

University of Graz

European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation  
A.Y. 2013/2014

**EU SANCTIONS: A NEW HUMAN  
RIGHTS TOOL?**  
The Case of Belarus

**Author: Rocio Alamillos Sánchez**  
Supervisor: Univ.-Prof. Mag. Dr. Wolfgang Benedek

## **Abstract**

The thesis focuses on the use of EU sanctions to promote respect for human rights in third countries. Targeted or 'smart' sanctions have been widely used in recent years by the European Union in pursue of its foreign policy objectives. Their purpose it is not punitive but to bring about a behavioural or policy change. This work reveals to what extent sanctions have become a 'normative tool' to promote 'normative aims'. On the other hand sanctions may conflict with other fundamental principles of international law, namely the principle of non-intervention or with respect for fundamental right of the targets. This work claims that the EU sanctions can effectively contribute to decrease human rights violations in third states. However, the effectiveness of these measures depends on a higher level of consistency among member states at the decision-making and implementation level. Based on the research outlined above the case study on Belarus illustrates the function of sanctions in a wider strategy to promote and protect human rights, however, the existence of the above mentioned inconsistencies have led to failure of this policy.

## Table of contents

Abstract .....	2
Table of contents .....	3
Table of abbreviations.....	6
INTRODUCTION.....	7
A. Research questions and limitations .....	8
B. Structure of the thesis .....	9
C. Methodology and sources.....	10
CHAPTER I - SANCTIONS AND THE INTERPLAY BETWEEN EU HUMAN RIGHTS AND FOREIGN POLICIES .....	12
A. The notion of international sanctions .....	12
1. The definition of international sanctions .....	12
2. Evolution from comprehensive to targeted or ‘smart’ sanctions.....	13
2.1. Sanctions and human security: lessons learned from the past .....	14
2.2. The concept of targeted or ‘smart’ sanctions.....	16
3. Types of sanctions .....	17
3.1. Sanctions adopted under the Common Foreign and Security Policy (CFSP) framework.....	17
3.2. Sanctions adopted outside the Common Foreign and Security Policy (CFSP) framework.....	18
B. The EU's external human rights policy.....	19
1. Towards a more coherent and consistent human rights policy .....	20
2. Human rights mainstreaming in EU external relations .....	21
C. The choice for autonomous sanctions.....	22
1. Factors which have contributed to increase the use of autonomous sanctions .....	22
2. The carrots-and-sticks strategy.....	23
3. Autonomous sanctions vs. implementation of UN Security Council Resolutions .....	24
Conclusion.....	24
CHAPTER II - LEGALITY, LEGITIMACY AND CONSISTENCY OF THE EU SANCTIONS POLICY .....	26

A. Compliance with International Law .....	26
1. The principle of non-intervention and obligations <i>erga omnes</i> .....	27
2. Compliance with International Human Rights Law .....	29
2.1. The EU’s human rights obligations .....	29
2.2. The use of sanctions and respect of fundamental rights of the targets .....	30
2.3. Unintended targets: the adverse consequences of EU sanctions on the population .....	32
B. EU sanctions normative framework and judicial control .....	34
1. Legal bases for EU sanctions and the decision-making procedure .....	34
2. Restrictive measures guidelines .....	36
3. Legal safeguards for restrictive measures .....	38
3.1. Mechanisms of protection .....	38
3.2. Judicial review in EU sanctions policy.....	39
C. Legitimacy of the use of sanctions as response to human rights violations .....	43
1. Multilateral sanctions and cooperation.....	44
2. International consensus on the use of sanctions .....	45
3. The aim to protect human rights as a legitimizing factor .....	46
4. Internal legitimacy: the compatibility with the national interests of the member states	47
D. Consistency in the EU sanctions policy .....	48
Conclusion.....	50
CHAPTER III - BELARUS: INTRODUCTION TO THE CASE STUDY .....	52
A. An overview of Belarus.....	52
1. The post-Soviet context.....	52
2. Failed democratisation and poor human rights records.....	53
B. The relationship between the EU and Belarus.....	56
1. The first track: relations between the Brussels and Lukashenko’s regime.....	56
1.1. The period from independence to the first round of sanctions .....	56
1.2. The EU ‘policy of critical engagement’ within the European Neighbourhood Policy (ENP).....	57
1.3. The inclusion of Belarus in the European Eastern Partnership (EaP) .....	58
2. The second track: the support to civil society .....	59
C. The relations between Russia and Belarus .....	60
Conclusion.....	61

CHAPTER IV - EU SANCTIONS AGAINST HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS IN BELARUS.....	63
A. Restrictive measures within a wider strategy towards Belarus .....	63
1. Strategic objectives towards Belarus.....	63
2. The function of the restrictive measures .....	64
B. The reasons for the adoption of sanctions and the targets .....	65
1. Are sanctions imposed for valid reasons? .....	65
2. Do sanctions target the relevant parties? .....	68
C. Effectiveness of restrictive measures .....	69
1. The problem of assessing effectiveness .....	69
2. Impact on the targets .....	70
2.1. Visa ban.....	70
2.2. Financial sanctions .....	71
2.3. Embargo on arms embargo and ban on exports of equipment for internal repression.....	72
3. Safeguards and protection of fundamental rights of the targets .....	72
4. What results have been obtained? .....	73
D. Unintended targets: the impact on the Belarusian society.....	74
1. The link between sanctions and repression of civil and political rights .....	75
2. The impact on welfare: economic, social and cultural rights .....	78
3. The impact on the public opinion.....	79
E. Coherence and consistency .....	80
F. Evaluation .....	84
1. Current challenges towards the sanctions policy.....	84
2. Are there other alternatives?.....	86
Conclusion.....	87
 FINAL CONCLUSIONS .....	 89
 Bibliography.....	 91