

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE DUBLIN

European Master's Programme in Human Rights and Democratisation

A.Y. 2019/2020

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

How the assassination of an elected Brazilian woman is moving with the structures of power and revealing a state that is complicit in with the death of a human rights defender

Author: Lidiane Dias Ferreira

Supervisor: Dr Graham Finlay

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

ABSTRACT

The death of the city councillor and human rights activist Marielle Franco in 2018 is a complex political crime that exposed all the scars of a country that has not adequately dealt with its past. The concept of Necropolitics, developed by the Cameroonian philosopher Achille Mbembe, in which the state decides who should live and who should die, and which it uses a 'war machine' for this purpose, applies to the Marielle case in several ways. Understanding Marielle's trajectory and death through the lenses of Necropolitics is understanding how Brazil's power structures still have their roots in racism, violence, and sexism. Understanding Marielle's death under different aspects of Necropolitics — her physical death and the attempt to erase her memory through what I called digital Necropolitics, characterized of a wave of fake news, and the Necropolitics of the discourse — is understanding that the Brazilian political space is still restricted and threatening to those who intend to defend human rights. Analysing the death of a black, bisexual woman from the favela of Rio do Janeiro and democratically elected is urgent because it calls for a much more difficult situation that we all need to stand for.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Writing a master thesis during a world pandemic was quite challenging. That is the reason why I wish to thank various people for their contribution and support, that in a way or another, helped me to achieve what became a dream. Firstly, I would like to express my deep gratitude to Professor Dr Graham Finlay, my thesis supervisor, for his patient guidance, comprehension, enthusiastic encouragement, and useful critiques of master thesis. I would also like to thank the EMA Programme for this great opportunity in my life, in special Wiebke Lamer and Daniela La Mattina; and UCD staff Orla Ni Cheallachain. Secondly, all my friends that were together along in this journey and to whom I send all my love and friendship, especially Leo Bernardo, Ana Lopez; Luis Carrasco, Fernanda Barros; Andriana Karaoulli; Deborah Caruana, Manon Koepp and Carolina Canettieri. I would also like to extend my special thanks to all my friends in Brazil, whose even apart, were with me in thoughts and support through this time, in special Vivian Raggazi; Ana Luiza D'Maschio; Patrícia Agusti; Flávia Siqueira; Giovanna Montemurro; Camila Audi; Julia Couto; Camila Ruiz; Larissa Tsuboi; Felipe Guarnieri; Carol Gaspar from Portugal and Jeet from India. Sharing all the challenges and joys with you made everything easier. Finally, I wish to thank my parents, sister and close relatives for their support: you are my everything. Special thanks should be given to all women who helped me somehow to write about someone like Marielle Franco. All my love and gratitude for being able to have all of you as inspiration.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	6
1. Methodology and structure	8
2. Objective; Research questions	11
1 The facts	15
1.1 Black people, black women	17
1.2 Human rights defenders	21
2 Crime and politics	24
2.1 Marielle Franco, the city councillor	24
2.2 A crime against democracy	27
2.3 Political femicide	32
2.4 The crime's authors, politics, and other relevant details	34
2.5 Palácio do Planalto	41
2.6 Militias	42
2.7 State-level	45
2.8 Federal level	46
3 Structural racism	52
4 Necropolitics	59
5 Marielle, <i>presente!</i>	70
6 The Necropolitics of the discourse	77
6.1 Words that kill	77
6.2 Digital Necropolitics	83
6.3 The first news	84
7 Conclusion	96
Bibliography	102

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

INTRODUCTION

Marielle Franco was a raising voice in defence of human rights in Brazil when she was shot to death in downtown Rio de Janeiro on 14 March 2018. She was 38 years old.

Elected as a city councillor in 2016, Marielle was a young political leader whose intersectionality became a flag: black, bisexual, solo mother and from *Maré*¹, one of the largest *favelas*² in Brazil. Defender of human rights, Marielle was much more than a councillor; she was the representation of an alternative movement in the political system, which has been dominated by the white male elite for centuries.

One of her most relevant work as a councillor was denouncing police brutality against the black population, and women and lesbian rights.

She was in her car that day and had just left an event that brought together black women to discuss racism, feminism, and politics. Marielle died on the spot after four gunshots hit in her head. Her driver also died. Her assistant survived but moved to another country.

¹ According to the NGO Redes da Maré, about 140,000 people live in the 16 communities that are part of the *Complexo da Maré*, in the North Zone of Rio de Janeiro, and form one of the largest population's centres in Brazil.

² In its dominant sense, favela is the term that designates areas that shelter precarious housing, as a rule in hills, lack of regularization and public services. The word favela is a Brazilianism that has a history of unusual clarity.

Nevertheless, the attempt to silence her has failed. Marielle became a seed, and her ideas are multiplying — either in public life or in civil society. However, the system that allowed her to be murdered, and that still allows the mentors of the crime to stay unknown has a name: Necropolitics, the death policy in which the state decides who should live and who should die.

Necropolitics is the concept developed by the Cameroonian sociologist and philosopher Achille Mbembe. The term expands the concept of biopower proposed by the philosopher Michel Foucault in 1988. According to Foucault, there is a calculated and optimized production of life. In contrast, Mbembe emphasizes death's primacy as a strategy for the exercise of modern power in territories and populations considered a threat.

One of the most visible dimensions of the Necropolitics refers to the material destruction of human bodies and populations, judged to be disposable and superfluous, leading them to a worthless and killable life.

In these terms, racism ensures the state's murderous function, and gives the condition for the government to exercise the 'sovereign right to kill'. The 'killing' is not only about direct murder, but also indirect murder, related to exposing death, multiplying the risk of death, political death, expulsion, and rejection.

So, as an exercise of sovereignty, Necropolitics determines who should live and who should die, who are the subjects, and the non-subjects reduced to biological and inhumane categories.

Necropolitics is not an episode; it is not a phenomenon that escapes a rule. Necropolitics is the rule because it is linked to the structure that organizes relations, societies and is reproduced in the daily lives of different groups and, here specifically, in the black women population's everyday lives.

Achille Mbembe elaborates this concept in the light of the state of exception and updates the biopower concept showing how the production of life and subjectivity by capitalism and its devices reach Necropolitics, which is specially located in the peripheries and

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

ghettos of the world. It means that it is lethal to minorities, such as migrants, blacks, women. Furthermore, the Brazilian statistics prove the theory.

The context of Marielle Franco's death presents us to a country where black women and human right defenders are in life danger. According to *The Atlas of Violence 2019*³, published by the Institute of Applied Economic Research (Ipea) in partnership with The Brazilian Forum on Public Safety, nine black women died by murder per day in 2017. They already account for two-thirds of all female homicide victims in the country - in 2007 they were 54%. Never so many black women were killed in Brazil.

Besides that, Brazil is one of the most dangerous countries for human rights defenders. According to the British non-governmental organization Global Witness, on its annual report⁴, Brazil had at least 20 murders of environmental and human rights activists in 2018. This number makes the country one of the most dangerous in the world for the life of human rights and environmental defenders.

1. Methodology and structure

Through a bibliographic review composed by primary and secondary sources, along with the description of facts from official journalistic references and official sources of data, I proposed to investigate how the concept of Necropolitics applies beyond its original definition proposed by Mbembe and applies to diverse contexts such as the virtual

3 Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada; Fórum Brasileiro de Segurança Pública (ed), Atlas da Violência 2019 (Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada (Ipea); Fórum Brasileiro de Segurança Pública 2019).

4 Global Witness, 'Annual Report 2018: Delivering Global Change' (Global Witness 2019).

environment and fake news and speech and language, having Marielle's case as an example of how these concepts are applicable to reality.

That is why this thesis is composed on its first part of a full description of her political life and all the most recent details about the crime against her because in this specific case all the information about the crime is part of a complex puzzle. The death of Brazilian counsellor and human rights activist Marielle Franco in 2018 is an intricate political and criminal puzzle which pieces are all related to these possible Necropolitics.

Investigating and discussing the facts about Marielle's life and death but her political and intellectual work is a democratic exercise that I dedicate myself in order to understand and warn of the urgency to position ourselves and act in a way to combat the Necropolitics and the Necropower.

With these facts ahead, this thesis also seeks to analyse how Necropolitics, in its diverse ways, explains two deaths of Marielle Franco: the death of her body and the 'death of her memory' (as an attempt of erasing her reputation and legacy).

Few hours after the crime, a wave of fake news spread through social networks in Brazil. A judge from Rio de Janeiro and a congress member were two of the primary sources of spreading false news about Marielle's life and background, associating her with organized crime and drug trafficking.

Through the case study, this thesis address how politically active women and human rights defenders are much more vulnerable in a government system based on the Necropower — which makes the Necropolitics a stable system.

Furthermore, and thorough analysis of official data, this work attempts to show how Necropolitics is even more lethal to women, especially black women, in life or on social media. When a state is under a death politics, a black woman who dared to face the political system and the power positions and who posted herself in the front line for the human rights is more vulnerable than ever.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Democracy depends on assuring that women's political participation, that black women's political participation, poor people, LGBTQIA+⁵ people political participation, and all minority groups participation is ensured and not mowed or threatened by violence and death.

Not only her ideas, but her body was a political body. The crime against Marielle Franco is a crime against democracy.

As a black and feminist woman, she was an uncomfortable body that exposed the sexist, racist and homophobic character of practices and institutions. By denouncing the murders of young people from the periphery, she reinforced in the public debate the voices of their mothers, their sisters, founded on pain of loss, to circumvent dehumanization. She denounced that the rule of law is based on 'killable lives' and extermination practices. The fact that women's lives continue to be claimed and that the bodies that fall are majority black bodies reveals the insufficiency of existing guarantees and, more broadly, of the Democratic Rule of Law. The same can be thought about political participation and the limits of democracy⁶.

Thus, the assassination of Marielle Franco is still affecting the highest power structures in Brazil. Who ordered to kill her and why are questions still seeking for answers.

5 Abbreviation for lesbians; gays; bisexuals; transsexual or transgender people; queer; intersex; asexual; all the existing sexual orientation.

6Nadine Grassman and Flávia Biroli, 'Um mês sem Marielle: democracia, legado e a violência contra as mulheres na política | #AgoraÉQueSãoElas' (#AgoraÉQueSãoElas, 14 April 2018)
<<https://agoraquesaoelas.blogfolha.uol.com.br/2018/04/14/um-mes-sem-marielle/>>.

In this sense, confronting these facts and analysing her intersectional case makes itself relevant because it puts a light on an even more complex scenario faced by women as politicians and as human rights defender. Understanding the circumstances that led to her death is also an attempt to comprehend the contemporary challenges that the democratization and human rights in a general way are dealing with.

Going deeply in her history until the day she was assassinated and the following episodes, are relevant for the debate I am suggesting because it helps to understand all the circumstances that made her a target. The crime against her seems to be a premeditated crime with a wealth of details. The difficulty in finding the responsible shows care in their planning. More than a hate crime, the crime against Marielle is political and multidimensional, involving the most diverse spheres of the state. Moreover, the message Marielle killers sent was a disturbing message to all human rights defenders: 'Be careful what you say. You are in the line of fire'.

Furthermore, knowing her history makes us rescue her humanity and legacy. Marielle became into statistics, but that does not make her a number. Each person who has her or his life finished in advance is a person with history, family, achievements. For this reason, reporting every step of her trajectory and death is essential so that her voice is not silenced, as her murderers and crime orders wanted. It is also an act of resistance against the attacks she suffered after her death through a wave of fake news that got spread in Brazilian online social networks a few hours after the crime.

2. Objective; Research Questions

Necropolitics may explain the context of her crime, but also brings up more questions about the oppressive regime that is still raising against women, black women, and minorities. Confronting these parts is fundamental for the debate about democracy, justice, and peace. Marielle was executed for what she meant politically and for what she

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

embodied in her body. She represented the emergencies and the disruptive bodies that undermine the logic of the neoliberal system cited by Mbembe.

Her murder is a brutal attempt to silence human rights defenders and, at the same time, an attack on the rights of all the people she represented and on what she meant in terms of a democratic figure — after all, Marielle was one of the 32 black women among 811 councillors elected in all Brazilian capitals in 2016.

More than two years after it happened, the lack of resolution of the case seems to show that authorities tolerate violence against activists, women, and black people. Moreover, impunity for crimes against human rights defenders reinforces the maintenance of this situation. To claim justice for Marielle is to claim justice for those who defend the country's maintenance of rights. Besides that, the intersectionality represented in Marielle's figure makes her case even more emblematic, as it is a political crime of racist, sexist, and homophobic bias.

Brazil has an obligation to promote, guarantee and respect human rights because it is one of the nations that has signed the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The Declaration on Human Rights Defenders⁷, adopted by the United Nations in 1998, also establishes guarantees for those who work in defence of rights, of which Brazil is also a signatory.

Furthermore, her death also had a severe and direct impact on her legislative activity and agendas, which was of great public interest. Marielle criticized human rights violations, abuses arising from public security policies, and proposed laws focused on women's health. During her tenure, she chaired the Commission for the Defence of Women. She

⁷The Declaration on Human Rights Defenders 1998 (General Assembly Resolution A/RES/53/144 adopting the Declaration on human rights defenders).

was also part of a monitoring committee for the Federal Intervention in Rio in 2018 that oversees and evaluates the results, and abuses, of military operations in the city.

Even with all the international repercussions of her death and the pressure of complaints from institutions, the investigation has many flaws, leaks, suspicious activities and supposed interferences from the highest positions of power in the country, which, in the end, seems to demonstrate the absence of commitment by the competent authorities to truth and justice.

The Rio de Janeiro that elected Marielle in a consecrating manner in 2016 is the same one that elected far-right names in 2018 at the height of an ideological and communicational clash. In this scenario, it is even more urgent to understand what her death and the attacks on her legacy represent.

Thus, the murder of Marielle Franco is an attack on the possibility of free debate about public security policy and gender and race equity. Inadequate response by the state to this crime, as noted, can be a severe precedent against the critical performance of democratically elected representatives in political spaces.

They arrested the executors, but who gave the order to kill her? That is the question that matters now. Marielle is not the first human rights defender to fall victim to violence and Necropolitics. However, the fight that begins is broadened and does not end when the case is resolved. Brazil owes this answer to itself because Marielle's death and everything that is surrounding this murder is, perhaps, the most significant force for the beginning of the Necropower and Necropolitics culture collapse — both online and offline — so ironically represented in Rio de Janeiro.

As a neoliberal phenomenon, originating from the 'peripheries of capitalism', as Mbembe explains, it is time to study it in-depth and understand its characteristics to develop and improve more efficient mechanisms to combat Necropower and structural racism that permeates the entire Necropolitical system.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Recognizing the Necropolitics as a system that threatens the lives of the most vulnerable and those on the front lines for them is urgent. It is also a duty of states that properly propose to protect and guarantee human rights. In this way, becoming aware of this is not merely denouncing but committing oneself to initiatives that seek to correct this reality. The challenge of how to resist is here and is urgent. Combating what endangers human rights is a duty to us all.

THE FACTS

One thing is to be born and raised in the *favela*. However, a different issue is to rise and to use your experience as a *favelada* (a woman from the *favelas*) to make politics differently. In 1998 I was part of the first class of the preparatory community course for university in the *Maré* Complex of *Favelas*. That was the year I got pregnant. I have a daughter that is 17 years old today. I did not escape the statistics at that point. However, then I did manage to escape the statistics regarding solo mothers from the *favelas*. I was able to raise my daughter, and it changed my perspective. I was a teenage mom and had to drop out of the preparatory community course for university. Since 2000, here at the *favela* of *Maré*, I have been dedicating myself to culture and education. In this place, which is known by the violence, we are exposed to oppression many times and from many ways. I do not think we have to accept that. It is not ok. We cannot normalize the fact that if you enter the *favela*, you must turn on the house's lights. At the same time, it is also not right to leave the *favela* and be threatened by a security officer that says he has not killed anybody today until that moment. So, we will go in, go out, and we will make politics, we will resist, we will show our faces because this is something that I am proud of. Let us go together and collectively debate about *favela* issues, about gender equality in this city that excludes so many people. So, these are the three pillars of my campaign: the gender issue, the racism issue, and the blackness. Who are these black women that are in the *favelas* today, their kids, their losses, their struggle, their work?... We must confront and think about all these issues through the lens of gender. From this perspective and dialogue, we must determine how we, as women, interact with the state.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Furthermore, to me, this is central. Women are not just about affection and assertiveness. We also have strength; we have a higher level of comprehension about the process that affects our lives⁸.

The text above was presented by Marielle Franco for the 2016 municipal elections in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. At that time, she was a sociologist that had coordinated the Human Rights and Citizenship Committee of the Legislative Assembly of Rio de Janeiro (Alerj) for the last years and a not yet well-known figure of the national politics.

Black, solo mother, bisexual and from *Maré*, Rio de Janeiro's biggest complex of *favelas*, Marielle was a young political leader. In 2017 she initiated her mandate as the fifth most voted city council with 46,500 votes⁹, of which only 1,600 were voters in and around *Maré*.

On 14 March 2018, 21:30, at *Rua dos Inválidos*, she was shot to death in downtown Rio along with her driver, Anderson Gomes, when 13 shots hit the vehicle. They had just left an event called 'Young Black Women Who Are Changing Power Structures' that brought together women to discuss racism, feminism, and politics.

She was shot to death with four gunshots in her head. Fernanda Gonçalves Chaves, Marielle's assistant, was also in the car and got hit by shrapnel. Today, for security reasons, she lives outside Brazil.

8 Marielle Franco - PSol (Mídia NINJA 2016)

<<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IKSWfgZLKMA&t=3s>>.

9 Miguel Caballero, 'Da Maré, Marielle Franco Chega à Câmara Como a Quinta Mais Votada' (O Globo, 4 October 2016) <<https://oglobo.globo.com/brasil/da-mare-marielle-franco-chega-camara-como-quinta-mais-votada-20228691>>.

Images from security cameras showed two cars suspected of had been used in the murder circulating in the region hours before the crime. Around 18:30, half an hour before Marielle arrives at the venue, a silver car passes by. At 18:55, another vehicle, the one in which the killers were to be found, enters the street. The windows have a very dark film, and it is not possible to quickly identify the occupants. The driver pulls up next to a parking space, but gives up parking, and gets even closer to the venue.

Three minutes later, Anderson and Marielle's white car passes by. She disembarks and arrives at the event at 19:00. The cameras also show a silver car, similar to the one that passed before Marielle came at the event, circling the block two more times after 19:00. The killers waited for over two hours looking out the vehicle in which Marielle, her driver and her assistant were in the ambush moment. It was 21:10 and four kilometres far from the event they had just left. From that time, Marielle could not escape the statistics.

1.1 Black people, black women

'To be a black woman is to resist and survive all the time. People look at our bodies, making us smaller; they investigate whether there are drugs or lice under the turban; they deny our existence.'

Marielle said it in an interview to the *Brasil de Fato* website during National Day of Struggle of the Landless Women in 2017. In politics, Marielle sought to draw attention to what it is like to be a black woman in Brazil, which is at the base of the social pyramid.

56.10%. According to the Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics (IBGE), this is the percentage of people who declare themselves black in Brazil. Among the country's 209.2 million inhabitants, 19.2 million considered themselves black, while 89.7 million, brown. Black people — which IBGE considers blacks and browns — are, therefore, most of the population. The superiority in numbers, however, is not yet reflected in Brazilian society.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

Although blacks are the majority in the public universities¹⁰ for the first time in Brazil, they are still a minority in leadership positions in the labour market and among political representatives in the legislature. They are also a tiny part of the Brazilian judiciary and are underrepresented in the culture and entertainment industry, being a minority among the winners and award juries¹¹ winners. However, among those who are unemployed or under-employed, blacks are the majority. They are also the majority among homicide victims and make up more than 60% of the country's prison population.

Hence, what is noticeable is that our society's bases institutions work in the logic of reproducing inequality. That is the structural racism in force in Brazil.

Among the 10% of the Brazilian population that have the highest income in the country, only 27.7% are black. In 2018, 15.4% of whites lived on less than US\$ 5.50 a day in Brazil — a figure adopted by the World Bank to indicate the poverty line in medium-sized economies, such as Brazil. Among blacks and browns, the percentage was higher: it reached 32.9% of the population. IBGE shows that extreme poverty, when people live

10 According to data from the Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics (IBGE), the number of self-declared black and brown students in public universities totalled 1.14 million in 2018, while whites occupied 1.05 million places. This is equivalent, respectively, to 50.3% and 48.2% of the more than 2.19 million Brazilians enrolled in public universities. This is the first time that blacks occupy more than half of the places in public universities. According to IBGE, the advance of this portion of the population is the result of the quota system, which since 2012 has reserved places for candidates from certain groups. 'Negros São Maioria Pela Primeira Vez Nas Universidades Públicas, Aponta IBGE - Jornal O Globo' <<https://oglobo.globo.com/sociedade/educacao/negros-sao-maioria-pela-primeira-vez-nas-universidades-publicas-aponta-ibge-24077731>> accessed 18 July 2020.

