THE USE OF INDICATORS FOR PROMOTING AND MONITORING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF ECONOMIC SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS
Towards the construction of Human Rights Indicators in the area of economic, social and cultural rights
An analysis of the reporting system under Article 19 of the Protocol of San Salvador

Author:
ANA MARÍA MÉNDEZ JARAMILLO

Thesis supervisor:
Prof. GUSTAVO M. AROSEMENA SOLÓRZANO
ABSTRACT

The use of qualitative and quantitative indicators has become an increasingly used tool in the human rights community at the international, regional and national level. Nevertheless, the term “indicator” has been used indistinctly to refer to, for instance, the assessment of human development issues, the different data-generating mechanisms, as well as the existing instruments used to analyse realisation of human rights. In light of this, the construction of an adequate conceptual framework to identify specific indicators with a human rights-based approach has becomes a necessity, especially for measuring efforts of States when implementing its human rights obligations.

Acknowledging the existence of a gap between the formal adjudication of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and their uneven levels of enjoyment, this thesis suggests the construction of an appropriate concept of Human Rights Indicators, as a mechanism for strengthening their implementation. The analysis will be based on two measurement models: the model proposed by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights in 2012, to be applied in the universal system of human rights; and the one approved by the Organisation of American States in 2012, and afterwards in 2014, to be applied in the Inter-American system of human rights, with regards to the periodic reports on the progressive measures taken by States to ensure the rights contained in the Protocol of San Salvador.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................................................. 1

1. WHAT ARE HUMAN RIGHTS INDICATORS? ........................................................................... 6
   1.1. Defining Human Rights Indicators ...................................................................................... 6
   1.2. Measuring Human Rights? .................................................................................................. 8
      1.2.1. Events-based measures .................................................................................................. 9
      1.2.2. Standards-based measures ............................................................................................ 12
      1.2.3. Survey-based measures .................................................................................................. 16
      1.2.4. Socio-economic and administrative statistics ................................................................. 18
   1.3. Addressing the types of Human Rights Indicators proposed by the OHCHR... 20
      1.3.1. Structural indicators ..................................................................................................... 21
      1.3.2. Process indicators ......................................................................................................... 22
      1.3.3. Outcome indicators ..................................................................................................... 24

2. WHAT IS NEEDED FOR AN INDICATOR TO TRULY BE A HUMAN RIGHTS INDICATOR IN THE CONTEXT OF ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS? .......................................................................................................................... 26
   2.1. Theories regarding the use of Development Indicators to measure ESCRs ..... 28
      2.1.1. “Sameness” theory ........................................................................................................ 28
      2.1.2. “Proxy” theory ............................................................................................................ 30
      2.1.3. “Separateness” theory .................................................................................................... 31
      2.1.4. Separateness as the best theory -- Differences between Development Indicators and Human Rights Indicators in the context of ESCRs................................................................. 33
   2.2. Requirements for an indicator to be a Human Rights Indicator in the context of ESCRs .......................................................................................................................... 37
      2.2.1. Anchoring indicators – normative content of ESCRs .................................................... 39
         i. Identifying specific attributes of ESCRs ............................................................................ 40
         ii. Core content approach.................................................................................................... 42
iii. Concept of “progressive realisation” and “maximum of available resources” .................................................................................................................................................. 43

2.2.2. Types of Obligations in ESCRs ........................................................................................................................................................................... 45

2.2.3. Reference to cross-cutting human rights principles ......................................................................................................................................... 47

2.2.4. Should indicators for CPRs and ESCRs be based on the same methodology? .................................................................................................................. 49


3.1. A new version of Human Rights Indicators in the reporting procedure provided in Article 19 of the Protocol of San Salvador .................................................................................................................. 58

3.1.1. Including three conceptual categories in the selection of the structural, process and outcome of Human Rights Indicators .................................................................................................................. 60

i. Incorporation of the right .................................................................................................................................................................................................. 60

ii. States capabilities ...................................................................................................................................................................................................... 62

iii. Financial context and budgetary commitment ......................................................................................................................................................... 64

3.1.2. Reference to cross-cutting human rights principles .............................................................................................................................................. 65

i. Equality and non-discrimination ......................................................................................................................................................................................... 66

ii. Access to Justice ........................................................................................................................................................................................................... 68

iii. Access to Information and Participation ................................................................................................................................................................. 71

3.2. Should indicators for CPRs and ESCRs be based on the same methodology? ................................................................................................................. 72

3.3. Is there a duty for applying the system of indicators developed by the WG? .......................................................................................................................... 76

4. CONCLUSION ......................................................................................................................................................................................................... 83

5. BIBLIOGRAPHY ...................................................................................................................................................................................................... 86

6. ANNEXES ............................................................................................................................................................................................................... 93
The use of indicators for promoting and monitoring the implementation of economic social and cultural rights: towards the construction of Human Rights Indicators in the area of economic, social and cultural rights: an analysis of the reporting system under Article 19 of the Protocol of San Salvador

Méndez Jaramillo, Ana Maria