

OUR PROGRESSIVE NATURE:
THE ENVIRONMENT
&
THE RIGHT TO ENJOY THE BENEFITS OF SCIENTIFIC
PROGRESS AND ITS APPLICATIONS

Author	Sarah Bassiuoni
Supervisor	Prof. William Schabas
Second Semester	The Irish Centre for Human Rights, at the National University of Ireland, Galway
Academic Year	E.MA 2009 - 2010

ABSTRACT

The right to enjoy the benefits of scientific progress and its applications seeks to ensure equitable distribution of the knowledge and tools that impel social advancement. Reflecting on the condition of our Earth and the considerable environmental transformations impacting upon communities across the globe, the equitable distribution of the knowledge and tools to limit, redress, and prevent further damage is crucial. This work aims to illustrate how the right to scientific progress can assist in protecting human dignity in an environmentally sustainable world.

Thanks to:

Prof. William Schabas for his helpful supervision and critical analysis which kept me focused and driven.

The Lionel Murphy Foundation for its generosity and commitment to the advancement of human rights and social justice. The foundation's continued financial assistance of Australians endeavouring to build a more equitable world enabled me to undertake the E.MA wholeheartedly.

My loving parents Triona and Fikry Bassiuni for their unfaltering support, honest opinions, encouraging words, faith in me and for loving me at my worst.

Mary Billing, Jenny Boylan, Simon Thornton, Michelle Worthington and Clare Preece for their suggestions, advice and time given to my rambling.

And lastly my housemates , Eoin Flood, Patricia McAfee and Joe Kerins for answering my questions, putting up with my stress and mess and being so good natured.

ACRONYMS

AAAS	American Association for the Advancement of Science
Ibid.	‘The same place’ referring to the note immediately preceding
ICHRP	International Council on Human Rights Policy
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights
Idem.	‘The same as’ referring to a preceding note
IP	Intellectual property
Passim	‘Here and there’ meaning throughout the work cited
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organisation
WTO	World Trade Organisation

UK English spelling except for inside direct quotes.

E.MA style guide and editing rules have been followed in the preparation of this work.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
PART ONE	
1. THE ALL BUT FORGOTTEN RIGHT: THE RIGHT TO ENJOY THE BENEFITS OF SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS AND ITS APPLICATIONS	3
1.1 CORE OBLIGATIONS	6
1.1.1 <i>Respect</i>	6
1.1.2 <i>Protect</i>	8
1.1.3 <i>Fulfil</i>	10
1.2 GUIDING THE QUEST FOR THE UNKNOWN: HOW SCIENCE’S MOTIVES SHAPE DISCOVERIES	13
1.2.1 THE INFLUENCE OF SCIENCE	14
1.2.2 <i>What is Behind the Agenda of Scientific Progress?</i>	15
1.2.3 <i>Should the Research and Development Agenda of Science be Framed by Human Rights?</i>	17
1.2.4 <i>The Motivation of Intellectual Property Rights and Scientific Progress</i>	19
1.3 A NEW FRAME FOR SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS	22
1.3.1 <i>Government and Business</i>	22
1.3.2 <i>Education</i>	23
1.3.3 <i>The Scientific Community</i>	24
1.3.4 <i>In the Environmental Context</i>	25

PART TWO

2. THE TRIANGLE: SCIENCE, HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE ENVIRONMENT	27
2.1 THE ROLE OF SCIENCE IN INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW	28
2.1.1 <i>Modifying Sovereignty</i>	30
2.2 THE ENJOYMENT OF SCIENTIFIC BENEFITS	32
2.2.1 <i>What Are Scientific Benefits?</i>	32
2.2.2 <i>The Dilemmas of Intellectual Property Law in the Enjoyment of the Benefits Derived from Biological Scientific Progress and Applications</i>	34
2.2.3 <i>Securing Enjoyment Under Intellectual Property Law</i>	37
2.3 SCIENCE IS CENTRAL TO THE ROLE OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT	40
2.3.1 <i>Human Rights and Environmental Management</i>	41
2.3.2 <i>Human Rights and the Scraps of Science</i>	43
2.4 CLIMATE CHANGE: ENVIRONMENTAL REALITIES AFFECTING HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE ROLE OF SCIENCE	44
2.4.1 <i>Equity and Climate Change</i>	45
2.4.2 <i>The Science and Politics of Addressing Climate Change</i>	47
2.4.3 <i>Reframing Climate Change Under the Right to Scientific Progress</i>	48

PART THREE

3. THE RIGHT TO SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS IN THE HOME: ENVIRONMENT: DOMESTIC APPLICATION OF INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW	50
---	----

OUR PROGRESSIVE NATURE

3.1 SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND THE RIGHT TO SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS	51
3.1.1 <i>Environmental Impact Assessments</i>	52
3.2 PERMANENT SOVEREIGNTY OVER NATURAL RESOURCES AND THE RIGHT TO SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS	55
3.3 COMMON BUT DIFFERENTIATED RESPONSIBILITIES AND THE RIGHT TO SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS	59

PART FOUR

4. HOW SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS CAN AUGMENT THE DEBATE ABOUT GLOBALISATION: AN EXAMINATION OF INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS AND CORPORATIONS	62
4.1 INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS	64
4.1.1 <i>Trade Policy Development</i>	65
4.2 CORPORATIONS	67
4.2.1 <i>The Global Financial Crisis</i>	68
4.3 LIBERALISATION OF WATER SERVICES, THE ENVIRONMENT AND THE ENJOYMENT OF SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS	71
4.3.1 <i>Human Rights Framing Water Management</i>	72
4.3.2 <i>The Right to Scientific Progress and Corporate Water Use</i>	79
4.4 SANITATION AND THE RIGHT TO SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS	80
4.5 PROGRESS: THE RIGHT TO SCIENCE PROGRESS ESTABLISHES MEANING BEYOND ECONOMIC GROWTH	82

PART FIVE

5. ENFORCEMENT	84
----------------	----

5.1 INTERNATIONAL MECHANISMS AND THE RIGHT TO SCIENTIFIC PROGRESS	85
5.2 LITIGATION	91
5.3 OUTSIDE THE TRADITIONAL APPROACH: BEYOND LITIGATION AND THE STATE	94
CONCLUSION	97
BIBLIOGRAPHY	99
ANNEX I	114