11Nathália Afonso, '[Agência Lupa] Dia da Consciência Negra: números expõem desigualdade racial no Brasil' (Agência Lupa, 20 November 2019) <<https://piaui.folha.uol.com.br/lupa/2019/11/20/consciencia-negra-numeros-brasil/>> accessed 23 August 2020.

on less than the US \$ 1.90 a day, affects 8.8% of the black population in the country and 3.6% of the white Brazilians.

According to the most recent data from the Brazilian Ministry of Health compiled by the *Atlas of Violence*, launched by the Institute for Applied Economic Research (Ipea) and the Brazilian Public Security Forum (FBSP)¹², in 10 years — from 2007 to 2017 — Brazil has become a country with more death potential for blacks than for non-blacks. The homicide rate of blacks increased by 33.1% in the period, while that of whites increased by 3.3%.

It means that blacks are the ones who die the most and are also the population with the highest rate of violent deaths.

In 2017, 75.5% of the people murdered in the country were black or brown, the equivalent of 49,524 victims. It means that the chance of a young black man being a victim of homicide in Brazil is 2.5 times greater than that of a young white man. On average, one young black man is killed in Brazil every 23 minutes¹³.

According to Ipea, if a person is a black woman the chance of being killed is also higher than a white woman in Brazil: between 2007 and 2017, the rate of homicide for black women grew 29.9%, while for non-black women increased by 1.6%. With this variation, black women's homicide rate reached 5.6 per 100,000, while that of non-black women ended 2017 at 3.2 per 100,000.

12 Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada; Fórum Brasileiro de Segurança Pública (n 2).

13 TV Senado, 'A cada 23 minutos um jovem negro está sendo assassinado no Brasil, diz pesquisadora' (TV Senado, 6 December 2018) <<https://www12.senado.leg.br/tv/programas/noticias-1/2018/12/a-cada-23-minutos-um-jovem-negro-esta-sendo-assassinado-no-brasil-diz-pesquisadora>> accessed 23 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Nine black women were murdered per day in Brazil in 2017. They already account for two-thirds of all female homicide victims in the country — in 2007 they were 54%.

In other words, and numbers, from the almost 5,000 murders of women in 2017, 66% were black. The fact that women's lives continue to be claimed and that the bodies that fall are majority black bodies reveals the insufficiency of existing guarantees and, more broadly, the fragility and absence of an established democratic rule of law.

In general comparison, The 2018 Global Study on Homicide - Gender-related killing of women and girls, by The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC)¹⁴, shows that the global rate of total female homicide in 2017 was estimated to be 2.3 per 100,000 female population. In Latin America, nine women were murdered each day victims of gender-based violence. The region, according to the report, is the most dangerous place in the world for women outside a war zone.

Brazil faces 4.7 cases of deaths of women for each group of 100,000 inhabitants. This average means that almost half of the terrible number of 2,559 murders occurred in Brazil, a country with advanced legislation on the subject, but with a support structure that does not meet the demand. In 2017, 1,133 Brazilian women were murdered for gender reasons: an average of three per day¹⁵.

14 UN Women, The Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights and Rapporteur on violence against women, 'Violence Against Women in Politics - Expert Group Meeting Report & Recommendations' (UN Women 2018) Violence Against Women in Politics.

15 Elena Reina, Mar Centenera and Santiago Torrado, 'América Latina é a região mais letal para as mulheres | Notícias | EL PAÍS Brasil' (El País, 27 November 2018)
<https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2018/11/24/actualidad/1543075049_751281.html> accessed 23 August 2020.

Besides that, for the first time, the most recent *Atlas of Violence* focused on reports of violent crimes related to sexual orientation and gender identity. According to the report, although the problem is mostly invisible to the official statistics, the few existing data indicates that this type of violence has also worsened.

The *Grupo Gay da Bahia*, one of the mains organizations that recorded data on violence against LGBTQIA+ in Brazil since 1979, shows that at least one lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans or cross-dresser person is murdered in the country every day. In 2018, according to the annual report, 420 deaths were registered. The data show that 76% of them were homicides, and 24% were suicides. The numbers put Brazil in the ranking of countries that kills the most LGBTQIA+ people in the world¹⁶.

1.2 Human rights defenders

Brazil is one of the most dangerous countries for human rights defenders. According to the organization Front Line Defenders¹⁷, on its annual report, 321 human rights defenders were killed in the world in 2018, 23 in Brazil. This number makes the country the fifth in the world ranking of human rights defenders' deaths.

16 Eduardo Michels, Luiz Mott and Paulinho, 'Mortes violentas de LGBT+ no Brasil 2018' (Grupo Gay da Bahia 2019) <<https://grupogaydabahia.files.wordpress.com/2019/01/relat%C3%B3rio-de-crimes-contra-lgbt-brasil-2018-grupo-gay-da-bahia.pdf>> accessed 23 August 2020.

17Front Line Defenders, 'Front Line Defenders Global Analysis 2018' (Front Line, the International Foundation for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders 2019) <www.frontlinedefenders.org>.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

In the report *Human Rights in the Americas: Retrospective 2019*¹⁸, Amnesty International pointed out that Latin America is the most dangerous place in the world for human rights defenders.

Since 2018, with the election of the far right-wing politician Jair Bolsonaro as President, Brazil has seen public authorities' speeches against human rights being translated into administrative and legislative measures, with tangible impacts on the limitation and loss of fundamental rights of the population.

In December 2019, The National Council for Human Rights in Brazil released an official recommendation for the Jair Bolsonaro government to immediately adapt to the National Human Rights Program 3 (PNHD) in its activities, administrative practices, and public statements. The recommendation came after the Council concludes that Bolsonaro and his administration violated the program, instituted by law in 2009, 36 times. Much of the disrespect for the PNDH occurred through statements by the president¹⁹.

18 Amnesty International, 'Facts & Figures: Human Rights in the Americas in 2019' (2019) <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2020/02/facts-and-figures-human-rights-in-the-americas-in-2019/>> accessed 23 August 2020.

19 The council is a collegiate body with 11 members of civil society and 11 members of the Public Ministry, whose purpose is the promotion and defence of human rights in Brazil. The council is not a government body, but is linked to the Ministry of Women, Family and Human Rights. Among the Council's competences, the most important are the inspection and monitoring of public human rights policies carried out by the federal government and the application of the National Human Rights Program. The Council can also initiate procedures to investigate possible violations of fundamental rights. The National Human Rights Program 3 is the main human rights guideline in Brazil and is a voluntary commitment by the country to the United Nations. Marcelo Oliveira, 'Gestão Bolsonaro violou 36 vezes programa de direitos humanos, diz conselho' (UOL Notícias, 12 December 2019)

We are living a grave moment and full of threats to the guarantee of fundamental rights of Brazilians. It is what the report produced by Human Rights Watch on Brazil, part of the World Report 2019²⁰, reveals. In its 29th edition, Human Rights Watch analysed human rights practices in more than 100 countries.

According to Maria Laura Canineu, director of the Human Rights Watch Brazil office, impunity in cases of violence against human rights and environment defenders and communicators exposes severe flaws in the Brazilian state, in all its spheres: investigating these abuses and the significant interaction of the various authorities responsible for a criminal prosecution, would consequently make us achieve the respective and fundamental responsibility of the perpetrators. All of this could help to interrupt the cycle of violence that is so perverse in Brazil. Still, according to Canineu, the lack of a solution in Marielle's case generates extreme distrust about the Brazilian state's capacity to do justice and to repair the victims of abuse²¹.

<<https://noticias.uol.com.br/politica/ultimas-noticias/2019/12/12/gestao-bolsonaro-violou-36-vezes-programa-de-direitos-humanos-diz-conselho.htm>> accessed 23 August 2020.

20 Human Rights Watch, 'World Report 2019' (Human Rights Watch, 4 December 2018)
<<https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2019>> accessed 23 August 2020.

21 GIFE, 'Relatório da Human Rights Watch aponta graves ameaças aos direitos' (GIFE, 11 March 2019)
<<https://gife.org.br/relatorio-mundial-2019-da-human-rights-watch-aponta-graves-ameacas-aos-direitos-humanos-no-brasil/>> accessed 23 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

2

CRIME AND POLITICS

2.1 Marielle Franco, the city councillor

‘I propose to cooperate to guarantee rights in a space as misogynist as the state is’,

Part of Marielle’s speech during the election campaign in 2016. She did what she said. While she could, Marielle always did her best to bring female agendas, especially black women, and lesbians.

In 2002 Marielle started her college studies in Social Sciences with a full scholarship in Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro, one of the leading private universities in Rio. At that time, she was already a mother. Her daughter, Luyara, was born when Marielle was 19 years old.

In 2006, she joined the campaign of Marcelo Freixo, then a candidate for state deputy for the left-wing party Socialism and Freedom Party (PSOL), in the community of *Maré*, where he was her professor at the preparatory community course for university.

Marielle was Freixo’s advisor for ten years. He became known for his fight against militias formed by police and corrupt former police officers in the poor communities of Rio de Janeiro and has been under police protection for years. She also coordinated the Commission for the Defence of Human Rights and Citizenship of the Legislative Assembly of Rio de Janeiro, alongside Marcelo Freixo.

In 2014, she defended a master's dissertation at Federal Fluminense University, analysing the public security policy of the state of Rio de Janeiro, specifically studying the Pacifying Police Units (UPP) program²².

Finally, in 2016, she was a candidate for councillor for PSOL, and obtained 46,500 votes, making her the fifth most voted city councillor elected. The number of votes was considered a surprise for PSOL team.

Marielle Franco had tirelessly denounced police brutality affecting the black population in the city of Rio de Janeiro. One of her last posts on social media was about the homicide of a young man: 'Another homicide of a young man who may be on the police account. Matheus Melo was leaving the church. How many more will need to die for this war to end?'²³.

She also strongly opposed the authorization of military intervention in Rio²⁴. As a counsellor, she was appointed rapporteur in a chamber committee that would oversee federal intervention in Rio de Janeiro.

22 The Pacifying Police Units (UPPs) in the favelas of Rio de Janeiro are public security program implemented by the Government of Rio de Janeiro from 2008. The objective is to establish the end of drug trafficking territories in Rio's favelas through the permanent occupation of police units in strategically chosen locations.

23 Available at <https://twitter.com/mariellefranco/status/973568966403731456>

24 The federal intervention in the city of Rio de Janeiro happened from February 2016 to December 2018, by an inedited decree by former President Michel Temer. In practice, he transferred the command of the police, firefighters, and prisons of Rio de Janeiro to the hands of the federal army. The measure was a response to the scenes of theft in the capital of Rio de Janeiro that took over the TVs at that year's Carnival. It also allowed the government to abandon controversial political reforms that were on the agenda. Federal intervention has not produced significant changes in Rio de Janeiro's security. Data show, for example, that there was a significant increase in shots and shootings (57%), massacres (64%) and deaths caused by police officers (34%), compared to the same period last year (February to December).

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Among her 17 filed bills and as chairman of the Chamber Women's Committee in Alerj, her defence of women's rights is clear. 'If it is legal, it has to be real' was the name of a law project to inform women about the situations in which abortion is legal in Brazil, such as rape. She also intended to create a dossier which would gather information on gender violence in the city. Another prominent project suggested the creation of day-care centres where mothers and fathers could leave their children when they need to study or work at night.

In September 2017, Marielle managed to pass a bill for the construction of new birth centres in partnership with hospitals to assist pregnant women and women at the postpartum period. She also proposed creating the municipal day of lesbian visibility and the day of fighting against the incarceration of black youth in order to strength and support these movements in civil society.

Her most recent law project intended to value Rio's funk music as a cultural movement²⁵. The bill was approved after her death. In August 2018, the Legislative Assembly of Rio de Janeiro approved in a second-round five bills authored by Marielle.

It is clear that her death also represents an interruption of a legislative agenda of significant public interest. How important was the presence of a person like Marielle,

Violent deaths overall fell slightly by 2%. The number of police officers killed in 2018 (92) was the lowest in the historical series, according to the PM.Felipe Betim, 'Intervenção no Rio se aproxima do fim com recorde de mortes por policiais e mais tiroteios' (EL PAÍS, 18 December 2018) <https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2018/12/18/politica/1545165331_275511.html> accessed 23 August 2020.

25Pâmela Carbonari, 'Quem foi Marielle Franco, a vereadora executada no Rio' (Super) <<https://super.abril.com.br/sociedade/quem-foi-marielle-franco-a-vereadora-executada-no-rio/>> accessed 23 August 2020.

who, occupying a space of public proposition, gave voice to a layer of the population that is daily silenced? How can we measure the impact of this regarding the maintenance of rights and also the sufficient vigilance of right's violations? The violence suffered by her is political violence, which undermines the social status of the ones she represented.

2.2 A crime against democracy

'How many more are going to need to die for this war to end? How many innocents died and will die in the same way?'

Posted by Marielle in a tweet the day before she died

What unites, for example, Marielle Franco with Juana Quispe²⁶, a city councillor from a small town in Bolivia that was found murdered in La Paz, the country's largest city, in 2012 and who was threatened several times for helping other women victims of harassment? Or with the British feminist parliamentarian Jo Cox, murdered in 2016 for reasons that mix misogyny and hatred of her political ideology?

The answer would be death, silencing, and the attempt to erase the narrative and history of women who swayed with the political structures. It cannot be said that Necropolitics is the context in the mentioned cases; however, the political violence to which women are exposed is a relevant factor, whether in Latin America or Europe.

²⁶BBC, 'Bolivian Women Battle against Culture of Harassment' BBC News (12 March 2014) <<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-26446066>> accessed 23 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

The 2016 survey *Sexism, Harassment and Violence Against Women Parliamentarians*²⁷, by the Inter-Parliament Union (IPU) that analysed female politicians' situation in 39 countries, showed that 82% of them had experienced some form of psychological violence, with 44% facing violent threats. In a survey about European female parliamentarians and staffers, IPU shows that 58% of interviewed women had received threats of violence online with mentions about death or rape²⁸.

That is the reason why Marielle Franco's election in 2016 represents the exception, as a black woman — although presumably not an exception to the threats, and that is one of the reasons her death constitutes a crime against democracy.

For every ten candidates in the 2016 municipal elections, only three were women, according to data from the Brazilian Superior Electoral Court (TSE). The proportion has not changed since the last municipal elections in 2012 and remains below the average of the Brazilian population. The Brazilian population is made up of 51,8% of women.

Of the 465,446 candidacies throughout Brazil that year, only 14.2% were women, 156,317. In the legislative, 13.5% of elected city councillors were women — or 7,818 out of 57,800 candidates.

Only 329 of these 7,818 women councillors were black, 4,2%. Altogether, 9 of the 27 capitals and the federal district did not elect any black or brown woman as a city

27 Inter-Parliamentary Union, 'Sexism, Harassment and Violence against Women Parliamentarians' 12 <<https://primarysources.brillonline.com/browse/human-rights-documents-online/sexism-harassment-and-violence-against-women-parliamentarians;hrdhrd10212016006>> accessed 23 August 2020.

28 Jamille Bigio and Rachel Vogelstein, 'Women Under Attack -The Backlash Against Female Politicians' (Foreign Affairs, January 2020) <<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/2019-12-10/women-under-attack>> accessed 23 August 2020.

councillor. Marielle was one of 32 black women among 811 elected city councillors in Brazilian capitals.²⁹

The presence of a woman like her in spaces dominated by an overwhelming majority of white men breaks centuries of practice. It allows these women to verbalize a prominent and previously silenced voice, either from the communities or from her colour, sexuality, or social condition.

In a democracy, women must have their participation ensured, however, when a black woman, who moved structures from the periphery to the space of politics, is killed, it shudders what has been built for democracy to be a political and social regime.

Violence against women in politics prevents participation and punishes those who leave. It distorts representation and restricts the majority group to access politics. Brazilian women, for example, are most of the population and the electorate. It also implies the denial of political debate on gender violence, racism, and homophobia, as in the case of Marielle.

Even though Brazil has specific legislation to guarantee the female presence in politics and is a signatory to international instruments such as the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action³⁰, the country is inefficient in terms of the occupation of parliamentary seats by women.

29 TSE, 'Eleições 2016: país elege 7.803 vereadoras e 638 prefeitas em primeiro turno' (Tribunal Superior Eleitoral, 2016) <<http://www.tse.jus.br/imprensa/noticias-tse/2016/Outubro/eleicoes-2016-pais-elege-7-803-vereadoras-e-638-prefeitas-em-primeiro-turno>> accessed 23 August 2020.

30 The Beijing Platform for Action was adopted by the United Nations' fourth World Conference on Women: Action for Equality, Development and PA, which took place in Beijing, China, in 1995. It enshrined three innovations with great transformative potential in the struggle to promote the situation

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

The most recent study with the global rankings of women in executive, governmental and parliamentary positions, the Global Map of Women in Politics in 2020, from the IPU and UN Women, places Brazil in 140th place in a list of 193 countries. In Latin America, Brazil is only ahead of Belize (169°) and Haiti (186°). With only two women among the 22 ministries (9.1%), the country now occupies the 154th position in ministerial positions compared to 190 countries in the ranking.

The existence of democracy depends on ensuring that women's political participation is ensured and that violence against us do not silence those who make themselves heard.

Francó's assassination shows not only that differentiating between violence against women in politics and backlash is intense, but also that the two phenomena sometimes occur concurrently. Her murder was both an attempt at silencing an inconvenient voice protesting police brutality (backlash) and an attempt at silencing the voice of a black, bisexual, poor woman defending the rights of those most marginalized (violence against women in politics). In the current political climate in Brazil, and globally, the silencing of marginalized communities cannot be ignored³¹.

As Flávia Biroli explains, 'violence against women in politics is grounded in sexist values, practices, and institutions'³². In the specific case of Brazil,

and rights of women: the concept of gender, the notion of empowerment and the focus on transversally. United Nations, 'Beijing Declaration and Platform of Action', (1995).

31 Juliana Restrepo Sanín, 'Violence against Women in Politics: Latin America in an Era of Backlash' (2020) 45 *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 302
<<https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/10.1086/704954>> accessed 23 August 2020.

32 Flávia Biroli, 'Violence against Women and Reactions to Gender Equality in Politics' (2018) 14 *Politics & Gender* 681

since 2015, organized attacks against a ‘gender perspective’ and a so-called gender ideology in laws, public policies, and education have occurred in the Brazilian Congress, as well as in local politics. Critics of gender equality frame feminists as enemies and seek to reaffirm the traditional family and women’s conventional roles³³.

This kind of violence has been escalating in Brazil. Since the impeachment process of ex-president Dilma Rousseff in 2016, there was a clear trivialization of political gender violence, the result of political disagreement and hate speech. Then, the government assumed by the then vice-president from 2016 until 2018, Michel Temer, was composed of all-white male cabinet and reversed progressive public policies related to women and minorities adopted during Rousseff’s tenure³⁴.

The theme gained greater prominence from 2018 when the Superior Electoral Court approved access to the political party’s fund and the guarantee of television time for candidates. It was also in that year that the distribution of electoral funds and free advertising on radio and TV started to obey the proportion of male and female candidates. As a result, the expansion of the female bench grown by 50% in the National Congress. However, the referenced law was put in practice in October 2018, seven months after Marielle’s death.

<https://www.cambridge.org/core/product/identifier/S1743923X18000600/type/journal_article> accessed 23 August 2020.

33 *ibid* 683.

34 Sanín (n 30) 305. *ibid*.

2.3 Political femicide

‘Roses of resistance are born on the asphalt. We receive roses, but we will be clenched fist by talking about our existence against the mandates and misconduct that affect our lives’,

Marielle’s speech on International Women’s Day in the plenary session of the Legislative Assembly of Rio de Janeiro in 2018. For Marielle, March should be seen as a month of fighting: fighting against all the violations, abuses, harassment, and so many rights that women still need to guarantee, so they are not taken as inferior subjects.

Since the execution of Marielle Franco, state deputy of Rio de Janeiro Renata Souza has provoked public debate on the concept of ‘political femicide’. The concept makes visible the murder of female leaders due to their political activities and or organized social movements.

