Can you believe? Reasonable religious accommodation in public educational institutions – a conceptual analysis and Dutch case study

YOUSRA BENFQUIH
E.MA THESIS
SUPERVISOR: PROF. DR. J. E. GOLDSCHMIDT
UNIVERSITY OF UTRECHT
‘What we seek,
We shall find,
What we flee from,
Flees from us.’

R. W. EMERSON
ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................. 9

Preface ...................................................................................................................... 10

I.  Introduction ........................................................................................................... 12

II.  Conceptualising duties of reasonable accommodation ........................................ 14

  1.  A conceptualisation of duties of reasonable accommodation in general, and religious accommodation in particular .......................................................... 14

  1.1.  Reasonable (religious) accommodation from the perspective of substantive equality .......................................................... 14

I.  The principle of equality or non-discrimination in a normative framework ......................... 14

  A.  Non-discrimination on an international and European level ......................... 14

  B.  The principle of non-discrimination in the Netherlands ......................... 17

     b1.  The Constitution ................................................................. 17

     b2.  The Equal Treatment Act ........................................ 17

II.  The principle of equality or non-discrimination in a legal-philosophical framework ................. 20

  A.  Shifting the balance ........................................................................... 20

   B.  The concept of material equality: what’s in a name? .......................... 20

   C.  The interrelatedness between reasonable accommodation and material equality .......................................................... 22

      C.1.  Reasonable accommodation and indirect discrimination ........................ 22

      C.2.  Religious accommodation ...................................................... 24

      C.3.  The relationship between reasonable accommodation and the classical forms of non-discrimination .................................................. 25

  1.2.  Reasonable religious accommodation from the perspective of freedom of religion .................................................. 26

  1.3.  The ‘reasonableness’ of reasonable accommodation .................................. 28

  1.4.  Accommodating whom? The individual versus the group dimension .......................................................... 30

II.  The development of reasonable accommodation duties: from religion to disability .................. 30

  2.  The development of reasonable accommodation duties: from religion to disability .......................................................... 30

     2.1.  Back to the religious roots: reasonable accommodation as developed in the US and Canada .......................... 31
2.2. REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION DETACHED FROM ITS RELIGIOUS ORIGINS 32

2.3. A CONCEPTUAL ANALYSIS OF THE DIFFERENCES .......................................................... 33
   I. RELIGIOUS BARRIERS TO PARTICIPATION ................................................................. 33
   II. ‘SAME, SAME, BUT DIFFERENT’ ............................................................................. 34
   III. ABSENCE OF EXPERT REFERENCE DOES NOT HINDER IMPLICIT
        DEDUCTION ........................................................................................................... 35

3. RELIGIOUS ACCOMMODATION FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION 36
   3.1. THE PRINCIPLE OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION .......................................................... 36
   3.2. THE CONCEPTUAL LIMITATION OF INCLUSIVE EDUCATION ................................. 37
   3.3. RELIGIOUS ACCOMMODATION AND EDUCATIONAL DESEGREGATION ............... 39

