots' tries to inflame tensions about Macedonia's past and 'Stadium "froze": Hitler appeared in a World Cup game!' is another attempt to stoke hostility and accusations of Nazism against Germany. The website also debunked conspiracy claims about Greece hiring mercenary armies to oppress the people ('Blackwater is in Greece to protect the government - They are afraid of a rebellion', 'SEEBRIG Brigade - Masonic Police in Greece. It is very important that the Greeks learn that we have evidence of an occupying army').

5.4.2 Governance

Disinformation about governance is presented in three stances: the common man victimised by government measures, economic hoaxes and corruption or ineptness by government.

Headlines present government measures as unfairly targeting normal people. ‘They went to fine 500 euros in fishermen in Skopelos for ... plastic bag’ and ‘BOMBA: “Hotels do not owe rights to TVs in the rooms”’ present undue taxation and regulation. Institutions are shown as inept in ‘Greek police to citizens: Greek police to citizens: If robbers break into your house ... pretend to be asleep’. ‘OPENING THE ROAD FOR DOG MEAT AT SUPER MARKET OF GREECE!’ furthers the narrative of Greece not being in control of its laws.

These are reinforced by out-of-context reports about financial misconduct and prosecution (‘Three-year imprisonment for Artemis Sora - Can pay and be released’) Economic hoaxes exploit anxieties of the financial crisis to suggest fictional relief as in “Bomb” decision of the Athens Court of First Instance: No borrower owes nothing - What are the conditions’ or conspiracy narratives, such as ‘The banker who reveals the shocking truth that hides us! (VIDEO)’.

Headlines exploiting scepticism in the government suggest cronyism (‘This is a kitten position ... Special Associate to Minister for African Dust’) and corruption (‘The accounts of the Governor of the Bank of Greece, Giannis Stournaras and his wife, were pledged by the Prosecutor’s Office as a result of the Novartis case’). They also imply the imminent failure of the government (‘TODAY EXTRACT - They sacked a SYRIZA MP and sent him a hospital!’).

Accusations of Nazism are hurled at politicians (‘Shame from the revelations: A descendant of Nazi co-workers with a fake resume, the Foreign Minister of Kotzia!’) and government disrespect for Greece is also alleged: ‘D. Vitsas defames the Armed Forces and calls them “kittens” (video)’. As seen by these examples, disinformation shames the opposition through time-tested claims – they are corrupt, they are Nazis, they hate their country. The sophistication of disinformation is in the delivery and its unembarrassed boldness, not necessarily in the actual content.

5.4.3 *Culture and social issues*

Culture and social issues provide a porous environment for clickbait to bleed into alarmist disinformation about the erosion of Greek culture and leftist extremism. These are accompanied by conspiracy theories that discredit refugees and leftists while inflating support for right-leaning causes.

The disinformation ecosystem presents many anti-left narratives purporting hostility or fascism: ‘Shock at the rally: Paralympic chairman did the Nazi salute ... [image]’ implies Nazism. ‘Truckloads with munitions on docks - anarchists from France “supplied” the ruby’ suggests that foreign entities are fueling leftist militants. ‘Eleni Foureira said: “Under Enver Hoxha we slept with open windows”’ presents a liberal celebrity as sympathetic to a dictator.

Other claims misappropriate quotes to further political means. The meme ‘sketch by Arkas encourages Macedonia rally, criticizes left’ is a stance violation that insinuates the righteousness of the right to fight leftist fascism. ‘Odysseus Elytis: The only name Macedonia is acceptable to Skopje is Pseudomacedonia’ and ‘Kosti Palama: “Patriotism is inherent, and I am a nationalist!”’ put words into the dead mouths of respected cultural figures. In the latter example, as EllinikaHoaxes notes, nationalism did not in the time of Palama have the connotations it does today, and there is a record of him saying the exact opposite.

There are claims about the destruction of Greek culture in ‘Unbelievable: They demolished Kazantzakis’ house in Heraklion to make parking (photo)’ and ‘Area Slaughterhouses of Thessaloniki ... They scatter statues and inscriptions from various parts of Greece ...’. Hoaxes about Greek culture suggest glory: ‘More than 100,000,000 Greeks around the world!’, ‘Byzantium knew about America before Columbus!’.

Another myth hoax, ‘The video that everyone has to see - Europe is at risk from migrants They can no longer hide the heavenly descent of the Greeks!’, not only furthers concepts of genealogical superiority, it grossly misstates them. The article argues that Greeks possess a certain gene that makes them genetically superior. However, that particular gene is actually more prevalent among those from North Africa and historically linked to northern African lineage. Thus, if the claim were to be true, it would be evidence that Greeks are genetically inferior and would benefit from procreating with North Africans .

Gender politics are shown as eroding Greek culture ('UNCENSORABLE COMPLAINT ...!! We will suffer a stroke ... See AHEAD and an anti-Hellenic poem that they gave to a girl of the NURSERY SCHOOL in DRAMA ...!!!', 'Teacher in Lesvos decided to dress with skirts boys of the Sixth Grade Primary School') or supplanting Greek history ('...ON THE DAY OF THE REMEMBRANCE OF THE GENOCIDE THEY WILL HOLD THE 2ND THESSALONIKI PRIDE!'). The latter claim resulted in the mayor of Thessaloniki being punched in the face. Enduring hoaxes have resurfaced or respread, among them the narrative that present day Greece has been humiliated and its female population degraded ('Times: Greek women are selling sex for a cheese pie because of a crisis', '19 year old Greek woman is auctioning her ... virginity! (PHOTO)').

Social issues concerning immigration and Islam further narratives of disingenuousness and competitive attentions. A common theme is that the government overaccommodates immigrants and refugees ('BROMEROS BUTARIS HAS DECIDED TO HELP MIGRANTS IN THE HELLENIC HOUSES OF THE BANKS!', 'Shock image - By bus sign in Arabic sign in Mytilene - Out of control situation'). '850,000 "Greekizations" for voting purposes' presents an opportunistic element, implying that the accommodation of non-Greeks is political opportunism and an attempt to change the face of Greek society. Following the virality of the French spider-man who saved a child dangling from a balcony, numerous claims surfaced that the event was staged.

Disinformation about Islamic dress is also seen. 'They photographed a power of love player with a burka! UNKNOWN Turkish propaganda through the reality of Ska! #powerofloveGr' suggests that celebrities are secret Islamists. 'Shock in Thrace! See what the Muslims wear under their headscarf and robe!' is a doctored image of a Muslim woman wearing a thong.

The implications of this headline raise another salient point. There is no Islamic ban on underwear, nor is it unheard of for Muslim women to wear underwear that is considered racy. This disinformation suggests that people, particularly those prone to disinformation, engage with connotations of Islam that misrepresent them as fundamentally different. The implication of this headline is that Muslims are not as modest as they present themselves. The claim is salacious with the latent criticism that a Muslim person is always hiding something.

Disinformation seeks to portray migrants and refugees as engaging in savage, often ungrateful behaviour ('Unbelievable! A breeder catches the "leeches" immigrants in Lesvos to slaughter his animals - You will not believe what followed (VIDEO)', 'Shame! Pakistani officials of Boutaris are ripping posters for the rally'). These claims are often framed by Islamophobic alarmism ('Murder attack in the center of Athens by Muslims against 3 immigrants who became Christians! (HARD IMAGES)', 'Islamic immigrants attack a Catholic church in France at the time of operation', 'A migrant Muslim destroys a statue because it shows nudity').

Headlines like 'they come to the house of the other to make a commune and enforce their Shari'ah! Without any respect for the customs of the host country' and 'Video to Everyone - Europe is at risk from immigrants [video]' present Muslims as ungrateful and oppressive. This is complemented by claims of imminent danger ('Is ISIS Head of Head Office identified in Mytilene?') and accusations against Muslim institutions within the country ('Prosecution for abuse of power was brought to the mufti of Komotini').

5.5 UKRAINE

Unlike the data for the other environments, the headlines in Ukraine relate specifically to Kremlin-related disinformation. This is not to suggest that Ukraine does not have disinformation about domestic issues or that it does not have social problems aside from the Russian invasion. Ukraine continues to deal with internal corruption and its own human rights issues, including the treatment of the Roma minority.

However, this study has elected to focus on Russian disinformation narratives for several reasons. Parallel to its physical conflict, Ukraine is digitally on the frontline of NLW with Russia. The characteristics of this motivation are blunt and direct, and the motivations and sources are more transparent than in other environments. Also, the fact-checkers' focus on this specific area provides a narrow view into an important section of the broader disinformation ecosystem.

Isolated from overt economic motivations of the other environments, the headlines of Ukraine feature similar trends such as the reaffirmation of bias and accusations of fascist behaviour and institutional failures. Without the dilution of medical hoaxes and celebrity clickbait,

disinformation in Ukraine reflects the focus and relentlessness of these campaigns. This also makes it seem akin to bullying. These are constant bombardments against the stability and integrity of a state caught between two spheres of influence.

Using StopFake, the non-profit that only publishes debunkings, these narratives emerge: Ukraine is weak, Ukraine is exploited and isolated by international institutions, Ukraine is a human rights violator, Ukraine is a Russophobic human rights violator, Russia is strong and just, blaming Russia for the Skripal poisoning and the downing of MH17 is Russophobia, Ukraine is militarily hostile and/or a puppet of the west.

5.5.1 Weak Ukraine

Health claims present a Ukraine that is disease ridden ('AIDS From Donbas Sweeping Ukraine', 'Hepatitis A epidemic quickly spreading in Ukraine') largely because of its military conflict with Russia, presenting the Donbas conflict as one the government engages in at the expense of its national health. This is complemented by claims that the government is literally sucking the blood from its people ('The Ukrainian government has decided to export Ukrainians' blood').

Economic claims ('Ukraine lost half of GDP due to Western sanctions against Russia', "'There was no compromise': how Ukraine intends to compensate for the lack of IMF loans') also function by suggesting that Ukraine's engagement in conflict with Russia, rather than Russia's actions, damage the economy. Kremlin-friendly disinformation also presents narratives of military inferiority: 'The DNR reported losses of APU when trying to break through in the Gorlovka area', 'Ukraine recognized that the APU cannot master American weapons'.

The government is said to be unable to finance itself or defend itself because of its inferiority while its inability to use 'American weapons' also implies that the conflict is being waged for foreign interests against the best interests of the state. 'The soldier of the APU surrendered to militiamen because of the constant drunkenness of his colleagues' proposes moral weakness as well as Russian superiority.

There are also claims that Ukrainians are desperately fleeing their country ('Large numbers of Ukrainians seeking asylum in Europe') and acting dishonestly to do so ('Ukrainians pretend to be gay for the sake of asylum in Europe'). Given Ukraine's conservative, sometimes intolerant approach to LGBTQI issues and Russia's self-framing as a conservative

bulwark against the sexual and gender liberalisation of Europe, this headline evokes issues of emasculation and debasement. The integrity of the Ukrainian state is also said to be debased and bound for exploitation ('Ukraine to become nuclear waste dump').

Admissions of Russian superiority by Ukraine also present a state forced to admit its submission to a stronger opponent. These are expressed in terms of economy ('Ukraine admits that Russian gas imports are profitable'), territory ('Volcker acknowledged the inability of Kiev to return the Crimea and Donbas') and military ('The fighters of the APU refused to greet the words "Glory to Ukraine"').

5.5.2 International institutions

International institutions are used against Ukraine to promote the idea that it is isolated from and looked down at by the international community. For example, 'Ukrainians Being Massively Deported from EU and Israel' and 'Peskov said that the US treats the conflict in the Donbass as an intra-Ukrainian' posit that Ukraine is unwanted by the international community and alone in resisting Russia. A complimentary framing is that the EU is detrimental to Ukraine: 'Azarov: Prices for products in Ukraine and in Europe are almost equal', 'European gas in Ukraine four times more expensive than Russian gas', 'European Court says not to pay Donbas seniors'. Ukraine's attempts to engage with Europe culturally are said to be rejected ('The Champions League final in Kiev risks going without the European fans'), and Ukraine is also framed as a burden on the international community: 'NATO Service Members Killed in Eastern Ukraine', 'Large numbers of Ukrainians seeking asylum in Europe'.

Other claims suggest that the EU is more pro-Russia than it is supportive of Ukraine, as in 'European Union Seeks To Improve Relations with Russia At Any Cost' and 'Naftogaz loses to Gazprom in EU Court'. There are also claims that Russia's actions against Ukraine are validated by institutions, such as 'The United Nations recognized the Russian telephone code for the Crimea' and 'The first time in history that a European and Italian institution recognizes the provisions of an institution of the republics of the # Donbass: it happens at the University of # Torino.' Another dimension assures Russian legitimacy – 'OSCE Declares Russian Presidential Elections Open and Fair', 'WSJ: Germany will ask the US to release it from sanctions against Russia' – and folds them into insinuations of US scheming and control.

Taken together, these framings act more like gaslighting than international discourse. All at once, Ukraine embarrasses itself by trying to engage with Europe while the continent exploits it, rejects it and makes friends with its bully who treats it better than the coalition it aspires to be a part of.

5.5.3 Human rights violations and Ukrainian military hostility

Ukraine is consistently framed as a human rights violator: ‘How Ukraine became the leader in anti-Semitism’, ‘“Theft at a high level”: The US State Department has stated about corruption and human rights violations in Ukraine’. It is also presented as openly cruel to Crimea: ‘President Poroshenko proposes Crimeans be deprived of Ukrainian citizenship’, ‘Ukraine boasted of a drought in the Crimea’.

These headlines posit global condemnation for Ukraine, non-compliance with international standards and impending punishment which doubles as vindication for the Kremlin. Other headlines allege human rights violations against Russian-speakers specifically: ‘Venetian Commission: Russian language in Ukraine is in the worst position’, ‘In Ukraine, they decided to force Crimeans and residents of Donbass to repent’. Such claims are not exclusive to Ukraine even when the message is promoted in that media space. For example, ‘Media: Members of “Right Sector” beat Russians peacefully sitting in cafe in Athens’, ‘The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Russia announced the availability of “Russophobic stereotypes” in the State Department’s report on human rights’.

Ukraine is also presented as openly hostile. They are responsible for instability in the Middle East (‘Ukraine involved in Syria attacks on Russian bases’, ‘Ukraine trains terrorists for European and Middle East operations’) and engage in unfair, predatory techniques (‘Train from Ukraine Arrives In Russia Loaded With Mines’, ‘Ukrainian military fired on a passenger bus in Donbas’). Impending aggression is a common accusation as well (‘Ukraine is preparing for a full war with Russia’, ‘Ukraine began to develop a project for the separation of Crimea channel’), and they are so hostile that they are alienating the rest of the world (‘OSCE Co-ordinator leaves session in Minsk because of threats of Kiev politicians’, ‘The APU fired at the OSCE patrol’).

This aggression is often presented as being masterminded by the US with embedded emasculations of Ukraine’s sovereignty: ‘The US intelligence community announced early presidential elections in Ukraine’,

‘The Defense Ministry was told about Washington’s violation of the INF treaty’. It is suggested that this is due to economic collusion between the Ukrainian elite and the US (‘GE locomotives: Poroshenko rescues sinking American corporation’).

5.5.4 Pro-Russia

At the same time, Russia is shown as considerate and sensitive to the needs of Ukrainians, especially minorities: ‘Kyiv residents want Russian social media platforms back’, ‘Boycott failed: Crimean Tatars actively vote in presidential elections’. Claims about other countries imply support for Russia (‘“Boris, shut up”: the British reacted to Johnson’s statement about Russia’, ‘The Ministry of Defense of Serbia recognized Maydan as a coup d’état’). It is suggested Russia’s view Ukraine’s lack of legitimacy as a state is recognised by others: ‘Ukraine loses Transcarpathia: nationalists press on the Hungarian community’.

5.5.5 EUvsDisinfo

StopFake is selective about the claims that it chooses to debunk, opting for precision and accuracy over scope, but when its findings are considered alongside those of EUvsDisinfo for the Ukrainian market, the scale and tone of disinformation in Ukraine becomes clearer. StopFake coordinates with StratCom, so some claims were repeated in the data. Those claims were omitted from the EUvsDisinfo results.

The rhetoric goes further than simply presenting Ukraine as weak, it suggests that it is ‘destroyed’ or even illegitimate (‘For 25 years, Russia has supported - artificially supported - the independence of the so-called Ukraine with the help of cheap gas’). It can also be surprisingly petty: ‘German Ministry of Defence is unaware of the presence of tanks of the Ukrainian army in a tank competition’ uses a minor event to make an untrue claim that paints Ukraine as diminutive against Germany and the EU by extension.

Disinformation presents institutions as both validating Russia’s claims and simultaneously persecuting former Soviet states, going so far to declare that ‘The EU is abandoning Ukraine’ and ‘The UN condemned persecution of the Ukrainian Orthodox Church’. Since the start of this year, there have been multiple claims of fascism in Ukraine alongside allegations that the country has legalised genocide and needs to be ‘denazified’. Russophobia

claims are equally common with allegations also lobbied against Nordic countries, the US who ‘rudely and insolently cheated Russia’ during the revolution in Ukraine and the entirety of Europe which ‘is pretending that Russians are subhuman’. Ukraine is also accused of building ‘houses with the remains of Soviet prisoners of war’ and organising the ‘hunting of pro-Russian civilians in Donbas for rich people’.

Other countries are used to attack Ukraine’s credibility as well. Narratives insist that Georgian snipers were operating at the behest of the Ukrainian government, while shooters during the protests in Ukraine were operating under the orders of the former Georgian president. ‘DPR: Ukrainian junta prepares a provocation against an EU-delegation’ uses ‘junta’ to disparage Ukraine’s sovereignty while suggesting open war with Europe. An even starker claim, playing on insecurities of gender politics and Russia’s self-framing as a bastion of conservative values is issued about the west: ‘Slowly, incest is being legalised in Europe’.

As can be expected, allegations of Ukrainian hostility and pro-Russian sentiment are widely and frequently distributed, with multiple stories often appearing in a single day. There is both ‘a civil war in Ukraine in which brother is killing brother’ and coordinated efforts with ‘Western special services’. Sweeping statements about Ukraine’s character continue. ‘The fascists’ war preparations against Russia are clearly visible’ and ‘Ukraine would sell even its nuclear bomb if they still had it’ contrast with Russia’s behaviour: ‘Russian army enthuses kids about de-mining and defusing bombs’ although it ‘will not stay on the sidelines if Ukraine starts carrying out a genocide against its own’ population. Russia insists that it is without blame (‘Russian soldiers are not present in Ukraine’) and a force for peace (‘A provocation by the Ukrainian armed forces was prevented in Donbas’). The US is widely implicated according to Russia, as is George Soros, and this is part of why Russia asserts that ‘Ukraine has lost its independence’.

Counter-narratives about the Skripal poisoning and the downing of MH17 project responsibility onto Ukraine: ‘Blaming Russia instead of Ukraine for the MH17 tragedy is Russophobia and demonization of Russia’ and ‘Ukraine violated international rules when they did not close the airspace, allowing MH17 to be shot down’. These headlines seem to suggest that even if Russia was responsible, Ukraine is still at fault. A final claim alleges that Ukraine is engaging in behaviour that Russia famously denied then admitted: ‘Ukrainian Soldiers Wearing Russian Uniforms Spotted in Donbas’.

6.

DISCUSSION

This section applies CP and CDA to disinformation headlines. It presents a Gricean perspective on the headlines arguing the disinformation creates falsehoods in order to debate their merit and use them as touchpoints. Next, it analyses the headlines using Fairclough's three-part social theory model. The first part, description, summarises the dominant linguistic trends of the data. It finds that news-imitating content replicates headline structures but imbeds expressive, often negative social cues while disinformation in the form of memes and social media use informal, personal devices as signs of authenticity.

The next part, interpretation, analyses how disinformation elicits overt behavioural cues to reaffirm bias. This section also features a limited application of the ideological square theory. Disinformation plays on markers of urgency and intimacy to further divisive social framings in line with new racism. Explanation, the final section, re-examines the narratives presented in section five, providing supporting headlines and analysis. It argues that disinformation actively negates the human rights regime by framing rights as distributive and presenting rights-based activities as corrupt and oppressive.

6.1 A GRICEAN PERSPECTIVE

Applying CP to disinformation headlines finds thorough violations of the categories of quantity and quality. While flouting quantity is common in a monetised news environment, the violation of quality is central to the function and identity of disinformation. Disinformation presents content that is intentionally false, while manipulated and hyperpartisan content lack adequate evidence or omit relevant information.

Quantity and quality are violated to create the allusion of an extreme adherence to the latter two maxims of relation and manner. Headlines claim to be highly relevant, and they are extremely respectful of the manner maxim in that they are broadly comprehensible, unambiguous, brief and orderly per the standards of the news industry. These auspices are, of course, empty. By being demonstrably untrue, content cannot be relevant in the way that it presents itself as, and manner is similarly irrelevant because the content is null.

Such content still evokes emotional reactions and can be internalised over time as true. As previously mentioned, one of the most informative aspects of the discourse about fake news is that it exists at all. While this point has been widely examined in the media, the attention to relevance and manner are indicative of priority and motivation.

One example of this is the absolving of rights-based responsibility on immigration, which is present in US and Italian data. In Italy, this is the assertion that other countries do not take refugees. In the US, it is the defence of family separations and child internment as standard operating procedure. In both cases, the argument is not whether the treatment of refugees or immigrants is inhumane or immoral, it is that turning refugees away or imprisoning immigrant children is already institutionalised, thus it does not need to be debated. Rather than try to counter a rights-based argument, motivated actors can simply circumnavigate it.

One could produce disinformation about any topic. The choice of certain subjects, say immigration or secret Nazi politicians, suggests that this viewpoint is beneficial to someone and that there are populations willing to believe it or use the discourse's existence to justify other behaviour. The need, particularly of right-leaning disinformation, to project its behaviour onto the opposition infers that they understand this behaviour as means to an end rather than an actual ideology.

Economic factors surely influence content, particularly when content creators are aware of their audience's psychology or have information about their clicking habits. But the targets chosen and the narratives about them can also be indicative of the insecurities of the creators and their positions on culturally contentious topics. It might also suggest that content creators need the public to believe these things to achieve a goal. This can also be relevant for the quality maxim.

If content creators need to repurpose footage or use imagery that is no longer accurate, then this might indicate an intention to fearmonger

or an awareness that their cause is deeply flawed. It should also be noted that simply by having content like this in a diverse media ecosystem increases the probability that it can be internalised and referenced in argumentation. Thus, even if the argument is not true or believed, it can still be used to effect in discourse.

6.2 DESCRIPTION

Description in three-dimensional social theory relates to formal properties of the text. These include lexical and syntactic structure. As stated in the results, disinformation closely conforms to establishment media standards. It departs from them in being more expressive and less formal. Content that imitates news does so by utilising existing syntactic structures and embedding negative cues that would be unacceptable in authentic reporting. Content that imitates social media is informal and seeks to persuade through authenticity markers.

Most headlines display expressive modality, which is the authority of the statement is in relation to the ‘truth’, as opposed to between one participant and another.²⁶³ These findings also extend to mode, as most of the headlines were declarative phrases. This was almost completely true for the US and Ukraine. This results in short, terse phrases that transmit highly opinionated messages with great efficiency. In this sense, headlines typically mimic hyperpartisan headlines or tabloid headlines dependent on their subject matter. The Italian and Greek headlines feature more instances of relational modality – statements where authority relationships are between participants. This was accomplished through memes and social media posts meant to persuade audiences based on a display of outrage.

The distribution of news-imitating content versus social media content across environments should be considered within this study’s limitations. The more political nature of the US and Ukraine fact-checkers explains this variation, as they focus on content that closely emulates news. Given the broader focus of the Italian and Greek sources, structural variety is expectable given that they look to less formal disinformation and feature more memes and social media posts.

²⁶³ Norman Fairclough, *Language and Power* (Longman Group 1989) 111.

The use of questions or imperatives as headlines is more common due to a higher concentration of meme and social media posts in these environments. Such content frequently uses manipulated or misappropriated visuals to signal verification, and they utilise informal punctuation, emojis and first-person perspectives to elicit feelings of authenticity.

Across all environments however, headlines use dynamic, expressive features to get attention. Specific to the US and Ukrainian environments, modal verbs are very uncommon. Headlines are articulated as directly and urgently as possible, and agency is rarely left ambiguous, though it is always misattributed or fabricated. In Italy and Greece, relational modality is used in conjunction with more expressive language and punctuation. Rather than emulating the news media, these texts use authenticity markers to convince audiences.

The headlines in the sample typically use expressive language and do away with relational value features such as formality and euphemism.²⁶⁴ Hedging language is also employed to create a sense of urgency via signifiers of extreme timeliness such as ‘breaking’. Expressive language, such as referring to US football players who do not stand for the national anthem as ‘kneeling thugs’, and metaphor, referring to refugees as leeches, are mainly used to cast aspersions on out-groups.

These lexical features largely operate through embedding. Governments become juntas. Refugees become migrants. Activists are crisis actors or violent radicals. By the time the reader has comprehended the phrase, negative associations have already been cast, and certain parties are re-entrenched as antagonists.

6.3 INTERPRETATION

Fairclough notes that ‘interpretation is concerned with the relationship between text and interaction - with seeing the text as the product of a process of production, and as a resource in the process

²⁶⁴ Norman Fairclough, *Language and Power* (Longman Group 1989) 119-120.

of interpretation'.²⁶⁵ It is 'generated through the dialectical interplay of cues' and members' resources (MR), which might also be described as interpretative procedures.²⁶⁶

Particularly relevant to the news environment are differentiations in direct discourse (DD), indirect discourse (ID), and a third subtype which slips between the two (DDS).²⁶⁷ This is one of the most accessed tools for disinformation, and it is often manipulated to mislead audiences.

Table 3: Examples of discourse manipulation

Headline	Country
Michelle Obama: 'Florida shooting is clearly Trump's fault, these shootings are happening constantly since he became our president.'	US
BOLDRINI: 'DI MAIO AND SALVINI ARE EVIL!' (I) 'YOU WANT A LAW AGAINST LEGA AND M5S'	Italy
Kosti Palama: 'Patriotism is inherent, and I am a nationalist!'	Greece
Azarov: Prices for products in Ukraine and in Europe are almost equal	Ukraine

These examples embed stances in highly partisan statements, exploiting the likelihood of peripheral processing. They often function as clickbait, but they can also subtly reaffirm bias or realign values. Social endorsements have a high theoretical value in information processing, and these stance violations allow for the transmission of bias. Using the authority inherent in news publication, they can drive both web traffic and misperceptions. Disinformation frequently hedges audience expectations to engage public awareness through packaged discourse. While stance violations like those above are fairly obvious examples, self-reflexive media narratives also play on audience expectations:

²⁶⁵ Norman Fairclough, *Language and Power* (Longman Group 1989) 26.

²⁶⁶ *ibid* 141.

²⁶⁷ Norman Fairclough, *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language* (Longman Group 1995) 54.

Table 4: Headlings showing self-reflexive media narratives

YouTube witness makes shocking admission on live TV. CNN pulls plug immediately	US
Fox News accidentally puts up a poll graphic that shows how they are the least trusted network	US
CONFESSIONS OF A BLOGGER: My Current Employment	Italy
Activissimo works for the Italian Government? The case ends up in Parliament	Italy
More on the star hoax: Star will legally move against anyone responsible for 'false reporting'	Greece
Former Russian radio host approved ethnic cleansing in Donbass	Ukraine

Media narratives in the data frequently work to reaffirm partisan bias about bias. The notion that news is already biased or manipulated affects how users attach MRs to their readings by stressing that misinformation is as valuable as verified information. More so, disinformation is often interpreted as an insider perspective targeted to certain audiences. It is framed as an inside scoop, new revelations that, conveniently for the reader, prove that their suspicions have been true all along.

Table 5: Headlines showing insider perspective narratives

Official: Rudy Giuliani officially resigns, Trump's legal team on it's last leg	US
The scoop of the Gregorio that nails PD and the Republic	Italy
The banker who reveals the shocking truth that is hidden from us! (VIDEO)	Greece
The Russian embassy: the head of the secret British laboratory actually confirmed the development of combat poisons	Ukraine

Several aspects of interpreting disinformation are defined by economies: SMF leverages apparent influence to achieve a goal, junk news forsakes accuracy for clicks in an attention economy by appropriating cues of newsworthiness, social media posts combine markers of user sincerity with apparent visual confirmation to instil and validate outrage, identity politics invoke rights to trump existing policy or attitudes. As a result, an economy of language in which users hedge the authority of a statement with its sincerity, validity and plausibility frames a relationship of expectancy between those who share misinformation and the participants in their social networks who might respond to it.

Disinformation in all environments aggressively pushes the narrative of imminent punishment. Corrupt politicians have been found out, a member of the opposition is about to be arrested, a media pundit engaging in partisan discourse has been fired. This is a validation of ideological othering, transmitted through efficient, highly internalisable micro-statements of authority that become truer over time. Even when Mueller is not fired or the EU does not lift sanctions, the belief that they would have if the proper system had functioned differently is meant to linger.

Table 6: Headlines related to imminent punishment narratives

Headline	Country
Mueller will be forced to resign over Pelosi affair	US
SICILY: 500 thousand pre-filled cards with the symbol of the PD were found. New ones will be printed	Italy
The accounts of the Governor of the Bank of Greece, Giannis Stournaras and his wife, were pledged by the Prosecutor's Office as a result of the Novartis case	Greece
EU will allegedly lift sanctions	Ukraine

Interpretations of disinformation can be understood as dual-functional, especially when they are polarised. Headlines often target one demographic with a claim that reinforces pre-existing beliefs, but it also exists for the opposite demographic to engage with. In this sense, both publics are monetised and elicited politically. Disinformation simultaneously reaffirms scepticism on one side and functions as agitprop for the other. This can be used to foster and exhibit disrespect in relation to other communities, as Boyd suggested with the example of the Pope endorsing Trump: most conservatives probably did not believe it, but liberals believed conservatives did and shared it as proof of that.²⁶⁸

In this way, there is room for van Dijk's ideological square²⁶⁹ within this application of social theory. This model says that interpretations emphasise the positive and deemphasise the negative of in-groups and do the opposite for out-groups. This interpretation is present in the

²⁶⁸ Danah Boyd, 'Did Media Literacy Backfire?' (Medium.com, 5 January 2017) <<https://points.datasociety.net/did-media-literacy-backfire-7418c084d88d>> accessed 30 June 2018.

²⁶⁹ Teun A van Dijk, *Ideology: A Multidisciplinary Approach* (Sage 1998).

data: in-groups that see their place with Russia against Ukrainians as fascist, EU-friendly human rights violators. In Italy and Greece, these are publics that are proud and affirmative as Italians and Greeks, rather than Europeans. The out-groups in this context include immigrants, refugees, hostile neighbouring countries and those that do not assert their national culture. These binaries exist in the US as in-groups formed by socio-ethnic similarities and ideological similarity, with each tribal entity interpreting the other as antithetical to their own values.

However, in line with the dynamics of new racism, these in- and out-groups shift with topic, and challenge existing binaries. While media narratives talk about the balkanisation of the media, it is also important to consider its increasing hybridisation. Journalism and public relations have blended over the last decades, the latter waning in the face of the economic incentives of the other.²⁷⁰ The lines between soft power and foreign disinformation have blurred considerably as disinformation makes overt inflections on society, and public policy itself is openly inspired by corporate methodology to fight regulation. The preference away from balanced reporting towards authenticity²⁷¹ may reflect changes in how societies measure accuracy.

Hyperpartisan news as disinformation has been conceptualised as ‘guerrilla marketing ... in pursuit of building an agenda’.²⁷² The populist movements that have raised such alarms are in themselves the incorporation of hybrid discourse standards to capture public awareness. Fake news is as much an example of discourse as it is a tool for it. The heuristic models by which many internalise this information are then a point of reference for interpretation. Disinformation is meant to be internalised out of convenience and the operationalising of existing economies, and it does this through the exploitation of urgency and authority that users bring to news, as well as the emotions and personalised cues present in social media.

²⁷⁰ Peter Pomerantsev and Michael Weiss, ‘The Menace of Unreality: How the Kremlin Weaponizes Information, Culture and Money’ (The Interpreter, Institute of Modern Russia, 2014) 34 <www.interpretermag.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/The_Menace_of_Unreality_Final.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

²⁷¹ Regina Marchi, ‘With Facebook, Blogs, and Fake News, Teens Reject Journalistic “Objectivity”’ (3 October 2012) 36(3) *Journal of Communication Inquiry* 196 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0196859912458700>> accessed 23 February 2018.

²⁷² Michelle A Amazeen, ‘Voter disdain: twenty-first century trends in political advertising’ in Danielle Coombs and Bob Batchelor (eds), *We Are What We Sell: How Advertising Shapes American Life... And Always Has* (Prager 2014) 287 cited in Vargo, Guo and Amazeen (n 134).

6.4 EXPLANATION

Explanation in line with social theory focuses on the relationships between interaction – how content is produced and interpreted – and social context, or how ‘transitory social events’ interact with ‘more durable social structures which shape and are shaped by these events’.²⁷³ Expanding on his conceptualisation of language and power, Fairclough suggests that explanation could consist of normative critique leading to explanatory critique ‘as the basis for transformative action’.²⁷⁴ In the same study, he notes, in terms of those critiques, that ‘some contradictions relate to questions of truth’.²⁷⁵

This is the rub of CDA to disinformation. Transformative action, or praxis, is itself devalued and repurposed by fake news. One of the defining features of disinformation is that it presents transformative action as already occurring – gun confiscations in the US, Ukrainian human rights violations, marches for Sharia Law in Europe and the destruction of cultural heritage by Muslims – with undesirable consequences. The data shows examples of positive transformative action taken from the data:

Table 7: Headlines showing positive transformative action

As Secretary of State, Brian Kemp fought Obama twice and won to stop illegal immigrants from voting	US
Breaking: Czech Republic arms citizens. You can now shoot terrorists on sight	US
When Italy was able to say No to Islam!! In the thirties, the ambassador of Saudi Arabia, requested an audience with the Head of the Government OF BENITO MUSSOLINI ...	Italy
Arkas for the current rally for Macedonia – PHOTO	Greece
Crimea decided its own fate after the unconstitutional armed coup in Kyiv	Ukraine
Boycott failed: Crimean Tatars actively vote in presidential elections	Ukraine

²⁷³ Fairclough (n 262) 27.

