

**European Inter-University Centre for Human Rights and
Democratisation**

European Master's Programme in Human Rights and Democratisation

Adam Mickiewicz University

2009-2010

MASTER THESIS

*The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural
Rights under the context of the Economic Crisis.*

Author: Sofia CRUZ

Supervisor: Prof. Dr. Zdzisław KĘDZIA,

E.MA Director

Thanks to:

*Professor Zdzisław Kędzia for his
constant availability and interest in my work*

My family for all the unconditional support.

Abstract

The purpose of this thesis is to assess the challenges and role of the International Covenant on Economic and Social Rights under the context of the present economic crisis.

This analysis entails a brief explanation of the root causes of the economic crisis and its impact on economic, social and cultural rights. Secondly, it is central to understand the nature of economic, social and cultural rights under the Covenant especially in what concerns the concepts of progressive realization, maximum of available resources, margin of discretion, international cooperation and justiciability, to assess if the Covenant is capable to meet the reality of an economic crisis or if there should be some changes adopted for times of economic distress.

At last, in the context of the need for a human rights approach to the economic crisis, the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural rights is briefly discussed in what concerns its role under the strategies to overcome the crisis.

List of Acronyms

Civil and political rights	CPR
Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	CESCR
Economic, Social and Cultural rights	ESCR
European Court of Human Rights	ECHR
Food and Agriculture Organization	FAO
Human Rights Committee	HRC
Inter-American Court of Human Rights	IACHR
International Covenant for Civil and Political Rights	ICCPR
International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights	ICESCR
International Labour Organization	ILO
International Law Commission	ILA
Least Developed Countries	LDC
Millennium Development Goals	MDG
UN System Chief Executives Board for Coordination	CEB
United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights	UNHCHR
Universal Declaration of Human Rights	UDHR
Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties	VCLT
Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action	VDPA

Table of Contents

I – Introduction	7
1. The Economic crisis as a challenge to human rights	9
1.1. The economic crisis: origins and motives	9
1.2. Consequences of the economic crisis: a focus on human rights	11
1.3. Accountability for the crisis	15
2. International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural Rights	18
2.1. The International Covenant of Economic Social and Cultural Rights in the context of the economic crisis	18
2.2. Nature of economic, social and cultural rights	20
2.2.1. Economic Social and Cultural Rights vs. Civil and Political rights	20
2.2.1.1. Arguments for distinction	21
2.2.1.2. Indivisibility, interdependence and interrelation	24
2.2.2. The tripartite typology of obligations	25
2.2.2.1. Obligation to respect	26
2.2.2.2. Obligation to protect	27
2.2.2.3. Obligation to fulfil	28
2.2.2.4. Interrelations between the three levels of obligations	29
2.2.3. Obligations under article 2(1)	29
2.2.3.1. “Undertakes to take steps”	30
2.2.3.2. "By all appropriate means, including particularly the adoption of legislative measures"	31
2.2.3.3. "achieve progressively”	32
2.2.3.4. "to the maximum of its available resources"	33
2.2.3.5. “international cooperation”	35
2.2.4. Non-discrimination	37
2.2.5. Principle of Equality	39
2.2.6. Margin of discretion	40
2.2.7. Prohibition of retrogressive measures	42
2.2.7. Core content of the right under the Covenant, which can be more affected by the crisis	44
2.2.7.1. Right to work	45
2.2.7.2. Right to social protection	45
2.2.7.2. Right to adequate food	46
2.2.7.3. Right to adequate housing	47
2.2.7.4. Right to education	48
2.2.7.5. Right to health	48
2.2.8. Justiciability	50
2.2.9. Violations	53
3. How to cope with the economic crisis under a human rights legal framework	55
3.1. Legal tools	55
3.1.2. Limitations	55
3.1.2.1. Determined by law	55
3.1.2.2. Compatible with the nature of the rights	56
3.1.2.3. General welfare	56
3.1.3. Derogation (ICCPR) vs. Retrogression (ICESCR)	57
3.1.3.1. The derogation clause in ICCPR	59
3.1.3.2. The derogation clause in ICESCR	61
4. Human rights approach to the Crisis	63
4.1. The role of the Committee on Economic Social and Cultural Rights	64
4.2. Legal force of general comments and concluding observations	66
4.2. Suggestion of issues fundamental to a human rights approach to the crisis	70

4.2.1. International Cooperation	70
4.2.2. Transparency and accountability	72
4.2.3. Monitoring	73
4.2.4. Non-discrimination	75
4.2.5. Participation	75
4.2.6. Securing the compliance with the core content of ESCR	76
4.2.7. Social Security	76
4.2.8. Promotion of justiciability	77
4.2.9. The need to address long-term goals in the approach	77
II – Conclusion	79
Bibliography	81