Giving violence a legal name is a way to reinforce that conduct is socially unacceptable and a crucial legal asset to protect the subject. In the Democratic State of Law, Criminal Law is not an instrument of repression or oppression; therefore, it exercises the role as a regulator of social contacts, through the application of penalties that aim only to curb harmful actions and encourage lawful conduct. To expose these conditions and to give names to this conduct is to raise the curtain of an unknown fact and point out the Brazilian democracy’s institutional limits, already marked by the marginalization of black women and other ignored peripheric groups.

Although the term ‘political femicide’ has not yet been officially given legal effect, it was used during the federalization trial of the case, which took place in May 2020. The responsible court voted unanimously for the non-federalization — which will be further discussed in this work. In his vote, Minister Rogério Schietti made a defence of Marielle’s history of militancy, expressly mentioned the presence of the gender component in her

murder and, besides, detached the concept of political femicide, highlighting the social markers of her death:

She was a woman from the periphery, black and lesbian. Ingredients that, in a patriarchal, misogynistic and racist culture, potentiated the reaction of those who felt uncomfortable, either by the denunciations made during her mandate or because of the position of an intimidating woman representing minorities and who denounced militiamen in the repeated and permanent violation of the rights of people who live in communities³⁵.

Renata Souza explains that the concept of political femicide starts from the observation of Brazilian society and the context in which the summary execution of a woman with an ascending career in politics occurs:

Marielle was elected by 46,502 people who understood that all her struggle against social inequalities, especially those of gender, race, and class, is necessary so that humanity does not become dehumanized. A message also assimilated by the world, who knew about her life after her death. The attempt to interrupt her political escalation, even though there were no real threats, is justified because Marielle represented, and still represents, a threat to the rotten powers allied to mafias in Rio de Janeiro³⁶,

explained Renata in an interview for the newspaper El País.

If from one side, it is essential to give a legal name to the political murder of women for gender reasons, on the other side, it is urgent to engage people in politics, to massively transform the

35 Augusto Fernandes, 'STJ decide manter investigação do caso Marielle no Rio de Janeiro' (Correio Braziliense, 27 May 2020)

<https://www.correiobraziliense.com.br/app/noticia/politica/2020/05/27/interna_politica,858838/stj-decide-manter-investigacao-do-caso-marielle-no-rio-de-janeiro.shtml> accessed 23 August 2020.

36 Renata Souza, 'O feminicídio político de Marielle Franco' (El País, 14 March 2019)

<https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2019/03/14/politica/1552562116_307529.html> accessed 23 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

conditions of existence and force the redistribution of power. Renata Souza is one of these cases. She is even what we can call ‘Seeds of Marielle’.

Renata studied with Marielle in her pre-university course and university. Also, they worked together for ten years in the parliamentarian Marcelo Freixo’s office. In October 2018, Renata Souza launched candidate for state deputy for Rio de Janeiro through PSOL, the same party as Marielle, and was elected: ‘I often say that Marielle’s legacy is not a person’s legacy, it would be unfair to history. Her legacy is universal. It is for humanity’³⁷.

2.4 The crime’s authors, politics, and other relevant details

On 14 March 2020, the murder of Marielle Franco and her driver Anderson Gomes completed two years without a solution.

The Civil Police of Rio de Janeiro and the Public Ministry of Rio de Janeiro State oversees the investigations, which led to the arrest of the military reserve police officer Ronnie Lessa and the former police officer Élcio Vieira de Queiroz in 2019.

For the police and prosecutors, Queiroz drove the car used on the night of the crime, and Lessa, from the back seat, fired the shots. Both are charged for triple-qualified murder of two persons for a terrible reason and ambush the victims without giving them a chance to defend themselves. They will go to trial by a not scheduled yet jury.

37 Felipe Betim, ‘As ‘outras’ Marielles que o Rio elegeu’ (EL PAÍS, 13 October 2018)

<https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2018/10/11/politica/1539275009_606211.html> accessed 23 August 2020.

Both Elcio Queiroz and Ronnie Lessa are well-known figures in Rio's criminal underworld. The investigators did not reveal details about the means used by the police to reach Lessa. It is only said that his name appeared in the investigations in October 2018, when the involvement of the 'Office of Crime' — a group of hired killers composed by militiamen — it was already a line of investigation in Marielle's case by the Public Ministry of Rio. The intelligence sector confirmed Lessa presence in the car through the analysis of infrared signal cameras.

Among the international human rights organizations that are following the case, Amnesty International Brazil has played an essential role in putting pressure on Brazilian authorities and conducting campaigns in public places and the media for the solution of the case.

The following information was compiled in Amnesty International's report entitled *The Labyrinth of the Marielle Franco Murder Case*. The document indicates the doubts and failures of the investigations that have taken place so far. According to the report, the information listed in this document was released by the following Brazilian press, including television, print and digital media: *TV Globo; TV GloboNews; TV Record; Agência Brasil; O Estado de S.Paulo; Extra, Folha de S.Paulo; O Dia; O Globo; Veja; G1; R7; UOL*:

'Although the investigations are confidential, such information from the press indicates that the murder of Marielle Franco was carefully planned, a sophisticated crime and that state agents and security forces may have attended it'³⁸.

Shots:

A total of 13 shots were made. The ammunition used was a 9 mm calibre, which is of restricted use in Brazil. The ammunition would be from batch UZZ-18, a batch belonging

38 Anistia Internacional, 'O labirinto do caso Marielle Franco' <<https://anistia.org.br/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/labirinto-caso-marielle.pdf>>.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

to the Federal Police. According to the Minister of Public Security, the UZZ-18 lot was diverted at the post office in Paraíba state in 2009. According to the post office, there is no record of this episode. Ammunition belonging to the same UZZ-18 lot would have been used in a massacre in São Paulo in August 2015. This massacre killed around 20 people in the cities of Osasco and Barueri, among other locations. It counted on the participation of police officers who would be part of a death squad. Partial fingerprints were reportedly found in capsules of the ammunition used.

The murder weapons:

Initially, it was announced that the weapon used would be a 9 mm pistol, adapted to shoot in sequence. Subsequently, it was disclosed that the weapon used was an HK-MP5 submachine gun, of German origin, which is also of restricted use and not very common in Brazil. The Civil Police of Rio de Janeiro has 60 units of this armament, and The Battalion of Special Operations of the Military Police of Rio de Janeiro (Bope) has 11 units. Five units of submachine guns of this same model HK-MP5 had disappeared from the arsenal of the Civil Police in 2011.

Used cars and electronic devices and security cameras:

Video footage shows a vehicle waiting for Marielle to leave the event, then followed the city councillors' car and committed the crime. In the video, it is possible to see that the driver uses a small device that looks like a cell phone at different times. Two cars were reportedly used in the murder, and at least one was said to have used a 'cloned' license plate. The partial route of one of the cars is disclosed. Some security cameras, part of the system that powers the Integrated Command and Control Centre in Rio de Janeiro, which

would specifically cover the place where the murder happened, would have been turned off on the evening of the crime.

Investigative procedures

There was no x-ray done of the bodies of Marielle Franco and Anderson Gomes. Authorities justify that they did not do the X-ray due to the lack of equipment in good use. Besides, they did not store the car correctly and preserved. Military police officers reportedly ordered eyewitnesses to leave the crime scene, and they would not have been sought after to give their testimony. A man mentioned in the press as a suspect alleged being coerced by the police to assume the crime (this topic will be further elaborated).

The civil police also used footage from private security cameras. Part of the images, however, was lost, according to Giniton Lages, the investigator responsible for leading the first phase investigations. The reason was the procedure adopted by the police, which left parts out of the checking. According to Lages, some saved files taken to the Homicide Police Station could not be accessed either.

In the end, the left images show the murderers' car between 17:34 and 18:44 on the day of the murder. Marielle was killed around 21:30.

A UOL news website report states that a video with security images was lost because the police recorded files with an incompatible format. According to the report³⁹, this video could be used to identify the car's occupants more easily. The police returned to the

39 Flávio Costa and Marina Lang, 'Polícia Civil perdeu imagens dos assassinos de Marielle no dia do atentado' (UOL Notícias, 13 October 2019) <<https://noticias.uol.com.br/cotidiano/ultimas-noticias/2019/10/13/policia-civil-perdeu-imagens-dos-assassinos-de-marielle-no-dia-do-atentado.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

commercial establishment that recorded the images 15 days after the murder. However, the images were no longer available.

All the information leaves a trail of unanswered questions. It exposes severe issues that have not been answered, possible inconsistencies and contradictions during the investigation, in addition, to raise doubts about the work of the competent authorities.

Until March 2019, the investigation had 29 volumes and 5,700 pages; 230 statements; 33,329 telephone lines analysed and 533 gigabytes of data.

A second phase of the investigation, which is in course, aims to reach possible crime's orders and to clarify what motivated the murders in addition to Ronnie Lessa hatred of human rights activists and left-wing politicians, as highlighted by the delegates and prosecutors.

The possibility of her case been classified as just a 'hate crime' is controversy and is vehemently rejected by family, friends, and co-workers of her. The data surrounding the event seems to point elsewhere. 'This version of hate crime is unacceptable, it makes no sense, it is stupid,' says the congressman and Marielle's friend Marcelo Freixo. 'The breakdown of the investigation is worrying, but the police and the Public Ministry should reach out to the responsible. We want answers. Who is behind this crime? This crime is political. It is necessary to show which is the political group interested in Marielle's death', pointed Freixo in an interview in 2019⁴⁰.

40 Sérgio Ramalho, 'Morte de Marielle: 'Falar em crime de ódio é inaceitável', afirma Freixo' (UOL Notícias, 12 March 2019) <<https://noticias.uol.com.br/cotidiano/ultimas-noticias/2019/03/12/delegados-da-pf-apresentaram-falsa-testemunha-no-caso-marielle-diz-freixo.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020.

Although tracing a psychological profile of a murderer is part of an investigation like that, and there may have been a will of the executioners, Rio police consider Ronnie Lessa and Elcio Vieira de Queiroz professional militiamen killers capable of sophisticated crime.

Recent investigations and the seizure of weapons found in the home of what would have been a childhood friend of Lessa — 117 incomplete fake rifles, but with equal destructive potential — generate suspicions that guns trafficking is among the various criminal businesses realized by the accused.

As if there was not enough evidence that he is a hired killer, Lessa drew the attention of the police after he was the victim of an attack on 27 April 2018, more than a month after the murder of Marielle and Anderson, and that would be related to her death.

The case was registered as armed robbery, but there are several gaps in the investigation, and there are suspicions of witness elimination. In the file of the investigation, Lessa reacted to an assault after parking his car.

Alessandro Carvalho Neves, identified as the perpetrator of the crime, arrived on a motorcycle, stopped near the scene, drew his revolver, and announced the assault. Lessa would have become unbalanced in action for using a prosthesis on his left leg and fell. A firefighter, identified as Maxwell Correia, who was going to lunch with Lessa, told Neves to drop the gun, but Neves shot instead.

Two shots hit Lessa in the neck, and one in Maxwell's leg. The firefighter also managed to hit a shot in the back of Neves, who ran away. Hours later he was arrested and sentenced to 13 years and four months in prison.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

According to police officers that agreed to talk by off the record to a news website⁴¹, several factors raised suspicions about a possible witness elimination. However, the investigations did not consider this possibility.

Neves is from another state, and until the day of the crime, there were no records of crimes committed by him in Rio de Janeiro. Seven months earlier, he was released from prison in the countryside of São Paulo state, where he was in jail for theft. There is nothing in the investigation that explains why Alessandro Neves was in Rio and chose Ronnie Lessa as his target.

Lessa and Maxwell were taken to different hospitals, and there is no way to claim that the bullet, which would not have been removed from Lessa's neck, came from the assailant's weapon. Besides that, the crime scene was not investigated, and it is unknown where are located the revolver and motorcycle that Alessandro Neves used in the assault.

Neves had a sentence of 13 years in prison confirmed two weeks after Ronnie Lessa and the former police officer Élcio Vieira de Queiroz arrests.

Maxwell, the other victim of the assault, is considered Lessa's partner in illegal businesses and was the subject of a warrant as part of Marielle's case investigations. In 2020 he was arrested. The Civil Police and the Public Ministry of Rio point the firefighter as an accomplice to ex-sergeant Ronnie Lessa, and for deliberately disrupting the investigation on Marielle's case.

41 Flávio Costa, 'Assalto a Ronnie Lessa: As Lacunas de Uma Possível Tentativa de Queima de Arquivo No Caso Marielle' (UOL Notícias, 11 December 2019) <<https://noticias.uol.com.br/cotidiano/ultimas-noticias/2019/12/11/caso-marielle-assalto-quase-matou-ronnie-lessa-policial-militar.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020.

According to investigators, the firefighter loaned the car for Lessa's weapons disposal the day after the former policeman was arrested in March 2019. Among the armaments that were thrown into the ocean, would be the gun used in the crime, the HK-MP5.

Maxwell is suspect of the act along with four other people suspected of hiding the weapons used by the killers, Elaine Pereira Figueiredo Lessa, wife of Ronnie Lessa, her brother and three more people.

Besides, Maxwell is also investigated for money laundering. The firefighter's home and assets do not match his income as a firefighter, and he is suspected of running illicit businesses in Rio de Janeiro.

2.5 Palácio do Planalto⁴²

The name of Brazilian President Jair Bolsonaro appeared in the investigations following the testimony of a doorman in the condominium *Vivendas da Barra*, on Barra da Tijuca, a wealthy region of Rio de Janeiro, where the President lived before taking office in January 2019.

The testimony would indicate that one of those accused of the murder would have arrived at the condominium and said that he would go to the home of then-deputy Jair Bolsonaro. It would have happened hours before Marielle's death.

⁴² The Palácio do Planalto is the official Presidential Office of Brazil. It is located in Brasília, the Brazilian federal capital. The building was designed by architect Oscar Niemeyer and completed in April 1960. Governo Federal, 'Palácio Do Planalto' (Presidência da República) <<https://www.gov.br/planalto/pt-br/conheca-a-presidencia/palacios-e-residencias/palacio-do-planalto>> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

The Public Ministry, however, then said that the doorman's testimony did not match the scientific evidence obtained and that he may have lied. Furthermore, on the day of Marielle's death, Bolsonaro was in federal capital Brasilia. Days later, the doorman told the Police that he made a mistake in mentioning the President.

Besides that, Ronnie Lessa, the retired sergeant of the Military Police, who according to the investigations is the author of the 13 shots that killed Marielle Franco and Anderson Gomes in March 2018, was arrested at his home in the same *Vivendas da Barra*, where Jair Bolsonaro lived.

Élcio Vieira de Queiroz, the other criminal who drove the car, appears with Bolsonaro in a photo published by him on Facebook. Élcio was expelled from the corporation in 2016, after being arrested in 2011 in an operation that investigated the involvement of military police in drug trafficking and militias.

Also, another link between the family of Jair Bolsonaro and Ronnie Lessa is that one of Bolsonaro's sons dated Lessa's daughter. The fact was confirmed by the delegate responsible during a press conference on the arrest of the suspects⁴³.

2.6 Militias⁴⁴

Other older indications connect Bolsonaro family with the militias. Ronnie Lessa is allegedly to be part of the called 'Office of Crime', as mentioned, and one of the leaders

43 Bruno Falci, 'Jean Wyllys: "Marielle vai derrubar Bolsonaro"' (Jornalistas Livres, 13 March 2019) <<https://jornalistaslivres.org/jean-wyllys-marielle-vai-derrubar-bolsonaro/>> accessed 24 August 2020.

44 'Around 2006 the term 'militia' was coined in Rio to describe groups of armed estate agents (policemen, prison guards, firemen, etc.), who took control of small territories, charging residents and

of the group is the former military police officer Adriano Magalhães da Nóbrega. A former member of the Battalion of Special Police Operations (Bope) of Rio de Janeiro, Captain Adriano, as he was known, was appointed as the leader of a militia in Rio das Pedras (on the west side of Rio) and was recently a fugitive from justice for more than a year, wanted for crimes involving land grabbing, illegal collection of fees and handling of stolen goods. Adriano da Nóbrega had also his name linked to the corruption scandal in the office of the then state deputy and today senator Flavio Bolsonaro, son of President Jair Bolsonaro.

Nóbrega had been introduced to Flavio by a former Bope colleague, Fabrício Queiroz⁴⁵, the former advisor of Jair Bolsonaro's son. He is at the centre of a scandal involving suspicious transfers of money to Flavio in the Rio's Legislative Assembly. In 2003, Adriano Magalhães da Nóbrega received an honourable mention proposed by Flavio

small business owners and collect fees in order to 'protect' them, therefore they are monopolizing most economic services and transactions. For instance, gas and water could only be bought at designated shops, at a higher price, whereas transport or Internet services were provided exclusively by their organizations. Often, a levy was placed on real estate transactions in the community' Ignacio Cano, '7.1 Violence and Organized Crime in Brazil: The Cases of "militias" in Rio de Janeiro' in Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung and Regine Schönenberg (eds), *Transnational Organized Crime*, vol 17 (transcript Verlag 2013) 183 <<https://www.degruyter.com/doi/10.14361/transcript.9783839424957.179>> accessed 24 August 2020.

⁴⁵ Fabrício Queiroz is a retired military police officer, former advisor and former driver of the state deputy and senator Flavio Bolsonaro. Queiroz started a friendship with the president's family in the 1980s. He moved R\$ 1.2 million in his account in a manner considered 'atypical', according to a report by the Financial Activities Council (Coaf). The investigations analyse suspicious banking transactions of 74 civil servants and former servants of the Legislative Assembly of Rio de Janeiro (Alerj). The document revealed an unusual movement of R\$ 1.2 million in Queiroz's account between January 2016 and January 2017, including deposits and withdrawals. He was discharged in October 2018. G1 Rio, 'Caso Fabrício Queiroz: o que é, cronologia dos fatos, envolvidos' (G1, 18 January 2019) <<https://g1.globo.com/rj/rio-de-janeiro/noticia/2019/01/18/caso-fabricio-queiroz-o-que-e-cronologia-dos-fatos-personagens.ghtml>> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Bolsonaro in the Alerj. In 2005, Nóbrega won a tribute promoted by Flavio, the Tiradentes Medal, the highest honour of the Legislative Assembly⁴⁶.

The State Prosecutor's Office also linked Adriano da Nóbrega to investigations about senator Flavio Bolsonaro⁴⁷. Adriano's ex-wife and mother worked in the office of Flavio when he was a state deputy. There is a suspicion that both were 'ghost' employees⁴⁸. Besides that, prosecutors believe the militiaman directly benefited from the scheme.

46 Beatriz Jucá, 'Adriano da Nóbrega, suspeito de envolvimento no caso Marielle, é morto em operação policial na Bahia' (EL PAÍS, 9 February 2020) <<https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2020-02-09/suspeito-de-envolvimento-no-assassinato-de-marielle-e-morto-em-operacao-policial.html>> accessed 24 August 2020.

47 Senator Flavio Bolsonaro, son of President Jair Bolsonaro, is appointed by the Public Ministry of Rio de Janeiro as head of a criminal organization that served in his office during the period, he was a deputy in the State Legislative Assembly (Alerj). Between 2003 and 2018, he served four consecutive parliamentary terms. The estimate is that R\$ 2.3 million were spent in a scheme, in which 'ghost' employees of the then deputy returned part of the salary they received at Alerj. The money, according to the investigation, was laundered in a chocolate shop in Rio, of which the senator is a partner and in real estate. G1, 'Entenda suspeitas do MP sobre Flávio Bolsonaro em esquema de "rachadinhas" na Alerj' (G1, 20 December 2019) <<https://g1.globo.com/rj/rio-de-janeiro/noticia/2019/12/20/entenda-suspeitas-do-mp-sobre-flavio-bolsonaro-em-esquema-de-rachadinhas-na-alerj.ghtml>> accessed 24 August 2020.

48 'The term ghost employee refers to someone on the payroll who does not actually work for the victim company. Through the falsification of personnel or payroll records, a fraudster causes pay checks to be generated to a non-employee, or ghost. The fraudster or an accomplice then converts these pay checks. The ghost employee might be a fictitious person or a real individual who simply does not work for the victim employer. When the ghost is a real person, it is often the perpetrator's friend or relative'. Fraud Fighting, 'Ghost Employees' <<https://fraudfighting.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/Ghost-Employees.pdf>>.

Adriano da Nóbrega died in February 2020 during a police operation in Bahia state. He was considered one of the main pieces of the puzzle surrounding the Marielle's case investigation, and his death is under suspicion of to be a witness elimination⁴⁹.