4. RELIGIOUS ACCOMMODATION IN THE PUBLIC SPACE: THE NEUTRALITY DEBATE
   (UN)RESOLVED? ........................................................................................................... 41
   4.1. THE DUAL EDUCATIONAL STRUCTURE IN THE NETHERLANDS ............................ 41
   4.2. RELIGIOUS ACCOMMODATION IN PRIVATE SCHOOLS ...................................... 43
   4.3. NEUTRALITY OF PUBLIC SCHOOLS AND RELIGIOUS ACCOMMODATION ....... 45
       I. THE CHURCH-STATE SEPARATION ...................................................................... 45
       II. THE PRINCIPLE OF NEUTRALITY ...................................................................... 46
           A. A MEANING OF STATE NEUTRALITY ......................................................... 46
           B. WHEN IDEALS BUMP INTO PRACTICE ...................................................... 47
           C. NEUTRALITY OF AIM VERSUS NEUTRALITY OF EFFECT ....................... 47
           D. INCLUSIVE VERSUS EXCLUSIVE NEUTRALITY .......................................... 48
           E. NEUTRALITY: ONE SIZE DOES NOT FIT ALL ........................................... 49
           F. DIFFERENT MODELS OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN STATE AND
              RELIGION ....................................................................................................... 49
               F.1. ‘LES EXTRÊMES SE TOUCHENT’ ............................................................. 50
               F.2. CLASSICAL SECULARISM ................................................................. 50
               F.3. THE ESTABLISHED OR PRIVILEGED CHURCH ...................................... 51
               F.4. THE PLURALISTIC COOPERATION ...................................................... 51
           G. THE NETHERLANDS MODEL: PLURALISTIC COOPERATION AND INCLUSIVE
              NEUTRALITY ..................................................................................................... 52
               G.1. THE CHURCH-STATE SEPARATION IN THE NETHERLANDS ............. 52
G.2. The Dutch tradition of pillarisation against the background of the School War .................................................. 53
G.3. And from the School War ruins grew pillars ................. 55
G.4. The Dutch model of inclusive neutrality .................... 57

H. Inclusive neutrality in Dutch public educational institutions 58

5. Lautsi and its importance for educational neutrality ........... 61
   5.1. Freedom of religion in the ECHR ........................................ 61
   5.2. The facts ............................................................................ 62
   5.3. The reasoning of the Grand Chamber ......................... 63
   5.4. The importance for educational neutrality .................. 65

I. Religion, public education and the ECHR ....................... 65

II. Personal criticism: an unjustified differentiation of symbols ... 66

III. Conclusion: Lautsi, a clear stance on educational neutrality? 67

III. Practical examples of religious accommodation .................. 69

1. Introduction ............................................................................ 69

2. The Netherlands Institute for Human Rights .................... 70
   2.1. General background and composition ............................... 70
   2.2. Complaints, procedures and expanded competence .......... 72
   2.3. The NIHR and discrimination on the ground of religion ....... 73

3. A sample of NIHR opinions concerning religious accommodation in public educational settings .................................... 75
   3.1. Prayer ................................................................................. 75
   3.2. Religious dress codes ......................................................... 79
      i. Unveiling the veil: what’s in an Islamic headscarf? ............ 79
      ii. The general position of the NIHR ................................. 81
      iii. The chador or niqaab ................................................... 83
      iv. The sports headscarf ..................................................... 87
   3.3. Religious holidays or days of rest ..................................... 88
   3.4. Dietary prescriptions ....................................................... 92

6. Conclusion ............................................................................. 94
ABSTRACT

Religious diversity: a phenomenon with which liberal immigrant societies are faced in different societal layers, including, and maybe predominantly in educational settings. Given the latter’s correlation with the personal development and identity of students in particular, and societal integration more general, how educational institutions accommodate religious diversity of students seems a question worthwhile of closer examination. To that end, the first part of the present dissertation consists of a conceptual-theoretical analysis of the notion of reasonable accommodation and its underpinning principles of material equality, the freedom of religion and inclusive education, thereby attempting to give an answer to the question: “accommodating diversity in general, and educational religious diversity in particular: what, why, when and who?” Given the dissertation’s focus on public educational institutions, possible tensions between religious accommodation and the principle of state neutrality will also be examined. As an indispensable corollary to the first part, the second part concretises the former through practical illustrations from Dutch soil, in turn attempting to give an answer to the question: “accommodating educational religious diversity: how?”. The present dissertation combines theory and practice, a sine qua non for an integral comprehension of the topical and heated debate on religious accommodation. Though the analysis is conducted mainly from a legal perspective, given the pervasive and inextricably connection between religious accommodation and fundamental societal questions, it is both unavoidable and inspiring that broader philosophical and sociological perspectives be included where needed.
Can you believe? Reasonable religious accommodation in public educational institutions: a conceptual analysis and Dutch case study

Benfquih, Yousra

https://doi.org/20.500.11825/488

Downloaded from Open Knowledge Repository, Global Campus’ institutional repository