²⁷⁴ Norman Fairclough, ‘What is CDA? Language and Power Twenty-Five Years On’ (Academia.edu, 2015) 32 <www.academia.edu/8429277/What_is_CDA_Language_and_Power_twenty-five_years_on> accessed 5 July 2018.

²⁷⁵ *ibid* 10.

When presented positively, transformative action supports causes that are against multi-culturalism and liberalism. Claims in Greece and Ukraine support Russia’s claims to Crimea and Greece’s opposition to North Macedonia’s legitimisation. Minority groups, the Tatars in the Ukraine for example, are eager to be considered assimilated into the Russian identity quilt. Positive action is inherently militant, othering and anti-EU. Compare these to negative examples of transformative action from the data:

Table 8: Headlines showing negative transformative action

The Violent Radicals Behind March for Our Lives: Women’s March Leaders	US
Rome’s captain Francesco Totti: Today I fight for the reception of the refugees, what I forgot to tell you is that I was in business with Odevaine and that these businesses gave me a million euros a year for renting my apartments to immigrants	Italy
‘Battles’ in Pisoderi with dozens of wounded - Woman in coma	Greece
The US is preparing personnel for the new ‘color’ revolution in Ukraine	Ukraine

Transformative action portrayed negatively deals with left-wing causes, and it becomes negative through discreditation. Women marching for equality are violent radicals. A celebrity that supports refugees masks financial concerns with empathy. In Greece, people protesting the Macedonia deal are met with violence and oppression. Ukraine’s attempts to maintain its integrity as a state are merely overtures by the world order.

Disinformation recontextualises some of western society’s most visible ideals – democracy, human rights and the rule of law – to stall transformative action. This can be seen in the narratives identified across all four environments.

- **Hostility towards the international order. Domestically, governments are seen as inept, out of touch, and corrupt.**

Table 9: Headlines concerning the international order

Pope calls for world wide gun confiscation except for the UN	US
Soros, Obama and the Dems Ordered the Shutdown to Stage a Coup	US
Obama Announces Bid To Become UN Secretary General	US
Unbelievable! As soon as I mentioned the word 'Italia', in the plenary of the European Parliament, they disconnected the microphone ...	Italy
Macron: 'Italy was a fascist country, it deserves all immigrants'	Italy
Shock from Germany after signing Tsipras: Prepare 'union' of Macedonia	Greece
'Red' from Berlin to the F-16 upgrade: 'The last thing Greece needs is an armament program'	Greece
OPENING THE ROAD FOR DOG MEAT AT SUPER MARKET OF GREECE!	Greece
Ukrainians Being Massively Deported from EU and Israel	Ukraine
European Court says not to pay Donbas seniors	Ukraine
The EU and NATO are dividing Europe and Ukraine is an example of this	Ukraine

The global order is liberal and utterly disdainful of the sovereignty of nations. Neo-liberal associations between countries are framed as ways of tainting their home cultures, controlling them and selling them shoddy products. By these narratives, liberals seek to control countries and enforce their will upon them using international institutions. In contrast to an actively sinister international order, domestic governments are marked by corruption and incompetence.

Table 10: Headlines concerning domestic governments

USDA approves slaughterhouses producing horse meat for human consumption	US
Obama paid FBI informant over \$1 million to do it to Trump	US
He had stolen the kicked scooter. The judge denies the reintegration to work	Italy
Battista Furbata: withdraws from politics but places his father in Parliament	Italy
They went to fine 500 euros in fishermen in Skopelos for ... plastic bag	Greece
This is a kitten position... Special Associate to Minister for African Dust	Greece
Ukraine recognized that the APU cannot master American weapons	Ukraine
'Theft at a high level': The US State Department has stated about corruption and human rights violations in Ukraine	Ukraine

The examples above contrast with those concerning the international order, but every environment is saturated with attempts to erode confidence in government. The US presents the federal government in the same way that the international order narrative frames the EU. Domestic governments limit and penalise normal people. Corruption is institutionalised. In Ukraine, the effort is again focused on portraying the state as a bumbling, inferior entity propped up by western geopolitical manipulation.

The glorification of antiestablishmentarianism has long been a feature of western identity. Underdogs, rebels and independent thinkers are contrasted with parental systems. This is one feature that disinformation utilises. While these fetishisations of attitudes have thrived in part because they existed in systems of authority that seemed stable, they are now an expansive feature of division. Neo-liberalism in some ways appropriates a traditionally conservative notion of limited government. These narratives of hostility exist in part because of corporate interference in government and income inequality, but they also suggest public ambivalence as to how government benefits them and what influence it can actually have in the current economic system.

- **Social and humanitarian movements are staged, disingenuous attempts to oppress the populace by appealing to human rights concerns.**

Table 11: Headlines discrediting social movements

David Hogg admits he wasn't at school during Parkland school shooting	US
Application for March for Our Lives permit was made months before Parkland shooting	US
Black men arrested in Philadelphia Starbucks settle for \$2 million	US
This is reality. do not be fooled around. open your eyes. do not trust what comes on your computer [about images from Syria]	Italy
Photo on republicca about saving today (rescue of those at sea was staged)	Italy
Crazy... Take advantage of a serious subject like the environment to legitimize illegal immigration... #stopinvasione	Italy
HOW THE BOTTOM PROPAGANDA ARE FALLING The studio is set and ready (about the White Helmets)	Greece
Volcker acknowledged the inability of Kiev to return the Crimea and Donbas	Ukraine
CIS Executive Committee: No official documents from Ukraine on withdrawal from the organization have been received	Ukraine

Regardless of motivation, be it humanitarian action (the White Helmets), legislative lobbying (March for Our Lives), awareness raising (Women's March, Black Lives Matter) or military objectives (Ukraine's APU), social or liberal movements are framed as disingenuous conspiracies with nefarious aims. The implication is that anyone who dreams of a better world is really working towards oppression. This might be considered an imposition of Yurchak's theory of hypernormalisation. Social change as a tool of the disingenuous and corrupt can be a means of forcing people to accept an unmovable status quo. The fact that, according to these narratives, these agents of change are aware of its futility or inherent corruption reaffirms the notion that dreams of different systems are lies that lead to chaos.

- **Refugees are migrants. Claims of asylum are smokescreens to exploit national benefits and dissolve what would otherwise be a majority culture.**

Table 12: Headlines concerning refugees and migrants

California To Register Illegal Aliens To Vote – Automatically	US
566,000 crimes made in Texas by criminal aliens in the last 6 years	US
Aquarius, the migrants throw away the red cross gifts and go to the restaurant with 100 euro bills	Italy
The deception of the ‘refugees’: in Germany 43% are fake minors	Italy
850,000 ‘Greekizations’ for voting purposes	Greece
Ukrainians pretend to be gay for the sake of asylum in Europe	Ukraine

Disinformation makes use of politicised differences between refugees and migrants, as well as the description of people as illegal. These implicatures are achieved through embedding processes that allow for subtle and efficient framing of distributive conditions and nativist narratives. Common rhetoric that immigrants are criminals and drains on social systems can be easily compacted with the idea of disingenuous asylum.

This approach is rooted in a distributive, rather than integrative,²⁷⁶ stance to rights. It suggests that not everyone can fully enjoy rights and that they must be safeguarded by the cultures that can afford them. This narrative is a mainstreamed version of new racism. A certain culture is under siege by interlopers who seek to exploit their cultural prosperity and dilute their traditions. The absolving technique discussed in the first part of this chapter is an example of this.

²⁷⁶ William J Bigoness, ‘Distributive Versus Integrative Approaches to Negotiation: Experiential Learning Through a Negotiation Simulation’ (1984) (11) *Developments in Business Simulation and Experiential Exercises* 64 <<https://journals.tdl.org/absel/index.php/absel/article/view/2215/2184>> accessed 10 July 2018.

• **Countries are irreconcilably divided, mainly along partisan lines.**
To this:

- Leftists care more about protecting non-citizens than their own people, and they overaccommodate as to not seem prejudiced while opening their own populations up to terrorism and unemployment.

Table 13: Headlines purporting leftist negligence of their citizenry

82-year-old who killed a Muslim in self-defense gets the death penalty	US
Chuck Schumer slams President Trump: ‘it’s racist to only allow citizens to vote’	US
While the refugees are in 3-star hotels, look at the conditions of the earthquake victims	Italy
Saviano: You miss a little detail: the Nigerian could not know that tearing a person to pieces is a crime in Italy, but the League knew very well that shooting is a crime.	Italy
Kyenge immediately threatens the new government: ‘The illegal immigrants must keep the same rights!’	Italy
BROMEROS BUTARIS HAS DECIDED TO HELP MIGRANTS IN THE HELLENIC HOUSES OF THE BANKS!	Greece
Is ISIS Head of Office identified in Mytilene?	Greece
AIDS From Donbas Sweeping Ukraine	Ukraine
Ukraine lost half of GDP due to Western sanctions against Russia	Ukraine
EU Bans Milk Sales from Private Ukrainian Farms	Ukraine

As seen in the previous narrative, disinformation alleges that non-citizens are given voting rights. This feeds into claims of overaccommodation. The false sentiments attributed to Schumer and Saviano depict liberalism disregarding law in favour of a preferential double-standard for the other. These claims are doubly concerning because they utilise the partisan to frame empathy as inherently ignorant and misguided. Double standards and overaccommodation are also conflated with alarmist claims about violence or terrorism. In the Ukraine examples, this narrative comes from a slightly different avenue. The headlines suggest that by pursuing claims to its territory, it is endangering public health. As in much of the Ukraine narrative, the social event is not immigration or multiculturalism but the existence and

the integrity of the state, and Kremlin-friendly disinformation suggests that it is as precarious as western ideals of tolerance.

- Leftists hide fascist tendencies ...

Table 14: Headlines purporting leftist fascism

Obama's Private 'Security' Company Sets Up Massive Camps Outside 3 Major Cities	US
So many of these shooters turn out to be communist Democrats	US
Congressional Black Caucus introduces bill: tax people for being white	US
These are the partisans, April 25th. When the civil war was over, houses ... were raided. Daughters ... of the 'fascists' were taken ... shaved ... raped ... tortured, publicly mocked and finally executed ... descendants of these shits (gathered in the 'ANPI' money eaters association)	Italy
'Too many white citizens': excluding a Hungarian city from the European capital of culture	Italy
Blackwater is in Greece to protect the government - They are afraid of a rebellion	Greece
Truckloads with munitions on docks - anarchists from france 'supplied' the ruby	Greece
Suddenly, US criticises Ukraine for Nazism and anti-Semitism	Ukraine
Venetian Commission: Russian language in Ukraine is in the worst position	Ukraine
Ukrainian Soldiers Wearing Russian Uniforms Spotted in Donbas	Ukraine

Leftist oppression provides a foundation for victimisation narratives and accusations of racism. The US features multiple claims about Obama attempting a coup and gun violence as a product of liberalism. Italian claims are used to suggest hypocrisy and past grievance. In Greece, these claims materialise as institutionalised fascism, and Ukraine is frequently, almost relentlessly, called a fascist violator of human rights. In all environments, multiple claims present liberal powers as discriminating and systematically fascist.

This is projection. In the US, claims about leftist gun violence seek to balance narratives that statistically implicate conservative actors. In Italy, they counter the inflammatory rhetoric of the far-right. In Greece, where Golden Dawn embraces behaviour (their salute, for instance) that is very evocative of the Nazis and has struggled to explain the difference between their party and the Nazis, this projects those

qualities onto SYRIZA. The Kremlin commonly attributes behaviour to Ukraine that has been carried out by Russia. The final Ukraine headline is so obviously a play on the ‘little green men’ narrative that preceded the Crimea invasion that it is akin to trolling.

In all environments, the prevalence of projection suggests that actors engaging in disinformation reveal their motivations and practices through how they present their opposition. The bluntness with which these narratives are presented is another characteristic of disinformation, especially Kremlin-adjacent campaigns, but it is pervasive in all environments even for content that is likely not connected to the Kremlin.

- ... and right-wing causes are more popular than the media suggests.

Table 15: Headlines purporting popularity of right-wing movements

The United States is 3rd in murders throughout the world. If you remove Chicago, Detroit, Washington, St. Louis and New Orleans, the United States is then 189th out of 193 countries in the entire world	US
Breaking: four million Democrat votes just declared fraudulent	US
Trump wins the award Obama never could	US
BBC chart: 5stella Movement - 48.4 PD- 20 LegaNord - 10.3 Strength Italy 10.2 ...	Italy
and now let's burst a mess...a contact of mine who is ABROAD, has just received the cards to vote. As you can see, you are missing all the symbols of the center-right and right-wing parties...	Italy
[poet] Kosti Palama: 'Patriotism is inherent, and I am a nationalist!'	Greece
Putin takes back the recognition of Skopje	Greece
Ukraine admits that Russian gas imports are profitable	Ukraine
European Union Seeks To Improve Relations with Russia At Any Cost	Ukraine
Kyiv residents want Russian social media platforms back	Ukraine

Oppression by the left coordinates with right-wing validation through influence. These are seen in party and policy. For example, the US headlines above validate pro-gun arguments with racist implicatures and devalue leftist voices as illegitimate. In Greece, this is reflected by supposed-international support for Greece's opposition to North Macedonia, while in the Ukraine this functions as recognition of Russian

superiority. Claims like these exist alongside claims of underreported popularity for the right.

This stance utilises narratives of a liberal media bias and hostility towards the international system to inflate influence. Taken in conjunction with Neuman’s spiral of silence, disinformation can function to create new realities. The data analysed here suggests that disinformation actively works to create narratives of grievances and validation to usher in new truths, which is to establish new standards of common values.

- **Liberalism, multiculturalism, and internationalism erode traditional culture and induce values that are antithetical to the population in that they are either too conservative, as with narratives of Islam, or hedonistic, as with gender politics**

Table 16: Headlines purporting cultural erosion

Heitkamp High-Fives Schumer After Voting Against 20-Week Abortion Ban	US
California State Assembly bill would ban the (sale of the) Bible!	US
BREAKING Trump Removes Muslim Federal Judge For Trying To Implement Sharia Law In America	US
The last folly of the Fedeli: the Italian theme will be abolished	Italy
PD: ‘ITALIAN CHILDREN LEARN ARABIC TO INTEGRATE’	Italy
Dad, at school they explained to me that I can change sex	Italy
Unbelievable: They demolished Kazantzakis’ house in Heraklion to make parking (photo)	Greece
A migrant Muslim destroys a statue because [it shows nudity]	Greece
Times: Greek women are selling sex for a cheese pie because of a crisis	Greece
The soldier of the APU surrendered to militiamen because of the constant drunkenness of his colleagues	Ukraine
Slowly, incest is being legalised in Europe	Europe

The erosion of culture is one of the most potent narratives of disinformation. It weaponises concerns over neo-liberalism, immigration and religion and grounds them in xenophobic debate. The perpetuation of migrants and refugees as animals has been a common device of political rhetoric for generations, and it is especially common in the

Italian and Greek environments. However, a more dynamic narrative, and one that the Kremlin has had a large stake in, is the Goldilocks transformation of culture: it is either too strict, through the application of Sharia Law, or too liberal, as gender politics emboldened by neo-liberalism; thus, nativism with homogeneity is just right.

The Kremlin has gone to great pains to frame Russia as an authoritative stronghold of traditional Orthodox values, and at least one claim positing as much is present in each environment, but the narrative extends past Putin’s Russia. Gender politics play a large part in that they are weaponised to suppose an emasculation of traditional society and the mainstreaming of paedophilia and incest. Islam is framed as actively, literally destroying western culture. Neo-liberalism, in addition to also destroying culture and selling public dog meat, forces people to degrade themselves. Amongst all of this, liberal conspiracy narratives progress, and the resistance – Putin, Trump – are the barrier between a new world order that is at once sexually perverse and repressive.

Alongside these narratives is the issue of agitation and how it elicits current political boundaries. As stated above, disinformation friendly to right-wing causes seeks to create and reinforce new narratives about society. This reflects a difference in content that clearly functions as agitation for the left. Many of those claims, particularly dealing with the refugee crisis and treatment of immigrants in the US, rely on doctored content to raise awareness for events that are actually happening. For example:

Table 17: Headlines on refugees and immigration in support of left-wing causes

This is what happens when a government believes people are ‘illegal’. Kids in cages	US
Germany, 1944/America, 2018	Italy
Syria ... Little girl keeps the eyes of her doll closed not to see the horror	Greece
Shock with the 4-year-old Syrian refugee in the desert - He was carrying the clothes of his dead mother and sister (PHOTO)	Greece

Other claims attach false information to current events like most disinformation does:

Table 18: Headlines with inflammatory leftist content

Trump: police officers and firefighters make too much money ... hits them with tax penalty	US
A young Texas rapper charged with capital crimes faces the death penalty but the alleged Santa Fe High School shooter faces prison and then parole after 40 years	US
That child fasting at school, watching the companions eat. It happens in a maternal of Frosinone. The parents asked for a preferential tariff, but the bureaucracy after months still does not respond	Italy
Salvini removes the escort to Saviano	Italy
No to the Africans: 'They always win' [says Africans were banned from competing in a marathon]	Italy
Ukrainian army organizes hunting of pro-Russian civilians in Donbas for rich people	Ukraine

From a holistic view, left-agitating disinformation in the data lacks one component seen in right-wing disinformation: the allegation of widespread, alarmist conspiracy. Some of the claims above are alarmist, and some of them promote claims about impending human rights violations. However, in the data collected, left-leaning disinformation does not have a strong equivalent to right-leaning narratives such as the implementation of Sharia law, gun confiscation or legalising non-citizens that allege long-standing, systematic undermining of stated values.

The far-right might see this as an indication that mainstream media is so biased that left-wing paranoia is already incorporated into it. However, this thesis suggests the opposite, that disinformation mainstreams illiberalism by presenting partisan observations as objective truth because it has no justification for its values that are totally compatible with those of society. An implication of this is that left-leaning disinformation functions to raise awareness, whereas right-leaning disinformation presents new interpretations to disrupt value systems.

This study's focus on partisan narratives reflects its presence in narratives to elicit outrage using existing divides. However, shifting identity markers are already present and will likely change the way

that persuasive campaigns target disinformation. New racism has abandoned race binaries in favour of cultural ones, and social justice causes no longer ascribe to the belief that all speech is free speech. Within the hyperpartisan disinformation ecosystem, Reuter's 2018 report found websites on both the left and right 'sharing a common anti-immigration and anti-establishment agenda'.²⁷⁷ Voting data from the 2016 US election revealed an 'underrepresented cohort' of socially conservative, fiscally liberal voters.²⁷⁸ It is important to consider that new social identities, like those who favour national sovereignty versus those who believe in active global cooperation, will increasingly define discourse and guide disinformation strategy.

As per this study, social theory is used in this section to explain how fake news connects social events to social structures. Through this analysis, we find that it induces scepticism and discredits agents of change. Furthermore, it reaffirms beliefs, validates conspiracy thinking and seeks to dissolve the middle ground. This makes disinformation radicalising in the micro-sense. People who internalise it move further towards the edges. However, in the larger narrative of fake news this radicalisation is meant to embolden challengers to liberalism and counter it, thereby inducing a stalemate. With populism – be it Brexit, Trump, Golden Dawn, Five Star and Lega Nord – voters rejected neo-liberalism based on some very real grievances, but this has enabled an illiberalism that takes special issue with human rights concerns perhaps because they present an obstacle against which it has no moral argument. Rather than challenge it directly, opponents must debate it.

In analysing the fake news ecosystem to identify human rights vulnerabilities, we have seen that social movements, multi-culturalism and gender equality are frequent targets, and this is carried out through narratives that discredit positive views towards these issues and cast aspersions at their supporters. At the same time, they also validate illiberal perspectives through the perpetuation of false narratives and insinuations of conspiracy.

²⁷⁷ Nic Newman and others, 'Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2018' (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2018) 46 <<http://media.digitalnewsreport.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/digital-news-report-2018.pdf?x89475>> accessed 8 July 2018.

²⁷⁸ Jonathan Chait, 'New Study Shows What Really Happened in the 2016 Election' (*Intelligencer*, 18 June 2017) <<http://nymag.com/intelligencer/2017/06/new-study-shows-what-really-happened-in-the-2016-election.html>> accessed 15 February 2018.

From an economic standpoint, disinformation plays the short-game. Users get wise to clickbait. But it creates a zero-sum game in terms of awareness raising. Human rights issues cannot compete with disinformation without fuelling pre-existing narratives of bias, grievance and disingenuousness. Meanwhile, criticisms through disinformation, the co-opting of rhetoric for illiberal causes and competitive memory strategies undermine its status as a tenet of society and re-frame it as derogable or impractical. Overtime, these discreditations and overapplications can wear away at the perceived value of the human rights regime. The quantity of content and narratives that competes for attention suggests that Hansen's cognitive firewall²⁷⁹ will become a foundation of information processing. Should disinformation function properly, it is possible that appeals to human rights will move to the cognitive equivalent of the spam folder.

²⁷⁹ Flemming Splidsboel Hansen, 'Russian Hybrid Warfare' (DIIS, 2017) 34 <http://pure.diiis.dk/ws/files/950041/DIIS_RP_2017_6_web.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

7.

CONCLUSION

Months before the 2016 parliamentary elections in Georgia, sex tapes of politicians were released online. These leaks were accompanied by threats to release more if other politicians did not resign. People took to the streets in outrage chanting slogans like ‘Sex is not a crime’. They opposed the leaks, not the politicians’ behaviour.²⁸⁰

In 2017, start-up Bodega unveiled its attempt to disrupt the convenience store. The product was an automated machine containing non-perishable items linked to an app that measured purchasing habits. Its founders envisaged a future when ‘centralized shopping locations won’t be necessary because there will be 100,000 Bodegas spread out’.²⁸¹ The public was not impressed. Throughout an industry that treats every application of technology with enthusiasm, people did not see disruption. They saw a vending machine, albeit a smart one.

In both instances, people recognised that they were being manipulated and rejected these attempts. Of course there are extenuating factors. The Georgia incident was shaped by public resistance to surveillance and opposition to the gender bias that targeted female politicians. For Bodega, cultural and economic insensitivity contributed to the backlash. Still, these episodes are a reminder that we are not damned to a polarised, tribalised, hyperpartisan future. People catch on to the ways in which they are being controlled.

²⁸⁰ Tamar Svanidze, ‘Sex Tape Scandal Rocks Georgian Society’ *Georgia Today* (Tbilisi, 14 March 2016) <<http://georgiatoday.ge/news/3249/Sex-Tape-Scandal-Rocks-Georgian-Society>> accessed 1 July 2018.

²⁸¹ Elizabeth Segran, ‘Two Ex-Googlers Want To Make Bodegas And Mom-And-Pop Corner Stores Obsolete’ (13 September 2017) <www.fastcompany.com/40466047/two-ex-googlers-want-to-make-bodegas-and-mom-and-pop-corner-stores-obsolete> accessed 1 July 2018.

Disinformation wants to challenge this. Its creators, as shown by the disinformation networks leading up to votes in Ireland and Mexico, are usually one step ahead of the current methods to stop them. However, as the results in both those cases show, disinformation is not always enough.

This research argues that disinformation narratives devalue human rights considerations and efforts. Multiple actors have a stake in this – autocratic leaders, racial and cultural supremacists, techno-libertarian regimes, nihilistic trolls that resent the positing of moral authority – but the discourse by which this is attempted seeks to exacerbate the worst stereotypes within political binaries to disengage the empathy of potential sympathisers and erode the middle ground.

This is enabled by existing, legal aspects of neo-liberal systems, including online monetisation, hybrid journalism-public relations structures and political resistance to regulating the technology industry. The strategic application of online amplification tools and freedom of speech arguments by governments, corporations and coordinated trolling networks reinforce existing power structures.

In analysing disinformation headlines in the US, Italy, Greece and Ukraine, this study found that disinformation headlines explicitly target social movements, othered groups and issues of cultural erosion by speaking to feelings of fraternal deprivation. These are framed by institutional criticisms alleging corruption, inefficiency and negligence of the citizenry in favour of over-accommodation of the other. International obligations are an active, insistent tax on the nation and violation of sovereignty, and those who invoke rights are speaking of entitlements that limit the freedom of others.

These findings are elicited through communicative theories. Grice's CP grounds disinformation as behaviour, and Fairclough's social theory provides a means to highlight relevant features, articulate narratives and analyse them to identify human rights vulnerabilities.

A common refrain in the fake news debate is Gatov's notion that 'the 21st century will be defined by malevolent actors, states or corporations, abusing the right to freedom of information',²⁸² and McStay imagines a

²⁸² Peter Pomerantsev and Michael Weiss, 'The Menace of Unreality: How the Kremlin Weaponizes Information, Culture and Money' (The Interpreter, Institute of Modern Russia, 2014) 14 <www.interpretermag.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/The_Menace_of_Unreality_Final.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

future where people paint their faces before leaving the house to evade facial recognition advertisements.²⁸³ Technology has been presented as a way to curate our lives, but overarching economic systems are more prone to use it to flood public channels and shape behaviour. The existence of fake news as a term and topic of discourse is proof of this.

Each of the four environments analysed in this study show that each state deals with its own disinformation concerns and social tensions. However, across these borders and cultures, there are unifying narratives of distortion, disruption and disinformation. From these, this research understands and suggests the following:

- Left-wing disinformation often focuses on raising awareness of existing behaviour using disingenuous content. Right-wing disinformation often uses disingenuous content to imply conspiracy and motivation.
- Rather than compete through disinformation, it is more productive to expand the middle ground and isolate fringe actors by highlighting illiberal, violent sentiments and reversing the mainstreaming of new racism in western discourse.
- CDA can help identify rhetorical strongpoints and vulnerabilities in public issues and understanding. Further research might include:
 - a quantitative behavioural study paired with CDA as to how the discourse of human rights organisations affects public opinion;
 - examining the technology industry's stance to human rights obligations, especially workers' rights;
 - examining the impact of citizen journalism and authenticity markers on persuasive efficacy; or
 - a cross-analysis of Trump tweets with disinformation linked to or associated with the Kremlin.
- Fake news offers predictive insight about the intentions of actors, frequently the right, in that they project their motivations and insecurities onto perceived opposition. The reliance on manipulated content is indicative of a lack of substance and foundation for claims, and these insecurities provide a window with which to combat disinformation.

²⁸³ Andrew McStay, 'Empathetic Media and Advertising: Industry, Policy, Legal and Citizen Perspectives (the Case for Intimacy)' (23 November 2016) *Big Data & Society*, 1, 10 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/2053951716666868>> accessed 29 March 2018.

- As Giles warns,²⁸⁴ this lack of foundation is not an inherent weakness or sign of ineffectiveness. The perpetuation of hyperbolic claims lacking integrity and the projection of behaviour onto opponents, are themselves techniques to devalue language and discourse economies.
- The example of repurposed memes for satire, as seen in the Italian cronyism examples, can devalue disinformation by exposing its methods and mocking it as rudimentary and impetuous, given that the falsity and reason for mockery are clear.
- The discourse around headlines suggest that human rights-framings would benefit from narratives that emphasise benefits for society, as opposed to the identity politics and competitive memory strategies that often occupy its discourse. A return to Roosevelt's four freedoms might be in order.

²⁸⁴ Keir Giles, 'Russia's "New" Tools for Confronting the West Continuity and Innovation in Moscow's Exercise of Power' (Chatham House, March 2016) 36 <www.chathamhouse.org/sites/default/files/publications/2016-03-russia-new-tools-giles.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS AND ARTICLES

- Al Kayed M and Kitishad A, 'The Violation of Grice's Maxims in Jordanian Newspapers' Cartoons: A Pragmatic Study' (January 2015) 4(4) International Journal of Linguistics and Literature 41 <www.researchgate.net/publication/306065313_The_Violation_of_the_Grice's_Maxims_in_Jordanian_newspapers'_cartoons_a_Pragmatic_Study> accessed 8 July 2018
- Amazeen MA, 'Voter disdain: twenty-first century trends in political advertising' in Coombs D and Batchelor B (eds), *We Are What We Sell: How Advertising Shapes American Life... And Always Has* (Prager 2014) 287
- Bakir V and McStay A, 'Fake News and the Economy of Emotions' (20 July 2017) 6(2) Digital Journalism 154-175 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2017.1345645>> accessed 1 April 2018
- Bakshy E, Messing S and Adamic LA, 'Exposure to Ideologically Diverse News and Opinion on Facebook' (5 June 2015) 348(6239) Science 1130 <<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/348/6239/1130>> accessed 1 April 2018
- Barberá P, 'How Social Media Reduces Mass Political Polarization. Evidence from Germany, Spain, and the US' (APSA Conference, San Francisco, 2015) <http://pablobarbera.com/static/barbera_polarization_APSA.pdf> accessed 29 March 2018
- — and others, 'Tweeting From Left to Right: Is Online Political Communication More Than an Echo Chamber' (21 August 2015) 26(10) Psychological Science 1, 10 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797615594620>> accessed 29 March 2018
- Berger J, 'Arousal Increases Social Transmission of Information' (20 June 2011) 22(7) Psychological Science 891 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797611413294>> accessed 29 March 2018
- Berinsky AJ, 'Telling the Truth about Believing the Lies? Evidence for the Limited Prevalence of Expressive Survey Responding' (January 2018) 80(1) The Journal of Politics <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/694258>> accessed 29 March 2018

- Bessi A, 'Personality Traits and Echo Chambers on Facebook' (December 2016) 65 *Computers in Human Behavior* 319 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2016.08.016>> accessed 23 March 2018
- Bigoness WJ, 'Distributive Versus Integrative Approaches to Negotiation: Experimental Learning Through a Negotiation Simulation' (1984) (11) *Developments in Business Simulation and Experimental Exercises* 64 <<https://journals.tdl.org/absel/index.php/absel/article/view/2215/2184>> accessed 10 July 2018
- Bode L and Vraga EK, 'In Related News, That was Wrong: The Correction of Misinformation Through Related Stories Functionality in Social Media' (1 August 2015) 65(4) *Journal of Communication* 619 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/jcom.12166>> accessed 25 March 2018
- Bohner G, Moskowitz GB and Chaiken S, 'The Interplay of Heuristic and Systematic Processing of Social Information' (1995) 6(1) *European Review of Social Psychology* 33 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/14792779443000003>> accessed 4 July 2018
- Boxell L, Gentzkow M and Shapiro JM, 'Greater Internet Use is Not Associated With Faster Growth in Political Polarization Among US Demographic Groups' (3 October 2017) 114(40) *PNAS* 10612 <<https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1706588114>> accessed 29 March 2018
- Cherry MA and Aloisi A, "'Dependent Contractors" in the Gig Economy: A Comparative Approach' (2017) 66(3) *American University Law Review* 635 <<http://digitalcommons.wcl.american.edu/aulr/vol66/iss3/1>> accessed 9 July 2018
- Dor D, 'On Newspaper Headlines as Relevance Optimizers' (May 2003) 35(5) *Journal of Pragmatics* 695 <[https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-2166\(02\)00134-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-2166(02)00134-0)> accessed 8 July 2018
- Dworkin R, 'Rights as Trumps' in Jeremy Waldron (ed), *Theories of Rights* (OUP 1984) 153-162
- Ecker U and others, 'The Effects of Subtle Misinformation in News Headlines' (2014) 20(4) *Journal of Experimental Psychology* 323 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/xap0000028>> accessed 1 July 2018
- Fairclough N, *Language and Power* (Longman Group 1989) 26, 27, 111, 119-120, 141
- — *Discourse and Social Change* (Polity Press 1992) 56
- — *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language* (Longman Group 1995) 54
- — 'What is CDA? Language and Power Twenty-Five Years On' (*Academia.edu*, 2015) 32 <www.academia.edu/8429277/What_is_CDA_Language_and_Power_twenty-five_years_on> accessed 5 July 2018
- Farkas J, Schou J and Neumayer C, 'Platformed Antagonism: Racist Discourses on Fake Muslim Facebook Pages' 15(5) *Critical Discourse Studies* 463 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/17405904.2018.1450276>> accessed 9 July 2018
- Fazio LK and others, 'Knowledge Does Not Protect Against Illusory Truth' (October 2015) 144(5) *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General* 993 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/xge0000098>> accessed 23 February 2018

