Women in European Asylum Law A legal and policy analysis

Master Thesis

Stephanie Dufner 2008/2009

Supervisor: Prof. Nuno Piçarra

Law Faculty of the New University Lisbon

To my parents, with love and gratitude

Abstract

Around one third of all asylum applications in Europe are made by women. Gender affects the whole process of asylum, from the question of why someone is leaving her or his home to the treatment in the host country. To deal with both female and male asylum seekers in a non-discriminatory and equal manner, gender-neutral provisions are essential. As the EU is the main legislator in the field of asylum law in the Member States, this thesis aims to analyse to what extent the heavily criticised legislative measures of the first phase of the Common European Asylum System show awareness of the gender dimension of the asylum process. I describe briefly the connection between human rights and gendered refugee law and the development of the European asylum system, continue to analyse the choice of words in the provisions and finish with an in-depth legal and policy analysis of the Reception Conditions Directive, the Dublin II Regulation, the Qualification Directive, the Procedures Directive and the respective proposals. The examination shows that only few gender-sensitive provisions are included in the measures, which is reflected in the lack of constant use of gender-neutral language. Female asylum seekers therefore do not find equal and sufficient protection in European countries.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
A. TERMINOLOGY	4
B. FRAME WORKING	7
I. Human rights and gendered refugee law	7
II. Development of European asylum law and its connection to int. refugee law	8
C. LANGUAGE	11
D. ANALYSIS OF THE LEGAL INSTRUMENTS	13
I. The Reception Conditions Directive	13
1. Introduction	13
2. Legislative history	13
3. Legal and policy analysis	14
a. General	14
b. Art. 7: Residence, freedom of movement and confinement	15
c. Art. 11 Employment	16
d. Art. 13: General rules on material reception conditions and health care	16
e. Art. 14: Modalities for material reception conditions	17
f. Art. 15: health care	19
g. Art. 17 and 20: Provisions for persons with special needs	19
h. Art. 24: Staff and resources	19
3. Conclusion	20
II. The Dublin II Regulation	21
1. Introduction	21
2. Legislative history	22
3. Legal and policy analysis	22
a. General	22
b. Chapter II and III	23
c. Chapter IV: Humanitarian Clause	24
d. Detention	24
4. Conclusion	25
III. The Qualification Directive	26
1. Introduction	26
2. Legislative history	26

3. Legal and policy analysis	28
a. General	28
aa. Concept of persecution and serious harm	29
bb. Examples for gender-based persecution	30
(1) Gender-specific persecution	30
(2) Gender-related persecution	31
b. Art. 4: Assessment of facts and circumstances	31
c. Art. 6: Actors of persecution or serious harm	32
d. Art. 7: Actors of protection	32
aa. Art. 7(1)	32
(1) state of origin protection	32
(2) non-state agents as actors of protection	33
bb. Art. 7(2)	34
(1) 'reasonable steps'	34
(2) 'has access'	35
e. Art. 8: Internal protection	36
f. Art. 9: Acts of persecution	36
aa. Art. 9(1)	36
bb. Art. 9(2)	37
(1) Art. 9(2)(a): Acts of violence	37
(2) Art. 9(2)(f): Acts of gender-specific nature	39
g. Art. 10: The five reasons for persecution	39
aa. The causal link	40
bb. Reasons for persecution	41
(1) "Gender" or "Sex" as separate persecution reason?	41
(2) Race	42
(3) Religion	42
(4) Nationality	43
(5) Particular Social Group	44
(aa) Definition of a PSG	44
(bb) Women as PSG	46
(6) Political opinion	47
h. Art. 15: Subsidiary protection	49
i. Art. 20: Content of international protection	51

j. Art. 24: Residence permit	51
k. Art. 36: Staff	52
4. Conclusion	52
IV. The Procedures Directive	53
1. Introduction	53
2. Legislative history	54
3. Legal and policy analysis	55
a. General	55
b. Art. 6: Access to the procedure	56
c. Art. 8: Examination of applications	57
d. Art. 10: Guarantees for applicants for asylum	59
e. Art. 11: Obligation of the applicants for asylum	59
f. Art. 13: Personal interview	59
g. Art. 23(3) and (4): Accelerated procedures	61
h. Art. 27 and Art. 29: Safe third country and safe countries of origin concepts	61
i. Art. 28: Unfounded and manifestly unfounded applications	63
j. Art. 32: Subsequent application	63
4. Conclusion	63
E. CONCLUSION	65
BIBLIOGRAPHY	I