THE DONOR ‘HUMAN RIGHTS’ SCHIZOPHRENIA
Aid cuts for human rights violations or the high costs of having good intentions

Author: Sunčica Brnardić
Supervisor: Dr. Phil. Univ. Prof. Walter Schicho
**ABSTRACT**

This thesis is devoted to challenging the idea that human rights violations should be a reason to cut foreign aid. While the issue is regarded as a matter of individual donor policy, if any, some provisional theoretical orientation for reconsidering and reframing such a practice is discussed here, along with a call for a more thorough and observant approach to human rights both in policy formulation and associated decision-making. The aforementioned stance is formed in relation to two factors: donors’ general attitude towards human rights in their foreign aid policies, and general objections that can be made to use of conditionality in aid. A closer focus on human rights conditionality reveals inconsistencies related to recipient’s ownership in development, donor’s assumption of a judicial role, and the difficulties associated with its implementation which lead to it lowered effectiveness. Finally, the mere hypothesis of feasibility of conditionality leveraging human rights improvements is put to a test, as it seems to be unable to address the complexity of situation at stake.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION
HUMAN RIGHTS AND AID: A (POSSIBLY) DIALECTIC RELATIONSHIP .......... 5

1. CHAPTER 1
BILATERAL AID: DEMOCRACY AND HUMAN RIGHTS .............................. 7
   1.1. Donor motives for giving aid ................................................................. 7
   1.2. The like-minded countries and the donor distinction .......................... 10
   1.3. Democracy and human rights at a discourse level: Study .................. 12
   1.4. Sharing is caring: Human rights in aid allocation .............................. 16
   1.5. The like-minded countries: Bridging the commitment and deliverance gap .... 19

2. CHAPTER 2
CONDITIONALITY ......................................................................................... 21
   2.1. Definitions ............................................................................................... 21
   2.2. Relevance ............................................................................................... 24
   2.3. Understanding conditionality .................................................................... 27
   2.4. Generations of conditionality: The big jump from economic to political ...... 29
       2.4.1. Economic Conditionality: “We will give you the money, but then you have to be careful with it, alright?” ................................................................. 30
       2.4.2. Political conditionality: “We will give you the money, but here’s what we want you to do” ....................................................................................... 32
   2.5. How to do conditionality anyway? ......................................................... 34

3. CHAPTER 3
HUMAN RIGHTS AND CONDITIONALITY ......................................................... 37
   3.1. Problematics ............................................................................................ 37
   3.2. The trouble with conditionality
       3.2.1. Development interventionism vs. ownership forgotten ....................... 41
3.2.2. The assumption of legality ................................................................. 43
3.3. The trouble with being conditional (in human rights) .............................. 45
  3.3.1. The disbursement imperative ............................................................ 47
  3.3.2. Cross-conditionality ........................................................................ 50
3.4. Factors significant to decisions to cut aid ................................................. 54
3.5. The (f)utility of aid conditionality to human rights .................................... 57

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS .................................................................... 61

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................................................................. 65

ANNEX .................................................................................................................. 69
The donor  human rights schizophrenia : aid cuts for human rights violations or the high costs of having good intentions

Brnardi, Sunica

https://doi.org/20.500.11825/379

Downloaded from Open Knowledge Repository, Global Campus' institutional repository