- Finkelman P, 'The Rise of the New Racism' (1996) 15(1) Yale Law & Policy Review <<https://digitalcommons.law.yale.edu/ylpr/vol15/iss1/6/>> accessed 4 July 2018
- Flaxman S, Goel S and Rao JM, 'Filter Bubbles, Echo Chambers, and Online News Consumption' (1 January 2016) 80(S1) Public Opinion Quarterly 298 <<https://doi.org/10.1093/poq/nfw006>> accessed 29 March 2018
- Flynn DJ, Nyhan B and Reifler J, 'The Nature and Origins of Misperceptions: Understanding False and Unsupported Beliefs About Politics' (26 January 2017) 38(S1) Political Psychology <<https://doi.org/10.1111/pops.12394>> accessed 23 February 2018
- Garimella K and others, 'Political Discourse on Social Media: Echo Chambers, Gatekeepers, and the Price of Bipartisanship' WWW '18 Proceedings of the 2018 World Wide Web Conference 913 <<https://doi.org/10.1145/3178876.3186139>> accessed 22 May 2018
- Goel S and others, 'The Structural Virality of Online Diffusion' (22 July 2015) 62(1) Management Science 180, 191 <<https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.2015.2158>> accessed 29 March 2018
- Grice P, *Studies in the Way of Words* (1st edn, Harvard UP 1991) 26
- Haglin K, 'The Limitations of the Backfire Effect' (3 July 2017) 4(3) Research and Politics 1 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/2053168017716547>> accessed 23 May 2018
- Hahn U and Harris AJL, 'What Does It Mean to be Biased: Motivated Reasoning and Rationality' (2014) 61 Psychology of Learning and Motivation 41 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-800283-4.00002-2>> accessed 4 July 2018
- Hartzell SL, 'Alt-White: Conceptualizing the "Alt-Right" as a Rhetorical Bridge between White Nationalism and Mainstream Public Discourse' (2018) 8(1/2) Journal of Contemporary Rhetoric 6 <http://contemporaryrhetoric.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/Hartzell8_1_2_2.pdf> accessed 23 June 2018
- Herzog S, 'Revisiting the Estonian Cyber Attacks: Digital Threats and Multinational Responses' (2011) 4(2) Journal of Strategic Security 49 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.5038/1944-0472.4.2.3>> accessed 30 July 2018
- Horne BD and Adali S, 'This Just In: Fake News Packs a Lot in Title, Uses Simpler, Repetitive Content in Text Body, More Similar to Satire than Real News' (2017) CoRR <arXiv:1703.09398> accessed 1 April 2018
- Howard PN, *New Media Campaigns and the Managed Citizen* (Cambridge UP 2006) 98
- Huckle S and White M, 'Fake News: A Technological Approach to Proving the Origins of Content, Using Blockchains' (1 December 2017) 5(4) Big Data <<https://doi.org/10.1089/big.2017.0071>> accessed 29 March 2018
- Kheirabadi R and Aghagolzadeh F, 'Grice's Cooperative Maxims as Linguistic Criteria for News Selectivity' (March 2012) 2(3) Theory and Practice in Language Studies 547 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.4304/tpls.2.3.547-553>> accessed 8 July 2018
- King G, Pan J and Roberts ME, 'How the Chinese Government Fabricates Social Media Posts for Strategic Distraction, Not Engaged Argument' (27 July 2017) 111(3) American Political Science Review 484 <<https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003055417000144>> accessed 5 March 2018

- Klein N, *No Is Not Enough: Resisting the New Shock Politics and Winning the World We Need* (Alfred A Knopf 2017)
- Koohikamali M and Sidorova A, 'Information Re-Sharing on Social Network Sites in the Age of Fake News' (2017) 20 *Informing Science: The International Journal of an Emerging Transdiscipline* 215 <<https://doi.org/10.28945/3871>> accessed 24 October 2017
- Kumar S and Shah N, 'False Information on Web and Social Media: A Survey' (23 April 2018) *CoRR* 1 <<abs/1804.08559>> accessed 4 July 2018
- Lum K and Isaac W, 'To Predict and Serve?' (7 October 2016) 13(5) *Significance* <<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1740-9713.2016.00960.x>> accessed 8 July 2018
- Marchi R, 'With Facebook, Blogs, and Fake News, Teens Reject Journalistic "Objectivity"' (3 October 2012) 36(3) *Journal of Communication Inquiry* 196 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0196859912458700>> accessed 23 February 2018
- Margolin DB, Hannak A and Weber I, 'Political Fact-Checking on Twitter: When Do Corrections Have an Effect?' (5 September 2017) 35(2) *Political Communication* 196 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/10584609.2017.1334018>> accessed 1 April 2018
- McStay A, 'Empathetic Media and Advertising: Industry, Policy, Legal and Citizen Perspectives (the Case for Intimacy)' (23 November 2016) *Big Data & Society*, 1, 10 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/2053951716666868>> accessed 29 March 2018
- Messing S and Westwood SJ, 'Selective Exposure in the Age of Social Media: Endorsements Trump Partisan Source Affiliation When Selecting News Online' (31 December 2012) 41(8) *Communication Research* 1042 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/0093650212466406>> accessed 25 March 2018
- Metzger MJ and Flanagin AJ, 'Credibility and Trust in Online Environments: The Use of Cognitive Heuristics' (December 2013) 59(B) *Journal of Pragmatics* 210, 217 <<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pragma.2013.07.012>> accessed 5 March 2018
- and Medders RB, 'Social and Heuristic Approaches to Credibility Evaluation Online' (19 August 2010) 60 *Journal of Communication* 413, 435 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.2010.01488.x>> accessed 5 March 2018
- Mihalache D, 'The Crisis of European Western Civilisation and the Risk of a New "Moral Wandering"' (March 2014) VI(1) *Cogito Multidisciplinary Research Journal* 60 <<http://cogito.ucdc.ro/cogito-en-martie.pdf>> accessed 4 December 2017
- Mustafaraj E and Taxis Metaxas P, 'The Fake News Spreading Plague: Was it Preventable?' (ACM Web Science Troy, June 2017)
- Neier A, *The International Human Rights Movement* (Princeton UP 2012) 257
- Newman JM, 'Silicon Valley Rhetoric: Three Myths Debunked' (CPI Antitrust Chronicle, April 2018) 5 <www.competitionpolicyinternational.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/05/CPI-Newman.pdf> accessed 8 July 2018
- Nyhan B and Reifler J, 'When Corrections Fail: The Persistence of Political Misperceptions' (30 March 2010) 32(2) *Political Behavior* 303 <<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11109-010-9112-2>> accessed 5 March 2018

- Pariser E, *The Filter Bubble: What the Internet is Hiding From You* (Penguin Press 2011)
- Pennycook G and Rand DG, 'The Implied Truth Effect: Attaching Warnings to a Subset of Fake News Stories Increases Perceived Accuracy of Stories Without Warnings' (8 December 2017) SSRN <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3035384>> accessed 26 February 2018
- 'Who Falls for Fake News? The Roles of Bullshit Receptivity, Overclaiming, Familiarity, and Analytic Thinking' (23 May 2018) SSRN 31 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3023545>> accessed 20 May 2018
- and Cannon T, 'Prior Exposure Increases Perceived Accuracy of Fake News' (3 May 2018) *Journal of Experimental Psychology General* <10.2139/ssrn.2958246> accessed 22 May 2018
- Petty RE and Cacioppo JT, 'The Elaboration Likelihood Model of Persuasion' (1986) 19 *Advances in Experimental Social Psychology* 123 <[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0065-2601\(08\)60214-2](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0065-2601(08)60214-2)> accessed 4 July 2018
- Polage DC, 'Making Up History: False Memories of Fake News Stories' (May 2012) 8(2) *Europe's Journal of Psychology* 245 <<https://doi.org/10.5964/ejop.v8i2.456>> accessed 24 October 2017
- Potthast M and others, 'A Stylometric Inquiry into Hyperpartisan and Fake News' (18 February 2017) CoRR <<http://arxiv.org/abs/1702.05638>> accessed 8 July 2018
- Quattrociochi W and others, 'Echo Chambers on Facebook' (13 June 2016) SSRN 1 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2795110>> accessed 23 March 2018
- Ramanathan R and Tan BH, 'Application of Critical Discourse Analysis in Media Discourse Studies' 21(2) 3L: *The Southeast Asian Journal of English Language Studies* 57, 58 <<http://ejournals.ukm.my/3l/article/view/9183>> accessed 9 July 2018
- Rashkin H and others, 'Truth of Varying Shades: Analyzing Language in Fake News and Political Fact-Checking' (Conference on Empirical Methods in Natural Language Processing, Copenhagen, September 2017) 2931, 2933 <<https://aclanthology.info/papers/D17-1317/d17-1317>> accessed 1 April 2018
- Rothberg M, 'Introduction: Theorizing Multidirectional Memory in a Transnational Age' in Rothberg M, *Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonization* (Stanford UP 2009) 1-29
- Schnauffer II TA, 'Redefining Hybrid Warfare: Russia's Nonlinear War against the West' (2017) 10(1) *Journal of Strategic Security* 17, 23-24, 27 <<http://scholarcommons.usf.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1538&context=jss>> accessed 9 February 2018
- Tandoc Jr EC, Lim ZW and Ling R, 'Defining "Fake News"' (2018) 6(2) *Digital Journalism* 137, 141, 147 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2017.1360143>> accessed 10 May 2018
- Theocharis Y and van Deth JW, 'A Modern Tragedy? Institutional Causes and Democratic Consequences of the Greek Crisis' (2015) 51(1) *Representation* 63 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/00344893.2015.1011464>> accessed 1 April 2018

- Treré E, 'The Dark Side of Digital Politics: Understanding the Algorithmic Manufacturing of Consent and the Hindering of Online Dissidence' (24 January 2016) 47(1) IDS Bulletin 127, 135 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.19088/1968-2016.111>> accessed 29 March 2018
- van Dijk TA, *News as Discourse* (Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc 1988)
- — *Ideology: A Multidisciplinary Approach* (Sage 1998) 267
- — 'New(s) Racism: A Discourse Analytical Approach' in Simon Cottle (ed), *Ethnic Minorities and the Media* (Open UP 2000) 33-49
- — 'Critical Discourse Analysis' in Schiffrin D, Tannen D and Hamilton HE (eds), *The Handbook of Discourse Analysis* (Blackwell 2001) 352, 367
- Vargo CJ, Guo L and Amazeen MA, 'The Agenda-Setting Power of Fake News: A Big Data Analysis of the Online Media Landscape from 2014 to 2016' (15 June 2017) 20(5) New Media & Society 2028 <<https://doi.org/10.1177/1461444817712086>> accessed 4 April 2018
- Weeks BE, 'Emotions, Partisanship, and Misperceptions: How Anger and Anxiety Moderate the Effect of Partisan Bias on Susceptibility to Political Misinformation' (19 June 2015) 65(4) Journal of Communication 699 <<https://doi.org/10.1111/jcom.12164>> accessed 25 March 2018
- Widdowson HG, *Text, Context, Pretext: Critical Issues in Discourse Analysis* (Blackwell Publishing 2004) 17
- Wood T and Porter E, 'The Elusive Backfire Effect: Mass Attitudes' Steadfast Factual Adherence' (January 2016) SSRN <<http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2819073>> accessed 23 May 2018
- Yang JH and others, 'How to Manipulate Social Media: Analyzing Political Astroturfing Using Ground Truth Data from South Korea' (AAAI Conference on Web and Social Media, Montreal, May 2017) <<https://aaai.org/ocs/index.php/ICWSM/ICWSM17/paper/download/15638/14870>> accessed 1 April 2018
- Yurchak A, *Everything Was Forever, Until It Was No More: The Last Soviet Generation* (Princeton UP 2006) 50-51
- Zannettou S and others, 'On the Origins of Memes by Means of Fringe Web Communities' (31 May 2018) CoRR 16 <<https://arxiv.org/abs/1805.12512>> accessed 19 June 2018

OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS

- European Commission, 'A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Disinformation: Report of the Independent High Level Group on Fake News and Online Disinformation' (March 2018) 18, 25 <<https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/news/final-report-high-level-expert-group-fake-news-and-online-disinformation>> accessed 20 March 2018
- Fredheim R, 'Robotrolling' (NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence, January 2017) <www.stratcomcoe.org/robotrolling-20171> accessed 5 March 2018
- Nissen TE, 'Social Media's Role in "Hybrid Strategies"' (NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence, 20 September 2016) 1, 2, 6-7 <www.stratcomcoe.org/social-medias-role-hybrid-strategies-author-thomas-eltkjer-nissen> accessed 20 February 2018

- United Nations Mission in Liberia ‘An Assessment of Human Rights Issues Emanating from Traditional Practices in Liberia’ (UN Mission in Liberia [UNMIL] 2016) 15 <www.refworld.org/docid/568d1ca94.html> accessed 25 June 2018
- UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Opinion and Expression and others, ‘Joint Declaration on Freedom of Expression and “Fake News,” Disinformation and Propaganda’ (3 March 2017) FOM.GAL/3/17 <www.osce.org/fom/302796?download=true> accessed 25 March 2018

INTERNET SOURCES

- — ‘About Us’ (StopFake.org, 2018) <www.stopfake.org/en/about-us/> accessed 30 March 2018
- — ‘About’ (EUvsDisinfo, 2018) <<https://euvsdisinfo.eu/about/>> accessed 30 March 2018
- — ‘Be the Disruptor’ (Fall 2012) Nieman Reports 66(3) <https://niemanreports.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/be_the_disruptor.pdf> accessed 27 March 2018
- — ‘Fake News Challenge’ (Fakenewschallenge.org, 2018) <www.fakenewschallenge.org/> accessed 4 March 2018
- Anderson K, ‘The Price of Silicon Valley’s “Disruption” – Is It Possible to Now Have Responsible Information Economics?’ (*Scholarly Kitchen*, 4 January 2017) <<https://scholarlykitchen.sspnet.org/2017/01/04/the-price-of-silicon-valleys-disruption-is-it-possible-to-now-have-responsible-information-economics/>> accessed 18 June 2018
- Auvinen H, ‘Tackling Fake News and Misinformation in Platforms’ (*PlatformValueNow*, 4 April 2018) <<http://platformvaluenow.org/signals/tackling-fake-news-and-misinformation-in-platforms/>> accessed 4 April 2018
- Babakar M, ‘Crowdsourced Factchecking’ (Medium.com, 29 May 2018) <<https://medium.com/@meandvan/crowdsourced-factchecking-4c5168ea5ac3>> accessed 29 May 2018
- Barthel M, ‘Why “Disruption” is an Ugly and Dishonest Buzzword’ (*Bullett*, 4 June 2013) <<http://bulletmedia.com/article/why-disruption-is-an-ugly-and-dishonest-buzzword/>> accessed 15 June 2018
- Bogost I, ‘Startups Need to “Stop Disrupting and Start Innovating”’ (*Wired*, 12 December 2016) <www.wired.co.uk/article/startups-disrupt-disruption> accessed 15 June 2018
- Bounegru L and others, ‘A Field Guide to “Fake News” and Other Information Disorder’ (Public Data Lab 2017) 8 <<https://fakenews.publicdatalab.org/>> accessed 20 April 2018
- Boyd D, ‘Did Media Literacy Backfire?’ (Medium.com, 5 January 2017) <<https://points.datasociety.net/did-media-literacy-backfire-7418c084d88d>> accessed 30 June 2018
- Bryant B, ‘Why Do Young Men Worship Professor Jordan Peterson?’ (*BBC News*, 1 August 2018) <www.bbc.co.uk/bbcthree/article/f1d7fed0-4ddf-4a8a-94b9-ea05f913cdd2> accessed 14 June 2018

- Buruma I, 'Final Cut' *The New Yorker* (New York City, 3 January 2005) <www.newyorker.com/magazine/2005/01/03/final-cut-2> accessed 3 July 2018
- Chait J, 'New Study Shows What Really Happened in the 2016 Election' (*Intelligencer*, 18 June 2017) <<http://nymag.com/intelligencer/2017/06/new-study-shows-what-really-happened-in-the-2016-election.html>> accessed 15 February 2018
- Chan FT, 'China's Social Credit System Has Blocked People From Taking 11 Million Flights and 4 Million Train Trips' (*Business Insider*, 21 May 2018) <www.businessinsider.com/china-social-credit-system-blocked-people-taking-flights-train-trips-2018-5> accessed 22 May 2018
- Chau A, 'How America's Identity Politics Went From Inclusion to Division' *The Guardian* (London, 1 March 2018) <www.theguardian.com/society/2018/mar/01/how-americas-identity-politics-went-from-inclusion-to-division> accessed 3 March 2018
- Chen A, 'The Agency' *The New York Times Magazine* (New York City, 2 June 2015) <www.nytimes.com/2015/06/07/magazine/the-agency.html> accessed 10 April 2018
- Chen M, 'This Is How Bad the Sharing Economy Is for Workers' *The Nation* (New York City, 14 September 2015) <www.thenation.com/article/this-is-how-bad-the-sharing-economy-is-for-workers/> accessed 8 July 2018
- Chertok P, 'Russophobia: How Russia Exploits Western Values For Its Propaganda' (StopFake.org, 22 May 2018) <www.stopfake.org/en/russophobia-how-russia-exploits-western-values-for-its-propaganda/> accessed 24 May 2018
- Christensen C, 'Disruptive Innovation' (Claytonchristensen.com, 2018) <www.claytonchristensen.com/key-concepts/> accessed 8 July 2018
- Constine J, 'Facebook Bans Monetization of Violence, Porn, Drugs, Hate' (*TechCrunch*, 13 September 2017) <<https://techcrunch.com/2017/09/13/facebook-monetization-2/>> accessed 4 April 2018
- Daniilidis T, 'About Us' (Ellinikahoaxes.gr, 2018) <<http://ellinikahoaxes.gr>> accessed 13 April 2018
- Darnton R, 'The True History of Fake News' *The New York Review of Books* (New York City, 13 February 2017) <www.nybooks.com/daily/2017/02/13/the-true-history-of-fake-news/> accessed 10 March 2018
- Diaz D, 'These Democrats Want to Abolish ICE' (*CNN*, 3 July 2018) <<https://edition.cnn.com/2018/07/02/politics/abolish-ice-democrats-list/index.html>> accessed 5 July 2018
- Del Mastro A, 'Social Justice Warriors Define Bigotry Down So They Can Stay In Business' (theFederalist.com, 21 September 2006) <<http://thefederalist.com/2016/09/21/social-justice-warriors-define-bigotry-can-stay-business/>> accessed 25 May 2018
- Donovan J and Boyd D, 'The Case for Quarantining Extremist Ideas' *The Guardian* (London, 1 June 2018) <www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/jun/01/extremist-ideas-media-coverage-kkk> accessed 1 June 2018

- Drobnic Holan A, 'The Principles of the Truth-O-Meter: PolitiFact's Methodology for Independent Fact-Checking' (*PolitiFact*, 12 February 2018) <www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/article/2018/feb/12/principles-truth-o-meter-politifact-methodology-i/> accessed 30 March 2018
- Dubberly S, 'In the Firing Line: How Amnesty's Digital Verification Corps Changed Official Narratives Through Open Source Investigation' (*Citizen Evidence Lab*, 18 May 2017) <<https://citizenevidence.org/2017/05/18/in-the-firing-line-how-amnestys-digital-verification-corps-changed-official-narratives-through-open-source-investigation/>> accessed 1 June 2018
- El-Bermawy MM, 'Your Filter Bubble is Destroying Democracy' (*Wired*, 18 November 2016) <www.wired.com/2016/11/filter-bubble-destroying-democracy/> accessed 10 March 2018
- Ellis EG, 'Can't Take a Joke? That's Just Poe's Law, 2017's Most Important Internet Phenomenon' (*Wired*, 5 June 2017) <www.wired.com/2017/06/poes-law-troll-cultures-central-rule/> accessed 6 March 2018
- Europa Taylor M, 'Egyptian Government Launches New Social Media Platform to Rival Facebook' (*Face2faceAfrica.com*, 26 March 2018) <<https://face2faceafrica.com/article/egyptian-government-launches-new-social-media-platform-rival-facebook>> accessed 15 June 2018
- Evon D, 'With Gates Wide Open' (Snopes.com, 17 November 2015) <www.snopes.com/news/2015/11/17/disturbing-muslim-refugee-video/> accessed 16 March 2018
- — 'Is Starbucks Offering Coupons for Black Customers Only?' (Snopes.com, 18 April 2018) <www.snopes.com/fact-check/starbucks-coupon-for-black-customers-only/> accessed 18 April 2018
- Feder JL and Kulcsar R, 'Meet The Mystery Man Who Is The Power Behind The Throne In Hungary' (*BuzzFeed News*, 4 April 2018) <www.buzzfeed.com/lesterfeder/hungarys-steve-bannon> accessed 16 April 2018
- Fielding N and Cobain I, 'Revealed: US Spy Operation That Manipulates Social Media' *The Guardian* (London, 17 March 2011) <www.theguardian.com/technology/2011/mar/17/us-spy-operation-social-networks> accessed 20 April 2018
- Frenkel S, 'Facebook Tried to Rein In Fake Ads. It Fell Short in a California Race' *The New York Times* (New York City, 3 June 2018) <www.nytimes.com/2018/06/03/technology/california-congressional-race-facebook-election-interference.html> accessed 5 June 2018
- Friedersdorf C, 'The Excesses of Call-Out Culture' *The Atlantic* (Washington DC, 19 February 2018) <www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2018/02/what-good-can-come-of-callout-culture/553661/> accessed 25 May 2018
- Funke D, 'These Two Studies Found That Correcting Misperceptions Works. But It's Not Magic' (Poynter.org, 11 October 2017) <<https://www.poynter.org/fact-checking/2017/these-two-studies-found-that-correcting-misperceptions-works-but-it%C2%92s-not-magic/>> accessed 15 May 2018
- — 'A Guide to Anti-Misinformation Actions Around the World' (Poynter.org, 14 March 2018) <www.poynter.org/news/guide-anti-misinformation-actions-around-world> accessed 30 March 2018
- — 'When a Popular Italian Debunking Site Was Sued, a Judge Shut it Down' (Poynter.org, 16 April 2018) <www.poynter.org/news/when-popular-italian-debunking-site-was-sued-judge-shut-it-down> accessed 23 April 2018

- Human Rights Watch, 'Germany: Flawed Social Media Law' (Human Rights Watch, 14 February 2018) <www.hrw.org/news/2018/02/14/germany-flawed-social-media-law> accessed 14 February 2018
- Greenwald G, 'How Covert Agents Infiltrate the Internet to Manipulate, Deceive, and Destroy Reputations' (*The Intercept*, 24 February 2014) <<https://theintercept.com/2014/02/24/jtrig-manipulation/>> accessed 20 April 2018
- Hanke J, 'Steve Bannon to French Far-Right: "Let Them Call You Racists"' (Politico.com, 11 March 2018) <www.politico.eu/article/steve-bannon-to-french-far-right-let-them-call-you-racists/> accessed 15 March 2018
- Harrington E, 'Oxford Study Saying Trump Supporters Share More Fake News is Fake News' (*Fox News*, 9 February 2018) <www.foxnews.com/politics/2018/02/09/oxford-study-saying-trump-supporters-share-more-fake-news-is-fake-news.html> accessed 9 February 2018
- Harrison P, 'Italy's Vote: Fake Claims Attempt to Influence Election' (*BBC News*, 3 March 2018) <www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-43214136> accessed 5 March 2018
- Hill L, 'Plastic Surgery With a Mouse Click' (*Vulture*, 4 April 2016) <www.vulture.com/2016/03/special-effects-c-v-r.html> accessed 1 June 2018
- Jackson J, 'In the Post-Truth Era Sweden's Far Right Fake Fact Checker Was Inevitable' *The Guardian* (London, 19 January 2017) <www.theguardian.com/media/2017/jan/19/in-the-post-truth-era-swedens-far-right-fake-fact-checker-was-inevitable> accessed 10 June 2018
- Kessler J, 'The Alt Right Should Be a White Civil Rights Movement' (JasonKessler.us, 28 December 2017) <<http://jasonkessler.us/2017/12/28/whitecivilrights/>> accessed 1 July 2018
- Koutantou A and Kambas M, 'Greece, Russia to Expel Diplomats in Macedonia Tussle Ahead of NATO Summit' (*Reuters*, 11 July 2018) <www.reuters.com/article/us-greece-russia-diplomats/greece-russia-to-expel-diplomats-in-macedonia-tussle-ahead-of-nato-summit-idUSKBN1K10PU> accessed 10 July 2018
- Kruzel J, 'Donald Trump's "Fake News" Epithet Emboldens Despots Around the World' (*PolitiFact*, 17 January 2018) <www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/jan/22/jeff-flake/donald-trumps-fake-news-epithet-emboldens-despots-/> accessed 5 April 2018
- Lavin R and Adorjani R, 'How Ireland Beat Dark Ads' *Foreign Policy* (Washington DC, 1 June 2018) <<https://foreignpolicy.com/2018/06/01/abortion-referendum-how-ireland-resisted-bad-behaviour-online/>> accessed 8 June 2018
- Lee D, "'Crazy" to Say Facebook Helped Trump Win – Zuckerberg' (*BBC News*, 11 November 2016) <www.bbc.com/news/technology-37946713> accessed 8 March 2018
- Levine I, 'Why "Fake News" As Word of the Year Is Bad For Human Rights' (Human Rights Watch, 11 November 2016) <www.hrw.org/news/2017/11/06/why-fake-news-word-year-bad-human-rights> accessed 30 June 2018

- Levitz E, “‘Baby Breitbarts’ Might Be the Future of Local Newspapers’ (*Intelligencer*, 1 May 2018) <<http://nymag.com/intelligencer/2018/05/baby-breitbart-might-be-the-future-of-local-newspapers.html?utm=bottom&utm=bottom>> accessed 1 May 2018
- Liptak A, ‘How Conservatives Weaponized the First Amendment’ *The New York Times* (New York City, 30 June 2018) <www.nytimes.com/2018/06/30/us/politics/first-amendment-conservatives-supreme-court.html> accessed 30 June 2018
- Lomas N, ‘Study: Russian Twitter Bots Sent 45k Brexit Tweets Close to Vote’ (*TechCrunch*, 15 November 2017) <<https://techcrunch.com/2017/11/15/study-russian-twitter-bots-sent-45k-brexit-tweets-close-to-vote/>> accessed 12 May 2018
- ‘Study: Russia-linked fake Twitter accounts sought to spread terrorist-related social division in the UK’ (*TechCrunch*, 18 December 2017) <<https://techcrunch.com/2017/12/18/study-russia-linked-fake-twitter-accounts-sought-to-spread-terrorist-related-social-division-in-the-uk/>> accessed 1 April 2018
- Lumb D, ‘Fake News on WhatsApp Is Inciting Lynchings in India’ (*Engadget*, 2 July 2018) <www.engadget.com/2018/07/02/india-fake-news-whatsapp-groups/> accessed 2 July 2018
- Malik K, ‘Fake News Has a Long History. Beware the State Being Keeper of “the Truth”’ *The Guardian* (London, 11 February 2018) <www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/feb/11/fake-news-long-history-beware-state-involvement> accessed 10 March 2018
- Mantzaris A, ‘French and American voters seem to respond in a similar way to fact-checking’ (Poynter.org, 5 May 2017) <<https://www.poynter.org/fact-checking/2017/french-and-american-voters-seem-to-respond-in-a-similar-way-to-fact-checking/>> accessed 15 May 2018
- ‘Conservative Websites are far more likely to attack fact-checkers than their liberal counterparts’ (Poynter.org, 8 June 2017) <www.poynter.org/news/conservative-websites-are-far-more-likely-attack-fact-checkers-their-liberal-counterparts> accessed 10 June 2018
- Markoff J, ‘Automated Pro-Trump Bots Overwhelmed Pro-Clinton Messages, Researchers Say’ *The New York Times* (New York City, 17 November 2016) <www.nytimes.com/2016/11/18/technology/automated-pro-trump-bots-overwhelmed-pro-clinton-messages-researchers-say.html?_r=0> accessed 20 April 2018
- Martin D, ‘Papua New Guinea to Ban Facebook For One Month, Broaches State-Run Social Network’ (DW.com, 29 May 2018) <www.dw.com/en/papua-new-guinea-to-ban-facebook-for-one-month-broaches-state-run-social-network/a-43982064> accessed 15 June 2018
- Maza C, ‘Far-Right Leader Thanks Facebook For Strong Election Results in Italy’ (*Newsweek*, 5 March 2018) <www.newsweek.com/far-right-leader-thanks-facebook-strong-election-results-italy-831023> accessed 30 June 2018
- Media Research Center, ‘Don’t Believe the Liberal “Fact-Checkers!”’ (*Newsbusters*, 2005-2018) <www.newsbusters.org/fact-checkers> accessed 10 June 2018

- McBride S, 'Silicon Valley's Next Target for Disruption Is Socks' *Bloomberg Businessweek* (New York City, 3 October 2017) <www.bloomberg.com/news/features/2017-10-03/silicon-valley-s-next-target-for-disruption-is-socks> accessed 15 June 2018
- McGuinness D, 'How a Cyber Attack Transformed Estonia' (*BBC News*, 27 April 2017) <www.bbc.com/news/39655415> accessed 30 June 2018
- Meserole C and Polyakova A, 'Disinformation Wars' *Foreign Policy* (Washington DC, 25 May 2018) <<https://foreignpolicy.com/2018/05/25/disinformation-wars/>> accessed 1 June 2018
- Meyer R, 'The Grim Conclusions of the Largest-Ever Study of Fake News' *The Atlantic* (Washington DC, 8 March 2018) <www.theatlantic.com/technology/archive/2018/03/largest-study-ever-fake-news-mit-twitter/555104/> accessed 10 March 2018
- Miriello N, Gilbert D and Steers J, 'Kenya's Face a Fake News Epidemic' (*Vice*, 22 March 2018) <https://news.vice.com/en_us/article/43bdpm/kenyas-face-a-fake-news-epidemic-they-want-to-know-just-how-much-cambridge-analytica-and-facebook-are-to-blame> accessed 2 July 2018
- Nathan AJ, 'How Human Rights Became Our Ideology' *The New Republic* (New York City, 16 November 2012) <<https://newrepublic.com/article/110197/how-human-rights-became-our-ideology>> accessed 28 June 2018
- Naqvi M, 'Burma's Aung San Suu Kyi Says "Fake News" Fuelling Rohingya Crisis' *Independent* (London, 6 September 2017) <www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/burma-rohingya-latest-aung-san-suu-kyi-fake-news-fuelling-crisis-minority-muslims-violence-exodus-a7931886.html> accessed 10 May 2018
- Paviour B, 'What a Facebook Experiment Did to News in Cambodia' (*BBC News*, 31 October 2017) <www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-41801071> accessed 10 May 2018
- Penzenstadler N, Heath B and Guynn J, 'We Read Every One of the 3,517 Facebook Ads Bought By Russians. Here's What We Found' *USA Today* (McLean, 11 May 2018) <www.usatoday.com/story/news/2018/05/11/what-we-found-facebook-ads-russians-accused-election-meddling/602319002/> accessed 12 May 2018
- Pomerantsev P, 'Brave New War' *The Atlantic* (Washington DC, 29 December 2015) <www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2015/12/war-2015-china-russia-isis/422085/> accessed 25 February 2018
- Rachleff A, 'What "Disrupt" Really Means' (*TechCrunch*, 16 February 2013) <<https://techcrunch.com/2013/02/16/the-truth-about-disruption/>> accessed 18 June 2018
- 'Racists in Skinny Jeans: Meet the IB, Europe's Version of America's Alt-Right' *The Economist* (London, 12 November 2016) <www.economist.com/europe/2016/11/12/meet-the-ib-europes-version-of-americas-alt-right> accessed 15 May 2018
- Rajagopalan M and Brown H, 'Facebook Is Being Taken to Court Over Human Rights Abuses in Cambodia' (*BuzzFeed News*, 8 February 2018) <www.buzzfeednews.com/article/meghara/an-exiled-politician-is-taking-facebook-to-court-over-human > accessed 10 May 2018

- Ranger S, 'BEFFA: This Is Ambrogio Salvini, Eldest Son of Matteo Salvini – Bufale.net' (Bufale.net, 18 March 2018) <www.bufale.net/home/beffa-ambrogio-salvini-figlio-maggiore-matteo-salvini-bufale-net/> accessed 30 April 2018
- Rasheed Z, 'In Sri Lanka, Hate Speech and Impunity Fuel Anti-Muslim Violence' *Al Jazeera* (Doha, 13 March 2018) <www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/03/sri-lanka-hate-speech-impunity-fuel-anti-muslim-violence-180310020253272.html> accessed 10 May 2018
- Roose K, 'Let's All Stop Saying 'Disrupt' Right This Instant' (*Intelligencer*, 16 June 2014) <<http://nymag.com/intelligencer/2014/06/lets-all-stop-saying-disrupt.html>> accessed 20 April 2018
- Samuel A, 'To Fix Fake News, Look To Yellow Journalism' (*JSTOR Daily*, 29 November 2016) <<https://daily.jstor.org/to-fix-fake-news-look-to-yellow-journalism/>> accessed 15 March 2018
- Segran E, 'Two Ex-Googlers Want To Make Bodegas And Mom-And-Pop Corner Stores Obsolete' (13 September 2017) <www.fastcompany.com/40466047/two-ex-googlers-want-to-make-bodegas-and-mom-and-pop-corner-stores-obsolete> accessed 1 July 2018
- Sexton C, 'Study Proves That Twitter Echo Chambers Are Very Real' (Earth.com, 25 April 2018) <www.earth.com/news/twitter-echo-chambers-real/> accessed 10 May 2018
- Shermer M, 'How to Convince Someone When Facts Fail' (*The Scientific American*, 1 January 2017) <www.scientificamerican.com/article/how-to-convince-someone-when-facts-fail/> accessed 12 May 2018
- Sloane G, 'Google Details Plan to Fight Fake News, From Search to YouTube' (*AdAge*, 20 March 2018) <<https://adage.com/article/digital/google-combats-fake-news-search-youtube/312810/>> accessed 24 March 2018
- Smith-Spark L and Vandoorne S, 'As France Debates Fake News Bill, Critics See Threat to Free Speech' (CNN.com, 7 June 2018) <<https://edition.cnn.com/2018/06/07/europe/france-fake-news-law-intl/index.html>> accessed 10 June 2018
- Solon O, 'Civil Rights Groups: Facebook Should Protect, Not Censor, Human Rights Issues' *The Guardian* (London, 31 October 2016) <www.theguardian.com/technology/2016/oct/31/facebook-human-rights-censorship-civil-rights-mark-zuckerberg-aclu> accessed 5 April 2018
- — 'The Future of Fake News: Don't Believe Everything You Read, See or Hear' *The Guardian* (London, 26 July 2017) <www.theguardian.com/technology/2017/jul/26/fake-news-obama-video-trump-face2face-doctored-content> accessed 1 June 2018
- Standage T, 'The True History of Fake News' *The Economist 1843* (London, 26 April 2017) <www.1843magazine.com/technology/rewind/the-true-history-of-fake-news> accessed 10 March 2018
- Subramanian S, 'Inside the Macedonian Fake-News Complex' (*Wired*, 15 February 2017) <www.wired.com/2017/02/veles-macedonia-fake-news/> accessed 12 December 2017
- Suwajanakorn S, Seitz SM and Kemelmacher-Shlizerman I, 'Synthesizing Obama: Learning Lip Sync from Audio' (Grail.cs.washington.edu, 10 July 2017) <<http://grail.cs.washington.edu/projects/AudioToObama/>> accessed 10 May 2018

