

Utrecht University

European Master's Degree in Human Rights and Democratisation

2013/2014

# BREAKING FERTILE GROUND IN THE EUROPEAN UNION

A Trial for the Regulation of Womb and Child Trade in Surrogacy

**Julia de Koenigswarter**

**Thesis supervised by Marjolein van den Brink**

## ABSTRACT

The thesis provides an overview of the challenges that arise in the European Union with an increasing number of incoming children born as a result of a commercial international surrogacy arrangement.

The principal objective of the analysis is to provide a human rights regulative approach to surrogacy which has mostly been apprehended to date under private law.

In the first part of the analysis, the filiation systems of a sample of EU member states and their adaptability to surrogacy cases are assessed. The thesis then proceeds to examine the existing legal protections available under international human rights instruments, such as the CEDAW, the CRC and the ECHR, for all the parties to surrogacy arrangements.

The inadequacy of family law on the national level or international private law to address issues raised by commercial surrogacy has impacts *per se* in terms of the human rights of the intended parents, the commissioned children and surrogates.

The results of this thesis plead for the design of a multilateral regulation of surrogacy that would take into account human rights and democratic values along with matters of private international law. In order to achieve this, more interdisciplinary endeavors in research, the legal arena and on the level of international bodies is necessary.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	3
Abstract	4
Table of acronyms	5
Table of contents	6
PART I : INTRODUCTION AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK	9
1. Introduction	9
1.1 Altruistic v. Commercial Surrogacy	13
1.2 Traditional v. Gestational Surrogacy	17
1.3 Parentage and Parenthood in Surrogacy: Cultural and Legal Issues	18
1.4 Research Questions, Scope and Structure	21
1.5 Methods and Materials	24
2. International Surrogacy in the European Union: A Rainbow of Arrangements	26
2.1. National v. Transnational Surrogacy Arrangements	26
2.1.1 Differentiation	26
2.1.2 Challenges Set by International Surrogacy Arrangements (ISA)	27
2.1.3 The Three Degrees of Positions Taken by Member States	29
2.2 The Diversity of Private Law Responses to ISA	31
2.2.1 Birth Registration	32
2.2.2 Nationality	35
2.2.3 Assisted Reproductive Technology	36
2.2.4 Contractual Enforceability of Surrogacy	37
2.2.5. Incoming and Outgoing Surrogacy Arrangements Within the EU	38
Conclusions	40
3. The Adaptability of Surrogacy to Filiation Systems	41
3.1. The Three European Models of Establishment of Legal Parenthood in Surrogacy	41
3.1.1 Ex Post Facto Filiation in Surrogacy	41
3.1.2 Ex Ante Facto Filiation in Surrogacy	43
3.1.3 De Facto Filiation in Surrogacy	44
3.2. Strengths and Weaknesses of Permissive Surrogacy Legislations	44
3.2.1 The Greek and South African Systems	45
3.2.2 The UK and Dutch Systems	47
Conclusions of Part I	50

PART II : HUMAN RIGHTS AND SURROGACY	53
1. Examining the Rights of the Surrogate with a Women’s Human Rights Lens	54
1.1 Substantive Equality	55
1.1.1 Definition	55
1.1.2 Challenges	55
1.1.3 Equality in Surrogacy	56
1.1.4 The Cliché of Exploitation	56
1.1.5 The Risk of Exploitation	59
1.1.6 The Exploitation of Surrogate Mothers	60
1.2. Gender Stereotypes	63
1.2.1. Commodification of Surrogates' Bodies in Surrogacy	63
1.2.2 Contractual Autonomy of the Surrogate	64
1.2.3 Criminal Law and Reproduction	65
1.3. Bioethics and Surrogacy	67
Conclusions	70
2. Surrogacy and the Rights of the Child	71
2.1 The Best Interest of the Child	73
2.2 The Commodification of Children in Surrogacy	76
2.2.1 Pricing the Child	76
2.2.2 Child Protection and Surrogacy	89
2.3 The Right to Nationality for Commissioned Children of ISAs	78
2.4 Public Order v. Human Rights	79
Conclusions	82
3. Surrogacy and the Right to Family Life : A Recognition of a Right to a Child ?	83
3.1. Absence of Parental Benefits for Intended Parents	83
3.2. The Importance of Identity	86
Conclusion	87
Conclusions of Part II	88
PART III : A REGULATIVE APPROACH TO SURROGACY	92
1. Regulating Surrogacy Under Two Treaty Zones	92
2. Private International Law Projects	94
3. Recommendations	96
3.1 Legislating on Surrogacy at the European Union Level	97
3.2 Needed Features of a Regulative Approach: Netherlands, France and the UK	97
3.3 Needed Features of a Regulative Approach to Surrogacy for the Surrogate	99
3.4 Needed Features of a Regulative Approach to Surrogacy for the Child	100
Final Conclusions	101
Bibliography	104
Annexe	117