

University College Dublin

**Chronic Hunger and Accountability: A Study on
the Right to Adequate Food and Levels of Impunity**

Alexandra de Bournonville
MA in History
DESS in Communication and Development

Supervisor: Majda Bne Saad

A thesis presented to the European Inter-University Centre for Human Rights and Democratization, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratization

Academic Year 2010-2011

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First I would like to thank Majda Bne Saad, my supervisor, for her constructive advice and the time and attention paid to my work.

I also thank Graham Finlay, Ema Director for UCD, and Susan Murphy, the Ema students' coordinator, as well as UCD secretariat for their hospitality and enthusiastic support.

A special thanks to my friends, Kate Thomas, Michelle Reddy, Christina Norwig, Malik Rajan and my mother for proofreading my thesis 'at last-minutes'. Last but not least, I would like to thank Isabelle de Ghellinck and Hijas Syed for dropping me to the bus station at 4.30 a.m.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgment
Table of contents
List of abbreviations
Abstract

Chapter One – INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

1.1. Introduction	p.7
1.2. Background to the study: A global picture of hunger	p.7
1.3. State of hypothesis	p.9
1.4. Chapter outline	p.10
1.5. Justification of the case study	p.11
1.6. Methodology	p.11
1.7. Use of terminology	p.12
1.8. Limitations	p.13

Chapter Two – THE CONCEPT OF HUNGER

2.1. Hunger and food insecurity	p.15
2.2.1. Definitions	p.15
2.2.2. Food insecurity and poverty	p.16
2.2. Dimensions of hunger	p.20-
2.2.1. Food and malnutrition	p.20
2.2.2. The cost of hunger	p.21
2.2.3. Famine and chronic hunger	p.22
2.3. Theoretical background	p.23
2.3.1. The famine paradigm shift	p.23
2.3.2. Human based-approach to hunger	p.26
2.4. Concluding Comment	p.27

Chapter Three – THE HUMAN RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD

3.1. Human rights mechanisms	p.28
3.2. The normative content and the key concepts of the right to adequate food	p.32
3.4. Obligation related to the realization of the right to food	p.34
3.4.1. Generic obligations	p.34
3.4.2. State obligations framework	p.36
3.4.3. The non-state obligations	p.37
3.5. National implementation	p.38
3.6. Concluding Comment	p.40

Chapter Four – THE CONCEPT OF IMPUNITY

4.1. Defining impunity	p.42
4.2. Impunity of violations of ESCR	p.43
4.2.1. Characteristics of violations of ESCR	p.43
4.2.2. Violations of the right to food	p.44
4.3. Weak governance, corruption and impunity	p.46
4.4. Concluding Comment	p.48

Chapter Five – ANALYSIS

5.1. Political failure to respond and to prevent chronic hunger	p.50
5.1.1. Justiciability of the right to food	p.50
5.1.2. Lack or defect of democracy?	p.53
5.2. Failure of accountability	p.57
5.2.1. International human rights law and the current world relations	p.57
5.2.2. The global actors: Exercising power without responsibilities	p.58
5.2.3. Accountability gap and lack of deterrence	p.62
5.3. Failure of responsibility	p.64
5.3.1. Extraterritorial obligations of States and responsibility of the global community	p.65
5.3.2. Failure of the global community	p.66
5.4. Concluding comment	p.68

Chapter Six – CASE STUDY: BIOFUEL LAND GRABBING IN MOZAMBIQUE

6.1. The issue of land grabbing in Africa	p.71
6.2. Land grabbing in Mozambique	p.73
6.2.1. General background	p.73
6.2.2. Policy and legal framework	p.74
6.2.3. The impact of European land grabbing on the right to food	p.78
6.2.4. Land grabbing and violations of the right to food	p.81
6.3. Concluding comment	p.84

Chapter Seven – CONCLUSIONS

Chapter Eight – BIBLIOGRAPHY

8.1. Books and articles	p.88
8.2. Internet	p.91
8.4. Lectures	p.93
8.4. Legal documents	p.95

Tables

Table 2.1. Food insecurity vulnerable groups	p.17
Table 2.2. Typology of food and nutritional vulnerability	p.18
Table 2.3. Evolution of famine thinking	p.24
Table 3.1. Relevant human rights instruments for the right to food	p.28
Table 6.1. Mozambican biofuel export market	p.79
Table 6.2. Biofuel investments	p.81

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CPR	Civil and Political Rights
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ESCR	Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
EU	European Union
DAC	Development Aid Committee (OECD)
GA	United Nations General Assembly
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HRC	Human Rights Council
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
GA	General Assembly
GC 3	General Comment 3
GC12	General Comment 12
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
IFI	International Financial Institutions
IMF	International Monetary Fund
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organisation
FIAN	FoodFirst International Action and Network
HRC	UN Human Rights Commission
MDG	Millenium Development Goals
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisations
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OP-ICESCR	Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
TNC	Transnational Institutions
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
WFP	World Food Program
WFS	World Food Summit
WTO	World Trade Organisation

ABSTRACT

Chronic hunger is the result of man-made action or inaction and unequal power relations from local to international scales, restricting the access to food to the powerless who go hungry. This reality has been exacerbated through globalisation process which has undermines States sovereignty and threatened the realization of the right to food. Because it is not visible and affects the most vulnerable groups, chronic hunger does not represent political and economic issue for policymakers, the public and the international community.

The purpose of this study is to examine the relationship between chronic hunger and impunity, to discuss the implications of the liability of national and international actors in the occurrence of hunger and to determine the factors contributing to the occurrence of chronic hunger. Taking the starting point of famine paradigm shift, this study argues that chronic hunger persists because the political will to eliminate it is lacking and that its occurrence is a consequence of impunity. The lack of political will is determined by the loophole of State extraterritorial obligations and the lack of responsibility of global actors, which bring about a lack of accountability for violations of the right to food.