- Svanidze T, 'Sex Tape Scandal Rocks Georgian Society' *Georgia Today* (Tbilisi, 14 March 2016) <<http://georgiatoday.ge/news/3249/Sex-Tape-Scandal-Rocks-Georgian-Society>> accessed 1 July 2018
- Tannen D, 'Discourse Analysis—What Speakers Do in Conversation' (Linguistic Society of America, 2012) <www.linguisticsociety.org/resource/discourse-analysis-what-speakers-do-conversation> accessed 10 June 2018
- Tashea J, 'The Limiting Language of Disruption' (*Huffington Post*, 29 October 2015) <www.huffingtonpost.com/jason-tashea/the-limiting-language-of-disruption_b_8400064.html> accessed 8 July 2018
- Timmons H and Kozłowska H, 'Facebook's Quiet Battle to Kill the First Transparency Law for Online Political Ads' (*Quartz*, 22 March 2018) <<https://qz.com/1235363/mark-zuckerberg-and-facebooks-battle-to-kill-the-honest-ads-act/>> accessed 22 April 2018
- Tomchak AM, 'Algorithms Are Screwing Us Over With Fake News But Could Also Fix the Problem' (*Mashable*, 5 October 2017) <<https://mashable.com/2017/10/05/artificial-intelligence-algorithm-neva-labs/>> accessed 30 June 2018
- Uberti D, 'The Real History of Fake News' (*Columbia Journalism Review*, 15 December 2016) <www.cjr.org/special_report/fake_news_history.php> accessed 10 March 2018
- Vanian J, 'Facebook Expanding Fact-Checking Project to Combat Fake News' *Fortune* (New York City, 21 June 2018) <<http://fortune.com/2018/06/21/facebook-fake-news-fact-checking/>> accessed 24 March 2018
- Valverde M, 'Website Claims Democrats Plan to Abolish ICE If They Win 2020 Election' (*PolitiFact*, 15 March 2018) <www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/15/blog-posting/website-claims-democrats-plan-abolish-ice-if-they-/> accessed 5 July 2018
- Weedon J, Nuland W and Stamos A, 'Information Operations and Facebook' (*Facebook Newsroom*, 27 April 2017) 5 <<https://fbnewsroomus.files.wordpress.com/2017/04/facebook-and-information-operations-v1.pdf>> accessed 5 March 2018
- White L, 'UK Supermarkets Analyze Customers' Shopping Habits to Price Insurance Products' (*Insurance Journal*, 13 December 2017) <www.insurancejournal.com/news/international/2017/12/13/473890.htm> accessed 14 April 2018
- Withrow B and Withrow M, 'Why Fact-Checking Fake News Backfires' (*Thecuriousape.com*, 24 November 2016) <www.thecuriousape.com/fact-checking-backfires/> accessed 10 May 2018
- Young C, 'Anti-PC for Anti-PC's Sake' *Observer Media* (New York City, 6 September 2016) <<https://observer.com/2016/09/anti-pc-for-anti-pcs-sake/>> accessed 25 May 2018

NON-GOVERNMENTAL REPORTS

- — ‘International Fact-Checking Network’ (Poynter, 2018) <<https://www.poynter.org/international-fact-checking-network-fact-checkers-code-principles>> accessed 20 April 2018
- Barthel M and Mitchell A, ‘Americans’ Attitudes About the News Media Deeply Divided Along Partisan Lines’ (Pew Research Center, 10 May 2017) <www.journalism.org/2017/05/10/americans-attitudes-about-the-news-media-deeply-divided-along-partisan-lines/> accessed 20 April 2018
- Bradshaw S and Howard PN, ‘Why Does Junk News Spread So Quickly Across Social Media? Algorithms, Advertising and Exposure in Public Life’ (Knight Foundation, 29 January 2018) 3, 13 <https://kf-site-production.s3.amazonaws.com/media_elements/files/000/000/142/original/Topos_KF_White-Paper_Howard_V1_ado.pdf> accessed 21 June 2018
- Campaign for Accountability, ‘How Google Makes Millions Off of Fake News’ (Campaign for Accountability, 30 October 2017) <<https://campaignforaccountability.org/work/how-google-makes-millions-off-of-fake-news/>> accessed 8 July 2018
- Fletcher R and others, ‘Measuring the Reach of “Fake News” and Online Disinformation in Europe’ (Reuters Institute, 2018) <<https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/2018-02/Measuring%20the%20reach%20of%20fake%20news%20and%20online%20distribution%20in%20Europe%20CORRECT%20FLAG.pdf>> accessed 15 June 2018
- Giles K, ‘Russia’s “New” Tools for Confronting the West Continuity and Innovation in Moscow’s Exercise of Power’ (Chatham House, March 2016) 36, 38 <www.chathamhouse.org/sites/default/files/publications/2016-03-russia-new-tools-giles.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018
- Gorodnichenko Y, Pham T and Talavera O, ‘Social media, sentiment and public opinions: Evidence from #Brexit and #USElection’ (NBER Working Paper No w24631, May 2018) 5 <https://eml.berkeley.edu/~ygorodni/Brexit_Election.pdf> accessed 1 April 2018
- Graves L, ‘Understanding the Promise and Limits of Automated Fact-Checking’ (Reuters Institute, February 2018) <<https://agency.reuters.com/content/dam/openweb/documents/pdf/news-agency/report/reuters-institute-graves-factsheet-180228.pdf>> accessed 8 June 2018
- — and Cherubini F, ‘The Rise of Fact-Checking Sites in Europe’ (Reuters Institute, 2016) 6 <<https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/our-research/rise-fact-checking-sites-europe>> accessed 6 March 2018
- Gu L, Kropotov V and Yarochin F, ‘The Fake News Machine: How Propagandists Abuse the Internet and Manipulate the Public’ (Trend Micro, 2017) 5, 30, 50, 59-60, 62 <https://documents.trendmicro.com/assets/white_papers/wp-fake-news-machine-how-propagandists-abuse-the-internet.pdf> accessed 6 March 2018
- Guess A and others, ‘Avoiding the Echo Chamber About Echo Chambers: Why Selective Exposure to Like Minded Political News is Less Prevalent Than You Think’ (Knight Foundation, 2018) 15 <https://kf-site-production.s3.amazonaws.com/media_elements/files/000/000/133/original/Topos_KF_White-Paper_Nyhan_V1.pdf> accessed 1 April 2018

- Guess A, Nyhan B and Reifler J, “‘You’re Fake News!’: Findings from the Poynter Media Trust Survey’ (Poynter Journalism Ethics Summit, 2017) 5 <<https://poyntercdn.blob.core.windows.net/files/PoynterMediaTrustSurvey2017.pdf>> accessed 30 March 2018
- Hansen FS, ‘Russian Hybrid Warfare’ (Danish Institute for International Studies, 2017) 10, 34 <http://pure.diiis.dk/ws/files/950041/DIIS_RP_2017_6_web.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018
- Marwick A and Lewis R, ‘Media Manipulation and Disinformation Online’ (Data & Society, 15 May 2015) 11, 33, 42 <https://datasociety.net/pubs/oh/DataAndSociety_MediaManipulationAndDisinformationOnline.pdf> accessed 6 March 2018
- Mitchell A and others, ‘In Western Europe, Public Attitudes Toward News Media More Divided by Populist Views Than Left-Right Ideology’ (Pew Research Center, 14 May 2018) <http://assets.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/13/2018/05/27124059/PJ_2018.05.14_Western-Europe_FINAL.pdf> accessed 20 May 2018
- Newman N and others, ‘Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2017’ (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2017) 10, 72, 78, 102 <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/Digital%20News%20Report%202017%20web_0.pdf> accessed 5 March 2018
- — ‘Reuters Institute Digital News Report 2018’ (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, 2018) 9, 20, 46, 62, 80, 88, 82 <<http://media.digitalnewsreport.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/06/digital-news-report-2018.pdf?x89475>> accessed 8 July 2018
- Nielsen RK and Graves L, “‘News You Don’t Believe’: Audience Perspectives on Fake News’ (Reuters Institute for the Study of Journalism, October 2017) 3 <https://reutersinstitute.politics.ox.ac.uk/sites/default/files/2017-10/Nielsen%26Graves_factsheet_1710v3_FINAL_download.pdf> accessed 25 March 2018
- Paul C and Matthews M, ‘The Russian “Firehose of Falsehood” Propaganda Model’ (Rand Corporation, PE-198-OSD, 2016) 2, 3, 10 <https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE100/PE198/RAND_PE198.pdf> accessed 5 March 2018
- Pomerantsev P and Weiss M, ‘The Menace of Unreality: How the Kremlin Weaponizes Information, Culture and Money’ (The Interpreter, Institute of Modern Russia, 2014) 5, 9, 12-13, 14, 16, 24, 34 <www.interpretermag.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/The_Menace_of_Unreality_Final.pdf> accessed 9 February 2018
- Sanovich S, ‘Computational Propaganda in Russia: The Origins of Digital Misinformation’ (Project on Computational Propaganda Working Paper No 2017/3, March 2017) 14, 15 <<http://comprop.oii.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/sites/89/2017/06/Comprop-Russia.pdf>> accessed 1 April 2018
- Silverman C, ‘Lies, Damn Lies and Viral Content’ (Tow Center for Digital Journalism, 2015) 105, 107 <<https://doi.org/10.7916/D8Q81RHH>> accessed 4 March 2018
- Tambini D, ‘Fake News: Public Policy Responses’ (London School of Economics Media Policy Project, March 2017) 3, 10, 14 <<http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/73015/>> accessed 27 March 2018

- Wardle C and Derakhshan H, 'Information Disorder: Toward an Interdisciplinary Framework for Research and Policy and Making' (Council of Europe DGI(2017)09, 27 September 2017) 17, 20, 51, 75, 83 <<https://rm.coe.int/information-disorder-toward-an-interdisciplinary-framework-for-research/168076277c>> accessed 4 March 2018
- Woolley SC and Howard PN, 'Computational Propaganda Worldwide: Executive Summary' (Project on Computational Propaganda Working Paper No 2017 11, November 2017) 564 <<http://comprop.oii.ox.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/sites/89/2017/06/Casestudies-ExecutiveSummary.pdf>> accessed 5 March 2018

OTHER SOURCES

- Block H and Riesewieck M, *The Cleaners* [motion picture] (Gebrueder Beetz Filmproduktion, 2018)
- Curtis A, *Hypernormalisation* [motion picture] (BBC, 2016)
- Email from Michelangelo Coltelli (Butac.it administrator and founder) to author (14 May 2008)

APPENDIX A

DISINFORMATION HEADLINE CHARTS

This appendix includes charts detailing headline numbers by environment and website code.

USA		Italy			
Coding	Total	Coding	Total		
Governance	8	politics	50		
Media, tech	19	Culture	23		
Celeb	24	Media, tech	12		
Guns	16	Social issues			
Liberal general	16	Immigration	36		
Clinton	7	Islam	10		
Obama	19	Race	2		
Social causes		Gender/sex	4		
Immigration	16	International	5		
Islam	5		142		
Race	7				
Gender/sex	6				
Trump	21				
	164				
		Ukraine			
		Coding	StopFake	EUvsDisinfo	Total
Greece		Weak Ukraine	17	6	23
Coding	Total	Institutions	16	10	26
Culture	52	Persecution	9	6	15
Governance	14	Russophobia	6	6	12
Social Issues		Hostile Ukraine	13	17	30
Immigration		Sovereignty	8	7	15
Islam	8	Pro-Kremlin	5	15	20
Gender	9	International Relations	8	12	20
	5	Skripal	2	4	6
International Relations	43	MH17	1	19	20
	131		85	102	182

APPENDIX B

UNITED STATES

This section provides a list of headlines gathered from PolitiFact in the United States, including the code the article was assigned for research, and the link to the claim.

Headline	Code	link
Says Shaquille O’Neal said Donald Trump “is possibly the best president.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/03/pro-conservative-news/no-shaq-didnt-declare-trump-best-president/
Says Sandra Bullock said to Hillary Clinton, “If you don’t like our president you can leave and never come back again.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/04/flash-24-daily/no-sandra-bullock-didnt-disparage-hillary-clinton/
“Legendary actor Kirk Douglas dead, 4 days before his 101st birthday.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/05/your-action-news-3/fake-news-circulates-death-hoax-about-kirk-douglas/
Singer Dolly Parton: “Trump in one year is already better than 16 years of Bush, Obama put together.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/05/americanproudinfo/no-dolly-parton-didnt-say-trump-better-bush-and-ob/
Keanu Reeves: “For me, Trump is the symbol of a successful man and a role model for every young American, something that our nation was looking for for year. I don’t think that America will again have a leader like him.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/mar/05/blog-posting/no-keanu-reeves-did-not-call-donald-trump-role-mod/
“Legendary actor Kirk Douglas dead, 4 days before his 101st birthday.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/05/your-action-news-3/fake-news-circulates-death-hoax-about-kirk-douglas/
Jennifer Aniston: “Me and all the Trump supporter celebrities decide to make a company named ‘celebrities for Trump’”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/12/universal-news-portal/headline-jennifer-aniston-formed-celebrities-trump/
“Irish superstar Saoirse Ronan dies after on-set accident in St. Lucia.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/20/st-lucia-times/fake-news-circulates-death-hoax-about-saoirse-rona/
“Robert Redford Says: Michelle And Barack Obama Should Get Five Years In Prison.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/30/blog-posting/no-robert-redford-didnt-say-michelle-and-barack-ob/
“Actress Emma Stone: ‘For the first time in history we have a president that...’	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/09/politics-elite-trump/fake-news-claims-emma-stone-converted-trump-suppor/
“Hollywood actor Bruce Willis: ‘Trump is the best US president ever, anyone who dislikes him should move to...’	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/11/global-headlines/fake-news-claims-bruce-willis-says-anyone-who-does/
“Singer Celine Dion Says: ‘I Can’t Even Look At An American Flag Any More, I Hate This Country.’”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/13/blog-posting/did-celine-dion-say-she-hates-country-no/
“Archbishop Desmond Tutu dies while holidaying in Texas”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/23/blog-posting/website-falsely-claims-desmond-tutu-died-texas/
“Denzel Washington: With Trump we avoided war with Russia and Orwellian Police State”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/24/blog-posting/no-denzel-washington-didnt-praise-trump-averting-w/
“Breaking: 3 liberal celebrities arrested for conspiracy to assassinate President Trump.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/07/miami-post/no-celebrities-were-not-arrested-trying-assassinat/

Headline	Code	link
“BREAKING: Queen Elizabeth II Dead At 94”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/10/liberty-raise-no-queen-elizabeth-ii-not-dead/
Says Julia Roberts told Celine Dion, “If you hate Trump you can go in your country.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/15/blog-posting/fabricated-headline-says-julia-roberts-told-celine/
“Legendary Actor Sidney Poitier: Donald Trump might become ‘The Greatest Of All Time.’ “	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/17/blog-posting/did-sidney-poitier-say-trump-will-be-goat/
“Prince William May Not Attend Royal Wedding Leaving Harry Without a Best Man; Princess Diana Would Not Be Happy”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/17/blog-posting/prince-william-plans-go-royal-wedding-contrary-spe/
“Hollywood celebs: We will go on ‘total strike’ if Trump does not resign.”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/09/Nourtey/hollywood-celebs-didnt-announce-strike-if-trump-wo/
“Oprah tells Fox News host ‘all white people have to die.’”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/16/americannewscom/oprahs-comments-about-race-2013-bbc-interview-dist/
“Singer Miley Cyrus: ‘Trump fans are destroying my career, I can’t stand them and I decided to move to...’”	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/14/blog-posting/fake-news-claims-miley-cyrus-says-trump-supporters/
Actor Brad Pitt: ‘Trump is not my president, we have no future with this...’	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/24/blog-posting/brad-pitt-donald-trump-not-my-president/
Kurt Russel Just SHOWED Overpaid Celebs It’s Time To Shut Up About Trump – Hits Them Where It Hurts!	Celeb	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/27/twentyeightmay/story-takes-actor-kurt-russells-comments-about-pol/
David Hogg is a crisis actor	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/florida/statements/2018/feb/21/blog-posting/why-you-shouldnt-believe-claims-stoneman-high-stud/
“So many of these shooters turn out to be communist Democrats.”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/north-carolina/statements/2018/feb/23/larry-pittman/nc-republican-says-many-mass-shooters-turn-out-be-/
“Dylann Roof, killer of 14 Charleston church members raped and beaten by inmate”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/20/blog-posting/no-evidence-charleston-shooter-dylann-roof-raped-b/
Doctored image of Emma Gonzalez ripping up constitution	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/florida/statements/2018/mar/26/viral-image/doctored-image-shows-parkland-school-shooting-surv/
David Hogg admits he wasn’t at school during Parkland school shooting	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/florida/statements/2018/mar/27/blog-posting/david-hogg-not-school-during-shooting-s-fake-news/
“The United States is 3rd in murders throughout the world. If you remove Chicago, Detroit, Washington, St. Louis and New Orleans, the United States is then 189th out of 193 countries in the entire world.”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/mar/28/viral-image/united-states-third-murders-outlier-cities/
“I went to school with him at Redondo Shores High School and he graduated in 2015. Here he is in our yearbook from 2015. He always wanted to work for CNN and be an actor. #GunReformNow #NeverAgain”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/30/blog-posting/no-david-hogg-graduate-california-high-school/
“Pope Francis: Gun owners ‘can’t call themselves Christian’”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/10/thenewyorkeveningcom/no-pope-francis-didnt-say-gun-owners-cant-call-the/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Headline	Code	link
Breaking: Santa Fe killer expresses his love for Obama	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/21/daily-world-update/no-evidence-santa-fe-killer-expressed-love-obama/
Pope calls for world wide gun confiscation except for the UN	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/20/common-sense-news/fake-news-says-pope-called-world-wide-gun-confisca/
“Seattle police begin gun confiscations: no laws broken, no warrant, no charges.”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/14/liberty-headlines/no-seattle-police-didnt-use-red-flag-law-seize-man/
“Emma Gonzalez bullied school shooter, isn’t sorry; then retweets message blaming ‘white boys’ entitlement’ as cause of all school shootings”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/30/project-republic/no-emma-gonzalez-did-not-admit-bullying-parkland-s/
“It begins: Florida police now confiscating guns from people with no due process.”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/florida/statements/2018/apr/04/free-thought-project/did-florida-police-seize-mans-gun-out-due-process/
“Congressman just annihilated Parkland ‘victim’ in calling her out -- now he’s facing arrest!”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/05/political-thinkers/headline-falsely-says-rep-steve-king-facing-arrest/
“Democrats go full tyranny: now demand nationwide gun confiscation from law-abiding Americans ... at gunpoint, of course.”	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/10/revolution-radio/california-lawmaker-called-assault-weapons-ban-not/
STATES WHERE YOU CAN BUY A [automatic rifle] WITH NO PROOF OF ID/ STATES WHERE YOU CAN VOTE WITH NO PROOF OF ID	Guns	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/feb/22/viral-image/fact-checking-meme-id-requirements-buying-guns-vot/
“Soros, Obama and the Dems Ordered the Shutdown to Stage a Coup”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/jan/22/reaganwasright/fake-news-claims-obama-coup-behind-government-shut/
“Mueller will be forced to resign over Pelosi affair.”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/24/patriot-report/headline-says-mueller-pelosi-affair-steamy-its-fak/
“Breaking: four million Democrat votes just declared fraudulent.”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/15/politico-news/no-four-million-democrat-votes-were-not-declared-f/
“Russian source behind fake Trump dossier killed in Russian plane crash, Rosatom CFO also dead”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/feb/14/puppetstringnewscom/fake-news-claims-two-russian-officials-dead-plane-/
Maxine Waters: “I would impeach Donald Trump” (as her first act as president)	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/may/17/blog-posting/no-maxine-waters-comment-anderson-cooper-meme-made/
Just in: John Kerry facing prison	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/24/conservative-stories/there-no-evidence-john-kerry-headed-prison/
“Putin issues international arrest warrant for Soros”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/16/viralpoliticsus/no-proof-putin-issued-arrest-warrant-soros/
“Thousands killed as Israel Drops Tactical Nuclear Bomb On Syria”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/04/blog-posting/fake-news-claims-thousands-killed-nuclear-bomb-syr/
Mexico’s Next President Calls for An Invasion Of The US	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/25/blog-posting/mexico-presidential-candidate-call-immigration/
“Heitkamp High-Fives Schumer After Voting Against 20-Week Abortion Ban.”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/feb/06/say-anything-blog/heitkamp-didnt-high-five-schumer-abortion/

Headline	Code	link
“Joe Biden just confirmed that he is running for president in 2020 and it has America applauding!”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/06/realtimopolitics/joe-biden-hasnt-confirmed-he-running-president-202/
Maxine Waters Is Getting Criminally Charged!	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/29/blog-posting/loomer-maxine-waters-not-facing-criminal-charges/
“California State Assembly bill would ban the (sale of the) Bible!”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/apr/26/oath-keepers/no-california-bill-would-not-ban-bible-sales/
Says Hillary Clinton once said “the average Democrat voter is just plain stupid, they’re easy to manipulate.”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/wisconsin/statements/2018/jan/05/david-clarke-jr/despite-david-clarkes-tweet-no-evidence-hillary-cl/
“Bill Clinton’s hitman confesses on his deathbed.”	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/23/patriot-report/fake-news-says-hitman-bill-clinton-confesses/
Haiti official getting ready to testify against Clinton Foundation corruption next week found dead with gunshot to the head.	Lib - General	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/26/us-political-news/fake-story-ties-dead-haitian-official-clinton-foun/
“Smallville star confesses she sold children to Rothschilds and Clintons.”	Lib – Clinton	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/01/newly-press/smallville-actress-didnt-confess-selling-children-/
“British Intelligence Seizes Clinton Foundation Warehouse, \$400 Million In Cash.”	Lib – Clinton	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/20/blog-posting/no-british-intelligence-didnt-sieze-400-billion-cl/
“Hillary Clinton killed in monster truck mishap.”	Lib – Clinton	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/04/daily-world-update/headline-hillary-clinton-killed-monster-truck-fake/
“Eric Schneiderman helped NXIVM sell child sex slaves to the Clintons”	Lib – Clinton	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/10/ny-evening-news/no-eric-schneiderman-didnt-sell-child-sex-slaves-c/
Hillary Clinton furious at ‘special gift’ Melania Trump sent her from her hospital bed	Lib – Clinton	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/23/blog-posting/melania-didnt-send-hillary-clinton-gift-hospital/
“Investigators: Anthony Bourdain was killed by Clinton operatives.”	Lib – Clinton	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/12/yournewswirecom/clickbait-headline-wrongly-blames-clintons-anthony/
“Clinton Email: We must destroy Syria for Israel”	Lib – Clinton	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/20/yournewswirecom/hillary-clinton/
“Delta Force raids Obama stronghold in Thailand.”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/08/someonesbones/fake-news-military-raided-obamas-compound-thailand/
“Queen Elizabeth removes Obamas from royal wedding guest list.”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/08/american-today/no-proof-queen-elizabeth-removed-obamas-prince-har/
Michelle Obama: ‘Florida shooting is clearly Trump’s fault, these shootings are happening constantly since he became our president.	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/16/usdeplorablenewscom/fake-news-says-michelle-obama-blamed-donald-trump-/
Michelle Obama Just Received Life-Shattering News from the Doctor	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/07/ny-fox-news-ny-fox-news/fake-news-claims-michelle-obama-has-made-hateful-c/
“Court orders Obama to pay \$400 million in restitution.”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/19/daily-world-update/no-barack-obama-does-not-owe-400-million-restituti/
“Biden preparing 2020 presidential bid -- with Obama as vice president.”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/21/yournewswirecom/no-joe-biden-not-running-president-barack-obama-hi/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Headline	Code	link
“Obama just broke federal law in attempt to take over presidency from Trump.”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/22/universal-news-portal/hoax-claims-barack-obama-broke-law-reclaim-preside/
“Obama secretly flees US - leaves stunning evidence behind.”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/05/viral-truth-wire/no-barack-obama-did-not-flee-country-because-surfa/
“Obama Announces Bid To Become UN Secretary General”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/13/blog-posting/no-barack-obama-did-not-announce-bid-un-secretary-/
“Obama’s Private ‘security’ Company Sets Up Massive Camps Outside 3 Major Cities.”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/25/blog-posting/barack-obama-has-security-company-camps-outside-3-/
Jeff Sessions Caught Colluding with Obama	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/23/blog-posting/false-claim-jeff-sessions-caught-collud/
Obama paid FBI informant over \$1 million to do it to Trump	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/24/blog-posting/fake-news-says-obama-paid-informant-trump-russia-p/
“First indictment issued in Russian bribery case tied to Obama-era Uranium One deal.”	Lib - Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/17/republican-news/no-uranium-one-investigation-has-not-led-indictmen/
“Queen Elizabeth removes Obamas from royal wedding guest list.”	Lib – Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/08/american-today/no-proof-queen-elizabeth-removed-obamas-prince-har/
“Obama did in fact unconstitutionally spy on Trump throughout the presidential election,”	Lib – Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/12/blog-posting/no-obama-not-facing-indictment-spying-trump/
“On September 2, 2016, while the FBI was actively investigating @HillaryClinton’s use of a private email server, #Page said that ‘POTUS wants to know everything we’re doing.’ This assertion raises alarming questions about the extent of Obama’s involvement with FBI investigations.”	Lib – Obama	http://www.politifact.com/florida/statements/2018/feb/12/matt-gaetz/fbi-not-actively-investigating-clinton-emails/
“FBI RAIDS OBAMA – Find Massive Secret That Was Hidden For YEARS.”	Lib – Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/30/blog-posting/obama-raided-fbi-not-so-fast/
Obama paid FBI informant over \$1 million to do it to Trump	Lib – Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/24/blog-posting/fake-news-says-obama-paid-informant-trump-russia-p/
“Busted: Obama is holding secret meetings to overtake the White House”	Lib – Obama	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/21/blog-posting/-website-falsely-claims-obama-was-bust/
“California To Register Illegal Aliens To Vote – Automatically.”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/california/statements/2018/jan/24/worldnetdaily/no-california-didnt-pass-law-allowing-undocumented/
“566,000 crimes made in Texas by criminal aliens in the last 6 years.”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/texas/statements/2018/jan/25/dan-patrick/dan-patrick-airs-unsupported-claim-about-566000-cr/
Democrats “booed families of children murdered by MS13.”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/01/csc-mediagroupusa/fake-story-says-democrats-booed-families-ms13-vict/
“100% of heroin/fentanyl epidemic is because we don’t have a WALL.”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/north-carolina/statements/2018/feb/02/ann-coulter/would-wall-have-prevented-opioid-epidemic/
“DeSantis voted in favor of food stamps for illegal immigrants,”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/29/uncle-sams-misguided-children/misleading-attack-ron-desantis-about-farm-bill-foo/

Headline	Code	link
“Democrats who just voted to deport Dreamers. Share to shame Democrats who are enabling Trump’s racism,”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/jan/09/credo-action/did-democrats-vote-deport-dreamers/
“Fall River, Massachusetts was not ‘built by immigrants.’ “	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/01/breitbart/following-joe-kennedys-speech-breitbart-says-fall-/
“Democrats are nowhere to be found on DACA.”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/mar/07/donald-trump/are-democrats-nowhere-be-found-daca-donald-trump-c/
“Democrats announce they will abolish ICE if they win 2020 election.”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/15/blog-posting/website-claims-democrats-plan-abolish-ice-if-they-/
“As Secretary of State, Brian Kemp fought Obama twice and won to stop illegal immigrants from voting.” Text under Obama’s photo said: “Fought Obama. Citizenship check. Photo ID.”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/georgia/statements/2018/mar/21/brian-kemp/Did-Brian-Kemp-fight-Obama-twice-to-stop-illegal/
“Chuck Schumer slams President Trump: ‘it’s racist to only allow citizens to vote,”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/05/blog-posting/no-chuck-schumer-didnt-say-it-racist-only-allow-ci/
This is what happens when a (l) government believes people are “illegal.” (l) Kids in cages.	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/texas/statements/2018/jun/15/tweets/tweeted-photo-inaccurately-indicates-boy-caged-fed/
Bill Clinton passed a law in 1996 that separated children from adults illegally entering America	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/21/blog-posting/no-bill-clinton-law-separating-families/
“Senate report admits Clinton ‘gifted’ children to human traffickers”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/18/yournewswirecom/false-headline-wrongly-links-hillary-clinton-forme/
“Trump’s DHS secretary confirms they are preparing to arrest sanctuary city leaders.”	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/13/newsflash/website-misleads-about-arrests-sanctuary-cit/
Obama administration kept illegal Mexican kids in detention camps as ‘experiment’	Social - Immigr	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/25/blog-posting/did-obama-detain-illegal-mexican-children-experime/
“82-year-old who killed a Muslim in self-defense gets the death penalty.”	Social - Islam	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/24/patriot-report/fake-story-says-elderly-man-shot-muslims-self-defe/
“Just in: 45 states just banned Sharia law”	Social - Islam	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/08/blog-posting/no-majority-states-did-not-ban-sharia-law/
“BREAKING Trump Removes Muslim Federal Judge For Trying To Implement Sharia Law In America”	Social - Islam	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/07/blog-posting/no-donald-trump-did-not-remove-federal-judge-over-/
“Breaking: Czech Republic arms citizens. You can now shoot terrorists on sight.”	Social - Islam	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/03/patriotnetworkone/headline-says-czech-republic-armed-citizens-shoot-/
Burka clad woman runs over baby, gets away with crime for one stunning reason ...	Social - Islam	http://www.politifact.com/ohio/statements/2018/jun/26/blog-posting/blog-site-wrongly-claims-muslim-woman-escaped-puni/
“First NFL team declares bankruptcy over kneeling thugs.”	Social - Race	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/07/blog-posting/no-jaguars-nfl-team-didnt-declare-bankruptcy-after/
“80% of black men in Atlanta are Homosexuals, study says”	Social - Race	http://www.politifact.com/georgia/statements/2018/mar/27/blog-posting/no-study-did-not-find-80-percent-black-men-atlanta/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Headline	Code	link
“Malia Obama suspended after racist anti-white attack goes viral.”	Social - Race	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/10/only-politics/fake-story-says-malia-obama-suspended-harvard/
Congressional Black Caucus introduces bill: tax people for being white	Social - Race	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/11/international-news-trends/no-black-congressional-leaders-didnt-propose-tax-w/
Says a young Texas rapper charged with capital crimes faces the death penalty but the alleged Santa Fe High School shooter faces prison and then parole after 40 years.	Social - Race	http://www.politifact.com/texas/statements/2018/may/23/instagram-posts/false-meme-suggests-texas-rapper-faces-death-penal/
“Oprah tells Fox News host ‘all white people have to die.’”	Social - Race	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/16/americannewscom/oprahs-comments-about-race-2013-bbc-interview-dist/
“Black men arrested In Philadelphia Starbucks settle for \$2 million”	Social - Race	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/07/blog-posting/radio-shows-headline-falsely-claims-philadelphia-s/
A Female-Led Construction Company Built The Florida Bridge That Collapsed	Social - Gender	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/20/blog-posting/no-it-was-not-all-female-company-built-bridge-coll/
The Violent Radicals Behind March for Our Lives: Women’s March Leaders	Social - Gender	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/mar/23/national-rifle-association/nra-says-violent-radicals-are-behind-march-our-liv/
“80% of black men in Atlanta are Homosexuals, study says”	Social - Gender	http://www.politifact.com/georgia/statements/2018/mar/27/blog-posting/no-study-did-not-find-80-percent-black-men-atlanta/
“Application for March for Our Lives permit was made months before Parkland shooting”	Social - Gender	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/03/fellowship-minds/no-march-our-lives-demonstration-was-not-prepared-/
“Trump votes for death penalty for being gay.”	Social - Gender	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/10/washingtonsources/no-trump-didnt-vote-death-penalty-gay-people/
Starbucks CEO: ‘If You Support Traditional Marriage We Don’t Want Your Business’	Social - Gender	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/05/blog-posting/what-starbucks-howard-schultz-said-about-same-sex-/
“White House staff compiled a number of gorilla documentaries into a makeshift gorilla channel” for President Donald Trump.	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/05/tweets/gorilla-channel-trump-satire-tweet-fools-1000s/
“If the Dow Joans ever falls more than 1000 ‘points’ in a Single Day the sitting president should be ‘loaded’ into a very big cannon and Shot into the sun at TREMENDOUS SPEED! No excuses!”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/06/tweets/fake-trump-tweet-about-dow-joans-dropping-called-t/
“Breaking: FBI just raided the White House, 6 people thrown out.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/05/new-century-times/white-house-staffers-removed-job-subject-false/
Says Donald Trump is “canceling funding for Obama’s free house and library.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/12/patriot-report/no-trump-didnt-cancel-funding-obama-presidential-l/
“Trump declares globalist Soros as ‘national security threat’ using Obama’s 2014 executive order.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/19/conservative-daily-post/no-trump-did-not-declare-george-soros-security-thr/
Melania Trump hired exorcist to ‘cleanse White House of Obama demons	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/19/yournewswirecom/fake-news-claims-melania-trump-hired-exorcist-clea/

