

**European Masters Degree in Human Rights and Democratization**

**Boltzmann Institute for Human Rights, Vienna**

---

**Access to Rights for Victims of Human  
Trafficking:  
Constructing Rhetoric or Constructing Reality?**

**Student**

**Kevin Baudouin Rory Kelly**

**Supervisor**

**Julia Planitzer**

---

Academic Year 2008-2009



**STOPPT MENSCHENHANDEL**

---

## **Abstract**

Access to rights for victims of human trafficking exists in international law, and states are legally bound to grant these rights, but the real question this thesis will attempt to answer will be what these rights are, whether these rights exist, implemented in domestic law and are they tangibly accessible for victims of trafficking. Moreover, are they victim specific, accommodating for the special needs states have pledged to provide.

These obligations to provide these rights exist under international and regional human rights standards, but are they honoured and if not, why not?

Do they grant the rights that are needed to fulfil and protect the rights of victims? Is the state actively creating rights for the purpose of victims of trafficking or does it end up being part of the problem more than the solution and why is access so difficult to achieve for the victims?

These fundamental questions will be investigated in this thesis, studying the relationship of the victim and the state throughout with these international human rights obligations always in mind.

This will attempt to provide the answer to whether ultimately the access to rights for victims of trafficking provided through international law are constructing its reality, or simply constructing its rhetoric.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>General Introduction</b>		<b>6</b>	
<b>Chapter 1</b>	<b>Defining Trafficking and Relevance in International and Regional Instruments</b>	<b>8</b>	
1.1	Introduction	8	
1.2	Defining Trafficking		8
1.3	Distinction between Trafficking and Smuggling	11	
1.3.1	Gaps in the Protocol	13	
1.4	Regional Significant Instrument	15	
1.5	Relevance in International Labour Law: Trafficking as a Labour Issue		16
1.6	Relevance in International Migration Law	18	
1.7	Relevance of Trafficking in other International Instruments	19	
1.8	Peremptory Norms in Human Trafficking	20	
1.9	Individual Complaints Procedures in International Law	21	
1.9.1	Individual Complaints Procedure in the ECHR	22	
1.10	The Positive Obligation of the State to Protect	23	
1.10.1	Case of Siliadin vs. France	24	
1.11	Conclusion	25	
<b>Chapter 2</b>	<b>Access to Rights in the Migration and Labour Context</b>		<b>27</b>
2.1	Introduction	27	
2.2	Immigration Issues for Victims of Trafficking	28	
2.3	The ‘Migration Trap’	29	
2.4	Rights through Asylum Law? The Significance of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) and the Policy of Non-Refoulement for Victims of Trafficking		31
2.4.1	Statelessness	32	
2.4.2	Case of Islam Appellant vs. Secretary of State	34	
2.5	Relevance in the UK	35	
2.6	The Issue of State Security	36	

2.7	Deportation in the UK for the ‘Public Interest’	37
2.8	The Identity Cards Act 2006	38
2.8.1	Case of R vs O	39
2.9	The Gangmasters Act 2004	40
2.9.1	Case of Gangmaster Victor Solomka	41
2.10	Importance of NGOs in Accessing Rights	44
2.11	Conclusion	45
<b>Chapter 3</b>	<b>Access to Justice: Assistance and Legal Redress</b>	<b>48</b>
3.1	Introduction	48
3.2	The Granting of Assistance Rights	49
3.2.1	Reflection Period	49
3.2.2	Residence Permit	51
3.2.3	Physical Protection of Victims	54
3.3	The Italian Social Protection Model	55
3.4	International Recognition of Rights for Victims of Crime	56
3.5	Legal Redress: The Right to Compensation	58
3.5.1	Compensation Through Restitution	59
3.5.2	Compensation by the State	60
3.6	Criminal Proceedings	62
3.7	Civil Proceedings	62
3.8	Labour Tribunals	63
3.9	Conclusion	64
<b>Final Conclusions</b>		<b>67</b>
<b>Bibliography</b>		<b>72</b>