



European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation



**The relationship of the World Court of Human Rights
with the United Nations human rights monitoring bodies**

**Anne van Eijndhoven
E.MA Academic Year 2009-2010
Supervised by Julia Kozma & Manfred Nowak
University of Vienna**

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, thank you to those who were willing to read this thesis before it was even close to being finished. Niev and Lucy for their insightful comments on the English language, and my mother for picking up on the small inconsistencies that I, after 5 months, could no longer see.

A warm thank you goes to the employees of the Department of Execution of Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights and Bertie Ramcharan, who have provided me with very valuable information and new insights. A half hour taxi drive was the basis for a new approach to my Human Rights Council chapter.

Thank you to Julia Kozma and Manfred Nowak, for giving me the freedom to research a new topic that one day, we will hopefully all see become reality. Julia, thank you for your advice, comments and personal approach to supervision.

A special thank you to Jozefien, my flatmate, friend and the one person who has been there right next to me every step of the way. And last but not least, to my parents, who made it possible for me to study for yet another year, because they believed this to be as valuable as it turned out to be.

Abstract

This thesis deals with the World Court of Human Rights and its relationship with the United Nations human rights bodies. Based on the Draft Statute by Kozma, Nowak and Scheinin, this thesis analyses how the World Court would relate to the United Nations treaty bodies, Human Rights Council and the High Commissioner for Human Rights. Through the use of the practical experience of these different bodies, as well as comparative research, this thesis establishes which bodies should exercise which functions, and to some extent how this could best be achieved. The aim of this thesis is to give recommendations to the drafters of the Statute for the World Court of Human Rights in the specific topic presented.

These recommendations are: to include an inter-state complaints procedure in the Statute; to require States Parties to actively withdraw from the complaints procedures under the treaty bodies; to draft new Optional Protocols to CEDAW and the CRPD, or to amend the existing ones; to establish regular session of the Human Rights Council to supervise execution of judgments; and to establish an execution division with the OHCHR.

Abbreviations

ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CAT Committee	Committee against Torture
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEDAW Committee	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
CMW	International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
Execution Department	Department for the Execution of Judgments of the European Court of Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
Inter-Am.Ct. H.R. (Ser. A)	Inter-American Court of Human Rights Series A
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
UN	United Nations
UN Charter	Charter of the United Nations
UNTC	United Nations Treaty Collection
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
UPR	Universal Periodic Review
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

Table of Contents

Abbreviations.....	4
Chapter 1 Introduction.....	7
1.1 Subject of this thesis.....	7
1.2 Methodology.....	9
1.3 Structure.....	9
Chapter 2 Treaty bodies.....	11
2.1 Introduction.....	11
2.2 Treaty bodies mandate.....	13
2.2.1 Individual complaints.....	13
2.2.2 Inter-state complaints.....	22
2.2.3 General comments.....	27
2.2.4 Inquiry procedures.....	29
2.3 Suspension of the operation of individual complaints procedures.....	32
2.3.1 Suspension of the human rights conventions and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties.....	33
2.3.2 Suspension of the operation of the Optional Protocols to CEDAW and CRPD.....	35
2.4 Conclusion.....	37
Chapter 3 Human Rights Council.....	39
3.1 The role of the Council in the Draft Statute for the World Court of Human Rights.....	39
3.2 The UN Human Rights Council.....	39
3.3 Option 1: Supervision through the UPR.....	42
3.3.1 Universal Periodic Review.....	42
3.3.2 The example of the Netherlands.....	44
3.3.3 The example of China.....	45
3.3.4 Individual complaints and the Universal Periodic Review.....	46
3.3.5 Conclusion.....	47
3.4 Option 2: Supervision through the Assembly of States Parties.....	47
3.5 Option 3: Supervision through special sessions – the example of the European system.....	48
3.5.1 Council of Europe – Committee of Ministers.....	48
3.5.2 Applied to the UN.....	53
3.6 Conclusion.....	53
Chapter 4 Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights.....	55

4.1 Introduction.....	55
4.2 OHCHR in Draft Statute.....	55
4.3 Advisory opinions.....	56
4.4 Execution of judgments.....	60
4.5 Conclusion.....	62
Chapter 5 Conclusion and recommendations.....	63
Bibliography.....	65
Annex 1: Case law of the Committee against Torture.....	79
Annex 2: Case law of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women.....	80