Headline	Code	link
“Kushner And Wife Ivanka Trump Were Tossed Out Of The White House — And Donald Is Cutting Them Out Of His Will!”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/05/blog-posting/no-trump-didnt-fire-jared-kushner-and-ivanka/
“Trump wins the award Obama never could.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/14/ladies-liberty/no-trump-didnt-win-international-man-year-award/
“Breaking: Supreme Court sides with Trump - this changes everything!” (about supreme court banning teaching about islam or sharia law	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/15/nowtrumpcom/no-supreme-court-didnt-ban-sharia-law-schools/
“Melania Just Hit Donald Trump With Shocking Announcement He Never Saw Coming”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/08/blog-posting/website-falsely-claims-melania-trump-made-shocking/
“BREAKING NEWS: Donald Trump On His Way To Donate Kidney To Melania Trump.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/florida/statements/2018/may/17/blog-posting/no-donald-trump-isnt-donating-his-kidney-melania/
Hillary Clinton furious at ‘special gift’ Melania Trump sent her from her hospital bed	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/23/blog-posting/melania-didnt-send-hillary-clinton-gift-hospital/
“Mitt Romney: ‘Trump has some very serious emotional problems, he must resign before we...’”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/08/blog-posting/hoax-story-wrongly-credits-mitt-romney-bernie-sand/
“Trump: police officers and firefighters make too much money...hits them with tax penalty.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/05/bluedot-daily/headline-misleads-about-president-trump-and-tax-de/
“Trump vows to end winter heating assistance for elderly and disabled.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/03/democrats-rising/headline-misleads-about-trumps-budget-proposal-and/
“The president is cutting the CDC budget by 80%”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/north-carolina/statements/2018/feb/16/bobbie-richardson/nc-democrat-says-trumps-cutting-cdc-budget-80-perc/
“BREAKING: Trump Just Ended Welfare For One HUGE Group For 5 Years! – Let The Riots ERUPT!”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/30/blog-posting/donald-trump-just-ended-welfare-immigrants-s-false/
“Breaking! Terrorist attacks Trumps at Mar A Lago -- police on scene,”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/03/trump-talks/misleading-headline-says-terrorist-attack-trump-pr/
“Official: Rudy Giuliani officially resigns, Trump’s legal team on it’s last leg.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/15/political-voice/no-rudy-giuliani-didnt-quit-trump-legal-team/
A Trump fan was just charged with trying to murder Maxine Waters on same day Trump threatened her	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/28/blog-posting/no-trump-supporter-did-not-try-murder-rep-maxine-w/
“Trump vows to end winter heating assistance for elderly and disabled.”	Trump	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/03/democrats-rising/headline-misleads-about-trumps-budget-proposal-and/
“YouTube witness makes shocking admission on live TV. CNN pulls plug immediately”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/apr/06/blog-posting/fake-news-says-cnn-pulled-plug-during-youtube-shoo/
“All Citizens Who Want to Receive Gvt Benefits Must Agree to Be Microchipped in the Near Future”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/09/blog-posting/no-evidence-websites-claim-about-microchipping-rec/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Headline	Code	link
“We have received a notification regarding your tax filings from the headquarters which will get expired in next 24 working hours. And once it gets expired after that, you will be taken into custody by the local cops as there are more serious allegations pressed on your name at this moment. We would request you to get back to us so that we can discuss about this case before taking any legal action against you.”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/texas/statements/2018/apr/11/anonymous-caller/anonymous-caller-warns-police-arrest-taxes-call-ba/
“Pope Francis cancels the Bible and proposes to create a new book.”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/11/everyday-devotional/its-fake-news-pope-cancelled-bible/
“Dying 78 year old CIA agent admits to killing Marilyn Monroe.”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/12/science-vibe/recycled-hoax-falsely-claim-cia-agent-admitted-kill/
“Laura Ingraham just fired!!!”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/23/red-state-wave/no-laura-ingraham-wasnt-fired/
“CNN shocks America, fires ‘journalist’ who made fun of Sarah Sanders’ face”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/01/daily-world-update/fake-story-says-cnn-fired-journalist-making-fun-tr/
“Bill Gates’ Former Doctor Says Billionaire ‘Refused To Vaccinate His Children’”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/02/yournewswirecom/Wbsite-falsely-claims-Bill-Gates-refused-to-vacci/
“Bill Gates Outlines 2018 Plan To Depopulate The Planet.”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/03/blog-posting/no-bill-gates-did-not-outline-2018-plan-depopulate/
“Breaking: Michelle Wolf fired -- Comedy Central apologizes to Sarah Sanders.”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/04/liberty-raise/no-michelle-wolf-wasnt-fired-after-making-fun-sara/
USA: Mysterious Nazi submarine from WWII discovered in Great Lakes!	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/24/blog-posting/no-german-submarine-wasnt-just-discovered-great-la/
Out of curiosity @ABC & @Disney this (index finger pointing down emoji) is okay with you? Hypocrisy on the Left is sickening! Your pathetic! #BoycottABC #IStandWithRoseanne	Media	http://www.politifact.com/truth-o-meter/statements/2018/may/30/viral-image/whoopi-goldberg-shirt-donald-trump-doctored/
“FOX Network Picks Up ‘Roseanne,’ Saying It Has No Problem With Occasional Racism”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/01/blog-posting/website-falsely-claims-fox-announced-plans-pick-ro/
“Breaking: Mike Huckabee just fired!”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/12/red-state-wave/no-evidence-trump-ally-mike-huckabee-was-fired/
“Breaking: Shep Smith to be canned because he can’t control his hate for Donald Trump.”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/13/newsflash/hoax-continues-circulate-foxs-shepard-smith-fired/
Dunkin’ Donuts is providing a free Dozen Doughnut Box to everyone! to celebrate 68th Anniversary!	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/29/blog-posting/free-dunkin-donuts-online-offer-scam/
“Fox News accidentally puts up a poll graphic that shows how they are the least trusted network.”	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/13/blog-posting/No-Fox-News-did-not-put-up-graphic-showing-it-was/
CNN to permanently close its doors as ratings plunge 30 percent	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/23/yournewswirecom/no-cnn-isnt-closing-after-ratings-drop/

Headline	Code	link
Red Hen owner just issued sick threat to Sarah Sanders	Media	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/27/houston-post/no-red-hen-owner-didnt-threaten-sarah-huckabee-san/
“Police discover meth lab in back room of Alabama Walmart.”	Governance	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/02/ufonly/fake-news-walmart-employees-operating-meth-lab-sto/
“Florida passes bill legalizing recreational use of marijuana.”	Governance	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/mar/26/abc-news-us/recycled-fake-news-story-claims-florida-has-become/
“NFL lawyer, who claimed Super Bowl is ‘rigged’, found dead.”	Governance	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/feb/02/eco-news/story-nfl-lawyer-said-super-bowl-rigged-and-was-mu/
“Breaking: FBI just raided the White House, 6 people thrown out.”	Governance	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jan/05/new-century-times/white-house-staffers-removed-job-subject-false/
“USPS loses \$1.46 each Amazon package it delivers.”	Governance	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/06/eric-bolling/usps-amazon-lose-146-every-package-delivers/
“BREAKING: 60 people just found dead in Ohio”	Governance	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/may/17/true-american/ohio-opioid-crisis-real-headline-misleading/
“New law (in California) makes it illegal to shower and do laundry on same day”	Governance	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/jun/07/blog-posting/it-illegal-shower-and-do-laundry-same-day-californ/
“USDA approves slaughterhouses producing horse meat for human consumption”	Governance	http://www.politifact.com/punditfact/statements/2018/apr/24/newstarget/no-government-has-not-approved-human-consumption-h/

APPENDIX C

ITALY

This section provides a list of headlines gathered from Butac in Italy, including the headline in its original language, the code it was assigned for research, and the link to the claim.

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Battista Furbata: withdraws from politics but places his father in Parliament/ Di Battista leaves a seat for his father	Furbata Di Battista: si ritira dalla politica ma piazza il padre in Parlamento/ Di Battista lascia in eredità un seggio per suo padre	Politics	http://www.butac.it/campagna-elettorale-si-aprano-le-danze/
Find a 1954 Bot (treasury bond) in a piece of furniture, now worth 500 thousand euros The story of the vibonese Gaetano Russo discovering rich at Christmas	Trova un Bot del 1954 in un mobile, ora vale 500 mila euro La storia del vibonese Gaetano Russo scopertosi ricco a Natale	Politics	http://www.butac.it/trova-un-bot-del-19xx-basta/
“You think that we politicians, on election day, we stick to the television, as you do, to see who wins and who loses? To us, we do not care, so much power is one. We are interested only in the data of those who do not vote, how many white cards and how many canceled. Because if the non-vote reaches 60%, it’s over for us! It would mean that the people have discouraged the whole political system. The judges would no longer be in check and would actually do the trials for real. And we would all end up in jail! But fortunately for us, you do not know this and you keep repeating the little phrases we put in your mouth, like: if you do not go to vote you will forgive the will of others who go there “ And he laughed with gusto. The person I know answered him: “Excuse me, but who assures him that when I go out of here, I do not tell what you just told me”? And Andreotti: “Do it, do it too! They will take it for a fool “!	“Voi pensate che noi politici, il giorno delle elezioni ci mettiamo incollati davanti al televisore, come fate voi, per vedere chi vince e chi perde? A noi, non ce ne frega nulla, tanto il potere è uno solo. A noi interessano solo i dati di quanti non vanno a votare, quante schede bianche e quante annullate. Perché se il non voto arriva al 60%, per noi è finita! Significherebbe che il popolo ha sfiduciato tutto il sistema politico. I giudici non sarebbero più sotto scacco e farebbero immediatamente i processi per davvero. E finiremmo tutti in galera! Ma per fortuna nostra, voi questo non lo sapete e continuate a ripetere le frasette che vi mettiamo in bocca, come: se non vai a votare ti rimetti alla volontà degli altri che ci vanno” E rideva di gusto. La persona che conosco gli rispose: “Scusi, ma chi glielo garantisce che, quando esco di qua, non racconto ciò che lei mi ha appena detto”? E Andreotti: “Lo faccia, lo faccia pure! La prenderanno per scemo”!	Politics	http://www.butac.it/non-voto-andreotti-e-le-citazioni-improbabili/
vote the scence choose the pd	voto la scenza scegli il pd	Politics	http://www.butac.it/vota-la-scenza/

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
<p>Dear Calabrians, remember this post by Salvini? Someone asks me what I think of Italians living abroad, and I always reply that everyone should live in their country and should participate in the growth of the same. Who escapes does not deserve to stay here, I consider him a slacker, and it is no coincidence that in general it is always MERIDIONAL and AFRICAN to leave, people without the culture of work.</p>	<p>Qualcuno mi chiede cosa penso degli italiani che vivono all'estero, ed io rispondo sempre che ognuno dovrebbe vivere nel proprio paese e dovrebbe partecipare alla crescita dello stesso. Chi scappa non merita di stare qui, lo considero un fannullone, e non è un caso che in genere siano sempre MERIDIONALI ed AFRICANI ad andarsene, gente senza la cultura del lavoro.</p>	<p>Politics</p>	<p>http://www.butac.it/democratica-salvini-calabresi/</p>
<p>MAKE SPRING ... SHAME !!!!! I would like to know in person the LADRI who entered the Public Soccorso square, which broke the windows of the side doors of two ambulances (two out of three) and then stole defibrillators, vacuum cleaners, electric lifting chair and much more material needed to daily performance of the service!</p>	<p>FATE GIRARE...VERGOGNA!!!! Vorrei conoscere di persona i LADRI che sono entrati nel piazzale del Soccorso Pubblico, che hanno rotto i vetri dei portelloni laterali di due ambulanze (due su tre) e che poi hanno rubato defibrillatori, aspiratori, sedia di sollevamento elettrica e tanto altro materiale necessario allo svolgimento quotidiano del servizio!</p>	<p>Politics</p>	<p>http://www.butac.it/ambulanza-vandalizzata/</p>
<p>and now let's burst a mess ... a contact of mine who is ABROAD, has just received the cards to vote. As you can see, you are missing all the symbols of the center-right and right-wing parties. Basically the votes abroad are rigged. Run, let's break the mess./ They have just informed me that the three right-wing parties (CasaPound, ForzaNuova and Fiamma tricolore) due to the absurd regulation for the collection of signatures abroad have not been able to participate and their logos will not be indicated in the foreign districts. Here is the democracy of the oligarchy. Prevent others from participating.</p>	<p>e ora facciamo scoppiare un casino... un mio contatto che sta all'ESTERO, ha appena ricevuto le schede per votare. Come potete verificare voi stessi mancano tutti i simboli dei partiti di centrodestra e destra. In sostanza i voti all'estero sono truccati. Fate girare, facciamo scoppiare il casino./ Mi hanno appena informato che i tre partiti di destra (CasaPound, ForzaNuova e Fiamma tricolore) a causa dell'assurdo regolamento per la raccolta firme all'estero non sono stati in grado di poter partecipare e i loro loghi non saranno indicati nelle circoscrizioni estero. Ecco la democrazia dell'oligarchia. Impedire agli altri di partecipare.</p>	<p>Politics</p>	<p>http://www.butac.it/lo-scandalo-dei-partiti-esclusi-dalle-elezioni-allestero/</p>
<p>«I read on the Sole 24 Ore that, once again, young people from the South will be helped. We broke the young people of the South, who go to fuck the young people of the South! In the South they do not merit ** or from morning to evening. Beyond everything, there are beautiful landscapes in the South, the problem is the people who live there. They are so, they have it right inside the cult of not doing a ca ** or from morning to night, while we are used to work from morning to night and pulls us a little 'ass>> attributed to Salvini</p>	<p>«Ho letto sul Sole 24 Ore che, ancora una volta, verranno aiutati i giovani del Mezzogiorno. Ci siamo rotti i co***oni dei giovani del Mezzogiorno, che vadano a fanculo i giovani del Mezzogiorno! Al Sud non fanno un emerito ca**o dalla mattina alla sera. Al di là di tutto, sono bellissimi paesaggi al Sud, il problema è la gente che ci abita. Sono così, loro ce l'hanno proprio dentro il culto di non fare un ca**o dalla mattina alla sera, mentre noi siamo abituati a lavorare dalla mattina alla sera e ci tira un po' il culo>> actually said by salvetti</p>	<p>Politics</p>	<p>http://www.butac.it/salvini-i-giovani-padani-e-quelli-del-mezzogiorno/</p>

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Farewell to the survivor's pension: the Government makes cash on the widows	Addio alla pensione di reversibilità: il Governo fa cassa sulle vedove	Politics	http://www.butac.it/la-pensione-di-reversibilita/
bbc chart: 5stella Movement - 48.4 PD-20 LegaNord - 10.3 Strength Italy 10.2 etc etc.	5stella Movement - 48.4 PD- 20 LegaNord - 10.3 Strength Italy 10.2 etc etc.	Politics	http://www.butac.it/il-sondaggio-politico-della-bbc/
DO TURN! - In the light bill from next April, there will be REALLY 30 to 35 € more (source ALTROCONSUMO Consumers Association) to cover the millions of euros accumulated by defaulters (people who do not pay) WE NEED TO PAY WAITING DECISIONS OF THE TAR ... I I do not pay (I have already removed the bank account and I will pay the amount that I have with a handwritten postal bulletin with the amount reduced by the amount that is not due under contract) BUT WILL WORK ONLY IF WE WILL DO IT IN MANY. it seems to me the case to collaborate with those who are organizing this civil and just protest ... What do you think?	FATE GIRARE! – Nella bolletta luce dal prossimo aprile, ci saranno VERAMENTE dalle 30 alle 35€ in più (fonte ALTROCONSUMO Associazione Consumatori) per coprire i milioni di euro accumulati da morosi (gente che non paga) NON DOBBIAMO PAGARE IN ATTESA DI DECISIONI DEL T.A.R ...Io non le pago (ho già tolto la domiciliazione bancaria e pagherò la somma CHE MI SPETTA con un bollettino postale scritto a mano con l'importo decurtato della cifra che non mi spetta come da contratto) MA FUNZIONERÀ SOLO SE LO FAREMO IN TANTI. mi sembra il caso di collaborare con chi sta organizzando questa civile e giusta protesta... Che ne dici?	Politics	http://www.butac.it/i-35-euro-della-bolletta-della-luce/
[5star member supports pseudoscience]		Politics	http://www.butac.it/sahaja-yoga-e-la-candidata-del-m5s/
And at Salvini's rally, the flag of the US neonati is on display	E al comizio di Salvini in bella mostra la bandiera dei neonazi Usa	Politics	http://www.butac.it/il-kekistan-neonazista/
Palermo, Twitter suspends the new candidatefor Forza Nuova	Palermo, Twitter sospende l'ater-candidato di Forza Nuova	Politics	http://www.butac.it/il-non-candidato-di-forza-nuova/
Trani - PD: the testimony of the mayor of Taurianova. VIDEO	Trani – PD: la testimonianza del sindaco di Taurianova. VIDEO	Politics	http://www.butac.it/pd-conveg-nichia/
This is Minister of Health. Imagine if you can! [video slowed down to make her seem drunk]	Questa è ministro della salute. Immagina...puoi!	Politics	http://www.butac.it/la-lorenzini-ubriaca/
SICILY: 500 thousand pre-filled cards with the symbol of the PD were found. New ones will be printed	SICILIA: trovate 500mila schede precompilate con il simbolo del PD. Ne verranno stampate di nuove	Politics	http://www.butac.it/bufale-fake-news-elezioni-2018/
This is Alessandro Boldrini, son of the president of the Chamber Laura Boldrini. It manages 10 cooperatives for immigrants and receives 6,000 euros of monthly salary. In the picture shows off his last Ferrari bought with money for Italians. Share if you're outraged!	Questo è Alessandro Boldrini, figlio del presidente della Camera Laura Boldrini. Gestisce 10 cooperative per immigrati e percepisce 6000 euro di stipendio mensili. Nella foto sfoggia la sua ultima Ferrari comprata con i soldi destinati agli italiani. Condividi se sei indignato!	Politics	http://www.butac.it/alessandro-boldrini-basta/
[screenshot showing that soros funds lega nord and 5 stelle]		Politics	http://www.butac.it/soros-paga-tutti/
He had stolen kicked scooter. The judge denies the reintegration to work	aveva rubato monopattino buttato. il giudice nega il reintegro al lavoro	Politics	http://www.butac.it/il-monopattino-della-discordia/

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Did you know that citizenship income already exists in the Italian constitution?	Lo sapevate che il reddito di cittadinanza esiste già nella costituzione italiana?	Politics	http://www.butac.it/lart-38-della-costituzione-non-parla-di-reddito-di-cittadinanza/
The scoop of the Gregorio that nails PD and the Republic	lo scoop della de gregorio che inchioda PD e Repubblica	Politics	http://www.butac.it/le-citazioni-verificabili-concita-de-gregorio-e-marino/
Real man use fists: FBI Data on homicides for 2014. Deaths per rifle: 248 Deaths per personal weapon (hands, punches, kicks): 660	translated from American meme	Politics	http://www.butac.it/le-morti-per-fucili-e-per-pugni/
THE TRUTH, I PLEASE, ON THE FISCAL EVASION FOR REGIONS: THE WORST [ARE] THOSE LEGHISTS. [THE] NORTH VIRTUOUS? A FAIRY TALE	LA VERITA', VI PREGO, SULL'EVASIONE FISCALE PER REGIONI: LE PEGGIORI QUELLE LEGHISTE. NORD VIRTUOSO? UNA FAVOLA	Politics	http://www.butac.it/levasione-al-nord-e-al-sud/
UNBELIEVABLE !!! A couple of Italians lose their homes: they are forced to live in cars ...	ALLUCINANTE!!! Una coppia di italiani perde la casa: sono costretti a vivere in auto....Coppia di italiani dopo lo sfratto vanno a vivere in auto, ma gli viene sequestrata ed ora vivono in strada. Quello che è capitato a questa coppia di italiani è allucinante. Avevano una vita normale ed un lavoro poi perdono tutto.	Politics	http://www.butac.it/vanno-a-vivere-in-auto-e-i-vigili-gliela-rimuovono/
La Casellati pulverizes Laura Boldrini: "President? Please..."	La Casellati polverizza Laura Boldrini: "Presidentessa? Per favore..."	Politics	http://www.butac.it/casellati-boldrini-e-accademia-della-crusca/
Last hour: Security guard savagely assaulted	ultim'ora: guardia giurata barbaramente assinata poco fa	Politics	http://www.butac.it/a-lezione-di-clickbaiting-le-guardie-giurate-uccide/
N ° deputies: from 630 to 300 (L) Salary: € 2500 (L) Saving: € 118 million per year (P) N ° senators: from 315 to 140 (L) Salary: € 2500 (L) Saving: € 56 million per year (P) N ° blue car from 630 thousand to 30 thousand (L) Savings: 20 BILLION € \ year (P) WE WANT (L) THESE CUTS!	N° deputati: da 630 a 300 (L) Stipendio: 2500 €(L) Risparmio: 118 milioni €\ anno (P) N° senatori: da 315 a 140 (L) Stipendio: 2500 € (L) Risparmio: 56 milioni €\anno (P) N° auto blu da 630mila a 30mila (L) Risparmio: 20 MILIARDI €\anno (P) VOGLIAMO (L) QUESTI TAGLI !	Politics	http://www.butac.it/sempre-questione-di-numeri-sbagliati-le-auto-blu/
He dies at 88 and leaves 3 million as a legacy to the Cavaliere (person dies and leaves money to Berlusconi)	Muore a 88 anni e lascia 3 milioni in eredità al Cavaliere	Politics	http://www.butac.it/andate-a-fare-in-culo-voi-e-le-eredita-da-3-milioni/
Leave a million euros for your dog: "Take care of him"	Lascia un milione di euro al suo cane: "Abbiate cura di lui"	Politics	http://www.butac.it/tor-il-cane-da-un-milione-di-euro/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Renzi attacks with the loan spread-mortgage / mortgage rates are not indexed to the spread but all-Euribor (or Eonia)	Renzi attacca con la bufala spread-mutui/ i tassi dei mutui non sono indicizzati allo spread ma all-Euribor (o all'Eonia)	Politics	http://www.butac.it/renzi-mutui-spread-e-politica/
108-year-old Pescarese finds a credit of 1948: now it is worth 32,500 euros	Pescarese di 108 anni ritrova un titolo di credito del 1948: adesso vale 32.500 euro	Politics	http://www.butac.it/bot-e-bufale-a-pescara/
Appointment of ministers, protection of savings and guarantor of the Charter: in Mattarella's speech, articles 92, 47 and 65	Nomina ministri, tutela risparmio e garante della Carta: nel discorso di Mattarella gli art.92, 47 e 65	Politics	http://www.butac.it/lart-65-della-costituzione/
The company went to Cottarelli, which ended up in trouble for Clean Hands	La società è passata a Cottarelli finito nei guai per Mani pulite	Politics	http://www.butac.it/cottarelli-e-mani-pulite/
Silvio Berlusconi is ready to invest more than 150 million euros in a company that can change your life.	Silvio Berlusconi è pronto a investire più di 150 Milioni di Euro in una compagnia che può cambiare la tua vita.	Politics	http://www.butac.it/il-leggendario-silvio-berlusconi/
BOLDRINI: "DI MAIO AND SALVINI ARE EVIL!" (I) " YOU WANT A LAW AGAINST LEGA AND M5S"	Ma siamo al ridicolo totale....(I) BOLDRINI SHOW: "DI MAIO E SALVINI SONO IL MALE!" (I) "CI VUOLE UNA LEGGE CONTRO LEGA E M5S"	Politics	http://www.butac.it/a-volte-ritornano-2/
I know they are reactionary and for this I find this photo not only vulgar, laida and unacceptably disrespectful, but more generally a perfect portrait of today's Italy. Not even the most daring imagination could represent a De Gasperi or a Berlinguer with legs apart and arms folded, seated, while the president of the republic enters the hall. How can we then surprise and complain about what we see every day at school?	Lo so sono reazionario e per questo trovo questa foto non soltanto volgare, laida e inaccettabilmente irrispettosa, ma più in generale un ritratto perfetto dell'Italia di oggi. Neanche l'immaginazione più ardita potrebbe raffigurarsi un De Gasperi o un Berlinguer a gambe divaricate e braccia conserte, seduti, mentre entra nella sala il presidente della repubblica. Come possiamo poi sorprenderci e lamentarci di ciò che vediamo tutti i giorni a scuola?	Politics	http://www.butac.it/salvini-non-si-alza-davanti-al-presidente/
Giuseppe Conte? He is the "poorest" premier in history: how much the new Prime Minister earns each month	Giuseppe Conte? E' il premier più "povero" della storia: quanto guadagna al mese il nuovo Presidente del Consiglio	Politics	http://www.butac.it/conte-il-presidente-del-consiglio-piu-povero-di-sempre/
"Regeni? Relations with Egypt are more important "	"Regeni? Sono più importanti i rapporti con l'Egitto"	Politics	http://www.butac.it/i-virgolettati-di-salvini/
Salvini removes the escort to Saviano	SALVINI TOGLIE LA SCORTA A SAVIANO	Politics	http://www.butac.it/salvini-toglie-la-scorta-a-saviano/

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
MAKE SUCCESS FOR HOW TO TREAT PEOPLE (line) The INPS has withdrawn the pension to a cancer patient living in Termoli, the figure is reduced to 270 euros but the lord in question with this figure was paid the ticket to go to do chemo since the hospital is far from home his, we have come to many in Italy. Instead of taking out the pensions of gold they take away the pension from a cancer patient, a defenseless citizen who fights against a disease like cancer.	FATE SCHIFO PER COME TRATTATE LE PERSONE (line) L'INPS ha tolto la pensione a un malato di cancro residente a Termoli, la cifra tolta è di 270 euro ma il signore in questione con questa cifra si pagava il biglietto per andare a fare la chemio visto che l'ospedale è distante da casa sua, si è arrivati a tanti in Italia. Invece di togliere le pensioni d'oro tolgono la pensione a un malato di cancro, a un cittadino indifeso che combatte contro un male come il cancro.	Politics	http://www.butac.it/pensione-a-un-malato/
That child fasting at school, watching the companions eat (head) It happens in a maternal of Frosinone. The parents asked for a preferential tariff, but the bureaucracy after months still does not respond (sub)	Quel bambino a digiuno a scuola, guardando i compagni mangiare (head) Accade in una materna di Frosinone. I genitori hanno chiesto una tariffa agevolata, ma la burocrazia dopo mesi ancora non risponde (sub)	Politics	http://www.butac.it/bambino-senza-cibo-mensa/
# Alfano, # Bindi, # Giovanardi, # Finocchiaro and many others (especially # PD): about € 45 thousand as liquidation because they are not re-elected. It is called "support for job reintegration", pity that many who will perceive it are already in retirement age	Alfano, #Bindi, #Giovanardi, #Finocchiaro e molti altri (soprattutto #PD): 45mila€ circa come liquidazione perché non rieletti. Si chiama "sostegno per il reinserimento lavorativo", peccato che molti che lo percepiranno sono già in età da pensione	Politics	http://www.butac.it/la-liquidazione-per-i-non-rieletti/
FOLLY !!! (line) Does a citizen foil a robbery and have to compensate the criminal ?! (line) It seems to be on separate jokes, instead it is a judge who applies the Italian "justice". Based on older headline "He threw out the bank robbery, he will have to compensate the bandit"	FOLLIA !!! (line) Un cittadino sventa una rapina e deve risarcire il delinquente ?! (line) Sembra di essere su scherzi a parte, invece è un giudice che applica la "giustizia" italiana. Based on older headline: Sventò la rapina in banca, dovrà risarcire il bandito	Politics	http://www.butac.it/politica-e-notizie-fresche-di-decennio/
«I've been looking for 25 workers for 3 months, I've only found four»	«Da 3 mesi cerco 25 operai, ne ho trovati solo quattro»	Politics	http://www.butac.it/cerco-25-operai-non-li-trovo/
Rome, fake blind stuck by shopping: it is the wife of Admiral Treu, merit gold medal	Roma, finta cieca incastrata dallo shopping: è la moglie dell'ammiraglio Treu, medaglia d'oro al merito/ Finta cieca beccata mentre fa shopping, è la moglie dell'ammiraglio friulano Treu, medaglia d'oro al merito	Politics	http://www.butac.it/la-finta-cieca-che-non-e-finta/
The public debt in 2011 was 1897 billion euros (line) after those "good" (line) Mountains 1990 billion euros (line) Read 2070 billion euros (line) Renzi 2251 billion euros (line) Gentiloni 2280 billion euros	Il debito pubblico nel 2011 era 1897 miliardi di euro (line) dopo quelli "bravi" (line) Monti 1990 miliardi di euro (line) Letta 2070 miliardi di euro (line) Renzi 2251 miliardi di euro (line) Gentiloni 2280 miliardi di euro	Politics	http://www.butac.it/il-debito-pubblico-dal-2011/
Can you have a hedgehog as a pet?	Si può avere un riccio come animale domestico?	Politics	http://www.butac.it/il-riccio-come-animale-domestico/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
meme: This is Costantino Mortati from "Institutions of public law", what the Constitution wrote it. Image: The President of the Republic has a limited margin of discretion in choosing the President of the Council (while he has none in the choice of ministers, formally referred to the President of the Council).	meme: Questo è Costantino Mortati da "Istituzioni di diritto pubblico", quello che la Costituzione l'ha scritta. Image: I Presidente della Repubblica ha un ristretto margine di discrezionalità nella scelta del Presidente del Consiglio (mentre non ne ha alcuno nella scelta dei ministri, formalmente demandata al Presidente del Consiglio).	Politics	http://www.butac.it/sergio-mattarella-danilo-toninelli-e-la-costituzione/
The public debt in 2011 was 1897 billion euros (line) after those "good" (line) Mountains 1990 billion euros (line) Read 2070 billion euros (line) Renzi 2251 billion euros (line) Gentiloni 2280 billion euros	Il debito pubblico nel 2011 era 1897 miliardi di euro (line) dopo quelli "bravi" (line) Monti 1990 miliardi di euro (line) Letta 2070 miliardi di euro (line) Renzi 2251 miliardi di euro (line) Gentiloni 2280 miliardi di euro	Politics	http://www.butac.it/il-debito-pubblico-dal-2011/
photo on republicca about saving today (photo of rescue is staged)	foto su republicca sul salvataggio di oggi	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/salvataggio-si-tocca/
Macerata: who really shot the migrants?	Macerata: chi ha sparato davvero ai migranti?	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/sciacalli-della-cronaca-nera/
Saviano: You miss a little detail: the Nigerian could not know that tearing a person to pieces is a crime in Italy, but the League knew very well that shooting is a crime.	Saviano: Ti perdi un piccolo dettaglio: il nigeriano non poteva sapere che fare a pezzi una persona sia un reato in Italia, il leghista invece sapeva benissimo che sparare è un reato.	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/saviano-e-i-tweet-fasulli/
receipt lampadusa: ABOUT ITALIAN BIRTH TAX PAYER HONEST AND BENEFITS CAN BENEFIT THIS PRIVILEGE ?????? APPEARANCE YOUR COMMENTS !!!!!	after receipt of lampedusa: CHI ITALIANO DI NASCITA PAGATORE DI TASSE ONESTO E BENPENSANTE PUO' VANTARE QUESTO PRIVILEGIO ?????? ASPETTO VOSTRI COMMENTI !!!!!	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/cie-scontrino-la-ricevuta-del-centro-immigrazione-emigrati-lampedusa/
post about an immigrant on the train scamming: Monday morning. Frecciarossa 9608, Rome Termini - Milan. The gentleman in a picture that I do not care to hide the appearance has sat next to me, without any baggage.	Lunedì mattina. Frecciarossa 9608, Roma Termini - Milano. Il signore in foto di cui non mi interessa nascondere la fisionomia si è seduto accanto a me, senza alcun bagaglio	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/condivisioni-inutili/
ARRIVES DIRECTLY FROM THE GUEST OF FINANCE REGGIO EMILIA [followed by a story about attempted drugging-hoax]	ARRIVA DIRETTAMENTE DALLA GUARDIA DI FINANZA DI REGGIO EMILIA	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/la-burundanga-che-circola-dal-2008/
heart and liver of Pamela eaten in a ritual of the Nigerian mafia	cuore e fegato di Pamela mangiati in un rituale della mafia nigeriana	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/gli-organismi-asportati-a-macerata-e-lindignazione/
Better to give it to a Nigerian than to a Po valley	Meglio darla a un nigeriano che a un padano	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/meglio-darla-a-un-nigeriano/

