



International Truth Commissions as a Vehicle of Transitional Justice: Do They Further the Right to the Truth?

A Case Study of the Kyrgyzstan Inquiry Commission

Katja Haslwanter

Supervisor: Prof. Lauri Mälksoo

2nd semester university: University of Tartu, Estonia

Academic year: 2012/2013

To Alois.

Abstract

This thesis examines the field of transitional justice, in particular one of its most prominent tools: truth commissions. Furthermore the notion of the right to the truth will be elucidated and it will be elaborated on the question to what extent these two concepts interrelate to each other. Thus the question will be stressed whether truth commissions, thanks to its mandate and work, act as a safeguard to the right to the truth. It will also be touched upon the question whether truth commission are efficient in terms of implementing their work, among others by means of formulating recommendations. It will be essential to point out that there are two ways of establishing a truth commission: truth commissions can come into being following international pressure, on one hand, or following a domestic need to establish a commonly accepted version of truth, on the other. It becomes clear that the latter are more likely to generate successful outcomes. A case study of a mainly internationally driven commission, namely the Kyrgyzstan Inquiry Commission (KIC), will be then conducted to picture the particular outcomes of truth commissions of that kind. As the outcomes of truth commissions are particularly diverse and difficult to grasp due to the individual character of every single country, it can be argued that the most likely element to be achieved by a truth commission is the establishment of a certain record of the past and thus a certain dimension of truth, which is of tremendous value for every single society that suffered from past human rights abuses; a value which they cannot be deprived of.

Keywords: Transitional Justice, Truth Commissions, The Right to the Truth, Kyrgyzstan Inquiry Commission. Measuring the Impact of Truth Commissions

Acknowledgements

Behind every thesis a lot more people are standing behind the author, without whom this particular undertaking wouldn't have been possible. Hence the intention of this acknowledgment is to pull these people from the back to the front and give them my deepest gratitude. Thus a special appreciation I give to my supervisor Prof. Lauri Mälksoo, for his great support, engagement and spirit throughout the research and writing process and for leaving me the essential space to create my own thoughts but at the same time guiding me through. Further on I would like to thank Alois Schläffer for his fundamental inspiration, without whom this thesis would not have been written. I also would like to thank James Baxenfield for proofreading my thesis and providing me with essential comments.

In addition all my interview partners deserve my deepest gratitude for taking their time and providing me with inevitable information.

Also I would like to give a special gratitude to all people who have accompanied me throughout the year and backed me up with emotional support. Hereby I want to thank my family and friends for standing constantly by my side and believing in me.

List of Abbreviations

AI	Amnesty International
AUCA	American University of Central Asia
CMI	Crisis Management Initiative
HRC	United Nations Human Rights Committee
IACHPR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
IACHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTJ	International Center for Transitional Justice
KIC	Kyrgyzstan Inquiry Commission
LSE	London School of Economics
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
UN	United Nations

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	5
1. Transitional Justice & the Right to the Truth: A Methodological and Theoretical Framework.....	6
1.1. The Concept of Transitional Justice.....	6
1.2. The Notion of the Right to the Truth.....	10
1.3. Truth Commission: A Safeguard to the Right to the Truth?.....	16
2. The Architecture of a Truth Commission.....	20
2.1. The Origin and Theoretical Purpose of Truth Commissions.....	20
2.2. Defining a Truth Commission.....	26
2.3. How a Truth Commission is Established.....	29
2.4. Activities of a Truth Commission.....	39
2.5. The Results a Truth Commission's Work.....	44
3. A case study of the Kyrgyzstan Inquiry Commission (KIC).....	46
3.1. How did the need for a truth commission in Kyrgyzstan arise?.....	46
3.2. Theoretical discourse on how to grasp the outcome of Truth Commissions.....	48
3.3. Implementation of a model on how to measure the impact of the KIC.....	49
Deductions and Conclusions.....	57
Bibliography.....	59