BREAKING FERTILE GROUND IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

A Trial for the Regulation of Womb and Child Trade in Surrogacy

Julia de Koenigswarter

Thesis supervised by Marjolein van den Brink
ABSTRACT

The thesis provides an overview of the challenges that arise in the European Union with an increasing number of incoming children born as a result of a commercial international surrogacy arrangement.

The principal objective of the analysis is to provide a human rights regulative approach to surrogacy which has mostly been apprehended to date under private law.

In the first part of the analysis, the filiation systems of a sample of EU member states and their adaptability to surrogacy cases are assessed. The thesis then proceeds to examine the existing legal protections available under international human rights instruments, such as the CEDAW, the CRC and the ECHR, for all the parties to surrogacy arrangements.

The inadequacy of family law on the national level or international private law to address issues raised by commercial surrogacy has impacts per se in terms of the human rights of the intended parents, the commissioned children and surrogates.

The results of this thesis plead for the design of a multilateral regulation of surrogacy that would take into account human rights and democratic values along with matters of private international law. In order to achieve this, more interdisciplinary endeavors in research, the legal arena and on the level of international bodies is necessary.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments 3  
Abstract 4  
Table of acronyms 5  
Table of contents 6  

## PART I: INTRODUCTION AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK 9

### 1. Introduction 9

1.1 Altruistic v. Commercial Surrogacy 13  
1.2 Traditional v. Gestational Surrogacy 17  
1.3 Parentage and Parenthood in Surrogacy: Cultural and Legal Issues 18  
1.4 Research Questions, Scope and Structure 21  
1.5 Methods and Materials 24  

### 2. International Surrogacy in the European Union: A Rainbow of Arrangements 26

2.1. National v. Transnational Surrogacy Arrangements 26  
2.1.1 Differentiation 26  
2.1.2 Challenges Set by International Surrogacy Arrangements (ISA) 27  
2.1.3 The Three Degrees of Positions Taken by Member States 29  
2.2 The Diversity of Private Law Responses to ISA 31  
2.2.1 Birth Registration 32  
2.2.2 Nationality 35  
2.2.3 Assisted Reproductive Technology 36  
2.2.4 Contractual Enforceability of Surrogacy 37  
2.2.5Incoming and Outgoing Surrogacy Arrangements Within the EU 38  
Conclusions 40  

### 3. The Adaptability of Surrogacy to Filiation Systems 41

3.1. The Three European Models of Establishment of Legal Parenthood in Surrogacy 41  
3.1.1 Ex Post Facto Filiation in Surrogacy 41  
3.1.2 Ex Ante Facto Filiation in Surrogacy 43  
3.1.3 De Facto Filiation in Surrogacy 44  
3.2. Strengths and Weaknesses of Permissive Surrogacy Legislations 44  
3.2.1 The Greek and South African Systems 45  
3.2.2 The UK and Dutch Systems 47  

Conclusions of Part I 50
## PART II : HUMAN RIGHTS AND SURROGACY

1. Examining the Rights of the Surrogate with a Women’s Human Rights Lens
   1.1 Substantive Equality
   1.1.1 Definition
   1.1.2 Challenges
   1.1.3 Equality in Surrogacy
   1.1.4 The Cliché of Exploitation
   1.1.5 The Risk of Exploitation
   1.1.6 The Exploitation of Surrogate Mothers
   1.2 Gender Stereotypes
   1.2.1 Commodification of Surrogates’ Bodies in Surrogacy
   1.2.2 Contractual Autonomy of the Surrogate
   1.3 Bioethics and Surrogacy
   Conclusions

2. Surrogacy and the Rights of the Child
   2.1 The Best Interest of the Child
   2.2 The Commodification of Children in Surrogacy
   2.2.1 Pricing the Child
   2.2.2 Child Protection and Surrogacy
   2.3 The Right to Nationality for Commissioned Children of ISAs
   2.4 Public Order v. Human Rights
   Conclusions

3. Surrogacy and the Right to Family Life: A Recognition of a Right to a Child?
   3.1 Absence of Parental Benefits for Intended Parents
   3.2 The Importance of Identity
   Conclusion

Conclusions of Part II

## PART III : A REGULATIVE APPROACH TO SURROGACY

1. Regulating Surrogacy Under Two Treaty Zones
2. Private International Law Projects
3. Recommendations
   3.1 Legislating on Surrogacy at the European Union Level
   3.2 Needed Features of a Regulative Approach: Netherlands, France and the UK
   3.3 Needed Features of a Regulative Approach to Surrogacy for the Surrogate
   3.4 Needed Features of a Regulative Approach to Surrogacy for the Child

Final Conclusions
Bibliography
Annexe
2014

Breaking fertile ground in the European Union: a trial for the regulation of womb and child trade in surrogacy

Koenigswarter, Julia de

https://doi.org/20.500.11825/389

Downloaded from Open Knowledge Repository, Global Campus’ institutional repository