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
While the refugees are in 3-star hotels, look at the conditions of the earthquake victims	Mentre i profughi stanno negli hotel a 3 stelle, guardate in che condizioni sono i terremotati	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/immigrati-3-stelle-italiani-al-gelo/
A Syrian child frightened by bombing. Dear politicians, these are the children to help bring in Europe not the nice muscular packs that run around Italy and break our balls in the parking lots and at the entrance to the supermarkets. SHAME ON YOU !	Un bambino Siriano spaventato dai bombardamenti. Cari politici sono questi i bambini da aiutare a far venire in Europa non quei bell'imbusti muscolosi che scorrazzano per l'Italia e ci rompono le palle nei parcheggi e all'ingresso dei supermercati. VERGOGNATEVI !	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/un-bambino-siriano-spaventato-dai-bombardamenti/
This is reality. do not be fooled around. open your eyes. do not trust what comes on your computer (about images from syria)	questa è la realtà. non farti prendere in giro. apri gli occhi. non fidarti di quello che arriva sul tuo computer	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/pandora-tv-e-la-controinformazione-sulla-siria/
(Marseille) France: Migrants having fun	trans from French	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/i-migranti-sul-camion-spar/
Did you know that all the Chinese shops in Italy for the first 5 years do not pay taxes, just after 5 years change the name and you're covered for another 5 years, and so on the game is done ...	Sapevate che tutti i negozi dei cinesi in Italia x i primi 5 anni non pagano le tasse, basta che dopo 5 anni cambi il nome e sei coperto ancora altri 5 anni, e così via il gioco è fatto...	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/i-cinesi-che-non-pagano-le-tasse-per-5-anni/
Macron: "Italy was a fascist country, it deserves all immigrants".	Macron: "L' Italia era un Paese fascista, si merita tutti gli immigrati".	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/macron-e-litalia/
The alert is triggered: refugees rush into cars to get compensation	Scatta l'allerta: profughi si lanciano sulle auto per farsi risarcire	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/profughi-si-lanciano-sulle-auto/
Saved and kept this resource in the reception center that hosts it behaves like this ... unfortunately in Italy of these people who behave like a beast there is too much. Think about finding it on the street	Salvato e mantenuto questa risorsa nel centro di accoglienza che lo ospita si comporta così ... purtroppo in Italia di questa gente che si comporta da bestia ce n'è troppa. Pensate a trovarlo per strada	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/misinformare-per-indignare-razzismo-2018/
Germany, 1944/America, 2018	No headline	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/le-gabbie-i-bambini-e-trump/
[Putin interview with fake subtitles about the Aquarius]	No headline	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/putin-e-laquarius-finte-pagine-e-finte-interviste/
Rome's captain Francesco Totti: Today I fight for the reception of the refugees, what I forgot to tell you is that I was in business with Odevaine and that these businesses gave me a million euros a year for renting my apartments to immigrants.	Oggi mi batto per l'accoglienza dei profughi, ciò che mi sono dimenticato di dirvi è che ero in affari con Odevaine e che questi affari mi fruttavano un milione di euro l'anno per l'affitto dei miei appartamenti agli immigrati.	Social issue- Immigration	http://www.butac.it/totti-e-gli-appartamenti-affittati-agli-immigrati/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Aquarius, the migrants throw away the red cross gifts and go to the restaurant with 100 euro bills	Aquarius, i migranti buttano via i doni della croce rossa e vanno al ristorante con banconote da 100 euro	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/i-migranti-della-aquarius-e-i-vestiti-della-croce-rossa/
And here is the beautiful station of central Milan (showing refugees sleeping en masse)	Ed ecco a voi la stupenda stazione di Milano centrale	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/migranti-alla-stazione-di-milano/
The «barge» that was hard to navigate .. 😞😞😞and that took us 8 days 😞😞😞to get to Valencia ... throws the mask back to being the German icebreaker from over 70 meters of always ... 😞😞😞and back in Libya in a day .. (l) easily.. (l)under the picture .. with the route followed .. (l)in the meantime ... for those who do not know ... dozens of migrants who were on board the boat are missing ... it (l) seems a hundred and more .. (l) Once landed ... (l) they disappeared ... (l) refusing board and lodging for free (l) weird ... they get out of war ... from hunger ... and from aquarius ... (l) and they do not ask for asylum. Strange refugees, are not they? 😞😞😞😞😞 (l) They are strange “refugees” those who run away and do not ask for asylum ..	Il “barcone” che faceva fatica a navigare..😞😞😞 e che ci ha messo 8 giorni 😞😞😞ad arrivare a Valencia... getta la maschera e torna ad essere il rompighiaccio tedesco da oltre 70 metri di sempre... 😞😞😞😞😞torna in Libia in un giorno .. (l) facilmente.. (l) sotto la foto.. con la rotta seguita.. (l) intanto ...per chi non lo sapesse..mancano all'appello decine di migranti che erano a bordo della nave... (l) pare cento e piu.. (l) Una volta sbarcati... (l) sono spariti... (l) rifiutando vitto e alloggio gratis.... (l) strano..scappano dalla guerra..dalla fame..e dalla aquarius... (l) e non chiedono asilo..strani profughi vero?😞😞😞😞😞 (l) Sono strani “profughi” quelli che scappano e non chiedono asilo..	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/ancora-aquarius-il-barcone-verso-la-libia/
History of Segen, who died of hunger in Italy after arriving from Libya (line) Migrants, 22-year-old Eritrean dies of hunger after landing. The mayor of Pozzallo: “Scenes like those of the Jews in the camps” (line) Ragusa, a 22-year-old migrant who died of hunger, had landed in Pozzallo	Storia di Segen, morto di fame in Italia dopo essere arrivato dalla Libia (line) Migranti, eritreo 22enne muore di fame dopo lo sbarco. Il sindaco di Pozzallo: “Scene come quelle degli ebrei nei lager” (line) Ragusa, migrante di 22 anni morto per fame: era sbarcato a Pozzallo	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/il-migrante-morto-per-fame-e-le-fonti/
“Report the presence of agents” The new Soros app for migrants	“Segnala la presenza di agenti” La nuova app di Soros per i migranti	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/la-app-di-soros-per-i-migranti/
Migrant with multiresistant TBC transported like this (PHOTO): then they are forced to make mass vaccinations	Migrante con TBC multiresistente trasportato così (FOTO): poi obbligano a fare vaccinazioni di massa	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/limportanza-del-fact-checking-migranti-e-tbc/
Kyenge immediately threatens the new government: “The illegal immigrants must keep the same rights!”	Kyenge minaccia subito il nuovo Governo: “I clandestini devono mantenere gli stessi diritti!”	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/cecile-kyenge-minaccia-subito-il-nuovo-governo/

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
The captain of the Aquarius vessel, with 600 illegal immigrants on board, refuses to dock in Malta for “adverse weather conditions”. And it is heading towards Italy. 26 degrees and sunny, as they say jackal in Maltese? - Valletta sunny 26th	L'ambasciatrice Maltese a Tgcom24: “Non sbarcare a la Il capitano della nave Aquarius, con a bordo 600 clandestini, si rifiuta di attraccare a Malta per “avverse condizioni atmosferiche”. E si fa rotta verso l'Italia. 26 gradi e soleggiato, come si dice sciacallo in maltese? – La Valletta soleggiato 26°	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/le-avverse-condizioni-atmosferiche-e-laquarius/
The non-EU citizen, after having the relatives come here, sends the family members or the over 65-year-old family member to the INPS. Here the subject self-certifies the absence of income or declares the minimum pension in the state of origin and the game is done. The INPS then provides 395.6 euros per month of social allowance plus 154.9 euros of additional amount. In total, 550.5 euros for 13 monthly payments, then 7.156 euros a year. Without ever paying any contribution to the INPS. (line) 7.156 Euro Did you know ?!	L'extracomunitario regolare, dopo aver fatto venire qui i congiunti, manda i familiari o il familiare ultra 65enne all'INPS. Qui l'interessato autocertifica l'assenza di reddito oppure dichiara la pensione minima nello stato di provenienza e il gioco e' fatto. L'INPS a quel punto eroga 395,6 euro al mese di assegno sociale piu' 154,9 di importo aggiuntivo. In totale, 550,5 euro per 13 mensilita', quindi 7.156 euro l'anno. Senza aver mai versato alcun contributo all'INPS. (line) 7.156 Euro Lo sapevate?!	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/pensioni-extracomunitari-aspettativa-vita/
The deception of the “refugees”: in Germany 43% are fake minors	L'inganno dei “profughi”: in Germania il 43% è finto minorenne	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/fact-checking-i-finti-minorenni-della-germania/
In Dublin, motorcyclists' rounds against the violent baby gangs of African minors	A Dublino, ronde di motociclisti contro le violente baby gang di minorenni africani	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/hells-angels-dublin-gang/
the government offer the illegal immigrants 500 euros per month!	il governo offre al clandestini 500 euro Al mese!	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/fatti-del-2013-cavalcati-nel-2018/
the state gives the immigrants the pension	Agli immigrati lo stato regala la pensione	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/il-governo-regala-la-pensione-agli-immigrati/
Crazy ... Take advantage of a serious subject like the environment to legitimize illegal immigration ... # stopinvasione	Pazzesco... Sfruttare un tema serio come l'ambiente per legittimare l'immigrazione clandestina... #stopinvasione	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/i-migranti-climatici-la-comprensione-del-testo/
FREE DENTIST FOR IMMIGRANTS: NOTHING FOR THE POOR ITALIANS	DENTISTA GRATIS PER GLI IMMIGRATI: SCHIAFFO AGLI ITALIANI POVERI	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/il-dentista-gratis-per-i-richiedenti-asilo/
Slayed in Pakistan by his father and brother because he wanted to marry an Italian (line) The girl lived in Brescia. On returning home the “punishment”	Sgozzata in Pakistan dal padre e dal fratello perché voleva sposare un italiano La ragazza viveva a Brescia. Al ritorno in patria la “punizione”	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/sana-cheema-fonti-e-giornalismo/
No to the Africans: «They always win» [alleges Africans were banned from participating in a marathon]	No agli africani: «Vincono sempre loro»	Social issue-Immigration	http://www.butac.it/niente-africani-alla-mezza-maratona-di-lucca/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
<p>When Italy was able to say No to Islam!! In the thirties, the ambassador of Saudi Arabia, requested an audience with the Head of the Government IF BENITO MUSSOLINI,..... to ask permission to build a mosque in Rome. "There is absolutely no difficulty," replied the Duce, adding immediately afterwards: "just make me build a church in Riyadh (ndr.capital Saudi Arabia)". "Absolutely not. NEVER !! "replied the Arab ambassador. So I'm sorry, but you will not build any mosque in Italy, Mussolini said dismissing the Arab ambassador. "</p>	<p>Quando l'Italia era capace di dire No all'Islam !! Negli anni trenta, l'ambasciatore dell'Arabia Saudita, chiese udienza al Capo del Governo S.E. BENITO MUSSOLINI...per chiedere l'autorizzazione a costruire a Roma una Moschea. "Non c'è assolutamente nessuna difficoltà", rispose il Duce, aggiungendo subito dopo: " basta che mi facciate costruire una chiesa a Riyad (ndr.capitale Arabia Saudita) ". "Assolutamente no. MAI !!" rispose l'ambasciatore arabo. Allora mi spiace, ma Voi non costruirete nessuna moschea in Italia, disse Mussolini congedando l'ambasciatore arabo."</p>	Social issue-Islam	http://www.butac.it/mussolini-lambasciatore-saudita-e-la-moschea-di-roma/
<p>ITALY OF PD (line) GIORGIO, ITALIAN, 93 YEARS, HAS WORKED ALL THE LIFE, THE STATE HAS REMOVED THE HOUSE AND IS CONSIDERED TO LIVE BY CAR (line) MOHAMED, NIGERIAN, 20 YEARS, IS IN ITALY FOR 2 YEARS AND HAS NEVER DONE EVERYTHING FROM THE MORNING TO THE EVENING AND THE STATE HAS GIVEN: HOTEL 5 STARS, IPHONE AND 30 € PER DAY</p>	<p>L'ITALIA DEL PD (line) GIORGIO, ITALIANO, 93 ANNI, HA LAVORATO TUTTA LA VITA, LO STATO GLI HA TOLTO LA CASA ED È COSTRETTO A VIVERE IN AUTO (line) MOHAMED, NIGERIANO, 20 ANNI, È IN ITALIA DA 2 ANNI E NON HA MAI FATTO NIENTE DALLA MATTINA ALLA SERA E LO STATO GLI HA DATO: HOTEL 5 STELLE, IPHONE E 30 € AL GIORNO</p>	Social issue-Islam	http://www.butac.it/piccole-perle-italiani-contro-immigrati-ancora-una-volta/
<p>Just another day in Sweden: Shiite Muslims march for Sharia law</p>		Social issue-Islam	http://www.butac.it/la-sharia-in-svezia/

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
<p>Today, unfortunately, they have just confirmed this terrible news right now. You can corroborate it in the news. What a sadness! Please pray for the 229 Christian missionaries who have been sentenced to death by Afghan Muslims tomorrow afternoon. Please send this message as soon as possible so that many people can pray. This message was sent by JUDITH CARMONA , a Chihuahua missionary who is in Africa. The whole pianeta is united in prayer. If you can send it again, please join us in urgent prayer, also because the radical Islamic group has just taken Quaragosh, the largest Christian city in Iraq. Where there are hundreds of Christians, women and children who are beheaded. He is asking for prayer coverage. Please take a minute and pray for them. Pass the message to whoever you can. We asked for the prayer, please pass it on to others</p>	<p>Oggi purtroppo hanno appena confermato questa terribile notizia in questo momento. Puoi corroborare nelle notizie. Che tristezza! Per favore pregate per i 229 missionari cristiani, che sono stati condannati a morte dagli islamici afgani domani pomeriggio. Per favore, puoi trasmettere questo messaggio il prima possibile in modo che molte persone possano pregare. Questo messaggio è stato inviato da JUDITH CARMONA, un missionario di Chihuahua che si trova in Africa. L'intero pianeta è unito nella preghiera. Se riesci a inviarlo di nuovo, ti preghiamo di unirci alla preghiera urgente, anche perché il gruppo islamico radicale ha appena preso Quaragosh, la più grande città cristiana in Iraq. Dove ci sono centinaia Cristiani, donne e bambini che vengono decapitati. Sta chiedendo la copertura della preghiera. Per favore, prendi un minuto e prega per loro. Passa il messaggio a chiunque tu possa. Abbiamo chiesto la preghiera, per favore passala agli altri</p>	<p>Social issue-Islam</p>	<p>http://www.butac.it/judith-carmona-missionaria-di-chihuahua/</p>
<p>In London, for not having closed the road as requested during Ramadan</p>	<p>En Londres por no haberles cerrado la carretera como ellos pidieron durante el ramadán (original), A Londra, per non aver chiuso la strada come richiesto durante il Ramadan</p>	<p>Social issue-Islam</p>	<p>http://www.butac.it/musulmani-che-assaltano-macchine-per-il-ramadan/</p>
<p>"Dedicated to Gino Strada by MICHELE CALABRESE: MOSUL, WHEN MY BROTHERS OF THE FOLGORE WERE USED INJURED CIVIL, CHILDREN INCLUDED AND LET US WAIT OUT FROM THE HOSPITAL, WHY 'ERI INTENT TO MEDICATE THE REBELS TO MAKE IT BACK TO COMBAT THAT FUCK YOU TELL YOU? IF YOU WERE TO LOAD ON BLINDO DO 70 KM TO GET THEM IN THEIR BASE AND SOMEONE WAS NOT LIVING LIVE .. THAT SAYS YOU KEY ENGLISH KEY, YOU BECAUSE 'YOU CALLED THIS KEY ENGLISH TO THE UNIVERSITY', BECAUSE 'TURNS WITH A KEY FROM 24 BELOW THE EXCHANGE ERI THE HEAD OF THE PICCHIATORI, OUR DOCTOR HAS SAVED 120 OF THOSE YOU REFUSED, FACCI THE C .. OF THE PLEASURE MADE A TICKET OF ONLY GOING AND DO NOT STAY MORE MONEY "</p>	<p>"Dedicata a Gino Strada da MICHELE CALABRESE: MOSUL, QUANDO I MIEI FRATELLI DELLA FOLGORE TI PORTAVANO FERITI CIVILI ,BAMBINI COMPRESI E LI FACEVI ASPETTARE FUORI DALL'OSPEDALE, PERCHE' ERI INTENTO A MEDICARE I RIBELLI PER FARLI TORNARE A COMBATTERE CHE CAZZO CI DI DICI? SE LI DOVEVANO CARICARE SUI BLINDO FARE 70 KM PER PORTARLI NELLA LORO BASE E QUALCUNO NON ARRIVAVA VIVO.. CHE CI DICI CARO CHIAVE INGLESE, SI PERCHE' TI CHIAMAVAMO COSI CHIAVE INGLESE ALL'UNIVERSITA', PERCHE' GIRAVI CON UNA CHIAVE DA 24 SOTTO L'ESCHIMO ERI IL CAPO DEI PICCHIATORI, IL NOSTRO MEDICO NE HA SALVATI 120 DI QUELLI DA TE RIFIUTATI, FACCI IL C ..DEL PIACERE FATTI UN BIGLIETTO DI SOLO ANDATA E NON CI RUBARE PIU SOLDI"</p>	<p>Social issue-Islam</p>	<p>http://www.butac.it/gino-strada-il-picchiatore/</p>

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
PD: "ITALIAN CHILDREN LEARN ARABIC TO INTEGRATE"	PD: "BAMBINI ITALIANI IMPARINO L'ARABO PER INTEGRARSI"	Social issue- Islam	http://www.butac.it/bambini-costretti-a-studiare-larabo/
expulsion of the hospital room because there is a Muslim	cacciata della stanza d'ospedale perché c'è una musulmana	Social issue- Islam	http://www.butac.it/la-musulmana-letto-dospedale/
Terrorism alarm in Rome, we seek a radical Tunisian Islamist, Mathlouthi Atef of 42, who would be ready to hit the center of Rome. Among the places indicated as possible targets are the subway, bars, shopping centers and various tourist sites. IT'S NOT A JOKE. Please share.	Allarme terrorismo a Roma, si cerca un islamista radicale tunisino, Mathlouthi Atef di 42 anni, che sarebbe pronto a colpire il centro di Roma. Tra i luoghi indicati come possibili obiettivi ci sono la metropolitana, i bar, i centri commerciali e diversi siti turistici. NON È UNO SCHERZO. Condividete per favore.	Social issue- Islam	http://www.butac.it/il-tunisino-ricercato/
Austria, the dying daughter in the hospital is in the room with a Muslim, the father can not come to visit her	Austria, la figlia morente in ospedale è in stanza con una musulmana, il padre non può entrare a farle visita	Social issue- Islam	http://www.butac.it/musulmani-in-ospedale-tutto-il-mondo-e-paese/
"Too many white citizens": excluding a Hungarian city from the European capital of culture	"Troppi cittadini bianchi": esclusa una città ungherese da capitale europea della cultura	Social issue- Race	http://www.butac.it/il-razzismo-latente-le-capitali-della-cultura-europea/
Girl found in a Roma camp in Greece: turn the photo to warn the parents.	Bimba ritrovata in un campo Rom in Grecia: fate girare la foto per avvertire i genitori.	Social issue- Race	http://www.butac.it/gli-zingari-rubano-i-bambini/
Dad, at school they explained to me that I can change sex	Papà, a scuola mi hanno spiegato che posso cambiare sesso	Social issue - Gender	http://www.butac.it/estate-tempo-di-gender/
Someone (for example, the Governor of Tuscany, Enrico Rossi, of the PD) says that we must bring children to Gay Pride. (l) This is a photo of a child during a Gay Pride. (l) The child, however, is the only one who has understood everything: the Gay Pride is repugnant. (l) It is urgent to save childhood !!!	Qualcuno (ad esempio il Governatore della Toscana, Enrico Rossi, del PD) dice che bisogna portare i bambini al Gay Pride. (l) Questa è la foto di un bambino durante un Gay Pride. (l) Il bambino, comunque, è l'unico che ha capito tutto: il Gay Pride è ripugnante. (l) È urgente salvare l'infanzia!!!	Social issue - Gender	http://www.butac.it/la-foto-del-bambino-durante-il-gay-pride/
How do I accept you, make you normal and legalize your pedophilia!	Come ti faccio accettare, ti rendo normale e ti legalizzo la pedofilia!	Social issue - Gender	http://www.butac.it/uncle-pete-fischi-per-fiaschi/
Here is the man who became gay because of painkillers	Ecco l'uomo che è diventato Gay a causa degli antidolorifici	Social issue - Gender	http://www.butac.it/gay-per-colpa-di-un-farmaco/
Paolo Borsellino said: The Revolution is done in the streets with the people, but the change is done inside the voting booth with a pencil in hand. That pencil, stronger than any weapon, more dangerous than a lupara and sharper than a knife.	Paolo Borsellino ha detto: "La rivoluzione è fatta per le strade con la gente, ma il cambiamento avviene all'interno del voto con una matita in mano. Quella matita, più forte di qualsiasi arma, più pericolosa di un lupara e più affilata di un coltello.	Culture	http://www.butac.it/paolo-borsellino-la-rivoluzione-le-citazioni-poco-verificate/

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Stefano Montanari: “An interesting article that reveals the interests of those who pretend to defend science and instead are paid to destroy it in its essence. Only on one thing I do not agree: science is not infallible. Simply what it states must be demonstrable by anyone, anywhere and at any time.	Stefano Montanari: “Un interessante articolo che svela gli interessi di chi finge di difendere la scienza e invece è pagato per distruggerla nella sua essenza. Solo su una cosa non concordo: la scienza non è infallibile. Semplicemente ciò che enuncia deve poter essere dimostrabile da chiunque, in qualunque luogo e momento.	Culture	http://www.butac.it/bufale-un-tanto-al-chilo-affidabile/
The last folly of the Fedeli: the Italian theme will be abolished	L’ultima follia della Fedeli: sarà abolito il tema di italiano agli esami	Culture	http://www.butac.it/valeria-fedeli-tema-ditaliano/
It is not Auschwitz ... They are Ukrainians, under the communist regime 7,000,000 of dead. THE DAY OF MEMORY IS ALSO FOR THEM?	Non è Auschwitz ... Sono ucraini, sotto il regime comunista 7.000.000 di morti. IL GIORNO DELLA MEMORIA È ANCHE PER LORO?	Culture	http://www.butac.it/la-memoria-di-tutti/
“Do you keep silent because I have not been killed by an immigrant? Or are you keeping silent because who killed me was a white man, an Italian, a Milan tram driver and a Casapound militant?”	“Tacete perché io non sono stata ammazzata da un extracomunitario? Oppure state tacendo perché chi mi ha assassinata era un bianco, italiano, tranviere di Milano e militante di Casapound?”	Culture	http://www.butac.it/il-tranviere-militante/
the director of the Egyptian museum meets Giorgia Meloni	il direttore del museo Egizio incontra Giorgia Meloni	Culture	http://www.butac.it/direttore-del-museo-egizio-gli-emigrati-italiani/
malago: the contract of astori and been renewed, the engagement goes to the partner and the daughter	malago: il contratto di astori è stato rinnovato, l’ingaggio andrà alla compagna e alla figlia	Culture	http://www.butac.it/il-contratto-di-davide-astori/
We must not scare robots but capitalism	Non ci devono spaventare i robot ma il capitalismo	Culture	http://www.butac.it/stephen-hawking-alla-marcia-contro-il-vietnam/
The Rosary of the Madonna of Pompeii fluctuates from the top of the Sanctuary: “A miracle”	Il Rosario della Madonna di Pompeii oscilla dall’alto del Santuario: «Un miracolo»	Culture	http://www.butac.it/il-miracolo-di-pompei/
Pope Francis in the places of Padre Pio	papa francesco nei luoghi di padre pio	Culture	http://www.butac.it/papa-francesco-e-padre-pio/
in Naples it looks like New Year’s Eve: in town to party after the victory over Juventus	a napoli sembra capodanno: in città a festa dopo la vittoria sulla Juve	Culture	http://www.butac.it/i-festeggiamenti-a-napoli-che-sembra-capodanno/
These are the partisans, April 25th. (line) When the civil war was over, houses, barracks, cellars, schools were raided. (line) Daughters, wives, mothers and even grandmothers of the “fascists” were taken, taken to the streets, shaved, naked, raped in turn by all the partisans, tortured, publicly mocked and finally executed on the spot. (line) Good “liberation”, children and descendants of these shits (later decorated and today gathered in the “ANPI” moneyeaters association)	Questi sono i partigiani, il 25 aprile. (line) A guerra civile terminata, furono razziati case, caserme, cantine, scuole. (line) Figlie, mogli, madri ed anche nonne dei “fascisti” vennero prese, portare in piazza, rasate, denudate, violentate a turno da tutti i partigiani, seviziate, schernite pubblicamente ed infine giustiziate sul posto. (line) Buona “liberazione”, figli e discendenti di queste merde (successivamente decorati al valore ed oggi riuniti nell’associazione mangiasoldi “ANPI”)	Culture	http://www.butac.it/le-rappresaglie-dei-partigiani-25-aprile/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Russian gymnasts Mom daughter and nephew Fantastic !!! (and I'm careful not to stumble when I walk 😊😊)	Ginnaste russe Mamma figlia e nipote Fantastico!!! (ed io sto attenta a non inciamparmi quando cammino 😊😊)	Culture	http://www.butac.it/le-ginnaste-russe/
Roberto Fico around Naples with his Ferrari Honesta	Roberto Fico in giro per Napoli con la sua Ferrari Honesta	Culture	http://www.butac.it/la-ferrari-di-roberto-fico/
The speech given by Bergoglio in yesterday's homily. Happy reading ... a Pope so we will never have it again!	Il discorso pronunciato da Bergoglio nell'omelia di ieri. Buona lettura...un Papa così non l'avremo mai più!	Culture	http://www.butac.it/lomelia-di-papa-francesco/
When a government does not do what the people want, it must also be thrown away with clubs and stones. - Sandro Pertini	Quando un governo non fa ciò che vuole il popolo, va cacciato via anche con mazze e pietre.	Culture	http://www.butac.it/sandro-pertini-le-citazioni-improbabili/
Unbelievable! As soon as I mentioned the word "Italia", in the plenary of the European Parliament, they disconnected the microphone. It is forbidden to talk about what is happening in Italy. Look with your eyes and spin as much as possible, we must be united ...	Incredibile! Appena ho nominato la parola "Italia", nella plenaria del Parlamento Europeo, mi hanno staccato il microfono. Vietato parlare di cosa sta succedendo in Italia. Guardate con i vostri occhi e fate girare il più possibile, dobbiamo essere uniti...	Culture	http://www.butac.it/la-censura-al-parlamento-europeo/
New tourism boom, Naples overcomes Rome for the first time	Nuovo boom del turismo, Napoli supera per la prima volta Roma	Culture	http://www.butac.it/bologna-supera-napoli-nel-turismo/
[Back to the future hoax]		Culture	http://www.butac.it/michael-j-fox-e-ritorno-al-futuro-iv/
"Bufu", the neologism of the Dark Polo Gang enters the Treccani	"Bufu", il neologismo della Dark Polo Gang entra nella Treccani	Culture	http://www.butac.it/bufu-e-la-dark-polo-gang/
The most beautiful region of Apulia in the world according to National Geographic	La Puglia regione più bella del mondo secondo National Geographic	Culture	http://www.butac.it/la-puglia-e-la-piu-bella-regione-del-mondo/
The Ignited Dialogue Between Gandhi and Professor Peters	L'Acceso Dialogo Tra Gandhi E Il Professore Peters	Culture	http://www.butac.it/gandhi-e-il-professor-peters/
Attivissimo works for the Italian Government? The case ends up in Parliament	Attivissimo lavora per il Governo italiano? Il caso finisce in Parlamento	Media	http://www.butac.it/attivissimo-lavora-governo-italiano/
Alien remains preserved in the Vatican: mystery	Resti alieni conservati in Vaticano: mistero	Media	http://www.butac.it/alieni-teschi-intrattenimento-e-fuffa/
Hello everyone, thank you for not sharing this post but just reading it and doing what is marked. Access your Facebook settings, click on "block", block users and type "Following me" without the quotes in the text box. Press "lock". You will find 15-20 people, from Asian countries, etc., that you do not know, but who follow you. We need to block them ONE BY ONE. You could avoid being hacked. Copy and paste this on your wall, do not share thanks.	Ciao a tutti, grazie per non condividere questo post ma solo di leggerlo e fare ciò che è segnato. Accedi alle tue impostazioni di Facebook, clicca su "blocco", blocca gli utenti e digita "Following me" senza le virgolette, nella casella di testo. Premere "blocca". Troverete 15-20 persone, provenienti da paesi asiatici, ecc., che non conoscete, ma che vi seguono. Bisogna bloccarle UNA PER UNA. Potreste evitare di essere hackerati. Copia e incolla questo sulla tua bacheca, non condividere grazie	Media	http://www.butac.it/following-me/

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Reporting to BUTAC on 17 August 2016: IS IT NECESSARY THAT NAPOLITAN PERCEIVES 880,000 YEARS EURO YEAR, KEEPING ALL THE BENEFITS? To the kind Beatrice who told us “screaming” we asked for a source, which never arrived. Although in the comments others reported blogs like the red pill (today closed).	Segnalazione a BUTAC del 17 agosto 2016: È VERO CHE NAPOLITANO PERCEPISCE 880MILA EURO L'ANNO, MANTENENDO TUTTI I BENEFICI? Alla gentile Beatrice che ce lo segnalava “urlando” avevamo chiesto una fonte, che non è mai arrivata. Anche se nei commenti altri segnalavano blog come la pillola rossa (oggi chiuso).	Media	http://www.butac.it/napolitano-lo-stipendio-doro-e-le-fonti/
ATMs breached with the smartphone: the new frontier of cyber attacks	Bancomat violato con lo smartphone: la nuova frontiera degli attacchi informatici	Media	http://www.butac.it/il-bancomat-scassinato-con-lo-smartphone/
[Facebook BFF hoax]	No headline	Media	http://www.butac.it/bff-e-la-sicurezza-di-facebook/
Elon Musk quits tesla to bitcoin	translated from English sources	Media	http://www.butac.it/musk-non-ha-lasciato-tesla-in-favore-di-bitcoin-code/
Tell all the contacts in your Messenger list not to accept Silvio’s friend request. He is a hacker and has connected the system to your Facebook account. If one of your contacts accepts it, you will be attacked too, so make sure all your friends know it. Steal photos and make profiles for improper use with hot activities ... Forward it as received. Hold your finger on the message. At the bottom center you will see the “forward” icon. Click on it and the list of your contacts will appear. Click on the name, send. Report Thanks.	Di a tutti i contatti della tua lista di Messenger di non accettare la richiesta di amicizia di Vinci Silvio È un hacker e ha collegato il sistema al tuo account di Facebook. Se uno dei tuoi contatti lo accetta, verrai attaccato anche tu, quindi assicurati che tutti i tuoi amici lo conoscano. Ruba foto e ne fa profili per uso improprio con attività hot... Inoltralo come ricevuto. Tieni premuto il dito sul messaggio. In basso al centro si presenterà l'icona di “inoltra”. Clicca sopra e si presenterà la lista dei tuoi contatti. Clicca sul nome, invia. Segnalate Grazie.	Media	http://www.butac.it/vinci-silvio-lhacker/
CONFESSIONS OF A BLOGGERS: My Current Employment	CONFESSIONI DI UN BLOGGERS: Il Mio Attuale Impiego Lavorativo	Media	http://www.butac.it/mr-no-la-fiction-e-la-diffamazione/
This gentleman has the stock paid for 10 years, cost about 3 million per year. With his stories (copied) and massacring the reputation of the Neapolitans, he has earned millions of euros, he bought houses in half of Europe and an attic in New York, but he still has his taxpayer pay. Exponents of the antimafia have reiterated several times that the escort does not serve Saviano ... In practice, the Camorra does not just shit.	Questo signore ha la scorta pagata da 10 anni, costo circa 3 milioni annui. Con i suoi racconti (copiati) e massacrando la reputazione dei napoletani, ha guadagnato milioni di euro, si è comprato case in mezza Europa e un attico a New York, ma si fa pagare ancora la scorta dai contribuenti. Esponenti dell’antimafia hanno ribadito più volte che la scorta non serve a Saviano... In pratica la camorra non lo caga proprio.	Media	http://www.butac.it/il-costo-della-scorta-a-saviano/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Italian headline	Code	Link
Attention is circulating one or more posts by Pinco Pallino with written private videos do not open because they are viruses .. thanks ..condividete to more I can not thanks. I know you will do so many because you are beautiful people. Thanks again friends	Attenzione è in circolazione uno o più post di Pinco Pallino con scritto private video non aprire perché sono virus.. grazie ..condividete a più non posso grazie. So che lo farete in tanti perché siete delle persone stupende. Ancora grazie amici	Media	http://www.butac.it/attenzione-private-video/
Salvini removes the escort to Saviano	SALVINI TOGLIE LA SCORTA A SAVIANO	Media	http://www.butac.it/salvini-toglie-la-scorta-a-saviano/
Sexual violence in Syria (headline) Meanwhile, according to the BBC , some Syrian women would have been abused by UN workers and other NGOs, who exchanged food and other aid with “sexual favors”. To reveal it in a British TV interview, the co-operative Danielle Spencer . (lede)	Violenze sessuali in Siria (headline) Intanto, secondo la Bbc, alcune donne siriane sarebbero state abusate da operatori dell’Onu e di altre ong, che scambiavano cibo e altri aiuti con “favori sessuali”. A svelarlo in un’intervista alla tv britannica, la cooperante Danielle Spencer. (lede)	International	http://www.butac.it/operatori-umanitari-abusano-denunciano/
(photo) China executes the death sentence of 26 corrupt politicians	(photo) La Cina esegue la condanna a morte di 26 politici corrotti	International	http://www.butac.it/i-26-politici-condannati-a-morte-in-cina/
EUROPE RISKS ANOTHER FUKUSHIMA	L’EUROPA RISCHIA UN’ALTRA FUKUSHIMA	International	http://www.butac.it/lallarmismo-sul-nucleare-in-europa/
In French supermarkets, motor oil in mayonnaise. But it is not withdrawn from the trade: Officially for “Absence of acute toxicity”	Nei supermercati francesi l’olio per motori dentro la maionese. Ma non viene ritirata dal commercio: Ufficialmente per “Assenza di tossicità acuta”	International	https://www.butac.it/maionese-fatale/
Federica Mogherini and Jyrki Katainen not to be admitted to the press conference. Europe has been destroyed by the Juncker-Selmayr political Commission.	A Federica Mogherini e Jyrki Katainen non è stato permesso da un portavoce di rispondere ad una domanda sull’Italia durante una conferenza stampa. L’Europa è stata distrutta dalla Commissione politica Juncker-Selmayr.	International	http://www.butac.it/federica-mogherini-david-carretta-e-laquarius/

APPENDIX D

GREECE

This appendix lists the disinformation headlines gathered from EllinikaHoaxes, including the original Greek headline, the research code, and the link to the debunking.