2.7 State-level

In October 2019, during a video broadcast on social networks, President Jair Bolsonaro sharply criticized the news reporting by *Jornal Nacional*, from Globo TV, the leading media group in Brazil, in which the name of Bolsonaro is linked to one of the accused of murdering Marielle Franco, as mentioned above. Bolsonaro also attributed the leak of information to the governor of Rio, Wilson Witzel (Christian Social Party).

In the 2018 governor campaign, Witzel publicly supported then-candidate Jair Bolsonaro and received support from the Bolsonaro family.

In September of that year, Witzel participated in a campaign event that was recorded and broadcasted live on Facebook. In the occasion, he asked for votes for two allies and then candidates of the right-wing party Social Liberal Party, the same party as Bolsonaro at that time: Daniel Silveira, elected federal deputy, and Rodrigo Amorim, elected state deputy.

In the video, Rodrigo appears saying that he will 'sweep' what he calls 'vagabonds' of PSOL (Marielle's party), PCdoB (Communist Party of Brazil) and exalts Jair Bolsonaro: 'Marielle was murdered. More than 60,000 Brazilians die every year. I am going to give you some news: these vagabonds, they went to *Cinelândia*, and despite everyone, they took a sign from *Praça Marechal Floriano*, in Rio de Janeiro, and put a sign written Marielle Franco Street. Daniel and I went there this week and broke the sign. Jair

49 Jucá (n 45).

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

Bolsonaro suffered an attack on democracy, and these scoundrels shut up. So, we are going to sweep these vagabonds: no more PSOL, no more PCdoB, no more. Bolsonaro, *fuck it*', Amorim shouted through the microphone. Then they showed the broken sign.

The crowd that participates vibrates with the speech. At that moment, Witzel films himself and says: 'That is it, guys, look at the answer'.

In March 2019, for the first time since taking office as governor of Rio de Janeiro, Wilson Witzel spoke with Marielle Franco's parents. According to Marinete Silva, mother of Marielle, the governor apologized to the family for participating in the event and pledged to continue with the investigations⁵⁰.

2.8 Federal level

In April 2020, Jair Bolsonaro found himself involved in a political crisis. The main charge is that he had used his influence in choosing essential names for the Federal Police Office and those responsible for the corporation in Rio de Janeiro, his home state.

The accusation came from the Minister of Justice and Public Security, Sergio Moro, in his resignation. The resignation was because Bolsonaro had exonerated, without Moro's knowledge, the head of the Federal Police at the time. The justification would be the President's interest in interfering in investigations by the corporation and in inquiries that

50 Raoni Alves, 'Witzel recebe família de Marielle e pede desculpa por ato com placa quebrada na campanha eleitoral' (G1, 13 March 2019) <<https://g1.globo.com/tj/rio-de-janeiro/noticia/2019/03/13/witzel-recebe-familia-de-marielle-e-pede-desculpa-por-ato-com-placa-quebrada.ghtml>> accessed 24 August 2020.

are being processed, especially in Rio de Janeiro state. At least six cases that involve people close to President Jair Bolsonaro are under investigation by the Federal Police⁵¹.

In a statement, President Jair Bolsonaro acknowledged having asked the Federal Police to collect testimony from one of the suspects of killing Marielle Franco and charging Sergio Moro to investigate the doorman who cited the President's name during the investigations. Bolsonaro said the Federal Police had more concern in solving the case of Marielle Franco than in investigating the stabbing he suffered in September 2018 during the election campaign — in this latter case, which has already been solved, the perpetrator of the stab was considered unaccountable for having a mental illness. The court ordered him to be hospitalized indefinitely.

The mention of Marielle's case during the speech had considerable repercussions. Amnesty International even issued a public note:

Our attention is drawn to the fact that President Jair Bolsonaro revisits the brutal murder of Marielle Franco and Anderson Gomes in his speech today, instead of presenting to Brazilian society consistent explanations of the severe accusations made against him by ex-minister Sergio Moro. When comparing the investigations of the stabbing he suffered in 2018 during the electoral campaign, to the investigations of the crime against Marielle, criticizing the impartial efforts of Brazilian institutions in investigating the execution of the human rights defender, he seems to consider his life more important than other citizens, in addition to making clear the lack of understanding about the isonomy of institutions and diminishing the importance of human rights defenders in Brazil. It is the President of the Republic's due to protect the lives of those who are dedicated to fighting for a more just world. We regret that the statement has also once again exposed the families of Marielle and Anderson to pain, during a political crisis and a pandemic. Suppose they do not

51 BBC Brasil, 'Os 6 casos envolvendo aliados ou família de Bolsonaro que ficam em evidência com mudança de comando da PF' BBC News Brasil (4 May 2020) <<https://www.bbc.com/portuguese/brasil-52448597>> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

discover who ordered to kill Marielle and Anderson and why no human rights defender will be safe and secure in the country. Besides, President Bolsonaro explained that he used the Federal Police for his benefit when he asked that Elcio Queiroz and Ronnie Lessa, accused of killing Marielle, be heard by agents of the corporation about alleged connections with the President that arose at the time of the arrests. It may be an indication that the Federal Police, under his command, adopts lines of investigation at the government's convenience. We demand that all measures to be taken to investigate the misuse of functions and breach of exemption by the Federal Police in Marielle's case. The same intention was declared by the President in his statement when he questioned the reasons why the Federal Police did not investigate the doorman who quoted him in testimony, which later proved to be false, to the Public Ministry of Rio de Janeiro.⁵²

The delay in reaching those responsible for the crime and the suspicion that members of the Rio de Janeiro security force close to militiamen were acting to disrupt the investigations led the Federal Attorney General to request the federalization of the case in September 2018.

It means that the investigation into those responsible for the deaths of Marielle and Anderson would leave the command of the Civil Police and the Public Ministry of Rio de Janeiro and would pass to the Federal Police and the Federal Public Ministry instead.

In the request for federalization, the former Federal Public Ministry chief Raquel Dodge classified the murder of Marielle Franco as femicide of a human rights defender who fought police violence and paramilitary groups. At that time Dodge said that the characteristics of the victims have a significant inhibiting effect on the exercise of human

52 Anistia Internacional, 'Nota Pública: menções ao caso Marielle Franco em pronunciamento do presidente Jair Bolsonaro' (Anistia Internacional, 24 April 2020) <anistia.org.br/noticias/nota-publica-mencoes-ao-caso-marielle-franco-em-pronunciamento-presidente-jair-bolsonaro/> accessed 24 August 2020.

rights in society, as the murderers demonstrate their strength and certainty of impunity in reaching a human rights defender, intimidating and making insecure other members of vulnerable groups.⁵³

In a letter, Marielle's family stated that federalizing the case would represent a 'regrettable setback' and that it should remain under the responsibility of the Civil Police and the Public Ministry of the state of Rio. What the family ultimately wants is a rigorous investigation, and that both executors and mentors to be identified and held accountable.⁵⁴

In October 2018, Dodge had already called for a federal investigation into the murder of Marielle and Anderson. Nevertheless, in this case, she asked the Federal Police to investigate attempts to obstruct the investigations. Dodge stated that based on this 'investigation of the investigation', she formally accused Domingos Brazão⁵⁵, former leader of the Rio's Legislative Assembly and exonerated Rio de Janeiro State Court of Auditors, to act to obstruct investigations at the state level using his office to confuse the Civil Police's investigations. Also based on this investigation, she asked for an investigation to ascertain whether Brazão was responsible for the murder of Marielle Franco.

53 Rosanne D'Agostino, 'STJ nega federalizar caso Marielle, e investigação continuará com Polícia Civil e MP do Rio' (G1) <<https://g1.globo.com/politica/noticia/2020/05/27/relatora-no-stj-vota-contra-federalizacao-do-caso-marielle-franco.ghtml>> accessed 24 August 2020.

54 André Cabette Fábio, 'O que significa federalizar parte da investigação do caso Marielle | Nexo Jornal' (Nexo Jornal, 19 September 2019) <<https://www.nexojornal.com.br/expresso/2019/09/19/O-que-significa-federalizar-parte-da-investiga%C3%A7%C3%A3o-do-caso-Marielle>> accessed 24 August 2020.

55 Equipe HuffPost, 'Quem é Domingos Brazão, homem acusado de mandar matar Marielle Franco' (HuffPost Brasil, 28 October 2019) <https://www.huffpostbrasil.com/entry/marielle-domingos-brazao_br_5db723e2e4b006d49172f3f3> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

According to the complaint presented by Dodge, the investigations by the Federal Police would have shown that Brazão used his office at the Court of Auditors to promote a false statement by the military and militia policeman Rodrigo Jorge Ferreira, known as Ferreirinha. This false testimony would have served as a basis to accuse militiaman Orlando Oliveira de Araújo, known as Orlando Curicica, and the city councillor Marcello Siciliano for Franco's murder. According to Ferreirinha, they would have planned Marielle's death because it would represent an obstacle to the duo's land interests in communities on the west side of Rio.

According to the Special Action Group to Combat Organized Crime (Gaeco), of the Public Ministry of Rio de Janeiro, Ferreirinha was a security guard and driver for Orlando Curicica, but turned against his boss. Despite denying the charges, both (Curicica and Siciliano) were, for months, the leading names publicly put forward as perpetrators of the crime. The complaint also raised suspicions that Brazão is connected to the militia group 'Office of crime', which may be behind the murders.

In May 2019, Ferreirinha confessed to having given false testimony. He said he did it to confuse the authorities. The delegates who presented Ferreirinha as a witness were also investigated, as other civil police officers. However, the report does not point anything against them. Also, in 2019, an operation by the Public Ministry of Rio de Janeiro and the Civil Police arrested eight people suspected of being part of the militia that was commanded by Curicica, including Ferreirinha.

Besides that, documents published by the media showed that the then head investigator, Ginton Lages, pressured militiaman Orlando Curicica to assume he was hired to kill Marielle Franco. Because of that, Raquel Dodge raised suspicions about the capacity of the Rio de Janeiro state forces to investigate the case due to the 'promiscuity' with militiamen.

In March 2019, Lages left the case after the arrest of the two men accused of the crimes, and a second phase of the investigations started. Lages would do a four-month exchange

in Italy. According to Rio's government, the leave for studies abroad was an 'award' for the work done for almost a year in Rio's Homicide Police, which brought 'exhaustion' to Lages.

Most recently, another motivation made Marielle's family emphasize the critics about the federalization. They feared that the possible interference in the Federal Police would put in doubt their exemption to investigate the case. Thus, the Marielle Franco Institute and the Black Coalition for Rights asked the Superior Court of Justice to postpone the decision until the end of investigations into President Jair Bolsonaro alleged political interference in the Federal Police in April 2020.

At the end of May 2020, the Superior Court of Justice — one of the highest organs of the judiciary in Brazil — unanimously rejected the federalization of the investigation. Therefore, the Rio de Janeiro authorities keep leading the investigation.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

3

STRUCTURAL RACISM

Brazil was the last country in the American continent to abolish slavery in 1888. When the so-called Lei Áurea was signed, the enslaved black population became free, but subhuman conditions did not end.

The law did not create a public policy system to insert freed slaves and their descendants into society, not guaranteeing to this population human rights such as housing, health, and food, in addition to formal study and positions in the labour market.

In 1824, the Brazilian Constitution stated that access to school was a right for all citizens, but it did not include enslaved peoples. In 1850, another law allowed the state to sell agricultural spaces at high costs, and later, that same law still provided support for European settlers to live and work in Brazil buying federal lands. Besides that, one of the objectives in supporting European migration to Brazil was to ‘whiten’ the Brazilian population⁵⁶.

If the legislation did make any effort to adjust the society for proper integration before the abolition, in 1890, with the first penal laws of the Brazilian Republic, it became worse.

⁵⁶ Lilia Moritz Schwarcz, *O espetáculo das raças: Cientistas, instituições e questão racial no Brasil, 1870-1930* (Companhia das Letras (1993) 1993).

Without land, education or work, freed enslaved people who were found on the street or practised *Capoeira*⁵⁷, for example, could be arrested.

Another consequence is that the newly released slaves went to live in places where there was no structure. It happened because they were unable to economically access places with more basic living conditions. Thus, hills, peripheries, areas far from urban centres were occupied, creating the *favelas*. In other words, without a job, without decent housing and without primary conditions for survival, the end of the 19th century and the first half of the 20th century in Brazil were marked by misery and violence against blacks, minorities and marginalized populations.

Thus, it should be noted that this social structure has made it possible to maintain racism throughout history. Structural racism is, therefore, the term used to reinforce the fact that there are societies structured based on discrimination that privileges some races over others. In Brazil, this distinction favours whites over blacks and indigenous peoples⁵⁸.

It becomes more evident when we analyse the profile of the Brazilian population and its representativeness in the National Congress. While most of the inhabitants of Brazil are

57 The self-defence fight, which is also recognized as dance that African enslaved people brought to Brazil. It is understood as folklore, sport and even as art. Two dimensions are always present in capoeira: the playful side, and the side of the resistance against the oppressive system. Iphan, 'Videos - IPHAN - Instituto Do Patrimônio Histórico e Artístico Nacional' <<http://portal.iphan.gov.br/videos/detalhes/20>> accessed 24 August 2020.

58 Bárbara Forte, 'O que é racismo estrutural? Ainda hoje existe? Somos todos racistas?' (Ecoa - UOL, 19 November 2019) <<https://www.uol.com.br/ecoa/listas/o-que-e-racismo-estrutural.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

black, 56%, only 17,8% of the congress members (men and women) are black⁵⁹. Besides the fact regarding the violence against the black population, already mentioned, that in every 23 minutes a young black man is murdered in Brazil.

Even if laws now guarantee and establish norms for achieving equality among people, racism is a historical process that has shaped and still shapes Brazilian society in general. The first time that legislation actually contributed to redressing it occurred only in 1989, almost a century after the Lei Áurea, when the Lei Caó⁶⁰ made racism a non-bailable crime in the country, with a prison sentence of up to five years.

Racism is a consequence of the social structure itself, that is to say, of the 'normal' way in which political, economic, legal, and even family relations are constituted, not being a social pathology nor institutional disarray. Racism is structural. Individual behaviours and institutional processes come from a society whose racism is the rule and not the exception⁶¹.

Structural racism also concerns the way we think, and it can takes forms, not always conscious and other times collectively, about the disadvantage of blacks and indigenous people in relation to white people, whether in the form of narrative or in the discourse itself.

Thus, the colour of the skin can gain meanings that go beyond a genetic characteristic and association with intellectual, sexual, and physical abilities. In Brazil and other countries, one can still find the idea that being black is being associated with physical qualities only,

59 O Globo, 'No Congresso, Só 17,8% Dos Parlamentares São Negros - Jornal O Globo' (O Globo, 21 November 2019) <<https://oglobo.globo.com/brasil/no-congresso-so-178-dos-parlamentares-sao-negros-24091102>> accessed 24 August 2020.

60 Carlos Alberto Caó, L7716 1989 [12.716] 369.

61 Silvio Almeida, *Racismo Estrutural* (1a edn, Pólen Livros 2019) 35.

such as dance, sports, hard work, and not intellectual — in what we can call epistemicide⁶².

This kind of behaviour generates and reinforces discrimination and prejudice. Moreover, this problem also goes far beyond stereotypes or violent discourse.

Structural racism encompasses what is called institutional racism, characterized by the direct or indirect practice of instigations and discrimination between races. These institutions structure the society and end up naturalizing the collective imaginary that the place of the black people is linked to servitude or crime, for example. It is clearly exemplified from the rate registered in the National Prison Information Survey 2017. According to the document, two-thirds of the country's entire prison population at that time, more than 726,000, were black⁶³.

Marielle even talks about this issue, and again in connection with Mbembe, in her master's thesis — which will be explored further ahead. However, Marielle's thoughts

62 Concept developed by the Portuguese scholar Boaventura de Souza Santos, which deals with the destruction of forms of knowledge and cultures that are not assimilated by the culture of the white West. The main reference on the theme in Brazil is the philosopher Sueli Carneiro, who describes, in her doctoral thesis, published in 2005 by the University of São Paulo (USP), that the epistemicide is configured by the negation of blacks of the condition of subjects of knowledge, through the devaluation, denial or concealment of the contributions of the African continent and the African diaspora to the cultural heritage of humanity; by imposing cultural whitening and by producing failure and dropping out of school. Pedro Borges, 'Epistemicídio, a morte começa antes do tiro – Educação em Direitos Humanos em Foco' (*Observatório de educação em direitos humanos em foco*, 2019) <<http://observatorioedhemfoco.com.br/observatorio/epistemicidio-a-morte-comeca-antes-do-tiro/>> accessed 29 August 2020.

63 Marcos Vinícius Moura Silva, 'Levantamento Nacional de Informações Penitenciárias Atualização - Junho de 2017' (Ministério da Justiça e Segurança Pública, Departamento Penitenciário Nacional 2017) <<http://depen.gov.br/DEPEN/depen/sisdepen/infopen/relatorios-sinteticos/infopen-jun-2017-rev-12072019-0721.pdf>>.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

on structural racism must be placed here in the context of the *Maré favela* in Rio de Janeiro, Marielle's neighbourhood.

Her thesis is about the government action called Pacifying Police Units (UPPs) that took place in some *favelas* of Rio in order to expel bandits who command and collect local taxes from residents. Hence, the state occupies that space bringing with it security conditions and fundamental rights to the local people. Moreover, *Maré* was occupied by one UPP. About that she claims:

the continuity of a racist logic of occupation of prisons by blacks and poor people added to the element of discarding part of the population to the right of the city continues to mark public security with the advent of the UPPs. These elements are central to the relationship between the Penal State and the security police in progress in Rio de Janeiro⁶⁴.

What Marielle is saying is connected to the institutional and structural racism that permeates the entire application of this 'pacification program'. Although she focuses her dissertation on other aspects, such as public security, it is clear how the racial issue is present and inherent, as pointed by Almeida:

The social structure is made up of numerous conflicts — of class, race, sex, etc. — which means that the institutions can also act in a conflicted manner, positioning themselves within the conflict. In a society where racism is present in everyday life, institutions which do not actively treat racial inequality as a problem will quickly reproduce the racist practices already considered 'normal' throughout society. It is generally the case in governments, schools, and companies where there are no institutional spaces or mechanisms to deal with racial and sexual conflicts. In this case, everyday relationships within institutions will reproduce everyday social practices, including racism, in the form

64 Marielle Franco, 'UPP – A Redução Da Favela A Três Letras: Uma Análise Da Política De Segurança Pública Do Estado Do Rio De Janeiro' (mestrado, Universidade Federal Fluminense 2014) 129.

of explicit violence or microaggressions — jokes, silencing, etc. In the end, without doing anything, every institution will become a belt of racist and sexist privilege and violence. So, if racism is inherent in the social order, the only way for an institution to combat it is through the impetus of effective anti-racist practices⁶⁵.

The philosopher Silvio de Almeida also highlights the relationship between slavery and racism and the importance of thinking about the subject under the optic of political economy.

According to him, there are two explanations. The first of them is the understanding that racism came from the marks left by slavery itself and colonialism. ‘Racism would be a specific remnant of slavery, essential social contamination which, especially in peripheral countries, would prevent the modernization of economies and the emergence of democratic regimes’⁶⁶.

Achille Mbembe recalls that at the ‘beginning of the capitalism’, the dispossession of the self-determination of black people transformed them into object men, merchandise men and currency men. It is to say, ‘in the context of the plantation, the humanity of the slave appears as the perfect figure of a shadow. Indeed, the slave condition results from a triple loss: loss of a ‘home’, loss of rights over his or her body, and loss of political status’⁶⁷.

The other theoretical line states that contemporary forms of racism ‘are products of advanced capitalism and modern rationality, and not remnants of an unsurpassed past’⁶⁸,

65 Almeida (n 60) 34.

66 *ibid* 123.

67 Achille Mbembe, ‘Necropolitics’ (2003) 15 *Public Culture* 11, 21
<<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/39984>>.

68 Almeida (n 60) 35.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

although it does not deny the terrible impacts of the slavery on the economic and social formation of countries like Brazil. According to this thought, racism would be an effective form of social control because it naturalizes the payment of low wages, precariousness, and the maintenance of exclusion, violence and crime.

According to Almeida, the term structural racism, however, does not mean that racism is an unavoidable condition or that the anti-racism trail made so far is useless. However, more than understanding that we are part of the racist system, we need to listen, talk, and study about it, because silence makes us responsible for its maintenance, and that is the reason why the attempted of silencing Marielle's voice cannot be successful.

