The prominence of the body as an instrument of border control
Assessing the age of unaccompanied migrant children in the European Union

Author: Denise Venturi
Supervisor: Prof. Marie-Claire Foblets
Abstract

The premises of the research are rooted in the debate about human rights of migrants and securitisation of borders in the European Union. In this context the body is in the spotlight, since a key component in the reinforcement of external borders has been represented by the growing use of biometric data that is derived from the human body. The paper aims at investigating how and to what extent the human body is considered as an instrument of border control in the European Union.

After providing an overview on the relevant EU legislation, the paper explains which human rights implications are entailed by the use of biometrics in the management of migration and asylum. It then introduces the case study of age assessment for unaccompanied migrant children, illustrating in particular the human rights that can be at stake with regard to medical age examinations. Through the analysis of the selected case study it makes clear the crucial role that the human body plays in the strategies of border control. Eventually the paper argues that, through the deployment of such techniques, States are expressing their power on the body of migrants in order to exclude and not to include them.
Table of Contents

Introduction ........................................................................................................................................ 1

Chapter I – Seeking evidences in migration proceedings in the EU

1. The human body as a source of evidence in migration proceedings ................................. 5
2. An overview on EU Policy on Migration and Asylum ...................................................... 7
   2.1 EU’s approach to migration ............................................................................................ 8
   2.2 The legislative framework ............................................................................................. 9
   2.3 The Common European Asylum System (CEAS) ....................................................... 11
3. Where is the truth? The use of data in migration management ...................................... 16

Chapter II – The body as an instrument of border control

1. Foreword .................................................................................................................................. 18
2. Biometric data and its use in the fight against irregular migration .................................... 18
   2.1 What biometrics? ............................................................................................................. 19
   2.2 Biometrics and migration in the EU ............................................................................... 20
       2.2.1 When fundamental rights collide with security needs:
           the EURODAC system ............................................................................................... 22
   2.3 Biometrics and human rights implications .................................................................... 24
   3.1 The body as a ‘medium’ between competing interests .............................................. 29

Chapter III – Human body and border control: the case of age assessment of
unaccompanied migrant children in the EU

1. The age assessment of unaccompanied migrant children as a case study ..................... 33
   1.1 Why is age assessment relevant? ............................................................................... 34
Table of contents

2. Conceptual clarifications ........................................................................................................ 37
   2.1 Unaccompanied migrant children .............................................................................. 38
   2.2 Age assessment ......................................................................................................... 40
3. Sources for age assessment at International and European level .................................... 42
4. State of the play in the field of age assessment in the EU ............................................... 44
   4.1 Current practices in EU Member States ...................................................................... 45
      4.1.1 Belgium ............................................................................................................. 46
         4.1.1.1 ‘Triple Test’ ............................................................................................... 48
   4.2 The need for a common EU policy on age assessment ............................................... 50
5. The body of unaccompanied migrant children in the spotlight ....................................... 52

Chapter IV – Assessing the truth from the body: conclusions from the selected case study

1. A disputed assessment ...................................................................................................... 55
2. Belgium’s ‘Triple Test’: a critical analysis ...................................................................... 56
   2.1 Procedure ................................................................................................................ 58
   2.2 Accuracy of age assessment .................................................................................... 61
   2.3 Human Rights Implications .................................................................................... 63
3. Towards a human rights based approach to age assessment ....................................... 69
   3.1 Re-thinking the concept of age ............................................................................. 71
4. The body as an instrument of border control: drawing some conclusions from the
   selected case study ......................................................................................................... 72

Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 75
Bibliography ....................................................................................................................... 77
Annex .................................................................................................................................. 114
The prominence of the body as an instrument of border control: assessing the age of unaccompanied migrant children in the European Union

Venturi, Denise

https://doi.org/20.500.11825/468

Downloaded from Open Knowledge Repository, Global Campus' institutional repository