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
Unbelievable: They demolished Kazantzakis' house in Heraklion to make parking (photo)	Απίστευτο: Γκρέμισαν το σπίτι του Καζαντζάκη στο Ηράκλειο για να φτιάξουν πάρκινγκ (φωτο)	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/01/gremisan-to-spiti-toy-kazantzaki/
More than 100,000,000 Greeks around the world!	Περισσότεροι από 100.000.000 οι Έλληνες σε ολόκληρο τον κόσμο!/?	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/02/greek-diaspora/
WHO IS IT! HATE the supermarket that sued the unemployed father!	ΠΟΙΟ ΕΙΝΑΙ! ΚΡΥΒΟΥΝ το όνομα του σούπερ μάρκετ που μήνυσε τον άνεργο πατέρα!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/04/volos-syllipsi-anergoy-patera/
Satanists in Kefalonia: The family of the 23-year-old Bulgarian is shocked (and more)	Σατανιστές στην Κεφαλονιά: Σοκαρισμένη η οικογένεια της 23χρονης Βουλγάρας	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/06/oi-satanistes-tis-kefalonias/
Messi bought a Greek island	Αγόρασε ελληνικό νησί ο Μέσι	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/11/proto-messi-hoax/
Arkas for the current rally for Macedonia - PHOTO (sketch)	ΣΚΙΤΣΟ-Ο Αρκάς για το σημερινό συλλαλητήριο για τη Μακεδονία	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/24/arkas-syllaliturio/
Shock at the rally: Paralympic chairman did the Nazi salute - Next to Mikis [image]	Σοκ στο συλλαλητήριο: Ο πρόεδρος των Παραολυμπιονικών χαιρέτησε ναζιστικά -Δίπλα στον Μίκη [εικόνα]	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/04/paltsanidis-nazi-salute/
Shame from the revelations: A descendant of Nazi co-workers with a fake resume, the Foreign Minister of Kotzia!	Σάλος από τις αποκαλύψεις: Απόγονος συνεργατών των Ναζί με ψεύτικο βιογραφικό ο Υπουργός Εξωτερικών Κοτζιάς!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/07/nikos-kotzias-grandfather-nazi-collaborator-hoax/
UEFA refuses to look at disputed PAOK goal	<<Οφσάντ το γκολ του ΠΑΟΚ σύμφωνα με την UEFA>>	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/16/uefa-paok-ack-goal/
[Sly Stone death hoax]	No headline	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/19/stallone-death-2018/
Catholic Archbishop: “Pedophilia is a spiritual encounter with God”	Καθολικός Αρχιεπίσκοπος: «Η Παιδοφιλία είναι πνευματική συνάντηση με τον Θεό»	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/21/archbishop-pedophilia-spiritual/
THE HEROIC WOMEN OF OUR MILITARY STRUGGLE	ΟΙ ΗΡΩΙΔΕΣ ΓΥΝΑΙΚΕΣ ΤΩΝ ΜΑΧΙΜΩΝ ΣΤΡΑΤΙΩΤΙΚΩΝ ΜΑΣ	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/25/eidiseis-star-tv-sizigos-iptamenu/
more on the star hoax: Star will legally move against anyone responsible for “false reporting”	Το Star θα κινηθεί νομικά κατά παντός υπευθύνου για το «ψευδές ρεπορτάζ»	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/27/reportaz-star-pomens/
The poorest and most humane president died in the world	Πέθανε ο πιο φτωχός και ανθρωπίνος πρόεδρος στον κόσμο	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/09/muhica/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
XEFTILA BUTARI! ON THE DAY OF THE REMEMBRANCE OF THE GENOCIDE THEY WILL HOLD THE 2ND THESSALONIKI PRIDE!	ΞΕΦΤΙΛΑ ΜΠΟΥΤΑΡΗ! ΤΗΝ ΗΜΕΡΑ ΤΗΣ ΓΕΝΟΚΤΟΝΙΑΣ ΤΩΝ ΠΟΝΤΙΩΝ ΘΑ ΔΙΕΞΑΧΘΕΙ ΤΟ 2Ο THESSALONIKI PRIDE!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/21/fake-news-boutaris/
truckloads with munitions on docks - anarchists from france "supplied" the ruby	φορτηγα με πολεμοφοδια στα εξαρχεια – αναρχικοι απο τη γαλλια “εφοδιασαν” τον ρουβικωνα	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/25/anarxikoi-opla-gallia/
Kefalonia: Suicide “show” surveys For the death of two Germans in Lourdata	Κεφαλονιά: Αυτοκτονία «δείχνουν» οι έρευνες/Για τον θάνατο δύο Γερμανών στα Λουρδάτα	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/02/ert-pentapostagma/
The Dark Side of Oprah Winfrey: “All white elderly people must die”	Η σκοτεινή πλευρά της Όπρα Γουίνφρεϊ: «Όλοι οι λευκοί ηλικιωμένοι πρέπει να πεθάνουν»	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/09/oprah-racism/
Laconia: The visit of Billy Zane - The revelation about the parents and the Greek origin [pics]	Λακωνία: Η επίσκεψη του Billy Zane – Η αποκάλυψη για τους γονείς και την ελληνική καταγωγή του [pics]	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/24/o-billy-zane-sth-lakonia/
ERT longs for many years in Theodoros who ... are not celebrating	Η ΕΡΤ εύχεται χρόνια πολλά στους θεοδώρους που... δεν γιορτάζουν	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/17/ert-xronia-polla-stous-theodorous/
Kyriakos Mitsotakis to say at the founding conference of the Movement of Change: “As the great astrophysicist Stephen Hawking has said: to turn the sun wants a lot of work	ο Κυριάκος Μητσοτάκης να λέει στο ιδρυτικό συνέδριο του Κινήματος Αλλαγής: «Όπως είπε και ο μεγάλος αστροφυσικός Στέφαν Χόκινγκ: για να γυρίσει ο ήλιος θέλει δουλειά πολλή	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/17/tuben-mitsotakis-hawking/
UNCENSORABLE COMPLAINT ... !! We will suffer a stroke ... See AHEAD and an anti-Hellenic poem that they gave to a girl of the NURSERY SCHOOL in DRAMA ... !!!	ΑΠΙΣΤΕΥΤΗ ΚΑΤΑΓΓΕΛΙΑ...!! Θα πάθουμε κανα εγκεφαλικό... Δείτε ΑΙΣΧΡΟ και ανθελληνικό ΠΟΙΗΜΑ που έδωσαν σε κοριτσάκι του ΝΗΠΙΑΓΩΓΕΙΟΥ στην ΔΡΑΜΑ...!!!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/19/to-poiimataki-pou-dothike-se-paidi-nipiagogeiou/
Sirenakis invited Trump to Greek Porn Oscar porn! (pic) -actual headline is correct, but subhead: “They did not believe in their eyes with what they saw and read at the US Embassy in Athens ...” is incorrect	Ο Σειρηνάκης κάλεσε τον Τραμπ στα ελληνικά Όσκαρ πορνό! (pic) Δεν πίστευαν στα μάτια τους με αυτό που έβλεπαν και διάβαζαν στην προεβεία των ΗΠΑ στην Αθήνα...	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/27/seirinakis-invitation-to-trump/
Distomo. I do not forget (accompanies screenshot of Uwe Boll’s Auschwitz)	Δίστομο. Δεν ξεχνώ	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/11/distomo-nazis-photo/
Area Slaughterhouses of Thessaloniki They scatter statues and inscriptions from various parts of Greece, the media the media ... Remembrance will become the traitors, not the story !!!	Περιοχή Σφαγεία Θεσσαλονίκης... Ξηλώνουν από διάφορα μέρη της Ελλάδας αγάλματα και επιγραφές, μόκο τα ΜΜΕ... Ανάμνηση θα γίνουν οι προδότες και όχι η ιστορία!!!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/26/protomes-makedonomachon/

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
ERT presented plans with new Greek immigrants as “financial advisers and investors”.	not actual headline, behavior description	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/27/ert-ependites-tou-londinou/
THE HOLY CROSS FROM LAGADA: 7 DAYS, TENS OF THOUSANDS OF BELIEVERS, COUNTLESS MIRACLES	ΑΝΑΧΩΡΕΙ Ο ΤΙΜΙΟΣ ΣΤΑΥΡΟΣ ΑΠΟ ΛΑΓΚΑΔΑ: 7 ΗΜΕΡΕΣ, ΔΕΚΆΔΕΣ ΧΙΛΙΑΔΕΣ ΠΙΣΤΟΪ, ΑΜΈΤΡΗΤΑ ΘΑΨΜΑΤΑ	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/30/thaumata-sto-lagada/
Confirmation of Father Paisiu For 2018! His Shocking Prophecy	Επιβεβαίωση Γέροντα Παΐσιου Για Το 2018! Η Συγκλονιστική Προφητεία Του	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/06/paisios-profitia-2018/
Eleni Foureira said: “On Enver Hoxha we slept with open windows”	Είπε η Ελένη Φουρέρα: «Επί Ενβέρ Χότζα κοιμόμασταν με ανοιχτά παράθυρα»;	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/17/foureira-parathira/
(lost kid) SOS! ALARM !! DROP !! LOSSED BEFORE MINUTES THIS 12 YEARS FROM THE ABOVE GLYFADA! NOTIFY	SOS !ΣΥΝΑΓΕΡΜΟΣ!! ΔΙΑΔΩΣΤΕ!! ΧΑΘΗΚΕ ΠΡΙΝ ΛΙΓΕΣ ΩΡΕΣ ΑΥΤΟΣ Ο 12ΧΡΟΝΟΣ ΑΠΟ ΤΗΝ ΑΝΩ ΓΛΥΦΑΔΑ! ΚΟΙΝΟΠΟΙΗΣΤΕ	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/25/12xronos-ano-glyfada/
[Cannibalism club hoax]	Καννιβαλισμός ευθέως...	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/19/cannibal-club-hoax/
Unbelievable: When we say the Greek alphabet we make an ancient secret invocation! See the words ...	Απίστευτο: Όταν λέμε την ελληνική αλφάβητο κάνουμε πανάρχαια μυστική επίκληση! Δείτε τα λόγια...	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/22/greek-alphabet/
Why Arnold Schwarzenegger sleeps as homeless under his statue (Photo)	Γιατί Άρνολντ Σβαρτσενέγκερ κοιμάται ως άστεγος κάτω από το άγαλμά του (Photo)	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/23/arnolnt-sbartsenegker-koimatai-ws-astegos-katw-apo-to-agalma-toy/
Daimler Benz: Another World Comes ... Is It Reality or Is It Imagination?	Daimler Benz: Ένας Άλλος Κόσμος Έρχεται... Είναι η Πραγματικότητα ή Πρόκειται για Φαντασία;	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/14/dieter-zetsche-enas-allos-kosmos-erchete-syntoma/
Machine of Time: When Hawking participated with crutches on the historical course for Vietnam	Μηχανή του Χρόνου: Όταν ο Χόκινγκ συμμετείχε με πατερίτσες στην ιστορική πορεία για το Βιετνάμ	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/16/stephen-hawking-tariq-ali/
CREEPY! “IF YOU HAVE SUCCESSFUL TO SLABENITE, DO NOT KEEP YOU THAT HUMAN RESOURCES HUMANS RESPONDED TO THE NOVAXIC PLANS”! [like farming after death of supermarket magnate]	ΑΝΑΤΡΙΧΙΑΣΤΙΚΟ! «ΤΟΝ ΕΦΑΓΑΝ ΤΟΝ ΣΚΛΑΒΕΝΙΤΗ! ΜΗΝ ΑΝΑΡΩΤΗΣΤΕ ΠΩΣ ΦΕΥΓΟΥΝ ΣΑΝ ΚΟΤΟΠΟΥΛΑ ΥΓΙΕΙΣ ΑΝΘΡΩΠΟΙ ΠΟΥ ΑΝΤΙΣΤΕΚΟΝΤΑΙ ΣΤΑ ΝΕΟΤΑΣΕΙΚΑ ΣΧΕΔΙΑ”!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/07/thanatos-sklaveniti/
Byzantium knew about America before Columbus!	Βυζαντινοί γνώριζαν για την Αμερική πριν από τον Κολόμβο!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/21/cockaponset-byzantine-temple-hoax/

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
SKLAVENITIS takes TURKISH PRODUCTS off the shelves to show solidarity with CAPTURED SOLDIERS...!	Αυτό θα πεί Μεγάλη Μαγκιά...! Ο ΣΚΛΑΒΕΝΙΤΗΣ κατεβάζει από τα ράφια του ΤΟΥΡΚΙΚΑ ΠΡΟΪΟΝΤΑ σε ένδειξη συμπαραστάσης στους δύο ΑΙΧΜΑΛΩΤΟΥΣ Στρατιωτικούς μας...!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/12/sklavenitis-tourkika-proionta/
The speech of the Russian President in the Duma (the Russian Parliament) on tensions with minorities in Russia has caused a world-wide feeling.	Η ομιλία του Ρώσου Προέδρου στην Δούμα (το ρωσικό Κοινοβούλιο) για τις εντάσεις με τις μειονότητες στην Ρωσία προκάλεσε αίσθηση παγκοσμίως.	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/12/putin-speech-duma-hoax/
A large Russian channel has distorted Kim's image so that he looks smiling with Lavrov.	No Greek headline	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/07/photoshopped-picture-kim-jong-un/
mayor of paleo faliro wears a masonic symbol	Διονύσης Χατζηδάκης δήμαρχος Π.φαλήρου ο εμπνευστής του γλυπτού	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/04/dimarhos-masoniko-symvolo/
[Thomas Edison meme]	No headline	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/15/thomas-edisons-mom/
"The phases of the moon can affect human behavior".	«Οι φάσεις του φεγγαριού μπορεί να επηρεάσουν την ανθρώπινη συμπεριφορά».	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/16/selini/
The video that everyone has to see - Europe is at risk from migrants They can no longer hide the heavenly descent of the Greeks!	Το βίντεο που πρέπει να δουν όλοι -- Η Ευρώπη κινδυνεύει από τους μετανάστες Δεν μπορούν να κρυψουν πλέον την ουράνια καταγωγή των Ελλήνων!	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/08/ichor-greek-dna-myths/
greeks playing football	See link	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/30/episkyros/
Everyone begins and believes that the setting was set/ For those who lost the story with the smuggler who saved a child hanging from the balcony ... (French spider-man conspiracy theories)	Όλοι αρχίζουν και πιστευουν ότι σκηνικό ήταν στημένο/ Για οσους χαψανε την ιστορία με τον λαθρομεταναστη που δηθεν εσωσε ενα παιδακι που κρεμοταν απο το μπαλκονι...	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/29/mamoudou-gassama/
What is the secret of the "Ark of Gabriel" that the Russians have? (video)	Ποιο Μυστικό κρύβει η «Κιβωτός του Γαβριήλ» που έχουν οι Ρώσοι; (βίντεο)	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/15/arc-of-gabriel-hoax/
Odysseus Elytis: «The only name Macedonia is acceptable to Skopje is Pseudomadecodia .“	Οδυσσέα Ελύτι: «Το μόνο όνομα με τον όρο Μακεδονία που είναι αποδεκτό για τα Σκόπια είναι: Ψευδομακεδονία». Το είπε όμως πράγματι;	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/22/elitis-makedonia/
He has confidence in life, he knows what he does. (I) He knows what he brings, what he gets back. (I) Just find out what she wants to tell you through her actions. (I) Do not regret for anything. Never. (I) Only for inertia. (I) Konstantinos Cavafy	Έχε εμπιστοσύνη στη ζωή, ξέρει τι κάνει. (I) Ξέρει τι φέρνει, τι παίρνει πίσω. (I) Βρες μόνο τι θέλει να σου πει με τις πράξεις της. (I) Μη μετανιώσεις για τίποτα. Ποτέ. (I) Μόνο για τη αδράνεια. (I) Κωνσταντίνος Καβάφης	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/29/kavafis-epistosini/

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
“ If the Greeks gain education and unity , our aunts . Winston Churchill,1874-1965, British Prime Minister, Nobel 1953 “	Αν οι Έλληνες αποκτήσουν μόρφωση και ενότητα, αλίμονό μας. Ουίνστον Τσόρτσιλ, 1874-1965, Βρετανός Πρωθυπουργός , Νόμπελ 1953 .	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/10/tsortsil_ellinies_enotita/
poet Kosti Palama:”Patriotism is inherent, and I am a nationalist!”	Κωστή Παλαμά: « Ο Πατριωτισμός είναι έμφυτος, και εγώ είμαι εθνικιστής! »	Culture	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/20/palamas-ethnikistis/
They went to fine 500 euros in fishermen in Skopelos for ... plastic bag	Πήγαν να βάλουν πρόστιμο 500 ευρώ σε ψαρά στη Σκόπελο για την... πλαστική σακούλα	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/03/skopelos-elegktes-apeilhsan-me-prostimo-psara-epeidhden-eixe-xrewei-thn-plastikh-sakoula/
“Bomb” decision of the Athens Court of First Instance: No borrower owes nothing - What are the conditions	Απόφαση «βόμβα» του Πρωτοδικείου Αθηνών: Κανείς δανειολήπτης δεν οφείλει τίποτα – Ποιες οι προϋποθέσεις	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/29/protodikio_athinon/
The banker who reveals the shocking truth that is hidden from us! (VIDEO)	Ο τραπεζίτης που αποκαλύπτει την σοκαριστική αλήθεια που μας κρύβουν! (BİNTEO)	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/06/banker-truth-hoax/
TODAY EXTRACT - They sacked a SYRIZA MP and sent him a hospital ... TO HELP YOUR HANDS OF MY PALICARI ... !!/ Farmers pushed the SYRIZA MP, Ayhan Karayushuff	ΤΩΡΑ ΕΚΤΑΚΤΟ – Έπεσαν σφαλιάρες σε Βουλευτή Του ΣΥΡΙΖΑ και τον έστειλαν Νοσοκομείο... ΝΑ ΑΓΙΑΣΟΥΝ ΤΑ ΧΕΡΙΑ ΣΟΥ ΠΑΛΙΚΑΡΙ ΜΟΥ ... !!/ Αγρότες προηπλάκισαν τον βουλευτή του ΣΥΡΙΖΑ, Αϊχάν Καραγιουσούφ	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/13/karagiousouf/
The accounts of the Governor of the Bank of Greece, Giannis Stournaras and his wife, were pledged by the Prosecutor’s Office as a result of the Novartis case	Δεσμεύτηκαν ο λογαριασμοί του διοικητή της ΤτΕ Γιάννη Στουρνάρα και της συζύγου του με εντολή των εισαγγελικών αρχών λόγω της υπόθεσης Novartis	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/07/trapezikoi-logariasmoi-giannis-stournaras/
Resignation-BOMBA at Maxim’s request	Παραίτηση-BOMBA με απαίτηση του Μαξίμου	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/10/paraitisi-kostas-athanasiou/
[controversy over media licensing fees]		Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/15/pseydis-cidisi-gia-ta-dikaiomata-sta-domatia-xenodocheion/
This is a kitten position ... Special Associate to Minister for African Dust	Αυτή είναι θέση γατάκια... Ειδικός συνεργάτης σε υπουργό για την αφρικανική σκονη - Είπατε κάτι;	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/28/eidikos-epi-thematon-afrikanikis-skonis/
D. Vitsas defames the Armed Forces and calls them “kittens” (video)	Ο Δ. Βίτσας απαξιώνει τις Ένοπλες Δυνάμεις και τις αποκαλεί «γατάκια» (βίντεο)	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/25/vitsas-diloseis/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
Disclosure: “Build” the resume of Peristera Baziana	Αποκάλυψη: «Χτίζουν» το βιογραφικό της Περιστεράς Μπαζιάνα	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/01/peristera-baziana-erevna-apnia/
Three-year imprisonment for Artemis Sora – Can pay and be released	Ποινή φυλάκισης τριών ετών για τον Αρτέμη Σώρρα - Μπορεί να την εξαγοράσει και να αφεθεί ελεύθερος	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/09/free-sorras/
Greek police to citizens: If robbers break into your house ... pretend to be asleep	Ελληνική αστυνομία σε πολίτες: Αν μπουν ληστές σπίτι σας... κάντε ότι κοιμάστε	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/04/burglary-tips/
OPENING THE ROAD FOR SKIMMED MEAT AT SUPER MARKET OF GREECE!	ΑΝΟΙΓΕΙ Ο ΔΡΟΜΟΣ ΓΙΑ ΣΚΥΛΙΣΙΟ ΚΡΕΑΣ ΣΤΑ ΣΟΥΠΕΡ ΜΑΡΚΕΤ ΤΗΣ ΕΛΛΑΔΑΣ!	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/22/skilisio-kreas-sta-super-markets/
“BOMBA”: Hotels do not owe rights to TVs in the rooms “	«Απόφαση «BOMBA» : Τα ξενοδοχεία δεν οφείλουν δικαιώματα για τις τηλεοράσεις στα δωμάτια»	Governance	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/17/telos-acpi-gea-dionysos-apo-ta-domatia-ton-xenodoxeion/
BROMEROS BUTARIS HAS DECIDED TO HELP MIGRANTS IN THE HELLENIC HOUSES OF THE BANKS!/ (thessniki mayor housing refugees in abandoned houses)	Ο ΒΡΩΜΕΡΟΣ ΜΠΟΥΤΑΡΗΣ ΑΠΟΦΑΣΙΣΕ ΝΑ ΣΤΕΓΑΣΕΙ «ΜΕΤΑΝΑΣΤΕΣ» ΣΤΑ ΣΠΙΤΙΑ ΤΩΝ ΕΛΛΗΝΩΝ ΠΟΥ ΘΑ ΚΑΤΑΣΧΟΥΝ ΟΙ ΤΡΑΠΕΖΕΣ!	Social Issues -Immigration	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/27/boutaris-migrants-houses/
Unbelievable! A breeder catches the “leeches” immigrants in Lesbos to slaughter his animals - You will not believe what followed (VIDEO)	Απίστευτο! Κτηνοτρόφος πιάνει στα «πράσα» μετανάστες στη Λέσβο να σφάζουν τα ζώα του – Δεν θα πιστεύετε τι ακολούθησε (BΙΝΤΕΟ)	Social Issues -Immigration	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/19/ktinotrofos-piani-sta-prasa-metanastes-na-sfazoun-ta-zoana-tou/
Emergency: Evacuation of Imia as Turkish warships and Coast Guard ships surround it	ΕΚΤΑΚΤΟ: Ναυτικό αποκλεισμό των Ιμιών με συγκέντρωση πολλών πολεμικών πλοίων και σκαφών της Ακτοφυλακής επιχειρεί τώρα η Τουρκία	Social Issues -Immigration	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/18/efes-2018-activity-not-related-to-alleged-presence-of-turkish-ships-in-imia/
850,000 “Greekizations” for voting purposes	850.000 «ελληνοποιήσεις» για ψηφοθηρικούς σκοπούς	Social Issues -Immigration	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/23/greek-citizenship-850000-migrants/
Shame! Pakistani officials of Boutaris are ripping posters for the rally	Ντροπή! Πακιστανοί υπάλληλοι του Μπουτάρη σχίζουν αφίσες για το συλλαλητήριο (translated); ΤΙ ΣΥΜΒΑΙΝΕΙ ΕΔΩ;; Πακιστανός με διακριτικά του Δ. Θεσσαλονίκης κατεβάζει αφίσες για το συλλαλητήριο! Ο Μπουτάρης τον έβαλε;;; (most common, but doesn't translate)	Social Issues -Immigration	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/22/pakistanos-afises/
SyriaLittle girl keeps the eyes of her doll closed not to see the horror	Συρία... Κοριτσάκι κρατάει τα μάτια της κούκλας του κλειστά να μην βλέπει τη φρίκη	Social Issues -Immigration	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/01/to-koritsaki-me-tin-koukla/

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
Shock with the 4-year-old Syrian refugee in the desert-He was carrying the clothes of his dead mother and sister (PHOTO)	Σοκ με τον 4χρονο Σύριο πρόσφυγα στην έρημο-Κουβαλούσε τα ρούχα της νεκρής μητέρας και αδερφής του (ΦΩΤΟ)	Social Issues -Immigration	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/20/unhcr-boy-dessert/
Video to Everyone - Europe is at risk from immigrants [video] (Muslims attacking citizens and cars in Birmingham, England)	Το βίντεο που πρέπει να δουν όλοι -- Η Ευρώπη κινδυνεύει από τους μετανάστες	Social Issues -Immigration	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/10/i-eyropi-kindynevei-apo-toys-metanastes/
Murder attack in the center of Athens by Muslims in 3 immigrants who became Christians! (HARD IMAGES)	Δολοφονική επίθεση στο κέντρο της Αθήνας από μουσουλμάνους σε 3 μετανάστες που έγιναν χριστιανοί! (ΣΚΛΗΡΕΣ ΕΙΚΟΝΕΣ)	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/11/dolofoniki-epithesi-kentro-athinas/
Islamic immigrants attack a Catholic church in France at the time of operation	Ισλαμιστές μετανάστες επιτίθενται σε εκκλησία καθολικών στην Γαλλία την ώρα της λειτουργίας	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/27/islamic-migrants-attack-french-church/
Is ISIS Head of Office identified in Mytilene?	Εντοπίστηκε αποκεφαλιστής του ISIS στην Μυτιλήνη;	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/19/isis-mytilini/
Prosecution for abuse of power was brought to the mufti of Komotini	Δίωξη για κατάχρηση εξουσίας ασκήθηκε στον μουφτή της Κομοτηνής	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/11/dioksi-gia-kataxrisi-eksousias-ston-moufti-tis-komotinis/
Shock image - By bus sign in Arabic sign in Mytilene - Out of control situation (photo on facebook)	Εικόνα σοκ – Με αραβική ταμπέλα κυκλοφορούν τα λεωφορεία στην Μυτιλήνη – Εκτός ελέγχου η κατάσταση	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/04/lesvos-epigrafi-leoforeiou/
fb comment: The Muslims in Manchester protested by asking that the English should not walk with dogs on the road because it is against Shari'ah, a lack of respect for Islam and offending them !! She again attacks me when they do not respect my dogs !! The difference is that I can not make a demonstration about it in Saudi Arabia !! Eventually something goes wrong with multiculturalism !!!!! blog headline: they come to the house of the other to make a commune and enforce their Shari'ah! Without any respect for the customs of the host country.	fb: Οι Μουσουλμάνοι στο Manchester διαδήλωσαν ζητώντας να μην περπατούν οι Άγγλοι με σκυλιά στον δρόμο γιατί είναι αντίθετο στην Σαρία, αποτελεί έλλειψη σεβασμού προς το Ισλάμ και τους προσβάλλει!! Εμένα πάλι με προσβάλλει όταν δεν σέβονται τα σκυλιά μου!! Η διαφορά είναι ότι δεν μπορώ να κάνω διαδήλωση για αυτό στην Σαουδική Αραβία!! Τελικά κάτι δεν πάει καλά με την πολυπολιτισμικότητα!!!! blog headline: ρχονται στο σπίτι του αλλοιου να κανουν και κουμάντο και να επιβάλλουν την Σαρία τους! Χωρίς κανέναν σεβασμό στα ήθη και στα έθιμα των ανθρώπων της χώρας που τους φιλοξενεί .	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/14/muslim-ban-dogs/
A migrant Muslim destroys a statue because [it shows a nudity]	Μουσουλμάνος μετανάστης καταστρέφει άγαλμα επειδή παρουσιάζει γυμνό	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/03/matanastis-katastrefei-agalma-stin-italia/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
They photographed a power of love player with a burka! UNKNOWN Turkish propaganda through the reality of Ska! #powerofloveGr	Φωτογράρισαν παιχτρια του power of love με μπούρκα! ΑΠΙΣΤΕΥΤΗ τουρκική προπαγάνδα μέσω του reality του Σκα! #powerofloveGr	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/04/09/anna-loreni-burka/
A Muslim in Thrace wears a scarf with ... sting! (pic)/ Shock in Thrace! See what the Muslims wear under their headscarf and robe!	Μουσουλμάνα στην Θράκη φοράει μαντήλα με... στρινγκ! (pic), ΣΟΚ στη Θράκη! Δείτε τι φοράνε οι μουσουλμάνες κάτω από την μαντίλα και την ρόμπα τους!	Social Issues -Islam	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/04/28/muslim-woman-with-thong-not-from-greece/
Times: Greek women are selling sex for a cheese pie because of a crisis/GREECE 2018-SEX FOR A SANDWICH PRICE (Video)	Times: Οι Ελληνίδες φοιτήτριες πουλάνε σεξ για μια τυρόπιτα λόγω κρίσης/ΕΛΛΑΔΑ 2018-ΣΕΞ ΓΙΑ ΤΗ ΤΙΜΗ ΕΝΟΣ ΣΑΝΤΟΥΙΤΣ(Βίντεο)	Social Issues -Gender	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/05/11/fake-news-greek-girl-sells-virginity/
19 year old Greek woman is auctioning her ... virginity! (PHOTO)	19χρονη Ελληνίδα βγάζει σε πλειστηριασμό την... παρθενιά της! (ΦΩΤΟ)	Social Issues -Gender	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/05/11/fake-news-greek-girl-sells-virginity/
Teacher in Lesvos decided to dress with skirts boys of the Sixth Grade Primary School	Δασκάλα στη Λέσβο αποφάσισε να ντύσει με φούστες τα αγόρια της Έκτης τάξης δημοτικού	Social Issues -Gender	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/05/19/daskala-sti-lesvo-ntysei-me-foystes-ta-agoria/
Specialist warns: Sex robots can be "chaffed" and kill you	Ειδικός προειδοποιεί: Τα ρομπότ του σεξ μπορούν να «χακαριστούν» και να σας σκοτώσουν	Social Issues -Gender	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/01/03/killer-sex-bots/
Experts warn: Keep mobiles away from your body and especially away from children	Οι ειδικοί προειδοποιούν: Κρατήστε τα κινητά μακριά από το σώμα σας και κυρίως μακριά από τα παιδιά	Social Issues -Gender	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/01/07/oi-eidikoi-proeidopoioun-kratiste-ta-kinita-makria/
Putin takes back the recognition of Skopje/ V. Putin to Greece: "We are taking back the recognition of Macedonia as Macedonia"	Ο Πούτιν παίρνει πίσω την αναγνώριση των Σκοπίων/ Β.Πούτιν προς Ελλάδα: «Παίρνουμε πίσω την αναγνώριση της ΠΓΔΜ ως Μακεδονία»	Intl Rel	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/01/18/poutin-pernoume-piso-tin-anagnorisi-tis-pgdm-os-makedonia/
President Trump sent George Soros to...turmoil!	Ο Πρόεδρος Τραμπ μόλις έστειλε τον Τζορτζ Σόρος στον... αγύριστο!	Intl Rel	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/02/04/trump-soros-davos-hoax/
Shock: CHO: VETO to NATO-EU. from Bulgaria for the name "Macedonia"! Everything changes ...	ΣΟΚ: ΒΕΤΟ σε NATO-E.E. από Βουλγαρία για το όνομα «Μακεδονία»! Αλλάζουν όλα...	Intl Rel	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/02/07/bulgaria-fyrom-name-dispute-hoax/
The Greek army of the Turkish army scared / Greek press: We cannot deal with the Turk	Türk ordusunun silahı Yunanlıları korkuttu/Yunan basını: Türklerle başa çıkamayız	Intl Rel	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/02/15/turkish-fake-news-about-ptisi-diastima/
Exclusive testimony: They "took" them out of the outpost! (concerning Turkey arresting two Greek soldiers)	Αποκλειστική μαρτυρία: Τους «πήραν» από το φυλάκιο!	Intl Rel	http://ellinkahoaxes.gr/2018/03/06/ellines-stratiotiko/

