Separatism between vs. integration within? A policy-oriented recipe for language-related education in multilingual states

Diana Pàmias

Supervised by: Prof. Helder De Schutter

E.MA 2012-2013

KU Leuven



Abstract

In multilingual states, language minorities generally require protection. The existing human rights instruments that target the issue are not effective. In this context, the author argues that implementing the right language education policy is pivotal in order to protect language minority rights and to minimise the effects of a given conflict. This thesis is aimed at analysing the nature and implementation of two different educational approaches to language – those applied in Flanders and in Catalonia. In particular, the author discusses whether – under the two linguistic models in question – the language rights of the individuals are protected. Importantly, the thesis assesses whether each of these two models are appropriate given the language capability background of the society they address and what is the impact that they have had on these societies. Although the main analysis revolves around Flanders and Catalonia, this thesis puts forward general recommendations that are applicable to a wide range of multilingual countries and scenarios.

Acknowledgements

Yes, it is a cliché, but true: I could not have done this alone.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor, Prof. Helder De Schutter, for his tremendous help, outstanding comments, and enlightening conversations. Thanks for encouraging me to close the circle.

Second, a special thanks goes to Prof. Lemmens, Michaël Merrigan, and the KU Leuven team, who have hosted me incredibly well during the second semester of this Master's in Leuven, where I have prepared this thesis from beginning to end.

Third, I would like to take this opportunity to thank the E.MA community, directed by Prof. Angela Melchiorre, for this amazing year and experience. Unforgettable.

Fourth, I want to thank all my family and friends.

A special mention goes to Joan de Solà-Morales. Thanks for the journey.

I dedicate this thesis to my mother.

List of abbreviations

CoE Council of Europe

EC European Commission

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

EU European Union

FCNM Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities

HCNM High Commissioner on National Minorities

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ICERD International Covenant on the Elimination of all forms of racial

discrimination

OHCHR Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights

OSCE Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe

TEU Treaty on European Union

UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

Table of contents

Introduction and methodology	1
1. Normative and legal framework: linguistic minority rights	5
1.1. Framing minority rights	5
1.1.1. Problems in defining minority	6
1.1.2. The relationship between minority rights and human rights	9
1.1.2.A. The collectivism vs. individualism debate	10
1.1.2.B. Minority rights protection under international human rights	
1.1.3. Minorities and politics	
1.1.3.A. Minorities and nationalism	15
1.1.3.B. Minorities and homogenisation	.16
1.1.3.C. Minorities and democracy	.18
1.2. Linguistic rights and the role of education	19
1.2.1. The concept of language rights	20
1.2.2. Language and education	.24
1.2.3. Models of justice for linguistic rights	25
2. The language policy in Flanders and Catalonia: past and present	29
2.1. Flanders	29
2.1.1. Introduction and description	29
2.1.2. Past: language conflict and policy before and after the independence	of
Belgium (XIX century)	.32
2.1.3. Recent past: language conflict and policy during the path toware Federalism (XX century)	
2.1.4. Present: language policy and education within the current panorama	40

2.2. Catalonia	42
2.2.1. Introduction and description	43
2.2.2. Past: language conflict and policy from the origins of Catalonia	
Spanish Civil War (from the IX century to 1939)	46
2.2.3. Recent past: language conflict and policy during Franco's dictator	ship and
in the transition to democracy (1939-1980)	50
2.2.4. Present: language policy and education within the current panoran	1a52
3. Comparing two distinct linguistic models: Flanders and Catal	onia 57
3.1. Introductory elements and clarifications: setting the scene	57
3.1.1. Minorised languages in the past	57
3.1.2. Minority? Who is the minority?	59
3.1.3. International and regional legal instruments	61
3.2. The linguistic models in place	63
3.2.1. Definition of the models	64
3.2.2. Effects of the models	65
3.2.2.1. Public sphere access	66
3.2.2.1.A. Flanders	66
3.2.2.1.B. Catalonia	67
3.2.2.2. Private sphere and social mobility	68
3.2.2.2.A. Flanders	69
3.2.2.2.B. Catalonia	70
3.2.2.3. Newcomers	71
4. Conclusions and policy recommendations	73
Bibliography	79