NECROPOLITICS

‘We must ensure that the *favelas* are also part of the cities. Since they are all over the city’,

Marielle affirmed in an interview with the newspaper O Globo in 2016. Born and raised in *Complexo da Maré*, a *favela* as many other communities in Rio, Marielle entered in the politics after losing a friend to a stray bullet. An advocate of campaigns against police violence in the *favelas*, Marielle spent much of her time fighting for the rights of those who live in the peripheries and suffer from violence there, especially in Rio de Janeiro.

All the details about her assassination are part of an intricate puzzle that involves the most diverse structures of power, since its execution, through investigation and repercussion. They become even more relevant from the moment we analyse them from the perspective of the Necropolitics.

Necropolitics is the concept developed by the Cameroonian philosopher, intellectual, political theorist, and university professor Achille Mbembe who, in 2003, wrote an article questioning the limits of sovereignty when the state chooses who should live and who should die when the state defines who matters and who does not matter.

The scholar rejects the ‘romantic’ belief of sovereignty as something ‘in which the subject is the ‘controlling author of his or her own meaning’⁶⁹. Mbembe is concerned, from an entirely different perspective, ‘with those forms of sovereignty whose central project is not the struggle for autonomy, but the generalized instrumentalization of human existence

69 Mbembe (n 66) 13.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

and the material destruction of human bodies and populations'⁷⁰. For Mbembe, when the other's humanity is denied, any violence becomes possible, from aggression to death.

To get to this analysis, he uses Michel Foucault's theories of biopower and biopolitics. And goes beyond. As Mbembe explains at the beginning of the article, there is a counterpoint to Foucault's idea of biopower and biopolitics. Mbembe works with the initial concept, not exactly opposing to it, but stating that the expression of death gives the materialization of this policy:

One could summarize in the above terms what Michel Foucault meant by *biopower*: that domain of life over which power has taken control. Nevertheless, under what working conditions the right to kill is exercised, to allow to live, or to expose to death? Who is the subject of this right?⁷¹.

To answer these questions, he relates these concepts to two others: the state of exception and state of siege by the Italian philosopher Giorgio Agamben⁷² to explain the repressive forms developed by Western politics. For Mbembe, these social practices support racial hierarchies, and, in this process, the actions taken by the state in the name of 'security' reveal violations of rights. This context allows the emergence of situations marked by violence.

Mbembe begins his discussions keeping in mind that modernity is presented in a plurality of concepts of sovereignty and biopolitics, which, according to him, proved to be alien to

70 *ibid* 14.

71 *ibid* 12.

72 Giorgio Agamben, *Means Without End: Notes on Politics*, vol 20 (1st edn, University Of Minnesota Press 2000) 50–51 <<https://www.upress.umn.edu/book-division/books/means-without-end>>.

contemporary political criticism. The thought that guides modernity is central to the meaning of the reason, which is one of the main elements of the modernity project and sovereignty.

In this case, the essential expression of sovereignty comes from the making of general laws by the people, which is composed of free and equal women and men. This policy has a twofold definition — a project of autonomy and the effectiveness of a convention in a community through communication and recognition — being, therefore, those characteristics that distinguish it from the war.

Mbembe turns attention to the aspect of sovereignty that has as its centralizing idea the widespread instrumentalization of human existence and the material destruction of bodies and populations. Rather than considering ‘reason’ as the truth of the subject, the author suggests other categories as elements of analysis, such as life and death.

In this sense, Necropolitics means a change in the way the notions of sovereignty and power are exercised. Sovereignty is understood as the ability to define who matters and who does not matter, who is ‘disposable’ and who is not. Hence the author claims that the maximum expression of sovereignty lies mostly in power and the ability to dictate who can live and who must die. That is why killing or letting live are the limits of sovereignty, its fundamental attributes.

For Mbembe, ‘the state of exception and the relation of enmity have become the normative basis of the right to kill’⁷³, as well as power ‘continuously refers and appeals to exception, emergency, and a fictionalized notion of the enemy’⁷⁴ to justify the extermination of the undesirable, of those who dare to resist. Thus, ‘to exercise

73 Mbembe (n 66) 16.

74 *ibid.*

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

sovereignty is to exercise control over mortality and to define life as the deployment and manifestation of power⁷⁵.

The Brazilian anthropologist Debora Diniz, and the Argentine political scientist, Giselle Carino in the article *Necropolitics as a government regime*⁷⁶, used the concept of Necropolitics to address threats, especially to women, who work in defence of human rights in Latin America. As they mentioned, Latin America is where relations of enmity moves for the right to kill, establish divisions of acceptability to take a life, establishing in this way, for example, regimes of fear and precariousness especially for these group, which start to see themselves as potential victims.

When the state accepts and supports the Necropolitics as a regime of government, we start to describe the disorder as ‘emergency’, ‘armed conflict’ or ‘humanitarian crisis’. Moreover, these situations, as explained by Mbembe, would justify interventions, violence, and use of force.

According to the authors, because of this scenario, it is no coincidence that ‘femicide’ was a word put into circulation by women in the Global South: Latin America is where they are the majority of victims of this type of crime, just the same as being a female human rights activist is an activity much riskier in that part of the planet⁷⁷.

75 *ibid* 12.

76 Debora Diniz and Giselle Carino, ‘A necropolítica como regime de governo’ (EL PAÍS, 16 July 2019) <https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2019/07/09/opinion/1562688743_395031.html> accessed 24 August 2020.

77 *ibid*.

The concepts of Necropolitics and Necropower developed by the author help to understand ‘the various ways in which, in our contemporary world, weapons are deployed in the interest of maximum destruction of persons and the creation of death-worlds, new and unique forms of social existence in which vast populations are subjected to conditions of life conferring upon them the status of living-dead’⁷⁸.

When analysing contemporary times and wars in which Necropower manifests itself, Mbembe brings the concept of ‘war machines’. According to the author, along with the official army, there is a machinery that can also be used by the state. They are

made up of segments of armed men that split up or merge with one another depending on the tasks to be carried out and the circumstances. War machines are polymorphous and diffuse organizations and characterized by their capacity for metamorphosis. The state may, of its own doing, transform itself into a war machine. It may moreover appropriate to itself an existing war machine or help to create one. War machines function by borrowing from regular armies while incorporating new elements well adapted to the principle of segmentation and deterritorialization. Regular armies, in turn, may readily appropriate some of the characteristics of war machines⁷⁹.

Mbembe analyses the situation of heteronomy in war spaces in contemporary times, in both internal and across state’s borders. These wars have no intention of conquering, of acquiring or even to manage a territory. According to him, the armed factions are formed and dissolved according to the circumstances. Due to their mobility and technology, they are fast, violent, profitable, and safe for the aggressor.

78 Mbembe (n 66) 40.

79 *ibid* 32.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

The consistent movement of these war machines is beneficial for them and or for the governments because they allow the control of spaces with profitable assets and because this war action creates lucrative obligations and debts valuable for the private interests.

These new arrangements use military strategies with the use of high-tech weapons associated with a 'structural war' to annihilate the enemy by eliminating resources and access, having as a result the complete bankruptcy of the means that enable the survival of the people.

The efficient extraction of the resources depends on immobilizing, monitoring, and controlling local populations of these areas, giving rise to a new way of governing. Mbembe calls it as *crowd management*. It consists of dividing the population of these areas as displaced, neutralized, or exterminable groups. In this way, submission is forced regardless of the immediate consequences, side effects or collateral damage of the military techniques used. A new aspect emerges, and the right to kill is no longer exercised as a monopoly by the state.

This new way of geographic organization occurs from a combination of political apparatus and commercial enterprise that operates with the use of captures and depredations as forms of death promotion. These spaces became administered by a network of diverse power structures, such as the army, private armed forces, local leaders, revolutionary groups, criminal organizations. It clearly means that even the state itself can become a war machine.

As a result, it is almost impossible to determine who holds control in that area. The collapse of formal political institutions under the use of violence has the power to create the militia economy.

What we see happening in Brazil, mainly in the *favelas* and in the periphery of large Brazilian cities, is a state that uses a policy of death and enmity such as racism, social struggles or homophobia, dividing the society between friends and enemies and

persecuting those considered enemies or dangerous. For this reason, the state makes an illegitimate use of force and death.

As Achille Mbembe says, the Necropolitics adopts typographies of cruelty. These are the places (and existence forms) where you have a license to kill. In Brazil, places with black and poor people density.

It is the state using death as a regulation of urban space and population control. Homicides, added to the precarious urban infrastructure, the scarcity of public equipment and police violence are mechanisms for controlling and managing life. The constitution of these places and the public security forces are used as a way to perpetuate the precariousness and extermination of life for this segment of the population.

For the author, it is from the racism that the power to dictate who should live and who should die is developed, in a state policy that is guided by a continuous exercise of lethality: 'racism is above all a technology designed to allow the exercise of biopower, this old sovereign right to kill'⁸⁰. In the biopower economy, the function of racism is to regulate the distribution of death and make possible the murderous functions of the State. According to Foucault, this is the condition for acceptability of making people die.

Understanding the historical character of the society in which we live, Mbembe points out that this process is more intense in the countries on the periphery of capitalism, in which democracy is still restricted as well as the rights remain connected to sovereign violence, thus forming a valid policy of production of death. The understanding of this phenomenon is given by racism.

As he points out, neoliberalism is considered the current and devastating face of capitalism, because it produces unemployed; disposable individuals; centres and peripheries; refugees; immigrants; a slave model that is based on the racialization of

80 *ibid* 17.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

humanity, whether biological or social: a whole horde of killable subjects, all of them exposed to death.

Thus, Necropolitics does not necessarily happen with the execution of death itself, but also when people whose bodies are not profitable to the system are left to die; bodies that neither produce nor consume are left to die. Neoliberalism imposes its Necropolitics through violence. However, this violence is not always explicit.

This extermination policy reveals the survival of the colonial root in the contemporary context and, especially, in Brazil today. In the management of life, hierarchies, classifications, asymmetries, discrimination are invented and reinvented, in which religion, moral and cultural values replace the biology as the foundation of discrimination, at the same time that they overlap with it. As a result, when we put all these together, we will see that this death policy has an address, a specific destination.

Why is there a consideration of a 'genocide' among black Brazilian youth? Because black people are being killed, and the numbers are exorbitant. Therefore, the more vulnerable the community, such as black women and children, indigenous peoples, people with disabilities, the higher the imbalance between the forces of life and death. Marielle represents the intersectionality of all these groups. She militated fully as a woman, black, poor and with a lesbian relationship, also, was a human rights activist. All of this in one of the countries that most kills black people, homosexuals, and human rights defenders:

Her black, feminist and lesbian activism without fragmentation was and is the statement that a subject, despite multiple vulnerabilities, can place herself in the world in an integral way and because of that, she can empower herself without being departmental. Empowerment at the same time of women, of black people, of the LBTQIA+ movement. Without a doubt, Marielle Franco's performance was intersectional. However, maybe that

was bothering a lot. However, her death made her more alive, as well as the debate over social inequity and overlapping social injustices⁸¹.

Reading Mbembe is to understand that democracy is only viable if racism is recognized, faced, and fought radically. If racist practices reissue fascism disguised as neoliberal economics and democracy, is urgent the restoration of rights as the main political element necessary to sustain democracy.

The book *Critique of Black Reason*⁸² deepens this theme. In this work, Achille Mbembe explains that neoliberalism is a reedition of modern black enslavement because, in this context, it is necessary to use and exploit working people as if they were slaves. The project of neoliberalism implies economic globalization; construction of centres and peripheries; maintenance of explorers and exploited, it is a slave model that sustains itself in the racialization of humanity, be it biological or social.

It is as explained by the philosopher Silvio Almeida: ‘racism is a process that constitutes people's consciousness’⁸³, the way they see the world and how they are affected by it. Because of that, because of racism itself, the racial issue was always put in a despised

81 Sérgio Henrique Teixeira, ‘Pensando a interseccionalidade a partir da vida e morte de Marielle Franco’ (2019) 4 Dignidade Re-Vista 15, 148.

82 Achille Mbembe, *Critique of Black Reason* (Duke University Press 2017) 7
<<https://www.dukeupress.edu/critique-of-black-reason>>.

83 Juliana Domingos de Lima, “‘Não dá para falar de democracia sem falar da questão racial’” (Nexo Jornal, June 2020) <[https://www.nexojornal.com.br/entrevista/2020/06/01/%E2%80%98N%C3%A3o-d%C3%A1-para-falar-de-democracia-sem-falar-da-quest%C3%A3o-racial%E2%80%99](https://www.nexojornal.com.br/entrevista/2020/06/01/%E2%80%98N%C3%A3o-d%C3%A1-para-falar-de-democracia-sem-falar-da-quest%C3%A3o-racial%E2%80%99”)> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

place, whether by the media, lawyers, economists, educators, or politicians, but the racial issue has always been central⁸⁴.

When black and also white voices reflect that there is no way to talk about equality nor democracy — democracy understood as broad popular participation in political policies, in the destiny of a country or even community — without talking about racial inequality, it is because it is seen the ruin of the world economy as it is. It is a process that has happened for a long time. With the ruin of liberal democracy, obviously, the racial issue arises, an issue that has always been muffled by ideological speeches which preached a consensus that does not exist.

It is clear to understand when we analyse the data regarding among Brazilian population. The unemployment rate of the self-declared black population reached 26.1% in 2019 and is above the national average of 11%, according to the Continuous National Household Sample Survey (Pnad) of the Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics (IBGE). In other words, the relationship between economics and racism, and everything that this structure generates, as a consequence, is inherent.

The institutions that support liberal democracy are being eroded. It is a model that is not concerned with the substance of political participation, and effective participation of minorities that guarantee their right to decide and take care of their own destiny. And so, the speeches who preach that this model of society in which we live in an egalitarian model, the unique form of life, and the most civilized one, cannot be sustained in the face of people's real situation, especially in a society in which people who have to choose between

⁸⁴ *ibid.*

deaths, starvation or to be killed by the police. When people have these three choices, they will obviously seek to create another way⁸⁵.

According to Almeida, Brazil is a country that has developed neither institutions nor democratic culture. To maintain 54% of the population in a subordinate manner, much higher brutality by the state is necessary, both from the practical point of view of violence and from a cultural reproduction that naturalizes the domination of whites over blacks. Thus, the Brazilian state is a system that defines practices in favour of a dominant group and maintains the social forms of the market, private property, freedom, and equality in order to reproduce racism in its politics as well.

The state acts in a constant state of exception, reproducing war, homicide, repression policies and suicide in its population, an element brought by Marielle herself in her master's dissertation⁸⁶.

About that, it is essential to highlight the fact that she had a master's degree being a black woman and her dissertation deals with police actions in Rio's *favelas* are intense demonstrations of Marielle's power to break with social structures effectively. Marielle brought up the questioning of the Necropolitics experienced daily as the critical point of her personal, professional and student life, even though without giving it the name itself.

85ibid.

86 ibid.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

5

MARIELLE, *PRESENTE!*

After Marielle's death, 'Marielle, present' became a quote. The morning after the murder, a crowd of people chanted the phrase. Today, 'Marielle present' is synonymous when people claim justice for Marielle; a way not to silence her voice and to keep her memory alive.

Her master's dissertation entitled *UPP: Reducing the favela to three letters* is text-critical to the work of the Pacifying Police Units (UPPs) in the *favelas* of Rio de Janeiro. The thesis is the result of an extensive bibliographic review, field research and documentary survey.

The so-called UPPs are part of a policy implemented by the Government of Rio de Janeiro, beginning in 2008, intending to combat and dismantle organized crime from drug trafficking in the communities and *favelas* of the state. The action is the result of a strategy taken jointly by the municipal, state, and federal spheres along with the support and supervision of civil society entities.

The areas considered as a potential for the installation of UPPs are those that have high rates of poverty and misery, in addition to inadequate infrastructure, a low average level of education, high level of job informality, and mainly, that shelter armed and organized criminal groups, as the *Complexo da Maré*, where she was born and raised.

The UPPs occupations are usually carried out through the intervention of the Rio de Janeiro military police, which, depending on the resistance conditions offered by criminal groups, can count on the help of Bope (Battalion of Special Police Operations) and even of the Army.

After the installation of a UPP, the sequence of work is the organization of a Social UPP, an extension of military services but along with community services to guarantee the population access to essential social elements, such as education and health. At least, in theory, that is what is supposed to happen. Moreover, that is the main point highlighted by Marielle.

Generally, the criticisms of UPPs are usually associated with reports of police abuse, such as torture of civilians in search of information; illegal and aggressive invasions of homes that are unrelated to trafficking; and other practices considered abusive such as toll collection in community inputs and lack of essential services and public policies.

‘The UPPs become a policy that strengthens the Penal State intending to contain the dissatisfied or “excluded” from the process, formed by a significant number of poor people, increasingly placed in city ghettos and prisons’⁸⁷, she wrote.

Marielle’s article, written in 2014, dialogues directly with Mbembe, even without citing him bibliographically. The dissertation reflects on the territorial occupation carried out by the state only in the form of policed and militarized occupation, without the presence of services, rights, and investments.

Marielle follows the same line as Mbembe about how the neoliberal model interferes in the construction of violent states in the peripheries. However, she calls on the theorist Loïc Wacquant⁸⁸ about the construction of penal states and applies it to the case of *Maré favela*.

87 Franco (n 63) 42.

88 Loïc Wacquant, *De l’Etat social à l’Etat pénal*, vol 1 (124th edn, Seuil 1998).

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Marielle argues that it is possible to identify the existence of a penal state that, through the discourse of ‘social insecurity’, applies a policy aimed at repression and control of the poor people.

It would not be an exaggeration to see in her dissertation the same criticism based precisely on that ‘enemies relations’ cited by Mbembe. About that and according to her, there is no public policy designed and carried out for ‘the other’ along with the pacifying units, but a public policy designed and realized against the ‘other one’. It is also not different from what Mbembe defines as an effect of war machines, that in the sense of establishing sovereignty, occupy territories and nullify rights.

Mixing the complexity of the state, an object of a dispute by several actors, to a scenario marked by unfinished policies, of precarious attendance throughout the social welfare network, to a criminal technology based on war, is a perfect result for building a favourable environment for growth and strengthening the penal state⁸⁹.

Besides, Marielle also explores another factor, in which Mbembe does not advance: the violence of the discourse. For Marielle, discourse is a fundamental element and an ideological resource that also establishes violent practices — and why not say necropolitical practices?

Thus, her criticism, in this case, is made about the term ‘Pacifying Police Unit’. According to her, the use of the term is part of propaganda for peace by the government. The central point of the UPP action, in reality, is a militarized occupation of territories dominated by criminals, and not actions focused on public policies for the citizens, as services and rights — what should be the main objective of the ‘occupation’ and would represent the presence of the state for real. In this way, the name UPP would thus

89 Franco (n 63) 42.

demonstrate ‘an ideological burden for maintaining the fundamental elements of hegemonic politics, since it is centralized in the police’s action and uses the ideological resource of the appeal for peace’⁹⁰.

The issue is that the police force, with the current approach, is not only establishing themselves as one of the activities of the state but end up gaining a strategic place in this process of territorial occupation. What happens is general propaganda for peace, in which the police, not politics, occupies a central place. It is yet another symptom of the predominance of a security policy sustained by militarization. It can be said that there is an apparently utopian proposition, which takes on a profoundly ideological character⁹¹.

Military police forces are a characteristic in Brazil security system, as frequent and known are their practices of repression and punishment. Because of the that, the relationship between the *favelas* in general and the state does not change that much with the arrive of the UPP, because the approach is made in the same way during the regular conflicts: the state in the form of police, of military force, of the war machine, as an orchestrated and polymorphic way. That is also to say, in a new parallel with the Cameroonian philosopher, this specific structure of action is appropriate for maintaining a necropolitical state:

The occupation is done by the police, with the militaristic character that predominates in the police of Brazil. It is precisely the predominance of the policy, already underway, that reinforces once again onslaught on the poor, with repression and punishment. In other words, even if there is a specific element of difference, changing the incursions by occupation, such specificity did not constitute a policy that differs significantly from the current relationship between the state and the *favelas*⁹².

90 *ibid* 123.

91 *ibid*.

92 *ibid* 124.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

It is no accident that Marielle's murder puts us on edge. At the border of democracy. Marielle, as a victim of the Necropower, what she knew deeply and what she wrote about, exposes the complicated situation of Rio de Janeiro and the entire violent system that operates the state and directly attacks certain groups of people. Definitely a fact that did not happen by chance, and that shows how Brazil operates at the limit of the objectification of human beings, and that foments the weakening of its own democracy.

It is a symptom that refers not only to the historical post-abolition process of slavery but also to another period in Brazil. The structures of the Brazilian Military Police, as we know them today, are a legacy of the military dictatorship that lasted 21 years in Brazil, from 1964 to 1985.

