# Separatism between vs. integration within? A policy-oriented recipe for language-related education in multilingual states 

Diana Pàmias

Supervised by: Prof. Helder De Schutter
E.MA 2012-2013

KU Leuven


#### Abstract

In multilingual states, language minorities generally require protection. The existing human rights instruments that target the issue are not effective. In this context, the author argues that implementing the right language education policy is pivotal in order to protect language minority rights and to minimise the effects of a given conflict. This thesis is aimed at analysing the nature and implementation of two different educational approaches to language - those applied in Flanders and in Catalonia. In particular, the author discusses whether - under the two linguistic models in question - the language rights of the individuals are protected. Importantly, the thesis assesses whether each of these two models are appropriate given the language capability background of the society they address and what is the impact that they have had on these societies. Although the main analysis revolves around Flanders and Catalonia, this thesis puts forward general recommendations that are applicable to a wide range of multilingual countries and scenarios.


## Acknowledgements

Yes, it is a cliché, but true: I could not have done this alone.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor, Prof. Helder De Schutter, for his tremendous help, outstanding comments, and enlightening conversations. Thanks for encouraging me to close the circle.

Second, a special thanks goes to Prof. Lemmens, Michaël Merrigan, and the KU Leuven team, who have hosted me incredibly well during the second semester of this Master's in Leuven, where I have prepared this thesis from beginning to end.

Third, I would like to take this opportunity to thank the E.MA community, directed by Prof. Angela Melchiorre, for this amazing year and experience. Unforgettable.

Fourth, I want to thank all my family and friends.
A special mention goes to Joan de Solà-Morales. Thanks for the journey.

I dedicate this thesis to my mother.

## List of abbreviations

| CoE | Council of Europe |
| :--- | :--- |
| EC | European Commission |
| ECtHR | European Court of Human Rights |
| EU | European Union |
| FCNM | Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities |
| HCNM | High Commissioner on National Minorities |
| ICCPR | International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights |
| ICERD | International Covenant on the Elimination of all forms of racial <br> discrimination |
| OHCHR | Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights |
| OSCE | Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe |
| TEU | Treaty on European Union |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Programme |
| UNESCO | United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization |

## Table of contents

Introduction and methodology ..... 1

1. Normative and legal framework: linguistic minority rights ..... 5
1.1. Framing minority rights ..... 5
1.1.1. Problems in defining minority ..... 6
1.1.2. The relationship between minority rights and human rights ..... 9
1.1.2.A. The collectivism vs. individualism debate ..... 10
1.1.2.B. Minority rights protection under international human rights law ..... 11
1.1.3. Minorities and politics ..... 14
1.1.3.A. Minorities and nationalism ..... 15
1.1.3.B. Minorities and homogenisation ..... 16
1.1.3.C. Minorities and democracy ..... 18
1.2. Linguistic rights and the role of education ..... 19
1.2.1. The concept of language rights ..... 20
1.2.2. Language and education ..... 24
1.2.3. Models of justice for linguistic rights ..... 25
2. The language policy in Flanders and Catalonia: past and present . ..... 29
2.1. Flanders ..... 29
2.1.1. Introduction and description ..... 29
2.1.2. Past: language conflict and policy before and after the independence of Belgium (XIX century) ..... 32
2.1.3. Recent past: language conflict and policy during the path towards Federalism (XX century) ..... 37
2.1.4. Present: language policy and education within the current panorama. ..... 40
2.2. Catalonia ..... 42
2.2.1. Introduction and description ..... 43
2.2.2. Past: language conflict and policy from the origins of Catalonia until the Spanish Civil War (from the IX century to 1939) ..... 46
2.2.3. Recent past: language conflict and policy during Franco's dictatorship and in the transition to democracy (1939-1980) ..... 50
2.2.4. Present: language policy and education within the current panorama. ..... 52
3. Comparing two distinct linguistic models: Flanders and Catalonia 57
3.1. Introductory elements and clarifications: setting the scene ..... 57
3.1.1. Minorised languages in the past ..... 57
3.1.2. Minority? Who is the minority? ..... 59
3.1.3. International and regional legal instruments ..... 61
3.2. The linguistic models in place ..... 63
3.2.1. Definition of the models ..... 64
3.2.2. Effects of the models ..... 65
3.2.2.1. Public sphere access ..... 66
3.2.2.1.A. Flanders ..... 66
3.2.2.1.B. Catalonia ..... 67
3.2.2.2. Private sphere and social mobility ..... 68
3.2.2.2.A. Flanders ..... 69
3.2.2.2.B. Catalonia ..... 70
3.2.2.3. Newcomers ..... 71
4. Conclusions and policy recommendations ..... 73
Bibliography ..... 79
