



**Democracy in law or democracy in fact?: The importance of effective criminal procedural rights for the development of democracy in Russia**

European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation

Student: Iris Nakov

Supervisor: Prof. Lauri Mälksoo

Tartu University, Estonia

A. Y. 2012/2013



## **Abstract**

This thesis examines the impact of the European Convention on Human Rights in the Russian Federation. Since the Convention was ratified fifteen years ago, it is interesting to look at the changes it has brought in the Russian legal system. The thesis focuses on the implementation of Criminal Procedural rights in the Russian legal system. The author will argue that although changes are slow to come, the European Convention on Human Rights has already greatly influenced the Russian legal system. Unfortunately, the current discrepancy between the theory of the law that was developed in the European Court on Human Rights, which has reached the Russian Constitutional Court, and the practical and effective protection of criminal procedural rights prevents individuals from being adequately protected daily. This thesis will therefore attempt to point out various elements in the Russian legal system detrimental to the protection of Criminal Procedural rights.

## **Acknowledgements**

The author is most grateful to Professor Lauri Mälksoo for his guidance, advice, feedback, and patience. The author would like to thank all the staff of the Faculty of Law of the University of Tartu who provided her with a supportive and agreeable environment to conduct her research and study.

This thesis would not have been possible without having conducted a field research in Russia. The author would like to thank Professor Mälksoo, Dr. Burkov and Professor Simons for their assistance in organising it and the E.MA programme for supporting it financially.

The author would like to express her deepest appreciation to Russian lawyers, advocates, researchers, and managers of non-governmental organisations who were willing to respond to questions of the author, to provide her with guidance in the Russian legal system and also to make available for her some of the essential documents for this thesis.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract.....	p. 3
Acknowledgments .....	p. 4
Introduction .....	p. 6
Chapter 1. Historical Overview of Russia and the ECHR.....	p. 12
Section 1. Questions and Method.....	p. 12
Section 2. Remarks on Russian History.....	p. 14
Section 3. The "raison d'être" of the ECHR & its ratification by the Russian Federation.....	p. 20
Chapter 3. Russia & Sovereignty.....	p. 25
Section 1. From the Westphalian order to 'Sovereign Democracy'.....	p. 25
Section 2. The Place of the ECHR.....	p. 31
Chapter 3. The Russian Constitutional Court & the ECtHR.....	p. 38
Section 1. The causes of a difficult relation.....	p. 39
Section 2. The RCC's 'interpretation' of the Court's jurisprudence.....	p. 45
Chapter 4. The Practical consequences on criminal procedure.....	p. 52
Section 1. The discrepancies between principles and practice.....	p. 52
Section 2. Unfair trials in practice.....	p. 57
Chapter 5. Rule of Law & Russia.....	p. 61
Section 1. The Detrimental distinction between Law & Justice.....	p. 62
Section 2. Cultural Identity & Law.....	p. 66
Conclusion .....	p. 70
Bibliography .....	p. 72