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
Greece and Cyprus buying russian weapons	(Appeared in Turkish Sputnik) Putin'in yardımcısı Kojin: Yunanistan'la Kıbrıs, Rusya'yla yeni silah görüşmeleri yapılıyor	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/13/fake-news-weapons/
Trump "sent out" Matt Damon from the US	Ο Τραμπ «έδωξε» τον Μπ Ντέιμον από τις ΗΠΑ	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/17/o-matt-damon-metakomizei-stin-australia/
"Red" from Berlin to the F-16 upgrade: "The last thing Greece needs is an armament program"	«Κόκκινο» από Βερολίνο στην αναβάθμιση των F-16: «Το τελευταίο που χρειάζεται η Ελλάδα είναι ένα εξοπλιστικό πρόγραμμα»	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/09/anavathmisi-f16/
HOW THE BOTTOM PROPAGANDS ARE FALLING The studio is set and ready (white helmets)	ΠΩΣ ΣΤΗΝΕΤΑΙ Η ΒΡΩΜΙΚΗ ΠΡΟΠΑΓΑΝΔΑ Το στούντιο είναι στημένο και έτοιμο	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/16/white-helmet-false-flag-operation-debunked/
Medical drugs sent to Cuba in Syria by two-tonne drugs in imperialist bombs/ Cuba sends vaccines and medicines to Syria	Γιατρικά στις βόμβες των ιμπεριαλιστών-2 τόνους φάρμακα στέλνει η Κούβα στη Συρία/ Η Κούβα στέλνει εμβόλια και φάρμακα στη Συρία	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/21/did-cuba-sent-huge-medical-help-to-syria/
Russia says Douma chemical attack was staged	Появились новые свидетельства того, что химическая атака в сирийской Думе была инсценировкой	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/25/channel-one-uses-old-pics-as-proof-for-staged-chemical-attack-in-douma/
The camps maze of Kammenos / The Minister who declared that anyone who pushes Greek territory will disappear, set up a whole business of deceiving the Turks to reach the same Greek territory. And it gave Turkey a chance to set up a small show in the world news reports	Οι τσάμπα μαγκιές του Καμμένου/Ο υπουργός που δήλωνε ότι όποιος πατήσει ελληνικό έδαφος θα εξαφανιστεί, έστησε ολόκληρη επιχείρηση παραπλάνησης των Τούρκων για να προσεγγίσει ο ίδιος ελληνικό έδαφος. Και έδωσε την αφορμή στην Τουρκία να στήσει ένα μικρό σόου στα δελτία ειδήσεων του πλανήτη	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/29/kammenos-stafani-imia/
DRAWING MAP, YOU REMEMBER NOTHING ??? This is one of the notes by F.Y.R.O.M. is circulating, does the picture remind you of anything ????	ΧΑΡΤΟΝΟΜΙΣΜΑ ΣΚΟΠΙΩΝ, ΣΑΣ ΘΥΜΙΖΕΙ ΤΙΠΟΤΑ;;; This is one of the notes F.Y.R.O.M. is circulating, does the picture remind you of anything????	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/14/chartonomisma-tis-fyrom/
Images of the military scene in Evros! The Turkish army develops tanks and infantry	Εικόνες πολεμικού σκηνικού και στον Έβρο! Αναπτύσσεται με τανκς και πεζικό ο τουρκικός στρατός	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/16/perase-ton-evro-o-tourkikos-stratos/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
Turkish soldiers are running and kicking Kurdish mistresses in Afrin! (video)	Τούρκοι στρατιώτες εκτελούν και κλωτσούν Κούρδισσες μαχήτριες στο Αφρίν! (video)/Τούρκοι εκτελούν Κούρδισσες μαχήτριες – Τις πετούν με κλωτσιές μέσα σε λάκκο	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/19/tourkoi-stratiwtes-ekteloun-2-gunaikes-ths-kourdikis-politifilakis/
IN ONE DAY 31 TURKISH SOLDIERS DEAD (video)	ΣΕ ΜΙΑ ΜΕΡΑ ΣΚΛΗΡΩΝ ΜΑΧΩΝ 31 ΤΟΥΡΚΟΙ ΣΤΡΑΤΙΩΤΕΣ ΝΕΚΡΟΙ (βίντεο)	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/01/turkish-casualties-afirin/
Turkish government spokesman: Greek soldiers are also accused of spying	Τούρκος κυβερνητικός εκπρόσωπος: Κατηγορούνται και για κατασκοπεία οι Έλληνες στρατιωτικοί	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/05/kataskopeia-duo-ellines/
One of the issues that are of concern in recent days is the presence of naval units in the Cypriot EEZ to protect the two ExxonMobil vessels that will carry out hydrocarbon searches on plot 10. (fb post featured on page, various headlines with headlines found on page)	Ένα από τα θέματα που απασχολούν την επικαιρότητα κατά κόρον αυτές τις ημέρες, είναι η παρουσία ναυτικών μονάδων στη κυπριακή ΑΟΖ για τη προστασία των δυο σκαφών της ExxonMobil που θα εκτελέσουν έρευνες για υδρογονάνθρακες στο οικόπεδο 10.	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/09/6th-fleet-cyprus-eez/
EXCLUSIVE: FINALLY BODY THE TURKISH HOSPITAL IN AFRINE OR NOT (not many Greek headlines, actually a discussion about sources in Turkish and English, concerning the destruction of a hospital in Afrin	ΑΠΟΚΛΕΙΣΤΙΚΟ: ΤΕΛΙΚΑ ΒΟΜΒΑΡΔΙΣΑΝ ΟΙ ΤΟΥΡΚΟΙ ΝΟΣΟΚΟΜΕΙΟ ΣΤΟ ΑΦΡΙΝ Η ΟΧΙ	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/17/afirin-hospital-bombed-or-not/
“Sudden movement of a Patriot rocket array in Attica”	«Ξαφνικής μετακίνηση συστοιχίας πυραύλων Πάτριος στην Αττική»	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/30/metakinisis-toixias-patriot/
Emergency: Evacuation of Imia as Turkish warships and Coast Guard surround it	ΕΚΤΑΚΤΟ: Ναυτικό αποκλεισμό των Ιμιών με συγκέντρωση πολλών πολεμικών πλοίων και σκαφών της Ακτοφυλακής επιχειρεί τώρα η Τουρκία	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/18/efes-2018-activity-not-related-to-alleged-presence-of-turkish-ships-in-imia/
“Salai”, Turkey’s new super-weapon: Underwater drone not detected [video]	«Σαλάι», το νέο υπερ-όπλο της Τουρκίας: Υποβρύχιο drone που δεν ανιχνεύεται [βίντεο]	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/24/wattozz/
Document - documentary about the fall of Mirage and the death of the shooter: Skyros radio was out of order!	Έγγραφο - ντοκουμέντο για την πτώση του Mirage και τον θάνατο του σηναγού: Ο ραδιοφάρος της Σκύρου ήταν εκτός λειτουργίας!	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/26/mirage2000-mpaltadoros-kai-to-vor/
EXTRACT- F-35 Ankara End! Formal cessation of arms sales to Turkey by the US	ΕΚΤΑΚΤΟ- F-35 τέλος για Αγκυρα! Επίσημα παύση των πωλήσεων όπλων στην Τουρκία από τις ΗΠΑ	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/05/american-embargo-for-turkish-f35s/
“Battles” in Pisoderi with dozens of wounded - Woman in coma [after Macedonia agreement]	Μάχες” σώμα με σώμα στο Πισοδέρι με δεκάδες τραυματίες – Γυναίκα σε κώμα	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/17/nekros-sta-episodia-sto-pisoderi/

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
IN PRESPESES THEY USE RUBBER BULLETS. WATCH THE VIDEO [police used plastic bullets in protest of Macedonia agreement]	ΣΤΙΣ ΠΡΕΣΠΕΣ ΡΙΧΝΟΥΝ ΚΑΙ ΠΛΑΣΤΙΚΕΣ ΣΦΑΙΡΕΣ. ΔΕΙΤΕ ΤΟ ΒΙΝΤΕΟ	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/17/nekros-sta-episodes-to-pisoderi/
Macedonian media: Fights between Greeks and Skopje in a handball match	ΜΜΕ ΠΓΔΜ: Συμπλοκές μεταξύ Ελλήνων και Σκοπιανών σε αγώνα χάντμπολ	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/22/sumplokas-metaxu-ellinon-kai-skopianon/
Stadium “froze”: Hitler appeared in a World Cup game!	«Πάγωσε» το γήπεδο: Ο Χίτλερ εμφανίστηκε σε παιχνίδι του Μουντιάλ!	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/23/o-hitler-emfanistike-se-painnidi-tou-moudial/
Skopje gain access to the Thermaic-Greek EEZ - Implementation of the German plan for independent Macedonia of the Aegean	Τα Σκόπια αποκτούν πρόσβαση σε Θερμαϊκό-ελληνική ΑΟΖ – Υλοποιείται το γερμανικό σχέδιο για ανεξάρτητη Μακεδονία του Αιγαίου	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/15/ta-skopia-apoktoyn-prosvasi-stin-elliniki-aoz/
From the textbooks of the junta. Wow patriots (From Jung’s book) map of macedonia	Από τα σχολικά βιβλία της χούντας. Πω πω πατριώτες	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/20/sxoliko-vivlio-hounta/
Shock from Germany after signing Tsipras: Prepare for the “union” of Macedonia - See the map of state DW	Σοκ από την Γερμανία μετά την υπογραφή Τσίπρα: Ετοιμάζουν «ένωση» της Μακεδονίας - Δείτε τον χάρτη της κρατικής DW	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/25/dw-macedonia/
P. Bommen: We remain in the 1992 national post (“if the Skopjans really want a solution, they will have to do what England has done to join the EEC and at the request of the President of France, Gall, changed its name from ‘Great Britain’ to ‘United Kingdom’.)	Π. Καμμένος: Παραμένουμε στην εθνική θέση του 1992	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/01/31/great-britain-ec-c-veto/
Iranian official: The West used lizards like spies (article dispels Iranian claim)	Ιρανόσ αξιωματούχος: Η Δύση χρησιμοποίησε σαύρες σαν κατασκόπους	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/17/iran-lizard-spies/
This video proves that: “In 48 hours the Hellenic Air Force will knead the Turkish war machine” - See what happened	Το βίντεο αυτό αποδεικνύει ότι : «Σε 48 ώρες η Ελληνική Πολεμική Αεροπορία θα γονατίσει την τουρκική πολεμική μηχανή» – Δείτε τι έγινε	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/26/f16-vs-mirage/
Macedonians changed the name of a motorway from “Alexander of Macedonia” to “former Alexander of Macedonia”	«Αλέξανδρος της Μακεδονίας» σε «πρώην Αλέξανδρος της Μακεδονίας».	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/02/27/gyrom-highway-name/
A Syrian archaeologist and his wife cries seeing the stolen treasures of Syria in a museum of Berlin!	Συριασ αρχαιολογος και η γυναικα του κλαινε βλεποντας τους κλεμμενους θησαυρους της Συριας σε μουσειο του βερολινου !!	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/03/31/syrios-arxaiologos/
Turkish Electronic War Weapon - This “Blind” the Batoro Mirage 2000-5? (video caption)	Τουρκικό Όπλο Ηλεκτρονικού Πολέμου - Αυτό «Τύφλωσε» το Mirage 2000-5 του Μπαταδώρου;	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/04/23/velopoulos-mirage2000/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Translated headline	Greek Headline	Code	Link
The F-16 Viper in a spectacular show in Rhodes - VIDEO	Το F-16 Viper σε μία φαντασμαγορική εμφάνιση στη Ρόδο - BINTEO	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/01/f16-viper-demo-team-not-in-rhodes-but-in-rhode-island/
Did Israel beat a nuclear bomb? A 2.6-inch earthquake was recorded in the area. (Israel attacks Iran)	Κτύπησε με πυρηνική βόμβα το Ισραήλ ; Καταγράφηκε σεισμός 2,6 ρίχτερ στην περιοχή.	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/03/nuclear-explosion-in-brigade-47/
An 8-year-old girl with fearless looks and unprecedented vigor defends his injured mom with a fork by the Israeli soldier. This is what distinguishes a people fighting for a homeland by a nation that steals homelands and enforced with the power of weapons ...	Ένα 8χρονο κοριτσάκι με ατρόμητο βλέμμα και πρωτόγνωρο σθένος υπερασπίζεται με ένα πιρούνι την τραυματισμένη του μάνα από τον Ισραηλινό στρατιώτη. Αυτό είναι που ξεχωρίζει έναν λαό που παλεύει για μια πατρίδα από έναν λαό που κλέβει πατρίδες και επιβάλλεται με την ισχύ των όπλων...	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/05/24/velopoulos-atairiastoi/
Skopje has already released the new passport and writes «North Macedonia»	Στα Σκόπια κυκλοφόρησε ήδη το νέο διαβατήριο και γράφει «Βόρεια Μακεδονία»	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/20/fyrom-passport/
SEEBRIG Brigade – Masonic Police in Greece. It is very important that the Greeks learn that we have evidence of an occupying army	Η Ταξιαρχία SEEBRIG - Η αστυνομία της μασονίας στην Ελλάδα. Είναι πολύ σημαντικό να μάθουν οι έλληνες ότι έχουμε πια στρατό κατοχής με αποδείξεις	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/19/seebrig-fake-news/
Blackwater is in Greece to protect the government - They are afraid of a rebellion	Η Blackwater βρίσκεται στην Ελλάδα για την προστασία της κυβέρνησης – Φοβούνται εξέγερση	Intl Rel	http://ellinikahoaxes.gr/2018/06/23/blacwater-greece-debunking/

APPENDIX E

UKRAINE STOPFAKE

This section provides a list of headlines gathered from StopFake in Ukraine. It also includes the code the article was assigned for research and the link to the debunking.

Headline	Code	Link
In Ukraine, the increase in the financial support to the military was postponed until 2019	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-postpones-salary-increases-for-military-for-a-year/
Hepatitis A epidemic quickly spreading in Ukraine	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-hepatitis-a-epidemic-in-ukraine/
AIDS From Donbas Sweeping Ukraine	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-aids-from-donbas-sweeping-ukraine/
Ukraine admits that Russian gas imports are profitable	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-admits-russian-gas-imports-profitable/
Ukraine lost half of GDP due to Western sanctions against Russia	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-loses-50-of-its-gdp-to-russia-sanctions/
Large numbers of Ukrainians seeking asylum in Europe	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-since-2014-1-7-million-ukrainians-asked-for-asylum-in-russia/
Ukrainians pretend to be gay for the sake of asylum in Europe	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/russian-agitprop-ukrainians-pass-as-gay-or-communist-to-gain-asylum-in-europe/
“There was no compromise”: how Ukraine intends to compensate for the lack of IMF loans	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-imf-and-kyiv-fail-to-compromise-on-ukraine-aid/
The Ukrainian government has decided to export Ukrainians’ blood	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-blood-for-sale/
Ukraine recognized that the APU can not master American weapons	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-ukrainian-military-can-t-handle-american-weapons/
Ukraine to become nuclear waste dump	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-to-become-nuclear-waste-dump/
Ukrainian sailors threaten Poroshenko with a return to the Crimea	Weak Ukraine	manipulation: https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-ukrainian-sailors-threaten-to-return-to-crimea/
Ukraine recognizes it cannot return Crimea	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-recognizes-it-cannot-return-crimea/
In the DNR reported losses of APU when trying to break through in the Gorlovka area	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-military-suffer-losses-in-eastern-ukraine/
Volcker acknowledged the inability of Kiev to return the Crimea and Donbas	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-kurt-volker-acknowledges-ukraine-unable-to-return-crimea-and-donbas/
(distortion) Ukrainian border guards recognized the superiority of Russia on the Sea of Azov	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/distortion-ukraine-s-border-defense-powerless-on-the-azov-sea/
The soldier of the APU surrendered to militiamen because of the constant drunkenness of his colleagues	Weak Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-soldier-willingly-joins-separatists/
Ukrainians Being Massively Deported from EU and Israel	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainians-being-massively-deported-from-eu-and-israel/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Headline	Code	Link
European Union Seeks To Improve Relations with Russia At Any Cost	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-european-union-seeks-to-improve-relations-with-russia-at-any-cost/
EU Bans Milk Sales from Private Ukrainian Farms	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-eu-bans-milk-sales-from-private-ukrainian-farms/
Azarov: Prices for products in Ukraine and in Europe are almost equal	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-food-prices-nearly-equal-eu-levels/
European gas in Ukraine is four times more expensive than Russian gas	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-european-gas-costs-ukraine-four-times-more-than-russian-gas/
European Court says not to pay Donbas seniors	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-europe-denies-donbas-pensions/
The United Nations recognized the Russian telephone code for the Crimea	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-un-recognizes-russian-telephone-code-for-crimea/
OSCE Declares Russian Presidential Elections Open and Fair	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-osce-declares-russian-presidential-elections-open-and-fair/
Peskov said that the US treats the conflict in the Donbass as an intra-Ukrainian	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-us-considers-donbas-war-an-internal-ukrainian-matter/
WSJ: Germany will ask the US to release it from sanctions against Russia	Institutions	manipulation: https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-germany-asks-us-to-ease-russia-sanctions/
Naftogaz loses to Gazprom in EU Court	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-naftogaz-loses-to-gazprom-in-eu-court/
The first time in history that a European and Italian institution recognizes the provisions of an institution of the republics of the # Donbass : it happens at the University of # Torino .	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-university-of-turin-recognizes-so-called-donetsk-people-s-republic-diplomas/
The Champions League final in Kiev risks going without the European fans/Thousands of fans of “Real” and “Liverpool” refused tickets for the Champions League final because of the price hike in Kiev	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-madrid-and-liverpool-fans-returning-champions-league-tickets-in-thousands-due-to-kyiv-price-hikes/
NATO Service Members Killed in Eastern Ukraine	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-nato-soldiers-killed-in-donbas/
(manipulation) CIS Executive Committee: No official documents from Ukraine on withdrawal from the organization have been received	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-problems-awaiting-ukraine-after-cis-exodus/
(manipulation) The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Russia was told about the destabilizing character of NATO expansion in the Balkans	Institutions	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-nato-expansion-destabilizes-europe/
How Ukraine became the leader in anti-Semitism	Persecution	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-leads-in-anti-semitism/
“Theft at a high level”: The US State Department has stated about corruption and human rights violations in Ukraine	Persecution	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-leads-in-human-rights-violations/
President Poroshenko proposes Crimeans be deprived of Ukrainian citizenship	Persecution	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-president-poroshenko-proposes-crimeans-be-deprived-of-ukrainian-citizenship/
Suddenly, US criticises Ukraine for Nazism and anti-Semitism	Persecution	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-upsurge-of-anti-semitism-in-ukraine/

Headline	Code	Link
Ukraine this year ignored all the requests of the People's Democratic Republic of Germany and the People's Republic of Germany on prisoners	Persecution	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-kyiv-breaks-talks-on-prisoner-exchange-with-occupied-territories/
US bans 155 Ukrainian imports due to political situation	Persecution	https://www.kyivpost.com/ukraine-politics/stop-fake-us-bans-155-ukrainian-imports-due-political-situation-fake.html
Ukraine boasted of a drought in the Crimea	Persecution	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-boasts-about-crimea-drought/
“Neo-Nazi party and anti-Semite”: the arrival of Andry Parouby in Paris unworthy of deputies (REPORTAGE) french headline	Persecution	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-parliamentary-speaker-called-neo-nazi-and-anti-semite/
Former Russian radio host approved ethnic cleansing in Donbass	Persecution	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-former-russian-radio-host-advocates-ethnic-cleansing-in-donbas/
Ukraine involved in Syria attacks on Russian bases	Russophobia	https://www.stopfake.org/en/russia-accuses-ukraine-of-involvement-in-syria-attacks-on-russian-bases/
Venetian Commission: Russian language in Ukraine is in the worst position	Russophobia	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-russian-language-woes-in-ukraine/
Media: Members of “Right Sector” beat Russians peacefully sitting in cafe in Athens	Russophobia	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-right-sector-radicals-attack-peaceful-russians-in-athens/
In Ukraine, they decided to force Crimeans and residents of Donbass to repent	Russophobia	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-to-force-crimea-and-donbas-residents-to-repent/
Flight safety office in UK apologizes for Russian plane search in Heathrow – Moscow	Russophobia	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-london-apologizes-for-aeroflot-border-force-search/
The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Russia announced the availability of “Russophobic stereotypes” in the State Department’s report on human rights	Russophobia	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-leads-in-human-rights-violations/
Ukraine involved in Syria attacks on Russian bases	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/russia-accuses-ukraine-of-involvement-in-syria-attacks-on-russian-bases/
Train from Ukraine Arrives In Russia Loaded With Mines	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-train-from-ukraine-arrives-in-russia-loaded-with-mines/
Ukrainian military fired on a passenger bus in Donbas	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-military-shoot-passenger-bus-in-donbas/
The fighters of the APU refused to greet the words “Glory to Ukraine”	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-glory-to-ukraine-is-a-nazi-greeting/
Ukraine trains terrorists for European and Middle East operations	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-training-terrorists-for-european-and-middle-east-operations/
Ukraine is preparing for a full war with Russia	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-readies-army-and-nationalists-for-war/
General Staff of Ukraine: APU will go to the Crimea	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-s-military-command-announces-punitive-donbas-campaign-and-crimea-offensive/
Ukrainian special services prepare provocation for Easter holidays at the crossing point “Stanitsa Luganskaya”	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-preparing-provocations-on-border-with-occupied-luhansk/
OSCE Co-ordinator leaves session in Minsk because of threats of Kiev politicians	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-osce-walk-out-on-donbas-talks-because-of-ukrainian-threats/
Ukraine began to develop a project for the separation of Crimea channel	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-to-separate-from-crimea-via-projected-canal/

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Headline	Code	Link
The APU fired at the OSCE patrol	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-military-fire-on-osce-patrol/
Special forces of Ukraine arrived in Donbass in the form of the Russian military	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukrainian-soldiers-wearing-russian-uniforms-spotted-in-donbas/
Kiev does not want to take prisoners from the NDP	Hostile Ukraine	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-does-not-want-to-claim-its-pow-s-from-occupied-territories/
The US is preparing a new revolution in Ukraine (manipulation)	Sovereignty	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-us-preparing-a-new-revolution-in-ukraine/
The US intelligence community announced early presidential elections in Ukraine	Sovereignty	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-us-intelligence-finds-reasons-for-regime-change-in-ukraine/
GE locomotives: Poroshenko rescues sinking American corporation	Sovereignty	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-buys-locomotives-from-a-failing-american-corporation/
Peskov said that the US treats the conflict in the Donbas as an intra-Ukrainian	Sovereignty	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-us-considers-donbas-war-an-internal-ukrainian-matter/
The US is preparing personnel for the new “color” revolution in Ukraine	Sovereignty	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-us-preparing-new-colored-revolution-in-ukraine/
The Defense Ministry was told about Washington’s violation of the INF treaty/ Russia accused the US of violating the missile treaty/The US intends to withdraw from the agreement on the elimination of medium-range and shorter-range missiles	Sovereignty	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-us-violates-inf-treaty/
WSJ: Germany will ask the US to release it from sanctions against Russia (manipulation)	Sovereignty	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-germany-asks-us-to-ease-russia-sanctions/
US bans 155 Ukrainian imports due to political situation	Sovereignty	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-us-bans-155-ukrainian-imports-due-to-political-situation/
Kyiv residents want Russian social media platforms back	Pro-Kremlin	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-kyiv-residents-want-russian-social-media-platforms-back/
Crimean Tatars to support Putin in March Presidential election	Pro-Kremlin	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-crimean-tatars-to-support-putin-in-march-presidential-election/
Ukraine admits that Russian gas imports are profitable	Pro-Kremlin	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-ukraine-admits-russian-gas-imports-profitable/
Boycott failed: Crimean Tatars actively vote in presidential elections	Pro-Kremlin	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-crimean-tatars-voter-turnout-greater-for-march-18-russian-presidential-elections-than-any-under-ukrainian-rule/
Ukrainian sailors threaten Poroshenko with a return to the Crimea (manipulation)	Pro-Kremlin	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-ukrainian-sailors-threaten-to-return-to-crimea/
Kyiv admits Ukrainian parts in North Korea missile engines	Intl Rel	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-kyiv-admits-ukrainian-parts-in-north-korea-missile-engines/
“Boris, shut up”: the British reacted to Johnson’s statement about Russia	Intl Rel	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-british-apologize-for-boris-johnson/
Ukraine loses Transcarpathia: nationalists press on the Hungarian community	Intl Rel	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-ukraine-losing-transcarpathia/
Media: Hungary announces aerial alarm due to Ukrainian aircraft	Intl Rel	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-hungary-to-shoot-down-ukrainian-airline/
The Ministry of Defense of Serbia recognized Maydan as a coup d’état	Intl Rel	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-serbian-defense-ministry-calls-euromaidan-a-coup/
Central Communication Port in Poland: “This is what NATO needs” (originally polish)	Intl Rel	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-the-central-communication-port-is-being-created-to-allow-quick-transfer-of-us-military-forces/

Headline	Code	Link
Kyiv admits Ukrainian parts in North Korea missile engines	Intl Rel	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-british-apologize-for-boris-johnson/
“Boris, shut up”: the British reacted to Johnson’s statement about Russia	Intl Rel	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-ukraine-losing-transcarpathia/
The Russian embassy: the head of the secret British laboratory actually confirmed the development of combat poisons	Skripal	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-uk-s-secret-weapons-lab-chief-confirms-chemical-weapons-development/
OPCW fails to identify origin of nerve agent in Skripal case	Skripal	https://www.stopfake.org/en/fake-organization-for-the-prohibition-of-chemical-weapons-unable-to-establish-origin-of-nerve-agent-in-skripal-poisoning/
(manipulation) The Dutch Foreign Ministry did not exclude the involvement of Ukraine in the case of MH17	MH17	https://www.stopfake.org/en/manipulation-dutch-foreign-minister-does-not-exclude-kyiv-s-involvement-in-mh17-downing/

APPENDIX F

UKRAINE EUVSDISINFO

This section provides a list of headlines gathered from EUvsDisinfo for Ukraine. It also includes the code the article was assigned for research. All the claims can be found at <https://euvsdisinfo.eu/disinformation-cases/>

Headline	Code
Ukrainians in Poland forced to work for food	Weak Ukraine
The Western-backed coup in Ukraine has torn the country asunder	Weak Ukraine
Ukraine has been destroyed	Weak Ukraine
Every month 100 000 Ukrainians travel to the West to earn a living	Weak Ukraine
German Ministry of Defence is unaware of the presence of tanks of the Ukrainian army in a tank competition	Weak Ukraine
Ukrainians in Poland forced to work for food	Weak Ukraine
EU will allegedly lift sanctions	Institutions
The EU and NATO are dividing Europe and Ukraine is an example of this	Institutions
European integration influences the price of food in Ukraine negatively	Institutions
EU and NATO's war agenda exposed	Institutions
EU postpones extension of the anti-Russian sanctions imposed after the reunification of Crimea	Institutions
Finnish election observer: Crimea is the most democratic place in the world	Institutions
The end of visa-free regime for Ukraine, Georgia and Moldova	Institutions
OSCE Walk Out on Donbas Talks Because of Ukrainian Threats	Institutions
Ukraine can be removed from the Olympics	Institutions
Popular band calls for the destruction of the Ukrainian Government	Institutions
Ukrainian policeman published a Facebook profile photo with a Nazi uniform	Persecution
Italian leading politicians support Ukrainian Nazis	Persecution
Ukrainian parliamentary speaker is a neo-Nazi	Persecution
The UN condemned persecution of the Ukrainian Orthodox Church	Persecution
The Maidan Museum in Kiev copies Hitler's projects	Persecution
EU plans to allocate money to the construction of concentration camps for refugees	Persecution
In Kiev there is not a single Russian-language school	Russophobia
Sweden beef up military strength due to Russophobic rhetoric	Russophobia
Helsinki supports Ukraine in its anti-Russian propaganda	Russophobia
US 'rudely and insolently cheated Russia' during Ukraine coup	Russophobia
Ukraine has built houses with the remains of Soviet prisoners of war	Russophobia
Blaming Russia instead of Ukraine for the MH17 tragedy is Russophobia and demonization of Russia	Russophobia
There is a civil war in Ukraine in which brother is killing brother	Hostile Ukraine
New law in Ukraine allows military to operate with impunity	Hostile Ukraine
Ukraine would sell even its nuclear bomb if they still had it	Hostile Ukraine
Kyiv: NATO troops must enter Ukraine and hit Moscow	Hostile Ukraine
It was the leaders of the coup in Ukraine four years ago that were responsible for the people killed	Hostile Ukraine

Headline	Code
Ukraine's Military command announces punitive Donbas campaign and Crimea offensive	Hostile Ukraine
Eastern Ukraine ceasefire ends because of Kyiv	Hostile Ukraine
Kurt Volker and Poroshenko discuss intensification of War	Hostile Ukraine
Ukraine plans to separate Crimea from the mainland by a navigable canal	Hostile Ukraine
DPR: Ukrainian junta prepares a provocation against an EU-delegation	Hostile Ukraine
A provocation by the Ukrainian armed forces was prevented in Donbas	Hostile Ukraine
Ukrainian Soldiers Wearing Russian Uniforms Spotted in Donbas	Hostile Ukraine
Ukraine violated international rules when they did not close the airspace, allowing MH17 to be shot down	Hostile Ukraine
The fascists' war preparations against Russia are clearly visible	Hostile Ukraine
Ukrainian army organizes hunting of pro-Russian civilians in Donbas for rich people	Hostile Ukraine
The Ukrainian intelligence service (SBU) is creating death squads against political opponents	Hostile Ukraine
George Soros wants another change of government in Ukraine	Sovereignty/ US interference
The Western-backed coup in Ukraine has torn the country asunder	Sovereignty/ US interference
Shooting during the Euromaidan in Kyiv was organised by former Georgian President Mikheil Saakashvili with the help of the US secret services and 'Georgian snipers'	Sovereignty/ US interference
US spy planes spotted near Russia's Crimea	Sovereignty/ US interference
Ukraine is becoming a testing ground for Western medical companies	Sovereignty/ US interference
Ukraine is a victim of US aggression and interference	Sovereignty/ US interference
Russia does not interfere in the domestic affairs of sovereign states.	Pro-Kremlin
Russia did not violate the Budapest Memorandum	Pro-Kremlin
Russian army enthuses kids about de-mining and defusing bombs	Pro-Kremlin
Russia will not stay on the sidelines if Ukraine starts carrying out a genocide against its own, Ukrainian, population in Donbas	Pro-Kremlin
Crimea and Sevastopol were returned to Russia in March 2014 after a referendum	Pro-Kremlin
Minister of National Defence of Lithuania Mr. Raimundas Karoblis recognised the Crimean annexation to Russia	Pro-Kremlin
Crimea reunited with Russia following a coup	Pro-Kremlin
For 235 years, Crimea is Russia's	Pro-Kremlin

DETECTING HUMAN RIGHTS VULNERABILITIES IN FAKE NEWS

Headline	Code
Moscow does not conduct a war with Ukraine // The internal political crisis in Ukraine was inspired by the West	Pro-Kremlin
Crimea is Russian	Pro-Kremlin
Crimea decided its own fate after the unconstitutional armed coup in Kyiv	Pro-Kremlin
Russian soldiers are not present in Ukraine	Pro-Kremlin
Crimea itself decided its fate	Pro-Kremlin
Not a single anti-aircraft missile system of the armed forces has ever crossed the Russian-Ukrainian border	Pro-Kremlin
Film maker Oleh Sentsov is a Russian citizen	Pro-Kremlin
EU is abandoning Ukraine	International relations
Slowly, incest is being legalised in Europe	International relations
Italian leading politicians support Ukrainian Nazis	International relations
An official delegation of German deputies visited Crimea	International relations
Finland is the only European country that has a neutral position in conflict and civil war in Donbas	International relations
Georgian snipers took orders from Maidan leaders	International relations
Georgian snipers took orders from leaders of today's Ukraine	International relations
Sweden is thinking of sending its army to Donetsk, Sweden and Ukraine have earlier demanded the results of the battle of Poltava to be re-examined	International relations
Upon Mikheil Saakashvili's instructions, Georgian snipers opened fire on the protesters rallying on Ukraine's Maidan in 2014.	International relations
Shooting during the Euromaidan in Kyiv was organised by former Georgian President Mikheil Saakashvili with the help of the US secret services and 'Georgian snipers'	International relations
Ukraine can get financial assistance from Europe in exchange for the placement of migrants	International relations
Latvian Army shot at civilians in January 1991	International relations
Ex-head of FSB suspects Ukraine poisoned Skripal	Skripal
Ukrainian trace in Skripal poisoning	Skripal
UK secret services/Ukraine/Exiled Russian oligarchs/hypothetical Browder all potential suspects behind Skripal poisoning	Skripal
Finns found a Ukrainian trace in the case of Skripal	Skripal
Dutch and Russian foreign ministers planned to discuss the investigation of MH17 that was shot down by a Ukrainian Buk	MH17
Normalisation of the Dutch-Russia-relations is possible only if the Netherlands admit MH17 was shot down by air force of Ukraine	MH17
New evidence on the flight MH17: debris fell against the laws of physics, it was an explosion inside the plane	MH17
Russia Provides Evidence That Ukrainian BUK Launchers Downed MH17 - Russian MoD	MH17
No evidence presented by JIT on MH17, only a colorful video based on information fabricated by bloggers from the Bellingcat agency	MH17
MH17 Probe: Everything Points to the Ukrainian Side	MH17
Investigation of MH17 Crash in Ukraine Biased - Russian Foreign Ministry	MH17
No evidence presented by JIT on MH17, only a colorful video based on information fabricated by bloggers from the Bellingcat agency	MH17

Headline	Code
The Netherlands Demand Russia to Provide Evidence of its Guilt in the MH17 Case	MH17
Almaz-Antey: JIT twisted or ignored of information presented by the company during the investigation	MH17
MH17 Downing Responsibility of Air Controller	MH17
Ukraine is to blame for MH17	MH17
MH17 probe biased	MH17
Bellingcat Allegations of Russia's Role in MH17 Crash Based on Fakes - MoD	MH17
It Was 'Certainly' Not Russian Missile That Downed MH17	MH17
Investigation to MH17 reminiscent of the Skripal case as there was no evidence	MH17
JIT Report: Poor Evidence, Bias and Convenient Timing	MH17
Accusations on MH17 Crash 'Planned Provocation'	MH17
Blaming Russia instead of Ukraine for the MH17 tragedy is Russophobia and demonization of Russia	MH17

Monastery of San Nicolò
Riviera San Nicolò, 26
I-30126 Venice Lido (Italy)

www.eiuc.org

Global Campus Europe. The European Master's Programme in Human Rights and Democratisation (EMA)

EMA is a one-year intensive master's programme with participation of 41 prestigious universities representing all EU Member States. It is based on an action- and policy-oriented approach to learning and combines legal, political, historical, anthropological, and philosophical perspectives on the study of human rights and democracy with targeted skill-building activities. As a measure of its success, EMA has served as a model of inspiration for the establishment of EU-sponsored master's programmes in several other regions of the world, all of which are being coordinated and cooperate in the framework of the Global Campus of Human Rights.

The Global Campus Europe - EMA Awarded Theses

Each year the EMA Council of Directors selects five theses, which stand out not only for their formal academic qualities but also for the originality of topic, innovative character of methodology and approach, potential usefulness in raising awareness about neglected issues and capacity for contributing to the promotion of the values underlying human rights and democracy.

The present thesis - ***“Slowly, incest is being legalized throughout Europe”. Detecting human rights vulnerabilities in fake news using critical discourse analysis***, by Samy Amanatullah and supervised by : Antonis Gardikiotis, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki - was submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the European Master's Programme in Human Rights and Democratisation (EMA), coordinated by EIUC.