The abuse of power, the brutality and the murders committed by the Military Police at that time had the support of a system of information control and a context of national security, as they justified at that time. However, now they have the support of an officially democratic regime, and the logic of seeing the population, or part of it, as an enemy and as a mass to be controlled still remains present.

It becomes easier to understand when we analyse the numbers⁹³. The police of the state of Rio de Janeiro, for example, is the most lethal in Brazil. In 2018, they killed nine in which 100,000 inhabitants, an average three and a half times higher than in other states in the country.

⁹³ These numbers are a compilation of the following sources: Public Security Institute (ISP); Violence Monitor; IBGE; United States Census Bureau; Military Police of Rio de Janeiro; The Washington Post. Luigi Mazza, Amanda Rossi and Renata Buono, 'A polícia que mais mata' (*Revista Piauí*, August 2019) <<https://piaui.folha.uol.com.br/policia-que-mais-mata/>> accessed 24 August 2020.

In Brazil, 6,160 people died at the hands of the police in 2018. Of this total, 1,534 people were killed in Rio de Janeiro. That is, for every four deaths committed by the police in Brazil, one was in Rio de Janeiro.

By comparison, just from January to July 2019, police in the state of Rio de Janeiro killed 1,075 people, which is twice the number of deaths committed by the United States police in the same period. Rio de Janeiro is also one of the states in Brazil, where most police officers die. Between January and July last year, 29 military police officers died on and off duty. Still, for every police officer killed in 2019 in Rio, 37 people were killed by police⁹⁴

It is necessary to understand that the police we have in Brazil is the result of a historical process, in which the state uses its armed arm, its war machine, to contain, control and eliminate sectors of the population seen as dangerous to the established social order. Which is still a severe violation of human rights, and which Marielle was fighting against and became a victim herself.

We are a society that has always been colluding with violence. Many experts say that this has to do with the fact that we have not dealt with the legacy of violence and the serious human rights violations of the dictatorship. However, I go further: it has to do with the fact that we never really deal with the legacy of slavery. Slavery is a regime of torture and violence. How do you force people to give up their social, mental and physical autonomy if not for violence?⁹⁵.

94 *ibid.*

95 Vitória Régia da Silva, 'ENTREVISTA: Como o discurso de ódio se tornou capital político?' (Gênero e Número, 18 October 2018) <<http://www.generonumero.media/como-o-discurso-de-odiose-tornou-capital-politico/>> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

It is essential to pay attention to the fact that the discourse assumes a fundamental role in maintaining this Necropolitics. Whether in the speech of public authorities or the digital universe.

THE NECROPOLITICS OF THE DISCOURSE

6.1 Words that kill

The truculent speech in politics was amplified on the election platforms of the 2018 Brazilian elections.

The gestures of the then-candidate Bolsonaro imitating the use of weapons, and the growing fear of those who belong to the black community, LGBTQIA+ and other minorities attacked by Bolsonaro on numerous occasions, even after the elections, are some examples of how the speech echoes in reality and directly affects people's lives.

Even if this violence is not transformed into measures and laws that diminish political rights, the idea that there are citizens with more or less value becomes a political capital.

This speech gains voice and supporters, whether on social networks or the streets, generating identification among the part of the population that saw itself underrepresented and discouraged to express such ideas before. When this speech is made by people with political authority, the idea gains strength, and a kind of complicity is created between the interlocutors.

Two examples of how violence becomes a political capital: the fact that the candidate for state deputy in Rio de Janeiro who broke the board under the name of Marielle Franco and less than a week later became the most voted for the post; and when Rio de Janeiro governor Wilson Witzel, who is a former federal judge, said in an interview about his public security program after being elected: 'The correct thing is to kill the bandit with

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

the rifle. The police officers will do the right thing: it will aim at the head and shoot!’ said the governor⁹⁶.

Both men and Bolsonaro represent a political charisma that connects with deep conservatism of Brazilian society, and nothing more conservative than violence related to gender and race.

The language of violence, the necropolitical language, is highly selective. Weapons are symbols usually associated with masculinity, and violence operates through ideas of masculinity and bodies that are violable and bodies that are not violable. At a time when there is an increase in conservatism related to gender, race, and sexuality, at some point, this gendered language of violence affects women, blacks and LGBTQIA+ people, like Marielle.

Thus, the then-candidate became famous on social media after appearing in the photo tearing the plaque with the name of Marielle, had his fame rightly linked to her name. It represents an inversion of narratives⁹⁷.

It becomes clear, then, that the political dispute of the discourse also becomes a dispute of narratives. In the specific case of breaking the board, there is an inversion: in the centre,

96 Roberta Pennafort, ‘A Polícia Vai Mirar Na Cabecinha e... Fogo’, *Afirma Wilson Witzel - 01/11/2018 - UOL Notícias* (UOL Notícias, November 2018) <<https://noticias.uol.com.br/ultimas-noticias/agencia-estado/2018/11/01/a-policia-vai-mirar-na-cabecinha-e-fogo-afirma-wilson-witzel.htm?cmpid=copiaecola>> accessed 24 August 2020.

97 Cristiane Carinhato, ‘O funcionamento discursivo das fake news: A criação do produto midiático’ (Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina 2019) <<https://repositorio.ufsc.br/bitstream/handle/123456789/199882/%23P%C3%93S%20BANCA%20TCC%20-%20CRISTIANE%20CARINHATO.pdfA.pdf?sequence=1>>.

the image that appears is of Jair Bolsonaro printed on the shirt of one of the men; the other wears a green and yellow T-shirt, a kind of symbol for Bolsonaro's supporters. Moreover, then-candidate Witzel is next to them (Figure 1). All are white, heteronormative men with clenched fists. We see that the discourse, the message transmitted is inverted in order to put it against Marielle's memory, assigning to her the role of criminal and to them the role of 'heroes'.



Figure 1 - Daniel Silveira (left), Rodrigo Amorim (centre, with a broken sign) and Wilson Witzel (right) at a rally held in the city of Petrópolis (Rio de Janeiro). Photograph: Facebook screenshot⁹⁸

98 Screen capture of the live video broadcast on 30 September 2018 on Daniel Silveira's page. Available at https://www.facebook.com/daniel.l.silveira.3/videos/174231743456421/?hc_ref=ARQ7wGG018u1fvYvXElyYItrCcQarU64JYEgftPo8mENIxaWEoEnVPYIZy46kCVraQ

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Furthermore, it is precisely this inversion of narratives, this political discourse clash that we have seen multiplying in likes and shares of fake news, in what I call digital Necropolitics and which will be further discussed.

Therefore, the case of Marielle becomes an object of study again because a black woman occupying a position of power brings with it the contained debate and the breaking of the logic of the discourse of the pre-established social institutions — also based on structural racism.

From a more philosophical point of view, from the perspective of Foucault⁹⁹, and considering the discourse as a set of statements practised over time, the discourse can build a social subject. It is the discourse that defines the subject, who the subject is. Through it, the subject says what he/she wants to be and what he/she can do.

This necropolitical discourse is also presented in the forms of insult and bravado. Insult is a way of diminishing the other, a way of putting an individual down to a position that is liable to humiliation and contempt. The other individual ceases to exist in his integrity and starts to exist apprehended in 'irrelevance', someone who in his insignificance dared to put himself in the path of those who denied him. It is the objective of the injury: to destroy the dignity of the person.

It is necessary to reduce the opponent to nothing, and thus verbal aggression can materialize in physical aggression. While insult is the delegitimization of the other, and bravado, the exhibitionist affirmation of something that cannot be achieved, discursive aggressiveness invests in correcting or destroying the behaviour of those who are perceived as a danger, as an enemy.

99 Michel Foucault, *A ordem do discurso* (3rd edn, Edições Loyola 1996).

With that, the reality is undone in the face of the presence of a rude and false speech. Everything happens as if anything could be said despite the facts: the interlocutor's veracity is plausible as long as it is pronounced with anger, conviction, and fuss. It is as if reality surrenders to language.

Moreover, a language is not just about something random, just a pure expression of something. It reveals a structure of thought, and in this case of violence, it reveals a structure of making its own aberration something banal¹⁰⁰. A way of expressing yourself that, little by little, constitutes a way of apprehending the world and vice-versa. This language is alive and penetrates people's dialogues at home, on the streets, on social networks. Thus, the language of authoritarianism and violence transcends its core of origin, impregnating society in its many different spheres.

Based on the power exercised by governments and administrative structures, through this language applied to the discourse, practices have become acceptable, even when they aim at violence and the annihilation of certain groups, for example. Thus, discourse is the instrument of power that determines conduct and validates policies.

To have an example to understand better how the hate speech and the 'ideological war' against Marielle's life and memory, it is necessary to resort to Marielle's speech on Women's Day 2018, in the City Council, precisely her last speech at Alerj. It is clear how the 'narrative battlefield' is created.

During her speech, she classified the Brazilian political scenario as a moment of democratic fragility. She cited a series of data on violence against women in Brazil and, while speaking, a male voice tried to interrupt her. She replied: 'Is there a man defending the dictatorship and saying something contrary to that? I will not be interrupted. I do not

¹⁰⁰ Renato Ortiz, 'Língua Franca Do Boçalnarismo: Autoritarismo e Linguagem | Nexo Jornal' (*Nexo Jornal*, 2020) <<https://www.nexojornal.com.br/ensaio/2020/L%C3%ADngua-Franca-do-Boc%C3%A7alnarismo-autoritarismo-e-linguagem>> accessed 31 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

endure interruption by a citizen who comes here and does not know how to listen and respect an elected woman', she said.

Her presence there challenged the narrative that a woman, in order to be respected needs to be silent and not question anything. As mentioned, she inverted the hierarchical logic prevalent in the country. It reverses the discourse of power, of Necropower. And that, for those who are used to be served, to be the holder of discourse — and consequently of power — is an affront. The context becomes even more intense because she is a black, peripheral, and bisexual woman occupying a prominent place and is the owner of the narrative.

Marielle's presence in that collective space of power, as well as her memory, was and still is, doubly uncomfortable¹⁰¹. The freedom she still represents is too dangerous for those who just want the changes to happen so that everything remains as it is: a country where a few people are in charge, and many others obey; a necropolitical state in which those who contest the structures are silenced.

Brazil that offends Marielle is a country that does not tolerate and does not accept looking in the mirror and its own social construction, so it does not see or identify itself as the criminal subject.

101 Matheus Pichonelli, 'Matheus Pichonelli - O que deu na cabeça dos brasileiros que resolveram odiar Marielle Franco?' (16 October 2018) <<https://matheuspichonelli.blogosfera.uol.com.br/2018/10/16/o-que-tem-a-esconder-os-que-querem-apagar-a-memoria-de-marielle-franco/>> accessed 27 August 2020.

6.2 Digital Necropolitics

‘To talk about equality between women and men, girls and boys is to talk about the lives of those who have not yet been able to defend themselves from violence. Even if we earn lower salaries; that we are in lower positions; that we go through triple journeys on a working day; that our clothes subjugate us; sexually, physically and psychologically violated; killed daily by our companions; we will not be silenced: our lives matter!’,

Speech that Marielle did not have the chance to make in the voting on the Municipal Education Plan at the Legislative Assembly of Rio de Janeiro. The voting happened days after the murdered, but her speech was already ready.

Until 2003, the year Achille Mbembe article was published, the world was still dealing with the fears and uncertainty after September 11. On one side, the fear of war, on the other, the fear of the economy. Afghanistan War; Israel organizing the most massive military operation over Palestinian territories since the invasion of Lebanon in 1982; tension in Iraq; Golf War and Kosovo dispute still fresh in the memories.

Obviously, every work, be it artistic, intellectual, technological, is a production of its time and reflects its historical context and the individual experiences of its author. References to the Palestinian occupation, the Gulf War and the Kosovo campaign are present in Mbembe’s text as contemporary examples of the use of war machines, the use of technology, neo-colonialism, death, Necropower, Necropolitics. Nevertheless, looking at today, what would Mbembe say about Necropolitics in the internet sphere? How to apply the theory of war machines and Necropolitics on the internet, more specifically on the advent of so-called fake news?

The term coined by Mbembe, still so current even 17 years after its creation and which explains so clearly and tactfully the relations of power and death, disposable and non-disposable lives, can be understood in various contexts, including the most recent, for example, the current health crisis caused by the new Covid-19 — about this, the author explains that in the case of the pandemic, power materializes through the ‘expression of

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

death'. Hence, the structure of death spreads to all, speedily. The 'politics of death,' which was in practice for a large part of humanity, is potentialized and widespread. According to Mbembe, we are susceptible to the virus — both to be infected by it and to transmit it. Now we all have the power to kill. The power to kill has been thoroughly democratized. Isolation would be precisely one way of regulating that power¹⁰².

Therefore, the challenge I am proposing here is also to analyse how Necropolitics is installed in another contemporary context, the digital sphere. At the same time, to draw a parallel about its relationship with the death of Marielle Franco. Or even with what we can call the second death of Marielle.

6.3 The first news

In the first moments after the crime, in March 2018, in addition to the notary television and news sites covering, messages and demonstrations on social networks, in general, showed that Marielle's death had the potential to unite different sectors, sensibilities and ideologies. The pain of her death and all that she symbolized triggered emotional tributes on social networks and, later, great demonstrations on the streets throughout Brazil and the world.

However, within hours of the first official news of her death, Twitter, Facebook, and WhatsApp, all popular in Brazil, were flooded with information that the 38-year-old city councillor might have a less clean resume than she proclaimed. Rumours circulated through social networks, without any kind of proof, ranging from her connection with

102 Diogo Bercito, 'Pandemia democratizou poder de matar, diz autor da teoria da 'necropolítica' - 30/03/2020 - Mundo - Folha' (March 2020) <<https://www1.folha.uol.com.br/mundo/2020/03/pandemia-democratizou-poder-de-matar-diz-autor-da-teoria-da-necropolitica.shtml>> accessed 24 August 2020.

organized crime to drug use. The narrative around Marielle seemed to change direction, and for the second time, Marielle died: now her memory begins to be the victim from then on.

Quickly, the Socialism and Freedom Party (PSOL), Marielle's family and a support group began to identify online publications that promoted fake news in order to initiate legal action against their authors and propagators. In less than a week, they collected 15,000 e-mails with reports of false news about her. Marielle's family also created an entire website called 'The Truth About Marielle' to accurately refute every false news that came out about her.

In 2018, a study by the Laboratory of Studies on Image and Cyberculture at the Federal University of Espírito Santo revealed that the most shared news on the internet about Marielle Franco's death was proven fake news. One day after the study was released, Facebook removed profiles identified as responsible for spreading false information about Marielle Franco.

However, before that, the wave of social networking sharing began with a few posts posted on the website called *Ceticismo Político*, which claimed that Marielle was married to *Marcinho VP*, a well-known drug dealer, that she had been elected by a criminal faction called *Comando Vermelho* and that she had also become pregnant at age 16. The false information was published on March 16, two days after the crime¹⁰³.

The mentioned website was created in 2017 by the businessman Carlos Augusto de Moraes Afonso. He is connected to the MBL - Free Brazil Movement a political

103 Marielle was never married to any ex-drug dealer. The city councillor was 38 years old, married to Mônica Benício and had a 19-year-old daughter, called Luyara Santos. This means that she became pregnant between the ages of 18 and 19 - and not at 16. There is no connection between the Comando Vermelho dispute over Maré and the election of Marielle. Marielle was elected with 46,500 votes, of which only 1,600 were voters in and around Maré.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

movement linked to the conservative right-wing ideological that gained notoriety after the 2013 protests and that supported both the impeachment of former President Dilma Rousseff and the election of Jair Bolsonaro in 2018. Afonso, who was arrested in July 2020¹⁰⁴ on suspicion of laundering money, was the author of the report that accused Marielle Franco of having maintained a relationship with the trafficker and the *Comando Vermelho* criminal faction.

Ceticismo Político took over the posts and statements of the Judge Marília de Castro Neves of Rio de Janeiro's Court of Justice. She shared on Facebook pejorative images and messages about Marielle without any proof. The reportage had the following title: 'Judge breaks PSOL narrative and confirms that Marielle was involved with bandits and is a common corpse'. The author, Moraes Afonso, identified himself as Luciano Ayan, a pseudonym he created to avoid the relationship of his identity with his political activism — which became notorious when MBL page on Facebook shared the fake article.

The text was shared by Ayan and then replicated by MBL, and so, according to Labic, more than 4,000 people engaged in spreading the link, generating about 400,000 unique shares just on Facebook. The issue ended up taking first place among the most talked about on the social media in Brazil on that day.

After judge Marília de Castro Neves posted the fake news about Marielle, the interest of the press in the judge's profile grew. After all, it is not to be expected that a representative of the judiciary will gain notoriety for the controversies unrelated to the magistracy. Thus,

104 The Movimento Brasil Livre started to be investigated due the suspicion of money laundering through the simulation of online donations. The São Paulo Public Ministry sees evidence of a scheme involving virtual platforms and false companies involving more than R\$ 400 million.

it was discovered that Marília also exposed positions considered homophobic and made attacks on anyone who suited her.

In August 2019, the Rio de Janeiro Court of Justice accepted the action filed by the family against Castro Neves, and the case will still be judged. If convicted, the penalty can be up to two years plus a fine. Her lawyers claim that she only reproduced a text received in a WhatsApp group without checking the truth and that she regrets it.

For Anielle Franco, Marielle's sister, the case against Marília de Castro Neves is a message to other slanderers of her sister's memory¹⁰⁵.

Still in 2018, the survey by the Getúlio Vargas Foundation (FGV DAPP) Public Policy Analysis Board¹⁰⁶ showed that the repercussion of Marielle Franco's death on Twitter led to 2.14 million mentions between Wednesday (March 14, the day of the crime) and midnight on Sunday (March 18). The repercussion was marked by three big 'waves' on the social network.

In the first 36 hours after the murder, the debate was focused on the event itself and with feelings of commotion, consternation, and indignation - in addition to a minority of about 7% of critics against her work. On Friday (March 16), fake news about Marielle's alleged links to trafficking, went viral in the late afternoon after a tweet by Congressman Alberto Fraga, of the Democratic Party and activist of the so-called 'bullet table', a group of parliamentarians who acts in favour of guns policies. This second moment lasts about 24

105 Lola Ferreira, 'Defesa de desembargadora culpa advogada por fake news sobre Marielle [16/12/2019]' (UOL Notícias, 16 December 2019) <<https://noticias.uol.com.br/cotidiano/ultimas-noticias/2019/12/16/defesa-de-desembargadora-culpa-advogada-por-fakenews-sobre-marielle.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020.

106 FGV, 'Reação a Boatos Superou Difusão de Informações Contra Marielle No Twitter, Aponta FGV DAPP' (FGV DAPP, 28 March 2018) <<http://dapp.fgv.br/reacao-boatos-superou-difusao-de-informacoes-contramarielle-no-twitter-aponta-estudo-da-fgv-dapp/>> accessed 24 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

hours, until Saturday afternoon (March 17, three days after the crime), and is marked by the defamatory tone against Marielle.

The third moment, finally, is marked by the wave of denial of the fake news, which manages to stop the rumours linked to Marielle and reaches a peak of mentions around Saturday 19:00, representing almost double the Twitter posts that spread the fake news. The third wave, in this sense, manages to contain the spread of false news until the end of Sunday. One of the posts with false information about Marielle, identified by FGV DAPP, was at 10:45 on Friday, two days after the crime.

But why is Marielle Franco quoted in so many false news? Is it because she is black? Because she is a woman? Bisexual? Because of the causes she was defending? Because of her tragic death?

The false news about Marielle is another example of shared history to *favela* people and all Brazilian minorities and peripheries — the places of killable subjects. It is the most severe ‘fake news’ phenomenon in contemporary Brazil because it illustrates the destructive relationship of the state with the most vulnerable part of its population. The misinformation in this particular case is not only a product of the internet, WhatsApp, or Facebook but the result of something older: offline and also online Necropolitics.

The judge cited above was one of the primary sources that propagated the false news about Marielle. The fact that a representative of the judiciary field expresses false news is what makes it even more important to highlight the role that Justice plays in Brazilian society.

A study presented by the Public Defender’s Office of Rio de Janeiro in 2018 shows that being a *favela* resident serves as a justification for a person caught with small amounts of drugs to be considered a trafficker, not a user. More than that: the defendant's domicile is a determining factor for the sentence to be aggravated and for he or she be also convicted for association with drug trafficking.

In addition to the judge Marilia, the congress member Alberto Fraga published false and defamatory news against Marielle Franco. In the post two days after the crime, Fraga said that Marielle would have been elevated to the rank of ‘myth of the left parties’ and that, in fact, her death would have to do with drug trafficking and consumption. The message was erased, but it continued to be shared on social media during the following days of her death - both by supporters and people who opposed the content. During the controversy, Fraga even argued about the topic with Twitter users. Later, he apologized for the publication. At the end of 2018, the Congress Council of Ethics dismissed the process that called for the annulment of Fraga’s mandate.

Although the professional press has committed itself to deny the false news about Marielle, the attitude of the judge and the congress member is also a reflection of what happens behind the scenes of Justice and Brazilian politics. It puts in check once again the neutrality of an entire system that already perpetuates the imprisonment and death of one specific group of society to the benefit of another group.

It is not an issue of questioning world views or even criticizing the commotion with a political crime, which are positions expected in a debate. What was seen is an activated machine of false information and rumours alluding, without any factual basis, to Marielle’s involvement with outlaws and the exponentially sharing of this information. It is the complete misrepresentation of the concept and fundamental right of freedom of expression. The production and dissemination of false news are also considered a crime because, according to jurists, it fits as slander and defamation, crimes under the Brazilian Penal Code, articles 138 and 139, respectively.

What we see in Brazil is the law as an instrument used by the state to give legality to racist conduct. Some society movements have caused national legal systems to change their norms, banning explicitly discriminatory laws — such as racism being considered a crime in Brazil. However, superiority-inferiority relations are still maintained. It explains

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

why Brazil is an authoritarian system. Therefore, the justice system reproduces this authoritarianism¹⁰⁷.

It is essential to notice that once a judge and a democratically elected politician share such information in their social media, there is a kind of validation. Thus, the rumour gains an authority label and body, and the spread becomes uncontrollable. In this sense, it is identified in the speech of authority, of who owns power, through social media and fake news, a tool at the service of Digital Necropolitics.

Going back to Mbembe, neoliberalism applies Necropolitics, lets people who are not profitable die. As Clara Valverde Gefaell¹⁰⁸ points out, neoliberal politics consists of a Necropolitics whose declared goal is to end the excluded. Whom are the excluded and how are they neutralized or eliminated by this power? They are those who do not have the minimum: roof, food, shelter, people with disabilities, without help. They are neutralized, letting them die. The power passes the image that the excluded and the vulnerable are dirty, unpleasant people who, according to them, do not want to work or to improve and it is better to take them out of the midst of others.

In his case, the best control mechanism is to let people see the vulnerability so they can realise that this can happen to them too. Thus, the Necropolitics of language is also violent because it stimulates the death, even if little by little, if not physical death but the death

107 Kamille Viola, ‘Sem espaço do sonho, a vida vira pura miséria’, diz jurista Silvio Almeida’ (UOL, 11 June 2020) <<https://www.uol.com.br/ecoa/ultimas-noticias/2020/06/11/mortes-por-racismo-representam-fracasso-do-homem-branco-diz-jurista.htm>> accessed 19 July 2020.

108 Gilson Camargo, ‘Neoliberalismo leva à morte as pessoas que não são lucrativas’ (Extra Classe, 3 June 2019) <<https://www.extraclasse.org.br/politica/2019/06/necropolitica-pesadelo-neoliberal/>> accessed 24 August 2020.

of legacies, memories, and reputations using the fake news as a way to kill. A symbolic death in life, or the reinforcement of the death.

Through the sharing of false news, Marielle has become the target of hate speech and resentment by a part of conservative sectors of society that would naturally already be contrary to the laws and projects proposed by her, such as the fight against police violence, protection of women, human rights, and the so-called ‘genocide’ of the black population in Rio de Janeiro.

That is what journalist Mabel Dias dos Santos explains in her article *The hate speech and the second death of Marielle Franco by the fake news in Brazil*. The attacks on Marielle reveal a racist and sexist face of part of Brazilian society, which does not accept a black woman from the periphery of Rio de Janeiro to arrive at university and parliament. ‘The disclosure of false news against Marielle Franco by congress member Alberto Fraga and judge Marília Castro Neves in their social networks seek to delegitimize the action for social justice for residents of Rio de Janeiro’s *favelas*’¹⁰⁹.

That is why we can also affirm that Marielle is a victim of another kind of war machine: the fake news machine. It takes advantage of a polarized and deeply divided political context, especially after the impeachment of former President Dilma Rousseff of the Workers’ Party (PT) in 2016.

The attempt to erase Marielle’s memory shows itself as a joint and political action because like the war machine described by Mbembe, this is a war machine that acts in an

109 Mabel Dias, ‘O Discurso de Ódio e a Segunda Morte de Marielle Franco Pelas Fake News No Brasil’
9

<<http://www.redor2018.sinteseeventos.com.br/arquivo/downloadpublic?q=YTToyOntzOjY6InBhcmFtcyI7czozMzoiYToxOntzOjEwOiJRRF9BUiFVSZPIjtzOjI6Ijg4Ijt9IjtzOjE6ImgiO3M6MzI6IjBjZTkzWTRjMTgwMDYyMDgzZmE2OTkxMDVhYzE4NDJjIjt9>>.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

orchestrated and polymorphic way. The digital universe still facilitates its dissolution, disguise, and impunity. Social networks reproduce the false news that precisely attacks those whose bodies and memories are considered inferior and killable. The false news is financed, produced, and shared by groups that take economic advantages from it.

When acting in the digital field, the fake news war machine becomes even more potent because there is no delimited geographic territory and a real face behind it. Identifying and punishing the responsible depends on a set of laws and, debate and actions that are still insufficient in Brazil.

The spread of information in a scalable way via social networks without a critical view of content is what ends up making these networks the fertile space for misinformation because users are engaged in the polarization diffusion of lies¹¹⁰.

Fake news appears in this space of discursive dispute, using distortions, inversions, and hyperboles to produce new truths and memories through offensive and accusation languages. With an aggravating factor: the fact that having a polymorphous nature, they become 'war machines' that attack memories and reputations with an unlimited capacity for propagation. In this way, adherence to them happens collectively, using the language of violence, panic, and rumour against who tries to combat this language.

Just like Marielle, Dilma Rousseff was also a victim of fake news. A survey by the Public Policy Research Group of the University of São Paulo reveals that in the week of the impeachment of the former president, in August 2016, three of the five reports most shared by Brazilians on Facebook were false, and all related to the former president.

110Bernardo Sorj and others, 'Sobrevivendo nas redes - Guia do Cidadão'

<http://www.plataformademocratica.org/Arquivos/Sobrevivendo_nas_redes.pdf> accessed 25 August 2020.

Not coincidentally, Rousseff and Marielle represent two emblematic cases of fake news victims. Women are the main victims of threats, violent content and swearing on the internet in Brazil, according to the Open Word Institute¹¹¹. In addition, a survey by Avaaz, an online mobilization platform, revealed that Brazilians are the ones who most believe in fake news in the world. According to the platform, seven out of ten Brazilians are informed by social networks, and 62% have already believed in some fake news¹¹².

Besides, another emblematic case of fake news has a relationship with a friend close to Marielle. Elected for the third time as federal congress member by PSOL in Rio de Janeiro, Jean Wyllys, 44, gave up his term in 2019.

Since the murder of Marielle Franco, Wyllys has lived under police protection. With the intensification of death threats, typical even before the death of Marielle, the deputy decided to abandon public life and leave Brazil.

The first openly homosexual parliamentarian to embrace the LGBTQIA+ agenda in the National Congress, he became one of the main targets of conservative groups, mainly on social networks. At the time, he said he was ‘broken inside’ due to fake news disseminated about him, even though he won at least five lawsuits for injury, slander, and defamation.

After disclosing that Wyllys decided to give up his term, Rio de Janeiro city councillor Carlos Bolsonaro, son of Jair Bolsonaro, wrote on Twitter: ‘Go with God and be happy!’. At the same day, President Jair Bolsonaro posted the message ‘Great day!’ on Twitter¹¹³.

111 Rui Maciel, ‘Brasileiros são os que mais acreditam em fake news no mundo, diz pesquisa’ (Canaltech, 27 November 2019) <<https://canaltech.com.br/internet/brasileiros-sao-os-que-mais-acreditam-em-fake-news-no-mundo-diz-pesquisa-156387/>> accessed 25 August 2020.

¹¹² *ibid.*

¹¹³ Available at <https://twitter.com/jairbolsonaro/status/1088500925923246080>

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

In June 2020, The Rio de Janeiro Court ordered congress members, YouTubers, and supporters of President Jair Bolsonaro to delete fake news posts against former federal deputy Jean Wyllys from their social networks.

Back to Marielle, what makes her an even more potential victim in this context is the fact that she is black because it is precisely the black women who are the main targets of derogatory comments on social networks¹¹⁴.

An analysis of 109 Facebook pages, 16,000 user profiles on Brazilian social networks and 224 journalistic articles that addressed cases of racism shows that 81% of victims of pejorative discourse on social networks are black women between 20 and 35 years of age. The survey also shows that 65% of users who spread racial intolerance are men in the 20 to 25 years old¹¹⁵.

In other words: black women who stand out in positions of power and privilege mostly occupied by white men cause many inconveniences in a model of racist and sexist social construction in the online environment. After all, the virtual environment replicates the Necropolitics that is established in the offline environment.

The repeated use of terms associating blackness with delinquency and lack of schooling establishes not only clear differentiation among blacks and whites in Brazil but also boundaries of belonging to differentiated social spaces. By depicting black women as

114 EBC, 'Discurso de ódio na internet tem mulheres negras como principal alvo' (Justificando, 13 August 2018) <<http://www.justificando.com/2018/08/13/discurso-de-odio-na-internet-tem-mulheres-negras-como-principal-alvo/>> accessed 25 August 2020.

115 Luiz Valerio P Trindade, 'Social Media in Brazil: Distilling Racism Against Black Women' (University of Southampton) <<https://data.southampton.ac.uk/event/0d8daf14092dd1fea62a5bd57969eae8.html>>.

contumacious perpetrators and uneducated, by exclusion, the jokes reinforce and naturalize their opposite attributes that are taken for granted as belonging exclusively to whites. This way, social and racial inequalities are also perpetuated in Brazil, and social media represents the contemporary arena for the manifestation, dissemination, and reinforcement of such values. As this phenomenon becomes an increasing natural component of the Brazilian online environment, this could potentially lead to society's indifference to racial inequalities, as they become widespread, naturalized, and reinforced¹¹⁶.

In Brazil, black women are at the bottom of the social pyramid and face difficulties of access in all spaces. The structure that makes access to determined spaces and positions impossible comes from a place with few opportunities. When black women shake this social construction of race and gender-based on racism and sexism and leave the place of those who benefit from public policies to the place of public policymaker, the whole structure moves¹¹⁷ against her. Whether online or offline. She is twice pointed as target: first for been black; secondly for change the social construction.

Therefore, the attack on Marielle's life and the spread of untruths after her murder demonstrates the cruellest face of another kind of Brazilian Necropolitics.

116 Luiz Valério P Trindade, 'Disparagement Humour and Gendered Racism on Social Media in Brazil' [2019] *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 1, 14
<<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/01419870.2019.1689278>> accessed 25 August 2020.

117 Djamilia Ribeiro, *Pequeno manual anti-racista* (1st edn, Schwarcz 2019).

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

7

CONCLUSION

As Marielle said, we live in a moment of crisis for democratic institutions.

To continue denying the structural and social character that surrounds this Brazilian crisis is to continue providing conditions for systematic, procedural, and historical discrimination in the country. This context creates a social stratification that results in countless political and economic disadvantages to minority groups, experienced in the form of poverty, lower wages, less access to health and education systems, higher chances of incarceration and death¹¹⁸. It is the current Necropolitics, and which Marielle fought against by proposing laws, being a feminist, activist and writer.

According to Mbembe, neoliberalism is a reissue of modern black enslavement. The enslavement of African peoples would be the condition for the possibility of liberalism and the advent of neoliberalism as a project to revitalize slavery itself. Neoliberalism would then be the moment in human history when all events have a market value. It is an era in which time, as short as it may be, passes to become the reproductive force of the money. Thus, those who are not part of this productive and consumer group become disposable and more vulnerable to death (and all its forms).

118 Renato Nogueira, 'A democracia é possível?' (Revista Cult, 5 November 2018)
<<https://revistacult.uol.com.br/home/democracia-e-possivel/>> accessed 25 August 2020.

Thus, the dynamics of the discriminatory process against these groups is linked to the logic of economics and politics, as stated by Silvio de Almeida¹¹⁹. And this discrimination only becomes systemic if the socio-political conditions that naturalize the inequality of treatment offered to individuals belonging to minority groups are reproduced - as through structural racism, for example. Therefore, forms of discrimination are only established if there is the participation of the state, which can act directly in the classification of people and in discriminatory processes.

For Marielle Franco, the legal apparatuses of death conditioned by the state become more potent when combined with the control interfaces promoted by the neoliberal stage:

In the replacement of social policies that invest in the field of rights, a policy that strengthens the Penal State is open, to contain those on the margins or “excluded” from the process. The “excluded group” is made up of a significant number of poor and black people, increasingly placed in the ghettos of the cities... “The neoliberal face”, the one from a new world order, is present and radicalizes the other ‘faces’. The “free market”; the “free trade”; the “minimum state”; privatisations; the “indebted man”; marketing; propaganda; turnovers; financial capitalism; “existence and thought for the market”; the “mass individual”; the cypher; the password; computers; the “technocratic isolation”; the market culture; the contraction of public space; the culture of terror; the neoliberal projects [...] are praised every day and become more concrete, more real¹²⁰.

Moreover, what makes this much more feasible is a violent discourse constituted under a verbal and imaginative language based on violence, on Necropolitics. Authorities or ordinary citizens when spreading false news, speeches on electoral stages show how

119 Silvio Luiz de Almeida, ‘Capitalismo e crise: o que o racismo tem a ver com isso?’ (Blog da Boitempo, 23 June 2020) <<https://blogdaboitempo.com.br/2020/06/23/capitalismo-e-crise-o-que-o-racismo-tem-a-ver-com-isso/>> accessed 25 August 2020.

120 Franco (n 63) 40–41.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF NECROPOLITICS

Necropolitics is also carried out in the dispute of narratives, in the discourse of powers. These powers consist of the power to let live and die: it is the Necropower.

To understand that a necropolitical and therefore racist system is part of Brazil's structure is to realize that those who put themselves in front of these minorities, those who are willing to change this system, those who defend human rights are at risk. The people that Marielle was legitimately and democratically representing are at risk.

Marielle's case is emblematic and becomes relevant because her intersectionality exposes all the wounds of a country that has not yet dealt with its own history of enslavement, authoritarianism and inequality, and shows how the struggle for human rights is even more complex and urgent than denunciations in international courts and tribunes around the world.

All the power structures that are involved in one way or another in Marielle's case, whether through involvement in the crime or the investigation, reveal how important it is to debate the link between justice, racism and democracy. A crime of this dimension that goes unpunished brings with it a series of consequences that reflect daily in people's lives. A crime against democracy that remains unpunished is to set a severe precedent that endangers life and the democracy itself.

Besides, it is setting a pattern also in the field of the discourse. The message that goes on while there has been no solution to this political crime is a message that further intensifies the disputes over narratives, so fierce in the virtual field — a dispute, it is important to note, based on the digital Necropolitics, and which consequences may be fatal — also in the 'offline' life.

In August 2020, a Federal Police report points out that former Rio de Janeiro city councillor Cristiano Girão Matias, who lost his term in 2010 after being sentenced to 14 years in prison for leading a militia in a community in Rio de Janeiro, is one of those investigated as the mastermind of the crime.

He was indicted by the CPI of the Militias¹²¹, chaired by Marcelo Freixo, for whom Marielle worked as an advisor. According to the document, the murder of Marielle would be a response to the investigation's actions, and Freixo would be the initial target. As the plan did not work, Marielle became the target.

Why?

Marielle Franco had her steps monitored for at least three months before the crime. Police say, Ronnie Lessa, the man who shot, did research on the internet and had information about the councillor's schedule, places she used to go and her habits.

Her case is exceptionally complex and nebulous. Crooked paths reveal the names of important people in the Brazilian political scene and all spheres of power. That is why the election, especially of women, committed to the elucidation of the case, reduction of violence and racial equity is so significant. Brazilian democracy finds in these alternatives a column of support and resistance.

The Brazilian state has failed to protect Marielle. The Brazilian state has failed to look after the lives of women, black women, LGBTQIA+ people. The Brazilian state colludes with the discourse and language of violence. The Brazilian state colludes with injustice and inequality. The Brazilian state colludes with death. The Brazilian state is a necropolitical state.

121 As state deputy, Marcelo Freixo managed in 2007 to create the CPI of the Militias. The landmark in his political trajectory ended up becoming the reason for the congressman to circulate with security guards for over 10 years. The focus was to investigate alliances between politicians and militiamen in Rio de Janeiro. The 2008 final report called for the indictment of 266 people, seven politicians among them. All suspected of using paramilitary groups in Rio de Janeiro. Janaína Carvalho, 'Seis anos após CPI, deputado diz que pouco foi feito no combate a milícias' (Rio de Janeiro, 6 November 2014) <<http://g1.globo.com/rio-de-janeiro/noticia/2014/11/seis-anos-apos-cpi-deputado-diz-que-pouco-foi-feito-no-combate-milicias.html>> accessed 25 August 2020.

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Nevertheless, Marielle's seeds are sprouting. The state may maintain a deafening silence about the real ones interested in her death, but there is no way to stop the seeds and the noise that comes from the streets and votes.

Marielle lives. Marielle, *presente!*

LIDIANE DIAS FERREIRA

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Afonso N, '[Agência Lupa] Dia da Consciência Negra: números expõem desigualdade racial no Brasil' (*Agência Lupa*, 20 November 2019)

<<https://piaui.folha.uol.com.br/lupa/2019/11/20/consciencia-negra-numeros-brasil/>>

accessed 23 August 2020

Almeida SL de, 'Capitalismo e crise: o que o racismo tem a ver com isso?' (*Blog da Boitempo*, 23 June 2020) <<https://blogdaboitempo.com.br/2020/06/23/capitalismo-e-crise-o-que-o-racismo-tem-a-ver-com-isso/>> accessed 25 August 2020

Almeida S, *Racismo Estrutural* (1a edn, Pólen Livros 2019)

'Alves - 2011 - Topografias Da Violência Necropoder e Governament.Pdf'

Alves JA, 'Topografias da violência: necropoder e governamentalidade espacial em São Paulo' [2011] Geography Department, University of Sao Paulo 108

<<http://www.revistas.usp.br/rdg/article/view/47222>> accessed 27 August 2020

Alves R, 'Witzel recebe família de Marielle e pede desculpa por ato com placa quebrada na campanha eleitoral' (*GI*, 13 March 2019) <<https://g1.globo.com/rj/rio-de-janeiro/noticia/2019/03/13/witzel-recebe-familia-de-marielle-e-pede-desculpa-por-ato-com-placa-quebrada.ghtml>> accessed 24 August 2020

Amnesty International, 'Facts & Figures: Human Rights in the Americas in 2019' (2019) <<https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2020/02/facts-and-figures-human-rights-in-the-americas-in-2019/>> accessed 23 August 2020

Anistia Internacional, 'O labirinto do caso Marielle Franco' <<https://anistia.org.br/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/labirinto-caso-marielle.pdf>>

—, 'Nota Pública: menções ao caso Marielle Franco em pronunciamento do presidente Jair Bolsonaro' (*Anistia Internacional*, 24 April 2020)

<<https://anistia.org.br/noticias/nota-publica-mencoes-ao-caso-marielle-franco-em-pronunciamento-presidente-jair-bolsonaro/>> accessed 24 August 2020

BBC, 'Bolivian Women Battle against Culture of Harassment' *BBC News* (12 March 2014) <<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-latin-america-26446066>> accessed 23 August 2020

BBC Brasil, 'Os 6 casos envolvendo aliados ou família de Bolsonaro que ficam em evidência com mudança de comando da PF' *BBC News Brasil* (4 May 2020) <<https://www.bbc.com/portuguese/brasil-52448597>> accessed 24 August 2020

Bercito D, 'Pandemia democratizou poder de matar, diz autor da teoria da "necropolítica" - 30/03/2020 - Mundo - Folha' (March 2020) <<https://www1.folha.uol.com.br/mundo/2020/03/pandemia-democratizou-poder-de-matar-diz-autor-da-teoria-da-necropolitica.shtml>> accessed 24 August 2020

Betim F, 'As "outras" Marielles que o Rio elegeu' (*EL PAÍS*, 13 October 2018) <https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2018/10/11/politica/1539275009_606211.html> accessed 23 August 2020

—, 'Intervenção no Rio se aproxima do fim com recorde de mortes por policiais e mais tiroteios' (*EL PAÍS*, 18 December 2018) <https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2018/12/18/politica/1545165331_275511.html> accessed 23 August 2020

Bigio J and Vogelstein R, 'Women Under Attack -The Backlash Against Female Politicians' (*Foreign Affairs*, January 2020) <<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/2019-12-10/women-under-attack>> accessed 23 August 2020

Biroli F, 'Violence against Women and Reactions to Gender Equality in Politics' (2018) 14 *Politics & Gender* 681 <https://www.cambridge.org/core/product/identifier/S1743923X18000600/type/journal_article> accessed 23 August 2020

Borges P, 'Epistemicídio, a morte começa antes do tiro – Educação em Direitos Humanos em Foco' (*Observatório de educação em direitos humanos em foco*, 2019) <<http://observatorioedhemfoco.com.br/observatorio/epistemicidio-a-morte-comeca-antes-do-tiro/>> accessed 29 August 2020

Caballero M, 'Da Maré, Marielle Franco Chega à Câmara Como a Quinta Mais Votada' (*O Globo*, 4 October 2016) <<https://oglobo.globo.com/brasil/da-mare-marielle-franco-chega-camara-como-quinta-mais-votada-20228691>>

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

Camargo G, 'Neoliberalismo leva à morte as pessoas que não são lucrativas' (*Extra Classe*, 3 June 2019) <<https://www.extraclasse.org.br/politica/2019/06/necropolitica-pesadelo-neoliberal/>> accessed 24 August 2020

Cano I, '7.1 Violence and Organized Crime in Brazil: The Cases of “militias” in Rio de Janeiro' in Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung and Regine Schönenberg (eds), *Transnational Organized Crime*, vol 17 (transcript Verlag 2013)
<<https://www.degruyter.com/doi/10.14361/transcript.9783839424957.179>> accessed 24 August 2020

Carbonari P, 'Quem foi Marielle Franco, a vereadora executada no Rio' (*Super*)
<<https://super.abril.com.br/sociedade/quem-foi-marielle-franco-a-vereadora-executada-no-rio/>> accessed 23 August 2020

Carinhato C, 'O funcionamento discursivo das fake news: A criação do produto midiático' (Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina 2019)
<<https://repositorio.ufsc.br/bitstream/handle/123456789/199882/%23P%C3%93S%20B ANCA%20TCC%20-%20CRISTIANE%20CARINHATO.pdfA.pdf?sequence=1>>

Carvalho J, 'Seis anos após CPI, deputado diz que pouco foi feito no combate a milícias' (*Rio de Janeiro*, 6 November 2014) <<http://g1.globo.com/rio-de-janeiro/noticia/2014/11/seis-anos-apos-cpi-deputado-diz-que-pouco-foi-feito-no-combate-milicias.html>> accessed 25 August 2020

Corrêa LH, 'Aproximações entre Foucault e Mbembe: a bio/necro política no devir sujeito dos que não importam' (2019) 4 13

Costa F, 'Assalto a Ronnie Lessa: As Lacunas de Uma Possível Tentativa de Queima de Arquivo No Caso Marielle' (*UOL Notícias*, 11 December 2019)
<<https://noticias.uol.com.br/cotidiano/ultimas-noticias/2019/12/11/caso-marielle-assalto-quase-matou-ronnie-lessa-policial-militar.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020

Costa F and Lang M, 'Polícia Civil perdeu imagens dos assassinos de Marielle no dia do atentado' (*UOL Notícias*, 13 October 2019)
<<https://noticias.uol.com.br/cotidiano/ultimas-noticias/2019/10/13/policia-civil-perdeu-imagens-dos-assassinos-de-marielle-no-dia-do-atentado.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020

D'Agostino R, 'STJ nega federalizar caso Marielle, e investigação continuará com Polícia Civil e MP do Rio' (*GI*)

<<https://g1.globo.com/politica/noticia/2020/05/27/relatora-no-stj-vota-contrafederalizacao-do-caso-marielle-franco.ghtml>> accessed 24 August 2020

Davis AY and Barat F, *Freedom Is a Constant Struggle: Ferguson, Palestine, and the Foundations of a Movement* (Haymarket Books 2016)

‘Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universa’

Dias M, ‘O Discurso de Ódio e a Segunda Morte de Marielle Franco Pelas Fake News No Brasil’

<<http://www.redor2018.sinteseeventos.com.br/arquivo/downloadpublic?q=YToyOntzOjY6InBhemFtcyI7czozMzoiYToxOntzOjEwOiJJRF9BUiFVSVZPIjtzOjI6Ijg4Ijt9IjtzOjE6ImgiO3M6MzI6IjBjZTkwZTRjMTgwMDYyMDgzZmE2OTkxMDVhYzE4NDJjIjt9>>

Diniz D and Carino G, ‘A necropolítica como regime de governo’ (*EL PAÍS*, 16 July 2019) <https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2019/07/09/opinion/1562688743_395031.html> accessed 24 August 2020

EBC, ‘Discurso de ódio na internet tem mulheres negras como principal alvo’ (*Justificando*, 13 August 2018) <<http://www.justificando.com/2018/08/13/discurso-de-odio-na-internet-tem-mulheres-negras-como-principal-alvo/>> accessed 25 August 2020

Equipe HuffPost, ‘Quem é Domingos Brazão, homem acusado de mandar matar Marielle Franco’ (*HuffPost Brasil*, 28 October 2019) <https://www.huffpostbrasil.com/entry/marielle-domingos-braao_br_5db723e2e4b006d49172f3f3> accessed 24 August 2020

Fábio AC, ‘O que significa federalizar parte da investigação do caso Marielle | Nexo Jornal’ (*Nexo Jornal*, 19 September 2019) <<https://www.nexojornal.com.br/expresso/2019/09/19/O-que-significa-federalizar-parte-da-investigacao%3%A7%C3%A3o-do-caso-Marielle>> accessed 24 August 2020

Falci B, ‘Jean Wyllys: “Marielle vai derrubar Bolsonaro”’ (*Jornalistas Livres*, 13 March 2019) <<https://jornalistaslivres.org/jean-wyllys-marielle-vai-derrubar-bolsonaro/>> accessed 24 August 2020

Fernandes A, ‘STJ decide manter investigação do caso Marielle no Rio de Janeiro’ (*Correio Braziliense*, 27 May 2020) <https://www.correiobraziliense.com.br/app/noticia/politica/2020/05/27/interna_politica>

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

[.858838/stj-decide-manter-investigacao-do-caso-marielle-no-rio-de-janeiro.shtml](https://www.g1.com.br/politica/2019/12/20/entenda-suspeitas-do-mp-sobre-flavio-bolsonaro-em-esquema-de-rachadinhas-na-alerj.shtml)>
accessed 23 August 2020

Ferreira L, 'Defesa de desembargadora culpa advogada por fake news sobre Marielle [16/12/2019]' (*UOL Notícias*, 16 December 2019) <<https://noticias.uol.com.br/cotidiano/ultimas-noticias/2019/12/16/defesa-de-desembargadora-culpa-advogada-por-fakenews-sobre-marielle.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020

FGV, 'Reação a Boatos Superou Difusão de Informações Contra Marielle No Twitter, Aponta FGV DAPP' (*FGV DAPP*, 28 March 2018) <<http://dapp.fgv.br/reacao-boatos-superou-difusao-de-informacoes-contramarielle-no-twitter-aponta-estudo-da-fgv-dapp/>> accessed 24 August 2020

Forte B, 'O que é racismo estrutural? Ainda hoje existe? Somos todos racistas?' (*Ecoa - UOL*, 19 November 2019) <<https://www.uol.com.br/ecoalistas/o-que-e-racismo-estrutural.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020

Foucault M, *A ordem do discurso* (3rd edn, Edições Loyola 1996)

Franco M, 'UPP – A Redução Da Favela A Três Letras: Uma Análise Da Política De Segurança Pública Do Estado Do Rio De Janeiro' (mestrado, Universidade Federal Fluminense 2014)

Fraud Fighting, 'Ghost Employees' <<https://fraudfighting.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/Ghost-Employees.pdf>>

Front Line Defenders, 'Stop Killing Us' (Front Line, the International Foundation for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders 2018) <www.frontlinedefenders.org>

——, 'Front Line Defenders Global Analysis 2018' (Front Line, the International Foundation for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders 2019) <www.frontlinedefenders.org>

G1, 'Entenda suspeitas do MP sobre Flávio Bolsonaro em esquema de "rachadinhas" na Alerj' (*G1*, 20 December 2019) <<https://g1.globo.com/rj/rio-de-janeiro/noticia/2019/12/20/entenda-suspeitas-do-mp-sobre-flavio-bolsonaro-em-esquema-de-rachadinhas-na-alerj.ghtml>> accessed 24 August 2020

G1 Rio, 'Caso Fabrício Queiroz: o que é, cronologia dos fatos, envolvidos' (*G1*, 18 January 2019) <<https://g1.globo.com/rj/rio-de-janeiro/noticia/2019/01/18/caso-fabricio-queiroz-o-que-e-cronologia-dos-fatos-personagens.ghtml>> accessed 24 August 2020

GIFE, 'Relatório da Human Rights Watch aponta graves ameaças aos direitos' (*GIFE*, 11 March 2019) <<https://gife.org.br/relatorio-mundial-2019-da-human-rights-watch-aponta-graves-ameacas-aos-direitos-humanos-no-brasil/>> accessed 23 August 2020

Giorgio Agamben, *Means Without End: Notes on Politics*, vol 20 (1st edn, University Of Minnesota Press 2000) <<https://www.upress.umn.edu/book-division/books/means-without-end>>

Global Witness, 'Annual Report 2018: Delivering Global Change' (Global Witness 2019)

Governo Federal, 'Palácio Do Planalto' (*Presidência da República*) <<https://www.gov.br/planalto/pt-br/conheca-a-presidencia/palacios-e-residencias/palacio-do-planalto>> accessed 24 August 2020

Grassman N and Biroli F, 'Um mês sem Marielle: democracia, legado e a violência contra as mulheres na política | #AgoraÉQueSãoElas' (*#AgoraÉQueSãoElas*, 14 April 2018) <<https://agoraquesaoelas.blogfolha.uol.com.br/2018/04/14/um-mes-sem-marielle/>>

Human Rights Watch, 'World Report 2019' (*Human Rights Watch*, 4 December 2018) <<https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2019>> accessed 23 August 2020

Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada; Fórum Brasileiro de Segurança Pública (ed), *Atlas da Violência 2019* (Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada (Ipea); Fórum Brasileiro de Segurança Pública 2019)

Inter-Parliamentary Union, 'Sexism, Harassment and Violence against Women Parliamentarians' 12 <<https://primarysources.brillonline.com/browse/human-rights-documents-online/sexism-harassment-and-violence-against-women-parliamentarians;hrdhrd10212016006>> accessed 23 August 2020

Iphan, 'Vídeos - IPHAN - Instituto Do Patrimônio Histórico e Artístico Nacional' <<http://portal.iphan.gov.br/videos/detalhes/20>> accessed 24 August 2020

Jucá B, 'Adriano da Nóbrega, suspeito de envolvimento no caso Marielle, é morto em operação policial na Bahia' (*EL PAÍS*, 9 February 2020)

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

<<https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2020-02-09/suspeito-de-envolvimento-no-assassinato-de-marielle-e-morto-em-operacao-policial.html>> accessed 24 August 2020

Krook ML and Sanín JR, 'Gender and Political Violence in Latin America' 34

Lilia Moritz Schwarcz, *O espetáculo das raças: Cientistas, instituições e questão racial no Brasil, 1870-1930* (Companhia das Letras (1993) 1993)

Lima JD de, "Não dá para falar de democracia sem falar da questão racial" (*Nexo Jornal*, June 2020)

<<https://www.nexojournal.com.br/entrevista/2020/06/01/%E2%80%98N%C3%A3o-d%C3%A1-para-falar-de-democracia-sem-falar-da-quest%C3%A3o-racial%E2%80%99>> accessed 24 August 2020

Maciel R, 'Brasileiros são os que mais acreditam em fake news no mundo, diz pesquisa' (*Canaltech*, 27 November 2019) <<https://canaltech.com.br/internet/brasileiros-sao-os-que-mais-acreditam-em-fake-news-no-mundo-diz-pesquisa-156387/>> accessed 25 August 2020

Marielle Franco - PSol (Mídia NINJA 2016)

<<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IKSWfgZLKMA&t=3s>>

'Marielle Franco no Twitter' (*Twitter*)

<<https://twitter.com/mariellefranco/status/973568966403731456>> accessed 23 August 2020

Mazza L, Rossi A and Buono R, 'A polícia que mais mata' (*Revista Piauí*, August 2019) <<https://piaui.folha.uol.com.br/policia-que-mais-mata/>> accessed 24 August 2020

Mbembe A, 'Necropolitics' (2003) 15 *Public Culture* 11

<<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/39984>>

——, *Critique of Black Reason* (Duke University Press 2017)

<<https://www.dukeupress.edu/critique-of-black-reason>>

Michels E, Mott L and Paulinho, 'Mortes violentas de LGBT+ no Brasil 2018' (Grupo Gay da Bahia 2019)

<<https://grupogaydabahia.files.wordpress.com/2019/01/relat%C3%B3rio-de-crimes-contra-lgbt-brasil-2018-grupo-gay-da-bahia.pdf>> accessed 23 August 2020

Nogueira R, 'A democracia é possível?' (*Revista Cult*, 5 November 2018)
<<https://revistacult.uol.com.br/home/democracia-e-possivel/>> accessed 25 August 2020

O Globo, 'No Congresso, Só 17,8% Dos Parlamentares São Negros - Jornal O Globo' (*O Globo*, 21 November 2019) <<https://oglobo.globo.com/brasil/no-congresso-so-178-dos-parlamentares-sao-negros-24091102>> accessed 24 August 2020

Oliveira M, 'Gestão Bolsonaro violou 36 vezes programa de direitos humanos, diz conselho' (*UOL Notícias*, 12 December 2019)
<<https://noticias.uol.com.br/politica/ultimas-noticias/2019/12/12/gestao-bolsonaro-violou-36-vezes-programa-de-direitos-humanos-diz-conselho.htm>> accessed 23 August 2020

Ortiz R, 'Língua Franca Do Boçalnarismo: Autoritarismo e Linguagem | Nexo Jornal' (*Nexo Jornal*, 2020) <<https://www.nexojornal.com.br/ensaio/2020/L%C3%ADngua-Franca-do-Boc%C3%A7alnarismo-autoritarismo-e-linguagem>> accessed 31 August 2020

Pennafort R, "'A polícia vai mirar na cabecinha e... fogo", afirma Wilson Witzel - 01/11/2018 - UOL Notícias' (*UOL Notícias*, November 2018)
<<https://noticias.uol.com.br/ultimas-noticias/agencia-estado/2018/11/01/a-policia-vai-mirar-na-cabecinha-e-fogo-afirma-wilson-witzel.htm?cmpid=copiaecola>> accessed 24 August 2020

Pichonelli M, 'Matheus Pichonelli - O que deu na cabeça dos brasileiros que resolveram odiar Marielle Franco?' (16 October 2018)
<<https://matheuspichonelli.blogosfera.uol.com.br/2018/10/16/o-que-tem-a-esconder-os-que-querem-apagar-a-memoria-de-marielle-franco/>> accessed 27 August 2020

Ramalho S, 'Morte de Marielle: "Falar em crime de ódio é inaceitável", afirma Freixo' (*UOL Notícias*, 12 March 2019) <<https://noticias.uol.com.br/cotidiano/ultimas-noticias/2019/03/12/delegados-da-pf-apresentaram-falsa-testemunha-no-caso-marielle-diz-freixo.htm>> accessed 24 August 2020

Reina E, Centenera M and Torrado S, 'América Latina é a região mais letal para as mulheres | Notícias | EL PAÍS Brasil' (*El País*, 27 November 2018)
<https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2018/11/24/actualidad/1543075049_751281.html> accessed 23 August 2020

Restrepo Sanín J, 'The Law and Violence against Women in Politics' (2018) 14 *Politics & Gender* 676

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS

<https://www.cambridge.org/core/product/identifier/S1743923X18000594/type/journal_article> accessed 23 August 2020

Ribeiro D, *O que é lugar de fala* (Letramento 2017)

——, *Quem Tem Medo do Feminismo Negro* (Companhia Das Letras 2018)

——, *Pequeno manual anti-racista* (1st edn, Schwarcz 2019)

Rodrigues HCF and Pinheiro JDJ, ‘A necropolítica neoliberal de encontro ao nomadismo: uma corpografia dos povos errantes na Bahia, no contexto do bolsonarismo no Brasil’ (2019) 13 *Revista Extraprensa* 241

<<http://www.revistas.usp.br/extraprensa/article/view/163215>> accessed 31 August 2020

Sanín JR, ‘Violence against Women in Politics: Latin America in an Era of Backlash’ (2020) 45 *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 302

<<https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/10.1086/704954>> accessed 23 August 2020

Santos B de S, *Epistemologies of the South: Justice against Epistemicide*, vol 2 (Routledge 2016)

Senado TV, ‘A cada 23 minutos um jovem negro está sendo assassinado no Brasil, diz pesquisadora’ (*TV Senado*, 6 December 2018)

<<https://www12.senado.leg.br/tv/programas/noticias-1/2018/12/a-cada-23-minutos-um-jovem-negro-esta-sendo-assassinado-no-brasil-diz-pesquisadora>> accessed 23 August 2020

Silva VR da, ‘ENTREVISTA: Como o discurso de ódio se tornou capital político?’ (*Gênero e Número*, 18 October 2018) <<http://www.generonumero.media/como-o-discurso-de-odioso-tornou-capital-politico/>> accessed 24 August 2020

Silva MVM, ‘Levantamento Nacional de Informações Penitenciárias Atualização - Junho de 2017’ (Ministério da Justiça e Segurança Pública, Departamento Penitenciário Nacional 2017) <<http://depen.gov.br/DEPEN/depen/sisdepen/infopen/relatorios-sinteticos/infopen-jun-2017-rev-12072019-0721.pdf>>

Sorj B and others, ‘Sobrevivendo nas redes - Guia do Cidadão’

<http://www.plataformademocratica.org/Arquivos/Sobrevivendo_nas_redes.pdf> accessed 25 August 2020

Souza R, 'O feminicídio político de Marielle Franco' (*El País*, 14 March 2019) <https://brasil.elpais.com/brasil/2019/03/14/politica/1552562116_307529.html> accessed 23 August 2020

Teixeira SH, 'Pensando a interseccionalidade a partir da vida e morte de Marielle Franco' (2019) 4 Dignidade Re-Vista 15

Trindade LVP, 'Disparagement Humour and Gendered Racism on Social Media in Brazil' [2019] *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 1 <<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/01419870.2019.1689278>> accessed 25 August 2020

Trindade LVP, 'Social Media in Brazil: Distilling Racism Against Black Women' (University of Southampton) <<https://data.southampton.ac.uk/event/0d8daf14092dd1fea62a5bd57969eae8.html>>

TSE, 'Eleições 2016: país elege 7.803 vereadoras e 638 prefeitas em primeiro turno' (*Tribunal Superior Eleitoral*, 2016) <<http://www.tse.jus.br/imprensa/noticias-tse/2016/Outubro/eleicoes-2016-pais-elege-7-803-vereadoras-e-638-prefeitas-em-primeiro-turno>> accessed 23 August 2020

UN Women, The Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights and Rapporteur on violence against women, 'Violence Against Women in Politics - Expert Group Meeting Report & Recommendations' (UN Women 2018) *Violence Against Women in Politics*

United Nations, 'Beijing Declaration and Platform of Action', *Declaration* (1995)

Viola K, "'Sem espaço do sonho, a vida vira pura miséria", diz jurista Silvio Almeida' (*UOL*, 11 June 2020) <<https://www.uol.com.br/eco/ultimas-noticias/2020/06/11/mortes-por-racismo-representam-fracasso-do-homem-branco-diz-jurista.htm>> accessed 19 July 2020

Wacquant L, *De l'Etat social à l'Etat pénal*, vol 1 (124th edn, Seuil 1998)

Wyllys J and Abujamra A, *O Que Será* (Objetiva 2019)

Cao CA, L7716 1989 [12.716] 369

The Declaration on Human Rights Defenders 1998 (General Assembly Resolution A/RES/53/144 adopting the Declaration on human rights defenders)

THE DEATH OF THE CITY COUNCILLOR MARIELLE FRANCO THROUGH THE LENSES OF
NECROPOLITICS